

#1

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, July 30, 2019 7:27:55 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, July 30, 2019 7:44:13 AM
Time Spent: 00:16:17
IP Address: 71.36.52.22

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kent Duckworth

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am interested in serving as a member of the Council. I am a recently retired attorney who practiced in Lake County from 1976.

My personal interest however is based on my ownership of a 450 acre property 390 acres of which is under a conservation easement. In recent years we have experienced a growing number of grizzlies crossing Highway 93 and using our farm from spring through the fall.

I am a friend of the Flathead Tribe bear biologist, Stacy Courville, who I believe will confirm my interest in and cooperation with the Tribe's attempts to conserve bears as well as protect people and their property.

I have no idea if there happens to be a vacancy on the Council, but if or when there is, I would like to apply. Please let me know if I need to take any further steps to be considered.

#2

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, August 01, 2019 6:27:00 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, August 01, 2019 6:32:07 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:07
IP Address: 216.47.63.135

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Norm Sindelar

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Wondering if Bryce Andrews author of Down from the Mountain is involved GFAC ??

#3

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, August 05, 2019 3:31:17 PM
Last Modified: Monday, August 05, 2019 3:36:07 PM
Time Spent: 00:04:50
IP Address: 174.208.25.2

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bill Mckinley

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I hope everyone on the council values this opportunity as much as I would have. I will look forward to seeing great ideas and concepts coming from group. Happy trails and congratulations

#4

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, August 31, 2019 7:58:42 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, August 31, 2019 9:08:27 PM
Time Spent: 01:09:45
IP Address: 98.193.15.239

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Robert H. Aland

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I have read the State of Montana's Executive Order No. 9-2019 creating the Grizzly Bear Conservation and Management Advisory Council, and I have two comments:

1. No Uncertainty. The 8th WHEREAS clause on page 1 states that "recent litigation has created uncertainty about delisting of grizzly bears from the Endangered Species Act." That statement is erroneous; there is no uncertainty. The Montana District Court held that the delisting was invalid and set it aside. As a result, the bears are protected under the Act. Montana - and Idaho and Wyoming - are required to protect the bears in accordance with the Act.

2. Additional WHEREAS Clauses. The following four WHEREAS clauses should be added to the Executive Order in the interest of accuracy and completeness:

WHEREAS, approximately 194,000 comments were submitted by the public pursuant to the federal Administrative Procedure Act in response to the 2005 proposed rule issued by the U. S. Fish and Wildlife Service to remove Endangered Species Act protection for grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem; and according to the Service's published statistics, 99.3%, including 90.4% from Idaho, Montana and Wyoming, the three states in which grizzly bears reside, opposed delisting. However, the Service disregarded that overwhelming sentiment and issued the 2007 final delisting rule, which was invalidated in *Greater Yellowstone Coalition v. Servheen*, 672 F. Supp. 2d 1105 (D. Mont. 2009), *aff'd*, 665 F.3d 1015 (9th Cir. 2011);

WHEREAS, approximately 665,000 comments were submitted by the public in response to the 2016 proposed rule issued by the Service to remove Endangered Species Act protection for grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem; but the Service did not prepare a statistical analysis of those comments of the type it prepared for the 2005 public comments due to a "change of policy." It is reasonable to assume that public sentiment in Montana and elsewhere with regard to the 2016 proposed rule was as overwhelming in opposition to delisting as the public sentiment expressed with regard to the 2005 proposed rule.

WHEREAS, the majority of conflicts involving grizzly bears and humans and livestock occur on public lands, which are owned by all Americans and constitute the only remaining safe havens for grizzly bears due to habitat loss;

WHEREAS, the only reason to remove Endangered Species Act protection for grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem is to permit trophy hunting of the bears under the 2016 Memorandum of Agreement, which divvies up "discretionary mortalities" of the bears among the States of Idaho, Montana and Wyoming;

#5

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, September 08, 2019 4:30:28 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, September 08, 2019 4:35:29 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:00
IP Address: 73.168.254.7

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Donnie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

9/8//19

I have two comments on Grizzly Bear conservation

I disagree that there is uncertainty under the law. The Montana District Court ruled that the delisting was invalid and set it aside. As a result, the bears are protected under the Act. Montana - and Idaho and Wyoming - are required to protect the bears in accordance with the Act.

These clauses should be added to the Executive Order in the interest of accuracy and completeness:

WHEREAS, approximately 194,000 comments were submitted by the public pursuant to the federal Administrative Procedure Act in response to the 2005 proposed rule issued by the U. S. Fish and Wildlife Service to remove Endangered Species Act protection for grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem; and according to the Service's published statistics, 99.3%, including 90.4% from Idaho, Montana and Wyoming, the three states in which grizzly bears reside, opposed delisting. However, the Service disregarded that overwhelming sentiment and issued the 2007 final delisting rule, which was invalidated in Greater Yellowstone Coalition v. Servheen, 672 F. Supp. 2d 1105 (D. Mont. 2009), aff'd, 665 F.3d 1015 (9th Cir. 2011);

WHEREAS, approximately 665,000 comments were submitted by the public in response to the 2016 proposed rule issued by the Service to remove Endangered Species Act protection for grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem; but the Service did not prepare a statistical analysis of those comments of the type it prepared for the 2005 public comments due to a "change of policy." It is reasonable to assume that public sentiment in Montana and elsewhere with regard to the 2016 proposed rule was as overwhelming in opposition to delisting as the public sentiment expressed with regard to the 2005 proposed rule.

WHEREAS, the majority of conflicts involving grizzly bears and humans and livestock occur on public lands, which are owned by all Americans and constitute the only remaining safe havens for grizzly bears due to habitat loss;

WHEREAS, the only reason to remove Endangered Species Act protection for grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem is to permit trophy hunting of the bears under the 2016 Memorandum of Agreement, which divvies up "discretionary mortalities" of the bears among the States of Idaho, Montana and Wyoming;

#6

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, September 22, 2019 4:44:08 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, September 22, 2019 4:45:09 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:01
IP Address: 174.216.7.168

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Laurel Angell

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Would just like to be on list to track and follow this.

#7

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, September 25, 2019 4:11:47 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, September 25, 2019 4:14:27 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:40
IP Address: 67.143.192.62

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Anne Wheeler, West Glacier

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Are the Minutes of your meetings available to the public? How would a person access the Minutes and the Agenda for you next meeting?

#8

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, October 02, 2019 8:10:04 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, October 02, 2019 8:14:36 PM
Time Spent: 00:04:32
IP Address: 72.174.63.147

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

David Krischel

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

There needs to be a limited hunt for grizzly bears say 3 to 5 bears per hunting district they are found in. Take them off the endangered species list. They have recovered sufficiently. Don't let the animal rights activists dictate what we should do with the grizzlies in Montana or any other state that has grizzlies.

#9

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, October 04, 2019 2:13:16 PM
Last Modified: Friday, October 04, 2019 2:14:42 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:26
IP Address: 174.208.21.121

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Gary Burnett

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Thank you for working towards solutions and the opportunity for public engagement.

#10

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, October 19, 2019 8:34:37 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, October 19, 2019 8:35:50 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:13
IP Address: 174.32.160.46

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

JoeJoetheDogFaceBoy

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Just fucking having a god damn controlled hunting season for grizzly bears.

#11

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, October 23, 2019 7:43:55 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, October 23, 2019 8:00:10 AM
Time Spent: 00:16:15
IP Address: 206.130.141.103

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Steve Ovenell

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I worked at glacier national park - where we dealt with grizzly bear (GB) incidences GB's endanger humans by mauling or killing them) that's a fact - wherever you increase the GB population you endanger humans People should be our first consideration - People need to be able to enjoy our great outdoors and our government should about the business of making the great outdoors more safe not less safe I have done trail closures and have been close to GB's - its a very scary environment - I feared for my life

#12

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, November 05, 2019 8:01:23 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, November 05, 2019 8:03:48 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:24
IP Address: 166.7.148.37

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Would you please post meeting notes and transcripts, if available. This may be very important in developing sustained public understanding and support for the council's efforts, and it would aid in understanding long-term planning. Thank you.

#13

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, November 06, 2019 6:20:39 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, November 06, 2019 6:21:07 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:27
IP Address: 69.145.38.230

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Five Leading Scientists To Say the Grizzly Bear Has Not Recovered and Remains In Peril

Contact: Mike Bader 406.721.4835; mbader7@charter.net; montanaforestplan.org

MISSOULA— The Status of the Grizzly Bear in the Northern Rocky Mountains: Has the Grizzly Really Recovered? features five leading PhD scientists with grizzly bear expertise who will present professional statements challenging the one-sided narrative from state and federal agencies pushing for delisting and even trophy hunting.

This event takes place on Friday, November 15th from 12-2pm in Room 330 of the University Center on the University of Montana campus and is open to the public, free of charge. It will also be available through an online link (details below). It is sponsored by the Flathead-Lolo-Bitterroot Citizen Task Force (www.montanaforestplan.org) and the UM Environmental Studies Department.

Presentors are: Dr. Fred Allendorf, Regents Professor of Biology Emeritus and board member of the National Academy of Arts and Science; Dr. Lee H. Metzgar, former director of UM Zoology and Wildlife Biology Programs (ret.); Dr. Brian Horejsi, independent scientist with extensive experience in western and northwestern Canada; Dr. David Mattson, USGS (ret.) who remains active and has extensive research experience in the greater Yellowstone; Dr. Frank Lance Craighead, author of book chapters on grizzly bear meta-populations and the genetics of large carnivores.

Following the presentations, at approximately 1pm questions will be taken first from the media and then the general public.

Date Time: Nov 15, 2019 12:00 PM Mountain Time (US and Canada)

Join from PC, Mac, Linux, iOS or Android: <https://umontana.zoom.us/j/859924284?pwd=UDJ3bWtwKzI4QU56Sng2UlhEVytOUT09>
Password: 186845

Join Us! Reception for Grizzly Bear Scientists
Friday, November 15, 2019, 5:30 PM – 8 PM
Goodworks Ventures
129 W Alder
Missoula, Montana 59802
Hosted by Flathead-Lolo-Bitterroot Citizen Task Force

#14

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, November 07, 2019 3:43:12 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, November 07, 2019 3:45:56 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:44
IP Address: 72.174.68.170

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Blake Nicolazzo

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hi there, just wanted to be sure the Council had access to t this report. Please note on Page 13- just over 10% of MT cattle producers are using non-lethal methods for predator management. It seems that number needs a sharp increase.
https://www.humanesociety.org/sites/default/files/docs/HSUS-Grizzly-Livestock_6.Mar_.19Final.pdf

#15

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, November 18, 2019 1:43:40 PM
Last Modified: Monday, November 18, 2019 1:44:57 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:17
IP Address: 168.149.242.219

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Gail Richardson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We value our iconic native wildlife, especially much maligned predators like the grizzly bear and gray wolf. We have lived, worked and recreated for over 40 years in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem and care deeply about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana. We have worked in tourism and recreation in Yellowstone and Montana and have seen firsthand the awe that visitors have for these magnificent creatures. We have been privileged and thrilled over the years to see grizzlies in the wild, both in Yellowstone and Glacier and around these iconic parks. We realize the importance of our state animal to the ecosystems in which they occur. We live in Montana because of its magnificent landscapes, its precious public lands and its native wildlife. We expect grizzly recovery and co-existence to benefit the bears which are experiencing myriad threats for climate change and habitat pressures. We expect recovery to include connectivity between populations and NO trophy hunting. The Great Bear deserves our support to keep Montana "the last best place."

#16

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, November 25, 2019 4:48:51 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, November 26, 2019 10:05:28 AM
Time Spent: 17:16:36
IP Address: 66.109.147.134

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeff Darrah

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am a sportsmen in Region 2 and I hunt in the upper Blackfoot Region. I would like to see the tenants of the North American Model followed in managing the Grizzly Bear. I know connectivity is a big issue and genetic diversity of great concern, if this is the case when Grizzly Bears in the NCDE are to be relocated why not fast track the spread of genes by relocating the bears to the Yellowstone and or the Cabinets. I am concerned that relocation is not working anyway, bears seem to find their ways back to their homes. I have trapped and relocated many black bears and eventually they return. I also support hunting as a method to control numbers of bears, currently human/bear conflict is on the rise and hunter incidents are increasing each year. I feel that human safety may not being considered at the level it should be. The Grizzly Bear Mortality rates are increasing each year due to their expansion and increasing numbers. As a hunter I feel that increasing grizzly bears, wolves and lions means less elk and deer, which in turn will eventually mean less revenue to manage these speices. AS a hunter I feel that the hunting component needs to be part of the Montana Grizzly management plan. The ESA delisting process and litigation makes this process stall out and needs to be fixed, so that management is from the science not the bench!

#17

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, November 26, 2019 7:57:17 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, November 27, 2019 8:58:37 AM
Time Spent: 13:01:19
IP Address: 76.76.71.229

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Dave Ruane

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzly bears should not be considered a trophy but rather just like Golden Eagles and Bald Eagles. I would rather have trained wildlife biologists continue to "manage" grizzly bears than to allow hunting of these animals. I am a hunter and have been appalled by the way "trophy hunters" have destroyed the image of hunting in North America with their wolf pictures, and commentary. Allowing them to do the same with Grizzly Bears would further this poor perception. Don't enable this tiny fraction of the hunting community to ruin the perception of hunting for the rest of us...

#18

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, November 27, 2019 12:43:26 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, November 27, 2019 12:44:28 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:02
IP Address: 73.249.81.98

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jacquelyn Waitkus

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please we can do exist with grizzlies. They should be protected.

#19

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, November 27, 2019 12:42:57 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, November 27, 2019 12:49:10 PM
Time Spent: 00:06:12
IP Address: 50.52.18.235

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

jon bush

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

sirs.....after 46 years living and recreating and working in NW MT woods, iam dismayed by the Liberal FWP attirudes and actions playing BEAR GAMES in our backyards for their entertainment to justify a job financed by my liscense dollars. there are TOO MANY grizzlies outside of Glacier/great bear/scapegoat/bob. we REALLY don't need any cabinet mtn splinter groups either. if some rational not LIBERAL alternative does not become implemented, MORE bears are gonna end up with big-bore bullet holes in them or maybe just gut shot with 22 mag for maximum suffering.
START ELIMINATING EXCESS BEARS IMMEDIATELY !

#20

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, December 01, 2019 12:10:05 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, December 01, 2019 12:35:53 PM
Time Spent: 00:25:48
IP Address: 67.176.108.60

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Larry Campbell

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council has had its effectiveness undermined right from the get go by framing it publicly as a vehicle leading toward delisting. It should be seen as a vehicle for recovery. Talk of delisting should happen only after robust recovery has been achieved and seen to be stable. The Council seems to be weighted toward participants with a vested interest in delisting a.s.a.p.

Landscape connectivity of suitable habitat is the key to recovery. As was noted in the initial recovery plan, the Bitterroot Ecosystem is a missing critical core anchor point for grizzly recovery. Priority should be given to protecting and recovering linkage zones to the BE. The bears are coming; the agencies need to catch up. The importance of identifying sites for relocating bears that are considered problems has been noted by the agencies for quite some time, but I don't see any progress, even though it would seem to be one of the more solvable challenges. That situation seems to indicate ineptitude or lack of good faith. Also, it appears that a grizzly bear connecting itself to the BE seems to be enough to define it as a problem bear, simply because it does not have a hall pass from management agencies. That intervention prevents connectivity. Criteria for what constitutes a problem bear need to be clearly defined.

Conflict prevention is also very important, as you have recognized. Public education and regulation are priorities. People management more than bear management should be the focus.

#21

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, December 02, 2019 8:20:48 AM
Last Modified: Monday, December 02, 2019 8:29:39 AM
Time Spent: 00:08:51
IP Address: 71.176.133.215

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Sharon Garlena

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Save our endangered grizzly bears!

#22

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 9:25:34 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 9:29:08 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:33
IP Address: 67.143.192.229

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Dave Schroff

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

My wife and I live off the West Fork of the Bitterroot River in southwestern Ravalli County. We would like to attend one of the council meetings. One is scheduled for tomorrow and the next day in Missoula; about a 100 mile trip for us one way. Are there any plans to have a meeting in Hamilton? Thank you.

#23

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 11:55:11 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 12:06:41 PM
Time Spent: 00:11:30
IP Address: 24.130.144.175

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Michelle MacKenzie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It would be great if public meetings could be held on weekends or evenings to allow more meaningful public input. I appreciate as well, the opportunity for online public comment because it is important to include national public opinion. Grizzly bears belong not just to Montanans but to the entire country. Many live in national parks and are important to the tourist industry.

In addition, independent scientists should be encouraged to participate.

It is already established that grizzly bears belong on the Endangered Species Act, according to the federal court. The purpose of this council should be to address coexistence, connectivity and such. Not to try and ensure that the bears can be delisted.

Speaking of connectivity, Montana's grizzly bear populations are all disconnected and it is critical for long term survival and genetic diversity to ensure connectivity. This includes working with local communities to reduce conflict and learn coexistence strategies. This is particularly an issue in the Bitterroot.

Finally, I oppose any hunting of grizzly bears such as is listed in Administrative Rule Section 12.9 1401 (1)(c)(ii). This section should be amended to indicate that coexistence strategies including non-lethal measures like bear-proof garbage cans, electric fencing are better long term than hunting to eliminate conflicts.

Thank you for the opportunity to submit online comments.

#24

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 8:55:20 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 8:59:00 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:39
IP Address: 107.182.43.109

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kelly R Sweeney

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

To the members of the Montana Grizzly Bear Advisory Council and the Montana Department of Fish, Wildlife and Parks:

I have some concerns about the push to remove grizzly bears from Endangered Species Act Protections. The primary concerns are outlined below.

1) Regarding process and public input:

The Executive Order establishing the Grizzly Bear Advisory Council states that "in order to ensure that its citizens have a voice in the future of grizzly bears, Montana must provide meaningful opportunities for people to engage in a public discussion around grizzly bear management."

The reality is that the current process does not allow for "meaningful opportunities" for public input at all, but is structured so that public participation is extremely inconvenient and often difficult. Council meetings are held on weekdays during hours most citizens are required to be at work, rather than during the evening or on a weekend day when many more people could participate. At least SOME of the meetings should be held at more convenient hours so that people wishing to attend didn't have to take time off work to do so. Emphasis should be placed on hearing a diverse array of scientific perspectives on the issue of grizzly management. Many see the Department as favoring the input of scientists that align with economic interests of ranchers and mineral extractors, as well as trophy hunters, rather than what is good for grizzly bears in the long run. Independent scientists-not just state sanctioned scientists-should be allowed to have a say.

Grizzly bears are not property of the Department but are valuable to all residents and a tremendous economic force in the state, bringing in many millions in tourism dollars from people visiting the parks and spending money on lodging, gas, food, entrance fees, photography supplies, and souvenirs, among other things. The people deserve a say in the management of these globally famous, iconic animals. It should not only be the interests of ranchers, miners and hunters which determines management protocols.

2) Regarding the Endangered Species Act and the possible delisting of the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem Grizzly:

The Council should NOT decide whether or not the GYE Grizzly loses or retains ESA protections. This should be decided by via judicial review and based on solid science. Currently, the courts have ruled the GYE Grizzly should remain protected.

The directive of the council is written as "to address challenges and help set a long-term vision for bear management and conservation in Montana," not to facilitate delisting as has been incorrectly stated by some agency leaders.

3) Regarding connectivity between the GYE population of grizzly bears and other local populations:

There is no connectivity between the various population groups of grizzlies in Montana. This results in genetic isolation and impacts the bears' ability to adapt to changes in climate, food sources, and other stresses. As four of the six recovery areas are wholly or in part IN the state of Montana, Montana's management protocols are critical to the long term viability of the species. This connectivity, and the establishment of such, must be part of the future management plans adopted by the state. Assuring geographical connectivity will strengthen the gene pool of the sub species, and make them more able to withstand the environmental challenges they inevitably will face.

Female grizzly bears need to be allowed to established home ranges in areas that overlap these recovery zones. Eventual recolonization of the Bitterroot ecosystem would be a step in the right direction. Attempts to prevent this recolonization, such as trapping and relocating bears that migrate there, should be reconsidered.

Conflict prevention in linkage areas should be given especial attention.

4) Regarding conflict prevention and mitigation:

More work needs to be done to reduce conflict between humans and bears, and livestock and bears, but the overwhelming focus should be NON LETHAL means.

The department and advisory council should work to identify areas of greatest concern and strive to implement additional measures to reduce conflict and decrease grizzly mortality while keeping people and livestock safe. Additional funding and resources should be allocated so this can be prioritized. Public outreach and education can play a key role in establishing a more peaceful coexistence between humans, livestock and grizzly bears.

Recommendations on conflict mitigation that were made by the 2009 Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team that included requiring hunters to carry bear spray should be implemented and enforced.

The state should support permanent retirement of livestock grazing allotments from willing producers.

While Montana's Administrative Rules, Section 12.9.1401 (1) (c) (ii) states that "sport hunting is the most desirable method of...minimizing depredations against private property within or adjacent to grizzly bear habitat," this has been shown to be false. Indiscriminate hunting of grizzlies will not only fail to reduce conflict between people and bears, but poses a serious threat to the species' long term survival. Far more effective means of conflict reduction exist, including such non-lethal methods as electric fences to protect property and livestock and bear-proof refuse containers to discourage bears from visiting areas where they are not welcome

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

protect property and livestock and bear proof refuse containers to discourage bears from visiting areas where they are not welcome. The record mortality rate of grizzlies over the past several years-mostly due to conflicts with humans- should be of great concern and efforts made to protect the bears from population instability or decline. These Administrative Rules should emphasize non-lethal conflict resolution and be amendable as situation warrants, rather than attempting to apply a one-size-fits-all solution to a complex set of problems.

Grizzly bears are among the most intelligent of animals and are icons of wild America. Valued domestically and globally, they are a treasure that should be treated with care and respect. The economic value of the bears to Montana's wildlife viewing tourism industry is tremendous. Many of the individual bears are famous across the world. Some studies have placed the value of a living grizzly at several millions of dollars over its natural lifespan, far outweighing the economic value of a beef cow or a hunting tag. Grizzly bears are money year in and year out when allowed to live and draw visitors from across the globe. And while many folks might say there are too many tourists, very few would like to see the tourism industry-one of the top industries that drive Montana-collapse.

And it would be remiss not to acknowledge the grizzly's status as an umbrella species that shelters and benefits all other life in its ecosystem. Scientists have demonstrated that healthy populations of bears mean healthy ecosystems. Economics aside, that is also a benefit to all of us.

In closing, I would like to see the state of Montana put in place a more open and accessible way to encourage public participation in grizzly recovery and management. I would like to see the state actively encourage geographical and genetic connectivity between the small population groups in the various recovery zones. I would like to see more emphasis placed on non-lethal methods of conflict mitigation between grizzlies and humans. And finally, I would like to see an honest adherence to the actual science of grizzly bear management, even when it does not fall in line with the personal interests of those in the Department, or the state's ranchers, or the trophy hunting contingent. Science should win over financial interests when it comes to wildlife, especially a species just 50 years ago on the brink of extinction, and one we have spent millions of taxpayer trying dollars to save.

Sincerely,

Kelly R Sweeney

#25

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 10:35:06 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 10:54:18 PM
Time Spent: 00:19:12
IP Address: 174.208.10.118

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Steve Yonce

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

A topic I hear come up in any discussion on bears is how to spread education to the general population to make people more bear aware and hopefully minimize conflicts.

A thought came to me that if you want to buy a bear license to hunt in Montana you are required to take and pass a short online quiz on bear identification. You are only required to take and pass this test one time.

I also belong to a shooting range east of Missoula that requires me to take and pass a similar test on safety every year when I pay my dues.

I recommend we look at creating a similar presentation through FWP designed around "bear aware" topics that would be a requirement in order to purchase a conservation licence...this would touch every person buying a hunting/fishing license. The quiz would be a yearly requirement to provide the opportunity to introduce new information and refresh the the existing information.

Thanks and you are all to be commended for you dedication.

#26

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 10:39:27 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, December 03, 2019 11:06:52 PM
Time Spent: 00:27:25
IP Address: 107.77.199.25

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Brett Goodkind

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Montanans and grizzly bears need to coexist! Griz population levels are at 3-4% of what they once were. They are a vital part of biodiversity in Western U.S.

Specifically, the bitterroot and Idaho wilderness could be a astronomical habitat for recovery and potential connectivity from the sawtooth wilderness up to the bob marshall wilderness and beyond.

Independent scientist are a imperative part of value in showing independent and relevant data and should be empowered as such. Huckleberries and Grizzly Bears are symbiotically responsible for Montanas draw as a "Wild, natural habitat" that brings infinite revenue and tourism to the area.

Connecting these localized griz populations is extremely important in building a long term viability.

Preventing grizzlys conflict is of utmost importance. Conflict is also probably the biggest threat of connecting these populations as humans continue to populate and destroy wild and natural areas at a rate never seen hitherto.

Livestock grazing and industrial agriculture are ruining possibilities of grizzly populations to thrive.

Education, public outreach and funding can help to revitalize griz pops in the bitterroot area which could be vital to a large griz population though frank church/nez perce.

Electric fencing, bear proof waste disposals and livestock feed relocation are simple solutions at a small cost. Wildlife Overpass on highway 90 east of Missoula would be extremely beneficial as well.

Finally, grizzly bears deserve so much more than we can ever give at this point. They may never again repopulate to their original levels and we are responsible.

It's only fair that we give back as much as we can to help them thrive once again.

Thanks
Brett Goodkind

#27

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 9:58:48 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 10:01:39 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:51
IP Address: 71.232.173.164

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Beverly Young

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We MUST save the bears from hunting. Tourism will suffer for sure if the wildlife is hunted down. They were here first. SAVE THE BEARS. Only human can protect what some try to destroy .

#28

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 10:29:37 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 10:31:05 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:27
IP Address: 70.114.229.186

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tanya Kasper

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The council should not be deciding this, facts and science should be making this decision. Our wildlife is facing a plethora of threats and it is vital that we learn to co-exist and stop this terrible mindset of killing everything. Please do the right thing for wildlife.

#29

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 10:40:16 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 10:50:30 AM
Time Spent: 00:10:13
IP Address: 216.195.41.184

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Gayla Welty

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I live in Oklahoma and travel to Gardiner, MT two times a year to visit Yellowstone and the surrounding area. We have also been to Glacier. We go exclusively to see bears and wolves. Tourism dollars should be important to your state and most of those come from the parks where one has the opportunity to see a grizzly. We have taken 8 grandchildren, will take three more this summer, to Yellowstone, and their favorite animal to see is a grizzly. Please don't allow hunting of these animals. When we can no longer travel to your state to see grizzlies we will take our hard earned tourist dollars elsewhere. Save the bears.

#30

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 11:11:05 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 11:13:05 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:59
IP Address: 205.142.59.31

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Sharon Mosher

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not kill a Grizzly because it kills a human who entered their space, and or came to their dinner table.

#31

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 12:06:54 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 12:41:38 PM
Time Spent: 00:34:43
IP Address: 72.174.9.197

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lee Boman

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

December 4, 2019

Dear Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council,

Thank you for working together to ensure Montana remains a wild and wonderful place to live. I have eight thoughts regarding Montana's grizzlies below that I hope you will consider.

Almost all grizzlies remaining in the lower 48 live in Montana. Please remember you will be making decisions not just for Montanans, but for all Americans living in the lower 48 that would like to know there are still grizzlies in Montana.

We lived between the Missions and Swans for eight years. One night a bear attacked our bear-proof trash container. The container suffered numerous puncture wounds from some pretty big teeth, but the container never opened and the bear never returned. Our neighbor however, left dog food on the porch. About a month after our trash can survived a bear attack, a bear was killed because it was attracted to the dog food. That was a pretty clear lesson for us, don't feed bears!

Think about what a tiny portion of Americans living in the lower 48 live in grizzlies habitat. I'm sure those that live in grizzly areas treasure their home and lifestyle. It also seems like those lucky enough to live in grizzly area would be eager to ensure grizzlies aren't fed in any manner by humans. That feels like a small price to pay for getting to live in grizzly areas.

Remember we don't have any grizzlies today in the Bitterroot, which is among the best grizzly habitat in the lower 48. Why kill them when they've already been eliminated from prime habitat?

The front page of the Missoulian today featured, "Grizzly mortalities high again this year" as a front page headline. We're already killing a bunch of grizzlies, please don't allow more killing of grizzlies.

I've enjoyed about 500 hikes in grizzly country over the last ten years. I've been fortunate to see 7 wild grizzlies during those hikes. Please ensure future generations (specifically my three grandchildren) will have a chance to see wild grizzlies in Montana.

Montana's outdoor recreation industry generates over 7 billion dollars a year. Avoid damaging the chances of providing long term prosperity for all by allowing additional killing of grizzlies.

I grew up in Utah where the last grizzly was killed about 10 years before I was born. The Boy Scouts built a monument in honor of that last grizzly. I don't want a monument telling about how grizzlies used to live in Montana, I want live Montana grizzlies.

Thanks again for working together as Montanans to find a path forward that ensures our wild places and wild critters will continue to make Montana a highly desirable place to live, work, and play.

Sincerely,

Lee Boman

#32

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 1:50:23 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 1:55:55 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:32
IP Address: 161.185.208.89

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Carol Deech

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Funding is needed for conflicts between grizzly bears and ranchers. Bears should not die because of negligence on the part of a rancher. At the sametime, ranchers should be given assistance to do everything possible to secure their livestock. Too many bears are dying and we will never reach recovery if the escalation of bear mortality continues to increase.

#33

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 7:59:44 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, December 04, 2019 8:37:07 PM
Time Spent: 00:37:22
IP Address: 68.227.35.164

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Craig Stevenson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I have a home within the range of the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem Grizzly Bear Population. From my observations and reading of reports, both scientific and otherwise, it is my opinion that the Yellowstone grizzly bear population has recovered well above a point where the population is sustainable and no longer in need of Endangered Species Act protection. Grizzlies have proven sufficiently adaptable within this area to demonstrate that there is no foreseeable, substantive condition to continue current federal ESA protections. From its demonstrated performance by managing the wildlife of Montana, I believe that FWP is fully capable of managing grizzlies for the prolonged existence of grizzlies while protecting the public accordingly. I support lethal means of population control as the FWP deems necessary, including limited hunting. I do not see the need for population connectivity as animals can be moved between populations to improve gene flow without increasing the scope of negative grizzly-human interaction. I find it inconsistent and unreasonable that the federal government can recognize such actions as reasonable with wild, free-roaming horses and burros, but may be held to a different standard with grizzly bears.

#34

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, December 05, 2019 12:48:27 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, December 05, 2019 12:52:04 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:36
IP Address: 94.71.170.176

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

To the members of the Montana Grizzly Bear Advisory Council and the Montana Department of Fish, Wildlife and Parks: Please allow me to voice my concerns about the push to remove grizzly bears from Endangered Species Act Protections, which are as follows:

1) As to process and public input: The Executive Order establishing the Grizzly Bear Advisory Council states that "in order to ensure that its citizens have a voice in the future of grizzly bears, Montana must provide meaningful opportunities for people to engage in a public discussion around grizzly bear management." The manner in which the current process is structured does not allow for "meaningful opportunities" for public input at all. In order for this actually to take effect, council meetings should be held mostly outside working hours so that working people can attend. On the scientific aspect of the matter, it is very important that a diverse array of scientific perspectives on grizzly management be welcome and freely heard. Many people see the Department as taking into consideration only the input of scientists that align with economic interests of ranchers and mineral extractors, as well as trophy hunters, rather than what is good for grizzly bears in the long run. Independent scientists-not just state sanctioned scientists-should be allowed to present their findings and share their perspectives. Grizzly bears are not the property of the Department, they are natural treasure of all the people in the state and a tremendous source of tourist income for the state, that is millions in tourism dollars from people visiting the parks and spending money on lodging, gas, food, entrance fees, photography supplies, and souvenirs, among other things. The people have a right to participate in the decision making for the management of these globally famous, iconic animals. People also care for the environmental balance and preservation as awareness grows more and more. It should not only be the interests of ranchers, miners and hunters which determines management protocols- because the grizzlies do not belong to them.

2) As to the Endangered Species Act and the possible delisting of the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem Grizzly: The Council should NOT decide whether or not the GYE Grizzly loses or retains ESA protections. This matter should only be decided by judicial review and based on solid science, as per above. The courts have already ruled that the GYE Grizzly should remain protected. The directive of the council is written as "to address challenges and help set a long-term vision for bear management and conservation in Montana," not to facilitate delisting as has been incorrectly stated by some agency leaders. So it is very important that this point be clarified.

3) As to the connectivity between the GYE population of grizzly bears and other local populations: Currently there is no connectivity between the various population groups of grizzlies in Montana. This results in weakening of the gene pool and the bears' ability to adapt to changes in climate, food sources and other stresses. Taking into consideration that four out of the six recovery areas are wholly or in part inside the state of Montana, the State's management protocols are critical for the long term viability of the species. The establishment of connectivity is of utmost importance and should be part of the future management plans adopted by the State. In particular, female grizzly bears need to be allowed to established home ranges in areas that overlap these recovery zones. Eventual recolonization of the Bitterroot ecosystem would be a step in the right direction and it should be taken and not prevented by trapping and relocating bears that migrate there. Special attention need be given to conflict prevention in linkage areas.

4) As to conflict prevention and mitigation: More work needs to be done to reduce conflict between humans and bears, and livestock and bears by NON LETHAL means. Areas of greatest concern need be identified and funds should be allocated so that additional measures be implemented there to reduce conflict and decrease grizzly mortality while keeping people and livestock safe. I could not emphasize enough the importance of public outreach and education that can play a key role in establishing a more peaceful coexistence between humans, livestock and grizzly bears. Recommendations on conflict mitigation that were made by the 2009 Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team that included requiring hunters to carry bear spray should be implemented and enforced. Bear spray saves lives of people and bears and really there is no excuse for not using it. The state should support permanent retirement of livestock grazing allotments from willing producers.

While Montana's Administrative Rules, Section 12.9.1401(1) (c) (ii) states that "sport hunting is the most desirable method of...minimizing depredations against private property within or adjacent to grizzly bear habitat," this has been proven to be completely false. Indiscriminate hunting of grizzlies will not only fail to reduce conflict between people and bears, but poses a serious threat to the species' long term survival. Far more effective and NON LETHAL means of conflict reduction exist and should be adopted, such as electric fences to protect property and livestock and bear-proof refuse containers to discourage bears from visiting areas where they are not welcome. The record mortality rate of grizzlies over the past several years-mostly due to conflicts with humans- is alarming and efforts need be made to protect the bears from population instability or decline.

These Administrative Rules should emphasize non-lethal conflict resolution and be modified as situation warrants, rather than attempting to apply a one-size-fits-all solution to a complex set of problems. Grizzly bears are among the most intelligent of animals and are icons of wild America. Valued domestically and GLOBALLY, they are a treasure that should be treated with care and respect. Many of the individual bears are famous across the world, people admire and care for them. Some studies have placed the value of a living grizzly at several millions of dollars over its natural lifespan, far outweighing the economic value of a beef cow or a hunting tag. Grizzly bears are a source of tourist income throughout their lives when they are allowed to live and draw visitors from across the globe

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

are a source of tourist income throughout their lives, when they are allowed to live and draw visitors from across the globe.

The grizzly's status as an umbrella species that shelters and benefits all other life in its ecosystem should also be emphasized.

Scientists have demonstrated that healthy populations of bears mean healthy ecosystems.

Please adhere to science and let the general public benefit win over financial interests when it comes to wildlife, especially a species just 50 years ago on the brink of extinction.

Sincerely

#35

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, December 05, 2019 3:03:45 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, December 05, 2019 3:08:11 PM
Time Spent: 00:04:26
IP Address: 107.77.206.59

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

richard schiuh

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Humans are way more dangerous than bears. Think about that before shooting innocent animals. Is killing the best answer for anything? Try thinking beyond violence for a change.

#36

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, December 06, 2019 1:34:57 PM
Last Modified: Friday, December 06, 2019 1:35:43 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:45
IP Address: 69.144.49.194

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Stacey Hellekson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

First, thank you for taking an interest and participating in the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council. The fate and the progress with grizzly bears in Montana are so important to our state's culture, history and natural resources. The Yellowstone grizzly bears have made a big comeback, but they are not fully recovered, and they are still at risk for long-term survival due multiple issues including a growing number of conflicts with humans, declining food sources like the white pine, and lack of genetic diversity.

Taking a pro-active approach to address these issues is important to the wildlife and the citizens of the state to identify specific items to help grizzlies survive and thrive in harmony with humans. In my opinion, the committee should focus intently on the following two significant aspects:

- Connectivity. Without connectivity to other areas, the Yellowstone grizzlies will continue to move up and bump into Interstate 90. I would like to see plans to create wildlife bridges across I-90 in areas that have been noted that grizzlies are trying to cross (Livingston pass and near Butte). Without this crucial step to create connectivity to other forest land, there will only be an increase in conflict in the Bozeman and Livingston area with grizzlies and recreationists, hunters and even unsuspecting urban residents.
- Education and Conflict Prevention. Education of the public and providing tools to ease conflict is important to help to decrease the number of grizzly deaths due to negative interactions with humans. Funding should be considered for education of the public and should be prioritized in area with the highest recurrence of conflict.

I am looking forward to the outcomes of the Advisory Council and will continue to provide comments as the Council continues to meet.

Sincerely,
Stacey

#37

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, December 08, 2019 1:41:38 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, December 08, 2019 1:52:30 PM
Time Spent: 00:10:51
IP Address: 71.32.19.212

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I live in Red Lodge. Ranch west of Red Lodge and this summer have run into 4 grizzlies on our ranch. Its totally not practical to be able to sustain my way of life if the program of let them roam conti nues. Grizzly bears on public property have no place. Get a program soon before someone like me gets mauled.

#38

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, December 09, 2019 6:45:10 AM
Last Modified: Monday, December 09, 2019 6:48:31 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:21
IP Address: 67.189.133.222

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeff McLaird

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

My wife and I visit Montana specifically to see wildlife. Particularly grizzlies. Please maintain their status as a protected species so that not only is but our children and grandchildren can continue to visit Montana.

#39

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, December 15, 2019 8:28:36 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, December 15, 2019 8:31:07 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:30
IP Address: 184.167.145.34

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Michael G. Smith

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Councilors,

I would like to comment on actions the Council can take to ensure the viability and long-term health of Montana's grizzly bear populations. Thank you for the opportunity to do so.

One reason I live in Montana is because of its abundance of wildlands that provide the opportunity for the grizzly bear to thrive. Few states in the Lower 48 can make such a claim to have extensive, non-human inhabited lands and waters that can support such a large predator and its food sources. I am grateful knowing these large carnivores and I co-exist together in close proximity. I am thrilled when I see grizzly tracks, the carcass of a kill or evidence of foraging, or a rare sighting in the back country. As a Montanan, a human being, such encounters are important to me.

However, Montana's ability to maintain a thriving grizzly bear population is threatened. As reported in the Missoulian (December 3, 2019), it appears grizzly bear mortality is rising with deaths occurring more often outside recovery zones due to human conflicts. These deaths appear to be partly due to a growing Montana population encroaching and ever-expanding into wildlands. They also appear to be due to some ranchers unsupportive of the idea that we – urban populations, First Peoples, ranchers and grizzly bears – live in a shared wildlands landscape that is diminishing rapidly due to urbanization and climate change. Efforts to prevent more mortalities also rely on their buy-in to proactive approaches.

Thus, I support the following initiatives for reasons cited and encourage you to adopt them:

1. Increased effort and work to establish connectivity of Montana's grizzly bear populations. I'd especially like to see them populate the Crazy Mountains and Bitterroot ecosystem. I encourage you to recommend bear crossings across major roadways to enable connectivity. Establishing relocation sites should be a priority.
2. Minimization of conflicts between human and bears, and livestock and bears, should be a priority. I urge you to advocate for and request more funding to educate the public and ranchers about the necessity of doing so and ways they can help. Please note that I support permanent retirement of public grazing allotments. Hunting as a form of conflict minimization Montana's Administrative Rules (section 12.9.1401(1)(c)(ii)) fails the "smell test" as a way to minimize human-grizzly conflicts. Furthermore, it is a reactive measure self-serving to special interests, e.g. ranchers and hunters. Proactive measures to minimize conflicts include greater public awareness of the special attributes and needs of grizzly bears and more landscape for them, and increased use of non-lethal measures including electric fences in problematic areas. Another proactive measure is a clearinghouse of conflict prevention methods and their effectiveness used by ranchers and communities. I would support the use of taxpayer dollars to help ranchers and communities minimize conflicts on a shared basis, i.e. state taxpayer dollars plus rancher or community dollars.
3. Closure of roads from urban and rural areas into wildlands will help minimize conflicts. Additionally, as e-bicycles become more popular I anticipate an increased use of them by urban and rural residents to venture into the wilds. It's a short leap to recognize surprised grizzlies will feel threatened at the sudden appearance of a quiet, speeding human. They will act accordingly and, ultimately, there will be another dead bear after the authorities determine the cause and the bear. Thus, more attention on educating the bicyclist population will be necessary.
4. Rapid urbanization is encroaching into Montana's grizzly habitat. Furthermore, it helps subdivide it. I urge you to work with communities to minimize their impacts and to create large buffer zones between residences and wildlands. Extensive wildlife corridors should be maintained and further developed.

We in Montana are fortunate to live amongst a population of grizzly bears. It is safe to say they are the defining mystique that is Montana. They have the right to thrive in safety. It is up to us to ensure this by being proactive (versus reactive). I appreciate the opportunity to comment and look forward to the Council implementing proactive and bold solutions to increase grizzly bear populations and their ranges while minimizing grizzly bear mortality rates.

Sincerely

Sincerely,

Michael G. Smith
Bozeman, MT
December 15, 2019

#40

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, December 21, 2019 8:14:01 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, December 21, 2019 8:19:59 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:58
IP Address: 174.208.19.160

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tom wilde

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I strongly support the preservation of our grizzly bears; these amazing holy animals are of great importance to Montana's psyche, economy, health.

Constantly bombarded by speeding traffic and trains, over development of their habitat and restricted movements. But still they survive !

please ignore selfish stockgrowers and support this native gift !

#41

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, December 21, 2019 3:10:56 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, December 21, 2019 3:26:37 PM
Time Spent: 00:15:41
IP Address: 172.14.12.193

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Reverend Jane Eagle

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

First, let us agree that lethal measures are a last resort, to be used in EXTREMELY rare instances.

It must be illegal for people to use attractants: unsecured garbage, birdseed, animal feed, etc. There is a guy in California who purposely leaves food in his car with open windows to attract bears so he can have them killed. This is unconscionable! Anyone whose negligence attracts bears should be cited and fined heavily, and bears relocated and NOT killed.

Grizzlies are not invading our neighborhoods; our neighborhoods have invaded their homes. Humans invading bear habitat must be taught respect for the wild inhabitants, ALL OF WHOM ARE PART OF THE PUBLIC TRUST and belong to all Americans, not just the ones who enjoy killing them or whose laziness causes problems. I recommend a LOT of education, both in schools and on community levels.

These actions will take care of your stated objectives:

Maintaining and enhancing human safety

Ensuring a healthy and sustainable grizzly bear population

Improving effective response to conflicts involving grizzly bears

Engaging all partners in grizzly-related outreach and conflict prevention.

Councils are a great way to pretend that something is being done, while not taking any real action; and the current "council" is heavily weighted in favor of ranchers and hunters. They are a minority of the population and must not be given control against the opinions of the majority of citizens/voters.

#42

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, December 23, 2019 11:59:43 AM
Last Modified: Monday, December 23, 2019 12:10:37 PM
Time Spent: 00:10:53
IP Address: 24.119.101.4

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I live in Idaho but am from Gardiner. My family ran the first dude ranch in Montana, the OTO. we are in Gardiner at least twice a year. The worst thing I have seen is the mess up Tom Miner Basin. Why is the BBar ranch allowed to lure the grizzlies with carroway grass and promote a side show that is dangerous to both people and bears. There are cattle that are not the BBar park whites, a range rider was mauled and a lady was attacked st Point of Rocks. We saw 9 besrs one night. Have not been back. This is an example of poor management

#43

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, December 23, 2019 2:54:51 PM
Last Modified: Monday, December 23, 2019 3:10:14 PM
Time Spent: 00:15:23
IP Address: 184.100.38.116

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Expand the habitats for bears between Glacier and Yellowstone so those two populations can diversify their genetics. Then you can think about hunting. 2500 to 6000 grizzlies in the lower 48 should be a goal before hunting is allowed. There used to be many many more.

#44

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, December 23, 2019 10:27:36 PM
Last Modified: Monday, December 23, 2019 10:35:50 PM
Time Spent: 00:08:13
IP Address: 172.85.231.162

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tristan Adler

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please consider taking a long-term view with regard to grizzly bear management that takes into account the importance of top predators for maintaining healthy ecosystems. These keystone species tend to have conflicts with humans where civilization and nature meet, and the people who regularly deal with these issues are often vocal opponents of greater protections for predators due to the extra cost and work involved in managing conflicts. But the answer cannot simply be to kill any animal that conflicts with humans, or to keep shrinking their range. As we continue to encroach upon the grizzly's native habitat, it becomes critical that we act as responsible stewards of the land that we share. The long term health of the planet depends upon your decisions, and the ramifications will be felt centuries down the line if you fail to adequately protect these important pillars of the ecosystem.

#45

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, December 25, 2019 8:35:57 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, December 25, 2019 8:45:29 AM
Time Spent: 00:09:31
IP Address: 107.77.201.117

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Russ Barrett

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I live in the Sun River valley and you can no longer walk in the woods along it like I did when I was young. We irrigate and hay after dark and don't know what to expect. We also pasture south of Valier and there is plenty of activity in that area. We lost a calf there last summer but all we found was the ear tag and some bones. It will only get worse unless there is some control. Take them off as endangered.

#46

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, December 26, 2019 10:36:15 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, December 26, 2019 10:40:26 AM
Time Spent: 00:04:11
IP Address: 174.224.5.195

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzly bear deserve a chance to recover. They flourished and coexisted with major game species for centuries before we interfered. Our fear and supposed right to graze cattle wherever we want should not imperil their continued recovery. The ranching industry has an outsized influence in American politics. Do what's right. Do what the tax paying American public want. Stop killing apex predators for private profit and out of fear. It's shameful.

#47

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, December 27, 2019 6:36:13 AM
Last Modified: Friday, December 27, 2019 6:41:11 AM
Time Spent: 00:04:58
IP Address: 107.77.169.2

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Nancy Dean

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The grizzly bears need to be allowed to live in the wilderness areas. People who do not know or wish to adhere to harmonious living with wildlife should not live in these areas.

#48

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, December 28, 2019 1:44:17 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, December 28, 2019 1:57:02 PM
Time Spent: 00:12:44
IP Address: 63.153.26.88

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

jeff Boyle

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We live near Rainbow Point, West Yellowstone MT and we also camp on the West Fork of the Madison River. There are so many Grizzly Bears in both places they are a constant threat to people and we no longer feel safe. It is only a matter of time until a child is taken by a Grizzly Bear purely because of the large numbers of Grizzlies we now have. I hope you protect the Bears we love them but we need control and management now! I hope you never have to explain to parents why when you had the chance to manage bears you didn't recommend it.

#49

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, December 29, 2019 10:06:13 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, December 29, 2019 10:10:37 AM
Time Spent: 00:04:24
IP Address: 99.8.209.227

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Carolyn

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The grizzly bears are important to the economy and to the ecology of Montana and other states. There are proven methods for living successfully with grizzly bears even in areas with ranches, cattle, horses and sheep. There is no need to eliminate grizzlies in order to successfully raise those animals. There are many things ranchers can do to minimize the effect of the grizzlies on their livestock. All they have to do is research the subject and follow the guidelines. Hunters want the grizzlies killed to make their paid hunts more comfortable. That is not a good reason to eliminate the bears. There are also things hunters can do to minimize the risk during their hunting trips. It seems that people don't want to make the effort to live with grizzlies and this is just wrong. They are important to the environment, the tourist industry and the financial health of Montana, Wyoming and Idaho. Ultimately, though, they should be protected because they are part of our history and should be part of our future as well.

#50

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, January 02, 2020 5:03:23 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, January 02, 2020 5:04:43 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:19
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bonnie Rice

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

This op-ed ran in several papers across the state in December.

https://missoulian.com/opinion/columnists/governor-s-grizzly-bear-advisory-council-needs-to-hear-from/article_c509c9d4-3874-51ce-bc44-450d2d7f46bf.html

#51

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, January 02, 2020 6:10:41 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, January 02, 2020 6:44:30 PM
Time Spent: 00:33:49
IP Address: 63.153.15.236

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Gail and John Richardson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We met working in Yellowstone in 1978 and have lived, worked and recreated (hiking and backpacking) in grizzly country ever since, from W. Yellowstone to Missoula to Helena to Bozeman, our home since 1989. We developed a life-long fascination with, and love for, our precious native wildlife heritage, especially for our much-maligned carnivores. The grizzly bear is not only our state animal but is an integral part of our state's unique identity. Having worked in tourism and recreation from 1978 until 2013, I (Gail) have had the amazing opportunity to share our wildlife heritage with visitors from around the world. It cannot be overstated how important the grizzly bear is for both visitors and Montanans.

We are very concerned about the grizzly's future in this time of climate change and habitat loss. The bear's food sources are changing but still the bears are incredibly tolerant of people in their territories and most simply want to avoid us.

We want the bears treated with respect; we want natural connectivity and the tools/money for conflict avoidance; we want promotion of coexistence with these magnificent bears on the landscapes of our beloved Montana.

We understand that individual bears sometimes cause problems for ranchers, but if the ranchers are practicing good animal husbandry, using guard dogs and available techniques to discourage bears, this seldom occurs. We are against any trophy hunting of grizzlies but can live with individual bears being moved, or in some cases, removed, because of depredations.

Montana must set the standard for management of grizzlies if/when they are removed from the protection of the ESA. You have the responsibility to do it right, for the Great Bear, for Montanans who value its presence in our lives and for our shared biodiversity as a nation.

We were away for your Bozeman meeting but want to be included in future mailings. Thank you for your service.

#52

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, January 03, 2020 7:53:28 AM
Last Modified: Friday, January 03, 2020 7:56:04 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:35
IP Address: 67.42.172.14

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I live on the west bench outside of red Lodge and we have had ever increasing numbers of grizzly bears roaming this area. I've had them ride in my yard a couple of times this past summer and it's incredibly dangerous for people as well as pets and livestock. What can be done about lowering the population or removing these bears?

#53

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, January 07, 2020 12:40:58 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, January 07, 2020 4:53:00 PM
Time Spent: 04:12:01
IP Address: 174.45.73.30

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Greg Price

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hello, my name is Greg Price. I was an applicant for the GBC. I want to introduce myself a bit because I will be writing some long comments and want you to know the context from which my perspective derives.

I led the Great Grizzly Search in the late 1990s to the early 2000s. Our project was a DNA collection project to show that grizzly bears were either present in the Greater Salmon/Selway/Bitterroot Ecosystem or could get there on their own. We were in favor of grizzlies in the GSSBE but against the reintroduction plan that called for an experimental/non essential listing of bears reintroduced therein; the plan was shelved upon the election of George W. Bush. I also taught classes on grizzly bear biology/ecology and politics with Dr. Charles (Chuck) Jonkel (Jamie Jonkel's father) for 13 years in Glacier Park and along the Rocky Mtn Front. I have been thinking about grizzly bears and recreating among them for the past 24 years, and hunting among them for the past 17 years. I am also a vegetable farmer and chicken flock owner on an urban farm in Missoula for the past 18 years. I deal with foxes, raptors, skunks and raccoons, but not bears. I attended the Missoula mtg and the NCDE mtg and plan to be in Polson and wherever the Feb and March meetings are. I am currently in my 6th year on the Region 2 Citizens Advisory Council (CAC).

I like to work from big picture to little picture: As a human being, I think we have taken a lot of power over ecosystems and their inhabitants; the corollary is that we also incur a great responsibility. I do not think we have owned up to that responsibility very well when it comes to conserving wildlife/habitat in general and grizzly bears in particular, though MT is doing better than most states, perhaps simply because of our relatively low population. I think we can do better and should not be so singularly focused on elevating humans above nature, for in the long run we too will follow the path of diminishment through destruction of the only habitat we have. That said, you all have a mighty task in your hands, and I commend you all for stepping up and into the complex issues around grizzly/human coexistence.

If you have not already, you should become at least aware that the government positions on grizzly bears and delisting are not the only voices out there, nor are they the only body of experts. I would highly encourage you to read the handout you got in Missoula that presents a different narrative about why grizzlies have suddenly become more present and visible outside of the designated recovery areas. While there is certainly some population growth happening, it is also probable that declining food sources within core habitats is occurring as well (e.g., declining native trout in Yellowstone lake and whitebark pine nuts) due to climate change related effects and human induced issues (Dr. David Matson is a great source for an alternative take on grizzly bear science and status). Food source changes are forcing grizzlies to forage in new areas to seek higher quality foods, like livestock/livestock carrion and increased predation on ungulates, especially elk calves and calving areas. In addition, none of the current populations is even close to long term genetic viability, according to Dr. Fred Allendorf, who is the preeminent geneticist in conservation biology. That is why grizzlies are still under a court ordered listing, and may very well remain there. I also recommend reading the op ed in the Sun. 12/15/19 Missoulian by Mike Jarnevic. He offers a good synopsis on another perspective on grizzly bear conservation.

For some reason you all were told to not pay much attention to whether grizzlies are listed or delisted, but their status has everything to do with what tools are available for you to recommend. The state wants grizzlies delisted so it can manage them, which, to those of us who follow these things closely, means killing more bears through an aggressive management strategy and hunting. I have heard that straight from the mouths of FWP employees. Management of wildlife in general and grizzlies specifically is highly political, meaning science often takes a back seat in high level decision making. Politics to me means simply what one group of people wants vs another. Motivations and reasoning can be all over the place. Politics is narrowly focused on what people want. It often occurs to me in attending CAC meetings that FWP operates too much like a hunting and fishing club. Their mission, however, is to steward wildlife for the general public. Wildlife is equally owned by the public through a public trust agreement. FWP says that hunters and anglers pay to play and so get higher priority when it comes to weighing in on issues. But, of course, we all pay for National Parks, Wilderness Areas, Forest Service Land, and BLM since their inception, which is the habitat that sustains all sorts of wildlife. I hunt and fish, but it is not true that hunting and fishing pays for all conservation, not even close. Hunting and fishing dollars pay for a very small and select group of animals and some habitat, and it has gotten a bit better over time. That view also dismisses the John Muirs and Aldo Leopolds of the world and all of the private money that goes into habitat protection through purchases and easements and private land holders, plus the Wilderness Act and the ESA.

Why does all of this matter? Because the state claims that when/if grizzlies are delisted they will be managed like any other wildlife. Which other wildlife? Check out the hunting regulations and different categories of wildlife and what protection, if any, they are afforded. Grizzlies are special in many ways. Scientifically, they are one of the slowest reproducing mammals on the planet, which helps explain why it has taken 45 years just to get to this point. A female grizzly becomes reproductively mature around 6 yrs old. If she has a female cub at 6 and the cub stays with her until she is 2.5 yrs old then embarks on her own and becomes a successful adult and reproduces at 6, that is a 12 yr cycle from birth of the mother to maturity to reproduction and replacement. Cub mortality is high until the sub adult establishes her own territory around 4-5 yrs old. I have heard folks say look how good the wolf situation is which is

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

the sub adult establishes her own territory around 4-5 yrs old. I have heard folks say look how good the wolf situation is, which is, frankly, a very poor analogy. Wolves are on the other end of the reproductive spectrum. Grizzlies are unique and need to be managed as such, not like any other wildlife species. It is that attitude by the state that gives many of us pause regarding delisting. The other problem with the current delisting process is that it relies too much on population numbers, which as you may have gathered is a slippery issue, involving lots of formula based extrapolation. Opinions on when grizzlies are recovered have evolved with the changing landscape of people and climate and an abundance of new information since the original goals were set.

Now to the specific questions you are trying to weigh in on: Grizzly bear distribution within Montana and Connectivity? These two questions go together. If we want true recovery, then the current island approach to recovery must include connectivity, which means that grizzlies can migrate to other island recovery zones to mate and thereby exchange genes between populations. If that occurs and is recommended, then the question of whether grizzlies should exist outside of recovery zones is also answered with a yes. No animals respect, care, nor adhere to lines humans draw on maps. It is kind of a silly question. The only other way to maintain genetic viability is to manually move grizzlies from place to place. The problem with manually moving grizzlies is it would be very expensive and labor intensive, and grizzlies sometimes just walk right back to habitat where they were captured. There were some examples of that shown in the Missoula meeting. Since the advent of satellite collars, we have seen this dynamic occur multiple times--bears can cover a lot of ground fast. If grizzlies do establish connections, then it follows that they would exist outside of recovery zones, as they would not just walk to another recovery zone without living in between.

The bigger question is where do we want them. In a perfect world, there would be areas where we should not have so much livestock, or none at all, as well as areas where grizzlies and wolves would not be allowed, but that is a long ways off. I think that the western third of the state (all contiguous mountains divided by different sized valleys) is all fair game when it comes to grizzly occupation, and short of killing them as they move into those areas, how is one to stop it? It seems that the real issue is out on the prairie, where there used to be abundant resources in a diverse short grass ecosystem, and now there is not. Home sites will be a major issue as they offer resources and often cover, especially along riparian corridors, which we learned from several examples in the Missoula meeting. So what do we do? Kill bears that move there? Tolerate some that will adapt and perhaps occupy some of the island mountain areas like the Little Belts, Big Belts, or Crazyes? Move bears to other recovery zones that are not recovered? I think the answer could be that we do some of all of those options. It will be nearly impossible to keep bears from moving to new places on their own. So I think that in certain prairie areas grizzlies will do ok and in some there will need to be more lethal control and/or very aggressive hazing. Moving grizzlies is very tricky, so I will wait until after the next meeting to address that, after we learn more about the possibilities and limitations. On the surface it makes a lot of sense to move grizzlies from a place where we do not want them to a place where recovery is lacking, but it is legally very complicated, as we will see.

We know how to deal with conflicts. I think one of the most obvious messages from the Missoula meeting is that bear managers are great at what they do, and that bears are very tolerant of people. Grizzlies can and do live in close proximity to people. The more difficult task is managing people's behavior, expectations and fear. And thus the socially tolerable question. One plays into the other. When bear managers have the resources (i.e., people on the ground), conflicts are managed pretty well. But in places like the prairie and the Blackfeet Reservation, where human resources do not meet the geographic challenges of space and time, there are real issues.

We need more resources. This is where we unfortunately again get into a kind of cultural stalemate. There are many creative ways to generate more money for agencies to increase their resources, but they are often politically blocked. For example, there have been efforts to create more dollars from the non hunting/fishing community through the wolf stamp, or ideas that, like the Pittman/Robertson funds, other outdoor gear could be minimally taxed to create funding for the agencies. These efforts are often vigorously opposed by hunting, fishing and trapping groups who have too much hold on agency decisions and priorities, as they are minority special interest groups. In short, they do not want other values of the non consumptive public to be part of how FWP makes decisions and sets priorities. It is a major elephant in the room when it comes to funding.

The human fear factor is a tough one. Time, experience and education go along way to allaying people's fears. Again, it is often a question of resources. In this case it is education that is needed. A bold or habituated bear is different from an aggressive bear. Bold or habituated grizzlies are by definition very tolerant of humans and some times pay a price for the irrational fear of simple proximity. Grizzlies, I would argue are more predictable than humans. Just because they are big and strong does not mean that they are unpredictable. As we learned in the Missoula meeting, if grizzlies were the killers many fear them to be, then they would be killing and we would not tolerate them at all. We do not say that because some people are murderers and rapists that all people should be feared or suspects of such behavior. And we certainly do not take out entire communities or families of murderers and rapists, as we some times do to animals. It is basic logic and we have the big brains to use it and should. That does not mean that grizzlies are not dangerous, like humans. But we should educate ourselves about what kinds of behaviors indicate possible danger, like certain body language messages in the case of grizzlies. We live with them and should educate ourselves whether we want grizzlies around or not--they are here and so are we. Survival skills. I have avoided conflicts with bears and people by knowing what I was seeing, hearing, and

experiencing in the moment.

Having different conflict protocols makes sense in the context I outlined in the where should bears be tolerated discussion. For example, creative and aggressive hazing with different tools works to teach bears lessons about where they can and cannot be, but this is resource dependent. Grizzlies and humans are very intelligent, and we should rely on each others ability to learn and adapt for a better coexistence. Where we want them and do not should help define the different protocols.

Ok, that is it for now. I hope I added some thing of value to the conversation.

#54

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, January 08, 2020 11:10:26 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, January 08, 2020 11:11:22 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:55
IP Address: 107.77.165.63

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Patty

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I wanted to just take a moment more of your time if you dont mind to clarify what my idea is for an alternative solution to re-homing or euthanizing the trouble bears. I am just speaking about those bears that come down to the valley floor and keep returning, not those that remain in the wilderness. I have attached a picture of an article that was ran in the Flathead Beacon in June of this year just in case you had not seen it. My thought is if we are already spending time and money doing things to these bears as per the picture clearly dictates, why couldn't we take a moment to spay it neuter these troublesome animals so they will not be able to teach any future cubs the same bad habits. We already are doing this to our dog and cat population, the concept is on the same level.

#55

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, January 08, 2020 9:58:06 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, January 08, 2020 11:18:11 AM
Time Spent: 01:20:04
IP Address: 174.45.73.30

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Greg Price

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

This is Greg Price again. Conflict prevention is a huge topic and I ran out of time yesterday. Here is part 2 to my comments regarding conflict prevention and management.

When it comes to preventing livestock depredations on a landscape that is shared with many wild animals, there are strong and diverging opinions. I think that 2.5 million cattle roaming Mt and however many thousands of sheep creates a skewed situation against wildlife. In a short 150-200 years we have completely rearranged a landscape that operated a certain way for tens of thousands of years. While we are busy living the "new way", wildlife is trying to live the way they always have, but with new rules and expectations. That many people want or expect wildlife to figure this out is rationally absurd. We expect them to discern between what animals are food and which ones are not. We take over key habitats, live in and dominate most valleys and riparian zones with towns, cities and ranches, put up fences everywhere, build roads with essentially no regard and just expect wildlife to figure it out. Then we give lip service to respecting how adaptable and tough wildlife is, but what do we do to compensate for all that we take? Very little to nothing, as I see it. People, overall, are doing quite well by any biological measure, and we can and should do more to accommodate wildlife that has lived here for many thousands of years longer than we have.

I also think that ranchers who have had to adapt to the return of higher numbers of predators should be fairly compensated and assisted in how to adapt to what for them is a new landscape of a changing public sentiment about wildlife. Domestic and wild have never gotten along well and probably never will. The idea that came forward in Missoula regarding greater compensation for livestock losses using a multipliers needs to be pursued and accomplished. To be fair, compensation needs to be linked to mitigation efforts by ranchers, and perhaps other wildlife friendly practices. A few that come to mind are wildlife friendly fencing practices, better riparian zone management, range riders, guard dogs, etc.... I do also think that the public, particularly the 12 million people who visit our state as tourists should pay for some of these efforts. This could be done through taxes, which, like it or not, is how we pay for collective responsibilities. Many ranchers manage their land with great care and many do not. I see lots of examples of both. It will be a multi generational effort that requires a longer view than one lifetime. FWP does a great job on the ground trying to work with ranchers. There needs to be more reciprocity from rural communities in efforts to adapt. As I said in earlier comments, there are places and situations that do require lethal actions and aggressive hazing, but folks need to do their part before those actions are employed.

I have raised and cared for chickens for 17 years among raccoons, skunks, foxes and raptors and have never killed a predator. There is a fox that I see regularly and always a raccoon or three around. I have lost chickens, but it is always a situation that can be fixed--a loose wire on a gate, digging under a gate, swooping down from trees, accidentally leaving a chicken out, etc... For grizzlies, the solution is electricity. I do not think any animal should loose its life because of chickens, but state law is heavily skewed against wildlife. If you are not smart enough to figure out how to safely raise chickens then you should not have them. I also taught urban chicken workshops for 7 years and mostly tried to talk people out of raising chickens, especially on the urban/wildland interface. People can and should step up their game when it comes to chickens. Build a good coop, fence/electrify, build a predator proof area within the yard and use appropriate protocols when letting chickens roam free, or stop keeping chickens.

Recreation conflicts is a fast emerging issue, with lots of people moving here from larger urban areas. Human recreation should not interfere with wildlife's ability to thrive on the last vestiges of semi wild habitat available to them. We need more education efforts around this issue. I find it especially frustrating that mountain biking groups cannot see how speed and distance is a real barrier to them accessing wilderness areas--pure selfishness. With recreation it is a matter of cumulative effects at play. Rules and restrictions follow people; that is, the more people the more rules and restrictions. We should get ahead of this and the state is trying to do just that, in some cases. If grizzlies are not there yet, they are coming. I faced that the past few years while hunting near Square Butte, a place grizzlies have not been present in the recent past, but where a few have shown up lately.

It is just a matter of being reasonable that if humans are going to occupy so much of the river valley landscapes and lower elevation habitat, that the few places where we do not live but want to recreate wildlife should be given precedent. On this the state can take cues from the tribes and national parks. Situational/seasonal closures and restrictions can be employed in key or dangerous areas. Yep, some folks will howl and get upset, but the reasoning is straight forward and compelling when it is clearly communicated. More people, more grizzlies (and other wildlife), more conflict, more rules and restrictions. I think hunters should be required to carry bear spray. That is real action that would support our lip service about how much we love and respect wildlife. We should take more responsibility for the situation on the ground that we have caused. With freedom and power comes responsibilities.

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

responsibility for the situation on the ground that we have caused, with freedom and power comes responsibility.

In general, state laws make it too easy to kill wildlife for whatever perceived offense they have committed. There is a list of animals that can be killed year round for no reason and with no accountability--raccoons, coyotes, foxes, badgers, weasels, skunks, etc... And when it comes to coyotes, there is great cruelty inflicted through predator derbies and practices like running them down with ATVs and snowmobiles. Killing should not be option number one, except for serious life threatening situations. Again, there are trade offs that can be reasonably instituted. I am bringing this up because some of the questions that the state poses are looking for permission to kill more grizzlies when/if they are delisted. Humans should take more responsibility for the changes we have imposed on other creatures and their habitats. When lethal action is necessary, it should be employed, but not lightly or casually.

#56

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, January 09, 2020 6:10:42 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, January 09, 2020 6:27:45 AM
Time Spent: 00:17:02
IP Address: 184.166.39.176

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Patricia Beseler

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I offered the crazy idea of spaying and neutering bears (actually all predator animals) that have have caused a problem for humans . The results are far reaching but certainly an idea worth exploring, just think of your own cats and dogs, they stay home and fight less. I hope for news that maybe you guys think it's a good idea too! Sincerely, Patricia Ann Beseler-Kjelstrup

#57

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, January 09, 2020 9:33:09 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, January 09, 2020 9:38:58 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:49
IP Address: 71.214.56.74

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Stop the the destruction of their home just for greedy humans to pave paradise to put up a parking lot for yet another fast food chain etc!! We need to find a way to coexist as one. You cannot destroy their hone and then wonder why they wander into "yours" quite the contrary we are taking their homes away at an alarming rate solely for greddy ass humans!! Once we destroy the the ecosystem that gives life life there will be no turning back!! Once all the tree are cut down and the animals ravaged and our air is no longer fit to breathe then we will realize we cannot eat money!!!!

#58

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, January 09, 2020 1:34:52 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, January 09, 2020 1:38:59 PM
Time Spent: 00:04:06
IP Address: 201.247.44.26

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lili

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I wish whoever calls the shots on how to protect our wildlife would be native Americans, those who respect instead of exploiting. Hunting, trapping, etc is barbaric.
Absurd to think immigrants today are terrorists! The violence is here among us.

#59

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, January 12, 2020 1:40:00 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, January 12, 2020 1:40:55 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:54
IP Address: 99.203.186.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

IM AN ANIMAL ADVOCATE& ACTIVIST. LEAVE THE BEARS ALINE

#60

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, January 14, 2020 5:49:40 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, January 14, 2020 5:53:28 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:48
IP Address: 107.217.103.36

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Patricia Martin

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I respectfully ask that protections for these majestic creatures be preserved. They are a vital part of a healthy ecosystem.

Thank you.

Dr. Patricia Denis Martin

#61

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, January 14, 2020 2:03:02 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, January 14, 2020 2:11:24 PM
Time Spent: 00:08:22
IP Address: 72.36.12.225

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Scott Johnson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am a Wyoming ranch owner and a fan of all wildlife including Grizzlies, they are an important part of America that were almost wiped out and most of us are glad they are back. People come from all over the world and spend money to see them. They should be protected with non lethal means when ever possible. We also need to work on connecting their habitat so that it is not so fragmented. The ESA needs to be followed as it has been for years. We live on a planet of 7.7 billion people and expected to hit 10 billion by mid century. If we kill everything that gets in our way there will be nothing left but us and the domestic animals we eat.

#62

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, January 14, 2020 10:45:38 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, January 14, 2020 10:47:36 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:57
IP Address: 205.149.11.1

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bill West

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

January 14, 2020

Dear Dillon Tabish and the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council,

Thanks for your encouragement to contribute information.

Hello to council members I know, Heath Martinell, Nick Gevock, Carolyn Byrd and my past neighbor Greg Schock. I know Greg more through his daughter Emily and her husband Matt. We lived 3/4 mile from his corn field 1998-2009. I have read "Down from the Mountain".

I understand Region 3 bear/human conflict may not be increasing and may be declining, while livestock conflict is increasing. Thus, my Centennial Valley (Beaverhead County) experiences might be relevant to the council. Lima/Dell and Centennial Valley are a small community (fewer people) compared to other areas I have lived. It was easier to know who is available to address problems. In a more populated community like Saint Ignatius, it is not always clear who is in best position or who is most responsible for stepping up. In the latter case we know CSKT was the Agency, but People and Carnivores stepped up to build a fence around Greg's corn field. Centennial Valley story may not fit all communities but it worked for us. Being that I was manager of Red Rock Lakes National Wildlife Refuge in CV and most other landowners were cattle producers it was obvious we should work together to prevent livestock/predator conflict. We had a history of working together to control invasive plants on the landscape. In addition, one producer had established a Range Rider program in Tom Miner Basin near YNP.

A grizzly bear can be an awesome predator. If they discover killing a cow is good for them, they will become full time predators rather than scavengers/omnivores. Our Range Rider program was the brain child of Yvonne Martinell (Heath's mom) and Hilary Zaranek-Anderson of the J bar L Ranch. Hilary supervised the Range Rider program for two years while Yvonne, Kara Mapplethorpe and I (as Wildlife Committee) helped find funds, equipment and housing for the program. All of us worked under the auspices of the local nonprofit Centennial Valley Association (CVA). The CVA just completed its sixth year of a Range Rider program.

Points that might help the council are: during my tenure as Refuge Manager, wolves changed habits once they were subjected to hunting. Today they don't want to be in same square mile with a human because they seem to know humans carry guns. Prior to delisting/hunting we observed wolves on occasion. They would stand in middle of the road and just look at us. Today they see you before you see them and they exit. Seldom did we see wolves in past six years except on a trail camera. Wolf depredations were few and not considered as probable as grizzly depredations. I don't think we could expect the same to happen when grizzlies are delisted and subject to some level of hunting but educated predators do change habits.

Best option is to not have grizzly bears learn to kill cows and if they kill one don't let them have the reward of returning to the carcass. Grizzly bear deterrence by Range Riders has been a combination of discovering where large predators are on landscape in early spring (June). Later, the work load was monitoring for sign of predators (scat, tracks, trail cam or depredation) during July, August, September and October. The primary place to patrol during those months was in and near the cattle of seven participating producers. The conflict line is the cattle. Don't need to know where the predators are everywhere in the valley, just if they are near the cattle. If sign is found, riders prioritize that herd where sign was found. In addition, if a Rider finds a fence down or a calf that might be sick during surveillance for predators, they contact cattle producer ASAP by text. Thus, cattle seldom get out and sick calves don't tip over and become bear bait.

Have you seen this video, I think it is a good reminder that first time a grizzly bear tries to kill a cow/big calf, its likely a challenging wrestling match.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Sd-4i0tKqCw>

Notice near end of the video this bear keeps biting the hump rather than the nose. Even though the bear likely wins, it may not be something they want to do a 2nd time unless they perfect a technique. Otherwise some trauma to the bear because a cow can be hard to kill. If bear finds success in technique, then they might keep killing and become intolerable actors in cattle country. Surprisingly that did not happen very often in the CV, despite the large number of cows and grizzlies on our landscape in September and October. As grizzly bears are migrating out of YNP westward they don't encounter many cows until they reach the CV. In the Summer there are

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

As grizzly bears are migrating out of the westward they don't encounter many cows until they reach the CV. In the summer there are 12,000+ cows on our landscape. Thus, bears can learn to be predators of cows or learn to leave them alone. Increased Human presence on the landscape deters them, producers first, Range riders 2nd and then cows that are less vulnerable 3rd.

Wildlife services has informed us that successful grizzlies learn the technique of jumping on the hump of the cow, quickly grabbing the nose and biting to close the airway. In 2014, we had a big bear kill a 1300-pound Herford cow by this method on the wildlife Refuge. Cow was likely trying to protect her calf. Bear killed her within 20 yards of where attack first began. Clearly a bear that knew the technique. Take home on that one was we removed the carcass next morning. The herd stayed there for two more weeks. There were no more depredations that year. The bear didn't get to enjoy the cow for days and maybe was less interested in killing again that year. In 2015 we had some calves and yearlings dying of drowning and pneumonia. Bears were scavenging the carcasses. At first, we didn't know if they had been depredated by bears or scavenged. Had to work with Wildlife Service to determine. We did know there were too many carcasses to move them. Thus, we moved the herd. Had no depredations in that herd that year.

Typically, if a carcass of a cow is discovered, wildlife services is contacted ASAP so they may investigate to see if it was depredated or died of other cause. No matter the cause we ask, can we move this carcass, can we move the entire herd or does this bear need a call to MFWP. We moved the carcass on some occasions, moved a herd 4 times in 6 years and only once had to remove a bear. That bear was captured in our landscape but justification for removal was predation north of us in Gravelly mountains landscape.

Our trail cam work has approximated between 15-20 distinct grizzly bears in each of the last 3 years. More of those bears are on the Gravelly Mountains (North) side of the Valley than on the Centennial Mountains (South) side of the valley.

We found that our best metric for measuring success was unconfirmed losses. Unconfirmed are cows or calves that are no longer around when producer rounds up the herd to move back home. Losses appear down from 40/year to 5 for some producers. This information can be sensitive.

Heath Martinell is a humble person who may not have told you how important the Martinell family has been to developing the Range Rider program, so I will tell. Yvonne is Chair of the CVA board and she has been in that position throughout development of tactics to address predators. She deserves huge credit for her pragmatic, no nonsense leadership style as well as her willingness to accept help from groups that come to this issue thru the doorway of wildlife advocacy. Some of her neighbors have accused her of doing deals with the devil but she has just kept moving forward. The Martinells have also made modifications to their cattle moves. I think those changes helped reduce vulnerability of their calves. They have in the past moved their pairs to their highest and most remote grazing units by mid-August and brought them back to the valley to wean mid-October. Grizzly bear activity appears to peak in that high country in mid-September to mid-October. For past couple of years, they brought the pairs back down for calf weaning in mid-September rather than waiting until mid-October. I have no idea of the economic benefit or loss of such a move but I do know the month those calves are not up on their high county pasture helped reduce loss of calves and reduced the number of unconfirmed losses. The momma cows are put back up on the high country after weaning and they stay until mid-October. This move reduced vulnerability of those calves to loss by bear and wolf.

The Centennial is a connectivity area between recovery zones (Yellowstone and Bitterroot). Conflicts have been lowered. MFWP bear managers have not had to visit the valley in years. Wildlife Services has been the responders when a potential depredation is discovered.

Cattle and bears have benefited from the Range Rider program. The lead Rider provides a report for CVA and a for a public readership every 2 weeks during the season.

Take home bullets...

1. Producers and partners can build capacity within their community to deal with predators.
2. Community should organize and work together. Even if MFWP can't respond, there are things you can do. MFWP bear managers can help by phone. Wildlife Services is helpful for learning and for identification of depredation confirmation & reimbursement.
3. Range Riders are a great tool! They add a couple of days of eyeballs and husbandry per week to what cattle producers would normally do themselves.
4. Multiple producers joining together may be needed to raise enough funds to pay the Range Riders. There is economy to having

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

multiple adjacent herds in the program

5. There are husbandry tactics to make cattle less vulnerable to predation. Education on this topic for producers would help with conflict management.

Good luck with your assignment.

Thanks for the opportunity to provide some ideas.

Yours, //Bill West, Belgrade, MT

#63

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, January 15, 2020 6:39:29 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, January 15, 2020 6:41:41 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:11
IP Address: 174.208.10.89

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bill Mckinley

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Griz bear meeting Polson

Educate public

Educate bears

Break management into smaller zones

Promote hunting in areas where populations have reached biological sustainability

Make no zones and buffer zones

Day 2

Public acceptance will be helped by...

Clear defined management zones

Start discussions sooner then later in areas where bears are starting to show up-or will be expected to

Promote diverse working groups In management zones

Feel free to call for clarification.

Good work so far looking forward to the outcome of the process.

Bill McKinley
406-289-0432

#64

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, January 16, 2020 2:17:54 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, January 16, 2020 2:37:31 PM
Time Spent: 00:19:36
IP Address: 69.144.219.194

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Derek G

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hi Committee members, and thanks for a great meeting yesterday. I appreciate how engaged everyone is.

I just wanted to add an additional comment on the discussion about "getting permission" from local communities to accept living with bears. I think it's the wrong way to frame the issue. By definition of the fact that Montanans live in Montana, we have already accepted that we live in bear country, since most of the state is (and historically for thousands of years was) bear country. Bears don't "need permission" to migrate within the state, because they were here before we were. By choosing to live in Montana, we have essentially already "given permission" for bears.

I do think it's vitally important to do outreach in local communities, particularly those where grizzlies haven't been for decades, but a better place to start that conversation is by "reminding" them that we are in bear country, rather than "asking permission" for bears to be here. Some of this can very subtle and simple, such as posting "this is grizzly country" signs at trailheads, dumpsite, road-ends, etc, reminding people how to manage themselves and their attractants, in order to keep people and bears safe. Reminding folks that grizzly bears can really be anywhere in the state will make any future translocation conversations that much easier. Thanks again, Derek.

Derek Goldman, Northern Rockies Representative
Endangered Species Coalition
Missoula, MT 59802
(406) 721-3218
dgoldman@endangered.org

#65

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, January 17, 2020 7:40:31 PM
Last Modified: Friday, January 17, 2020 7:56:10 PM
Time Spent: 00:15:39
IP Address: 184.166.181.131

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lonnie Maiden

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Why should the management of grizzly bears be any different then the elk and deer or any other? There have been times when the deer in eastern Montana were so big in numbers they had to be harvested by selling extra tags over the counter. The grizzly need to be harvested as well. The big difference between big numbers of deer and big numbers of grizzly is you don't have to be worried that a deer is going to attack you around the bend and kill you. Obviously their numbers are such to cause all of this concern. Humans should be put first before the grizzly and some of the stories I've heard that doesn't seem to be the case. People have shot them in self defense and were harassed because they didn't use pepper spray instead. Do the right thing and get the numbers of grizzly down per area. Manage.

#66

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, January 22, 2020 1:58:52 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, January 22, 2020 2:05:44 PM
Time Spent: 00:06:51
IP Address: 67.222.247.1

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Joseph Flood

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

As a wilderness ranger for over 20 years, I witnessed the return of the grizzly from near extinction to the point of beginning to balance a thriving population. Critical to the Grizzlies future will be dynamic education programs. Habituated bears are headed for irreversible trouble and ultimately death. At this point due to the high mortality rate, I do not support a grizzly hunt. Again, please keep your community discussions going and make an investment into education. Sincerely, JP Flood

#67

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, January 22, 2020 2:05:49 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, January 22, 2020 2:05:52 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:02
IP Address: 67.222.247.1

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Joseph Flood

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

As a wilderness ranger for over 20 years, I witnessed the return of the grizzly from near extinction to the point of beginning to balance a thriving population. Critical to the Grizzlies future will be dynamic education programs. Habituated bears are headed for irreversible trouble and ultimately death. At this point due to the high mortality rate, I do not support a grizzly hunt. Again, please keep your community discussions going and make an investment into education. Sincerely, JP Flood

#68

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, January 22, 2020 10:47:35 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, January 22, 2020 10:50:11 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:36
IP Address: 66.223.255.142

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We need to manage them with a hunting season. The bears here is in the Swan Valley where I live are getting more aggressive. They don't seem to have any fear of man and that is dangerous.

#69

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, February 07, 2020 5:00:31 PM
Last Modified: Friday, February 07, 2020 5:09:41 PM
Time Spent: 00:09:09
IP Address: 72.174.169.194

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Paul Seastrand

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I know I speak for many knowledgeable hunters, ranchers, and recreationalists in urging the Council and FWP to enact hunting of the expanded and expanding numbers of grizzly bears. It is a paradox that hunting is a vital way of sustaining grizzly numbers while tolerating them. Alaska grizzly attacks and mortality are proportionately very low in relation to grizzly encounters, which is attributed to the conditioning that hunting and shooting have instilled in bears to avoid and flee humans. Hunting does not eliminate tragic encounters, but it does minimize them. Please institute hunting as an essential tool of management and coexistence.

#70

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, February 09, 2020 3:32:04 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, February 09, 2020 4:36:34 PM
Time Spent: 01:04:30
IP Address: 174.90.223.143

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Grant & Tamara MacKinnon

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We live in the furthest Westward home at the end of the road in the West Kootenai Community. The next closest home is full of young children, therefore, every decision your committee makes could directly impact our safety. We purchased this home because we love nature and it's everlasting beauty but we also understand it is deliberate and unforgiving. After the fire, a couple young grizzly hung around to clean up some of the animals that died and burned. Fresh grizzly tracks are still noted crossing our 40 acres. We are educated and knowledgeable of bear specie living in our little mountain and believe we've appropriately fenced our horses and dogs to protect from predation. We merely urge you to consider us and those in our community when you make recommendations that could change the behavior or travel patters of Montana's grizzly, most especially in regard to relocaton. We've lived, worked and recreated in bear country all our adult lives. We've studied predator behavior at great length for our personal awareness and safety. Historically, human/predator encounters go up exponentially when habituated predators are relocated. We can site numerous incidents that can track back to failed relocation efforts. Food sources are the number one driving force behind predators, they learn quickly and have good memories. We personally observed and documented one particular black bear sow hunt and raise her cubs over a 10 year period. She was very protective of her offspring. Every year she had a litter ranging from 3-5 cubs. Most of her cubs survived, expanding their hunting territory which encouraged them to travel into areas commonly used by humans once they eliminated the area's deer species. The destruction of many of her offspring were forced after relocation efforts failed. We have many clients that have shared similar stories of Rocky Mountain grizzlies where they live that are inappropriately managed (with man's best of intentions). We have a personal friend that still suffers from a grizzly attack and another friend's documented near miss. Our lives and the stock we own are few, but they are important to us. Thank you for your time and consideration.

#71

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, February 10, 2020 11:42:34 PM
Last Modified: Monday, February 10, 2020 11:51:48 PM
Time Spent: 00:09:13
IP Address: 75.166.195.173

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jennifer Hane

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am a former Montana resident with relatives in the Cascade County area; though I do not currently live in the state, I vacation there often.

It is my hope that this Council, in laying groundwork for future policy, will prioritize both the true recovery of the grizzly bear as a species, and respect for the lives and welfare of individual animals. To that end, I request that the decisions of the Council will:

- 1) Promote recolonization of the bears in suitable habitat across their historic range, and promote connectivity between local populations;
 - 2) Prioritize non-lethal methods of resolving conflicts between bears and people;
 - 3) Hold the restoration of native wildlife, specifically the grizzly bear, as more important than agricultural profits; and
 - 4) Avoid any establishment of a trophy hunting season (aka worthless blood sport) after the bears are federally delisted.
-

#72

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, February 13, 2020 4:43:31 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, February 13, 2020 4:50:58 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:26
IP Address: 69.144.238.56

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Renee Gabrian

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

My husband and his cousin ranch west of Red Lodge. We had several grizzly bears this past summer and fall including one in our barn yard. I love wildlife and realize their habitat is being encroached on. I also realize problem bears are getting dropped off and this is my fear for our livestock, pets, and my family as we maintain our ranch. Our cattle graze in forested areas and our fences run through these forests as well. I carry pepper spray when walking but I no longer feel safe. These bears have been in the town of Red Lodge. It is time for a different type of management. Thank you for time. Renee Gabrian

#73

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, February 13, 2020 11:48:27 PM
Last Modified: Friday, February 14, 2020 12:04:45 AM
Time Spent: 00:16:17
IP Address: 184.166.88.153

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Megan Johnson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

My name is Megan Johnson and I am a journalism student at the University of Montana, currently in a conservation journalism class. We are working on conservation stories based out of Montana. The project I am working on is a photography portrait and interview series about human/grizzly bear conflicts on the Rocky Mountain Front. I am reaching out to you to see if any members on the Grizzly Bear Advisory Board would have time to be interviewed or know sources that would like to be interviewed about grizzly bear conflict on the Rocky Mountain Front. Please let me know if any of you would have any interest and/or time in talking. Thank for you time.

Megan Johnson
406-899-8870
mleighj88@gmail.com
megan.johnson@umconnect.umt.edu

#74

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, February 17, 2020 2:04:35 PM
Last Modified: Monday, February 17, 2020 2:30:57 PM
Time Spent: 00:26:21
IP Address: 71.15.197.197

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

George Thompson, Bozeman

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzly Bears:

It defies logic to allow increased areas for grizzlies to roam into towns like Choteau, or into ranch lands. Grizzlies are known killers, their migration into more populated areas, ranches has no upside.

As a hiker who had enjoyed long solitary backpacking into the mountains I find myself avoiding areas due to increased grizzly encounters.

More specifically, it is only a matter of time until the grizzlies are occupying the Hyalite range which is already crowded with Bozeman residents who now face restricted access due to environmentalists lawsuits closing human accessible areas via mountain bikes and e-bikes, motorized travel.

Responsible human activities should take priority over increased grizzly habitat.

If people think grizzlies aren't a problem, I suggest they go hang out in ghettos of a large city and see if fear inhibits their enjoyment of the city. Grizzlies impact our ability to enjoy the wonders of nature, if we feel threatened, fearful of assault by known killers.

Grizzlies are no longer an endangered species.

Please increase the Montana hunting areas and containment of Grizzlies to Yellowstone Park.

In areas of frequent grizzly sighting, warning signage should include the need to carry BOTH bear spray and large caliber guns.

Just say NO to more grizzlies.

Thank you,

George Thompson

Bozeman, MT

#75

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, February 17, 2020 7:15:15 PM
Last Modified: Monday, February 17, 2020 7:25:09 PM
Time Spent: 00:09:54
IP Address: 76.75.10.226

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Ann Halverson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I could comment on all of the basic things that humans need to be reminded of when they are in Grizzly Bear Habitat, but that would be a waste of your time because you already know that most humans need to be educated on how to act around bears. What I want to stress to you is that the Grizzly Bear population has not recovered enough to have a hunting season. There are some very famous bears that have world wide following on the internet and some ignorant would be hunters though that targeting those famous bears would be a good idea. Forget a hunting season on Grizzlies it would be a slaughter. Also, humans seem to believe that we have the right to annihilate a species (wolves, grizzlies) I don't believe we have this right and indeed, such a slaughter would be a death knell for our own survival. I am in favor of your council fully supporting protection of Grizzly Bears in Montana.

Thank you for your time,
Ann Halverson

#76

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 12:51:27 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 12:54:45 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:17
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Desiree Cygan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...I am a human being aware of threats to species other than humans. As we have the biggest negative impact on the planet, it is our duty to protect any species that we negatively impact. These are the consequences of our actions.

#77

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 12:57:29 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:04:46 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:17
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Barbara Redner

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am so disgusted with the way we dispose of things willy nilly, Is there no humanity? What happens when we have to explain the absence of our grizzlies to our future generations? Please, let us give them their rightful space. Nothing more to be said.

#78

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:04:50 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:08:58 PM
Time Spent: 00:04:08
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Diane Carter

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Its about diversity more than economics. We have lost 1/3 of our birds on this planet and 200+species a day are gone because the balance of life is OFF. The grizzly is one of the most amazing creatures that balance many ecosystems, we don't want to see it go forever!! Montana IS THE LAST BEST place lets not become like the rest of the world. We are also the crown of the continent for the worlds water supply and this too must be addressed, the more we take upstream the less the 3 downstream tributaries have. Please stop us from displacing all wildlife, we must keep area's open for wildlife only as well as co-existence. It's not the wildlife at fault when a negative encounter happens why does the wildlife suffer the consequence? The Grizzly, Black and Brown Bears always get the blame and are hunted down for punishment. Please step back and look at the Big Picture for future generations. Thank you, Diane

#79

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:09:03 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:12:21 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:18
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jacob Tutty

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzly bears are an extremely crucial part of our natural habitats overall functioning, they stimulate and help manage many aspects of the biodiversity that exists within our environment naturally. It is imperative that with grizzly populations rising, we maintain our developments, vehicular traffic systems, and especially residential and agricultural establishments, in ways that promote proper necessary travel of these bears and at the same time significantly limit the amount of human-to-bear interaction as aggression is in their nature when in defense.

#80

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:12:25 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:14:35 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:10
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lisa Sukut

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because bears are an integral part of our landscape. Grizzlies are facing increasing threats due to habitat loss. As good stewards of the land, we must make protecting grizzlies our priority.

#81

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:33:21 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:37:12 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:51
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Marc Peruzzi

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because as a Montanan and University of Montana graduate, I've worked in the outdoor industry for my entire adult life. Grizzlies set Montana apart from other western states. They reflect the wild and untrammelled ideals of the place. Losing grizzlies would turn Montana into the Colorado Front Range. Scenic but inauthentic. Please do everything you can to protect our heritage and the recreation economy.

#82

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:45:42 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:47:50 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:07
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Mary Leonard

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because they are a vital part of the ecosystem. Humans have the ability to shape the world around us, and with that ability comes the responsibility to care for and honour our physical environment. History (and current events) has sent a clear message that if we disregard this responsibility, it can create irreversible damage to our home. It is time humans move from a position of self-serving exploitation of our natural world to a positive of guardianship and co-existence. Let's set this standard with grizzlies.

#83

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:47:53 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:51:08 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:15
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Margarita Mclarty

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The grizzly is vital part of a healthy ecosystem. We need to establish a strong, diverse and interconnected population throughout our state to ensure their survival. I spent my working years guiding tourists on backcountry hikes in Yellowstone .Our future is entwined with our responsibility to encourage a robust wildlife population.

#84

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:51:11 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:52:50 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:38
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

William Nordholm

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because I have never even seen one in the wild. I would like there sparse habitat expanded and protected in perpetuity.

#85

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:56:02 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:57:53 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:51
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Faune Cavins

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because... They are a part of our American Heritage. We don't want to end up like Europe killing off their wild animals and losing touch with the wild and natural world. We have already decimated much of their habitat and population, it is time to preserve and respect these animals.

#86

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 1:58:24 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:00:15 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:51
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kathe Randle

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am a native Montanan and 4th generation cattle rancher. I learned techniques for avoiding predator conflicts at a young age. We have lost cattle to trains, trucks and sisters but not to bears! Grizzled are a part of my heritage, too

#87

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:00:53 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:02:08 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:15
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Scott Davidson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...He's a symbol of strength and persistence and the mascot of our state college. The world will remember Montana as either the state that helped preserve one of the most iconic predators of North America, or forget us for being the state that destroyed them.

#88

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:02:12 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:04:01 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:48
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Ronnie Peltier

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because we need every bit of our wildlife. Tourism adds to a healthy Montana. The grizzly bear is part of this. We need to keep our National Parks free of mining and for our animals...

#89

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:04:06 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:05:58 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:51
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kris Ellingsen

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Humans create the problems that get grizzlies get the blame for. Unless wounded or otherwise threatened, grizzlies show remarkable restraint in using their formidable strength. Let's learn to live with them and to honor their place on the landscape. They were here before we were. Residents in wildlife country need to learn basic biological facts, body language essentials, and cultivate compassion for our mammalian relatives and all other life forms.

#90

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:06:01 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:07:36 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:35
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Russ Thayer

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...we need to protect these magnificent creatures, they deserve a place in our environment, future generations should inherit a planet as beautiful and biologically diverse as we did.

#91

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:08:24 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:08:53 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:29
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Patricia Weber

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because this species belongs in the ecosystem and they and their habitat needs to be protected.

#92

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:09:36 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:11:17 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:41
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Norman Bishop

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because recovery of the great bear requires conservation of habitat, which is the secret for conserving biodiversity in general. At a time when a million species are at risk, this is a step in the right direction.

#93

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:11:22 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:12:35 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:13
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Candy Watzek

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because they are essential to a healthy ecosystem

#94

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:12:41 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 2:14:28 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:46
IP Address: 168.149.244.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kirsten Renander

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzly recovery in Montana is crucial as the last continuous link to Canadian populations. Delisting them at this point leaves them wide open to population decline due to increased wildland development, skyrocketing recreational use and environmental stress due to climate change. It's such a shortsighted decision to delist. I implore you to keep Grizzlies protected as an Endangered species.

#95

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 6:39:58 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 18, 2020 6:49:39 PM
Time Spent: 00:09:41
IP Address: 107.191.166.60

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Evergreen Motel

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We would like to invite the GBAC to stay at the Evergreen Motel during your meeting in Libby, Montana! We offer fully renovated, comfortable rooms. We look forward to accommodating the GBAC! Please reserve online or call 406-293-4178

<https://www.booking.com/hotel/us/evergreen-motel-libby.html?>

Thank you!!

Matthew and David
Owners
www.evergreenlibby.com

#96

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 19, 2020 8:37:24 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 19, 2020 8:52:00 AM
Time Spent: 00:14:35
IP Address: 131.93.150.169

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Sandy Monville

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear council...i wanyed to submit my comments as the Grizzly bears are very important to me and my family. We want to see them on the landscape living free as they should be without fear of being killed. We travel from Michigan every year to view Grizzlies and it brings us such joy to be able to see them in their natural environment, flourishing and raising families. They belong....they should not be hunted!!! We must learn ways to co exist with bears and it is possible. Our family spends 2 weeks a year in the area and we spend a ton of money with local businesses. We do not accept or will ever understand a hunt for the grizzly. Why bring them back from the brink to just hunt them again? Makes no sense. Please help save the Grizzly!!

#97

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, February 21, 2020 9:44:30 AM
Last Modified: Friday, February 21, 2020 9:52:49 AM
Time Spent: 00:08:18
IP Address: 97.117.78.65

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Joan Turpin

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am concerned about the possible outcomes for the grizzly bears of Montana. I have always thought that Montana was virtually the last bastion for grizzlies, a place where they could be safe and roam the vast spaces they prefer. I also think of Montana not as just a great place to fish, camp and see the beauty of nature, but as a place to see wildlife unmolested by humans, elk herds, free roaming bears and bighorn sheep and if your really lucky you might even see a real wolf. I would hate to see this change and would in fact look for another place to vacation, Canada perhaps. I think grizzlies are a Montana icon, the one place you think you might have a chance to see one! Please, wildlife and bears in particular right now are under tremendous pressure with habitat loss, climate changes and the horrific carnage of trophy hunters. If we don't protect them then we will surely lose them and you cannot undo that. Stand up for your wildlife, you could be the only place left with wildlife if things continue on as they are and there will be more economic benefit in that than anything else you offer. Please, fight for your bears, not against them.

#98

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, February 22, 2020 12:23:30 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, February 22, 2020 12:24:05 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:34
IP Address: 174.45.104.95

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jed Weingarten

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

To the Governor's Grizzly Advisory Council,

Grizzly bears are part of the fabric that makes Montana unique, and they play a vital role in our ecosystems as well as our economy. Millions of visitors come to Yellowstone and Glacier National Park and surrounding areas to experience the incredible scenery and the iconic wildlife that exist only in these places. Visitor polling in Yellowstone consistently places wildlife viewing in the top three reasons people visit the park. In 2018, national park visitors to Greater Yellowstone and Glacier contributed 1.5 billion dollars to the local economy supporting approximately 1.1 billion in additional economic activity. Montana's grizzlies are foundational to our livelihoods. We have built our businesses around showing people Montana's iconic wildlife and photographing the unique wildlife of the state. Without a healthy grizzly population our businesses would suffer, and so would Montana's rapidly growing tourism/recreation economy.

A healthy grizzly population in and around the parks has a direct positive impact on our livelihoods as business owners, guides, wildlife watching tour operators, and wildlife photographers. There are over 50 wildlife tour operators in Greater Yellowstone alone. We employ local guides who take thousands of people on trips every year. Seeing a grizzly bear is often the trip highlight as one visitor put it, "I went to see wolves and found myself awestruck

and by the bears and that amazing coyote too. To see these animals in their home and thriving

was such a joy." Even individual bears can have a positive impact on business as people travel and spend money to see specific animals. Additionally, grizzlies indirectly contribute to Montana's economy in the form of providing important ecosystem services. An example would be grizzlies' appetite for huckleberries. An individual bear can eat thousands of huckleberries a day, in doing so they distribute the seeds across the landscape, creating new berry patches and reseeding the old. Huckleberries alone are responsible for an estimated one million dollars in revenue for Montana. Grizzlies play a vital role in the overall health of the environment which in turn fuels our recreation economy.

We recognize that living with grizzlies does have a cost; conflict mitigation and compensation for depredations takes time, money, and resources to address. However, grizzlies are essential to Montana's wildness and bring tremendous benefit to Montana's economy and our businesses. They are a critical part of how we make a living and we need thriving, healthy populations of bears to be part of our future.

We are deeply concerned by the increasing number of grizzly mortalities across the state. Without an increase in resources for conflict prevention these numbers will be exacerbated by climate change and a growing human population. Grizzlies' presence on the landscape is not a guarantee and could easily reach a tipping point, sliding toward extinction..

This council has an opportunity to prioritize coexistence and connectivity management solutions, and in the process protect our way of life. We hope that this council recognizes the economic and intrinsic value of the grizzly bear. Four of the six federally-designated grizzly bear recovery areas are wholly or partially in Montana; as such, the state plays a huge role in their full recovery. A healthy grizzly population is genetically and demographically connected. It also requires strong investment in conflict prevention and coexistence strategies in cities, towns, and frontline communities. Montana's recreation economy is only projected to grow; this council has the opportunity and responsibility to make recommendations which protect the grizzly and recognize it as an important economic asset to the state.

Thank you for your consideration,

Jed Weingarten

Jed Weingarten
Jed Weingarten Photography
Insta: @jedweingarten
www.jedweingarten.com

#99

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, February 23, 2020 8:51:23 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, February 23, 2020 8:51:57 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:34
IP Address: 67.182.202.179

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kelly Bradbury

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am writing to advocate for the increased usage of proactive, non-lethal management approaches and public education for Grizzly-Human interactions. Please also support adding the Bitterroot an Crazy mountain ranges as reintroduction zones. We have recently purchased several acres near Conner, MT and while I really don't want to have an interaction with a Grizzly Bear, I also realize how valuable they are to the health of our landscape and all species. Being educated is key to having safe interactions and the avoidance of killing Grizzly's as a result of human contact. It is time we consider what we can do as humans to pay back the extensive damage we have done to both land and wildlife and realize this creates healthy ecosystems that we depend on for our survival.
Thank you!Kelly

#100

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, February 24, 2020 10:27:02 AM
Last Modified: Monday, February 24, 2020 11:33:46 AM
Time Spent: 01:06:44
IP Address: 192.161.70.63

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Christopher Thomas Hoff

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzly bears are part of the fabric that makes Montana unique, and they play a vital role in our ecosystems as well as our economy. Millions of visitors come to Yellowstone and Glacier National Park and surrounding areas to experience the incredible scenery and the iconic wildlife that exist only in these places. Visitor polling in Yellowstone consistently places wildlife viewing in the top three reasons people visit the Park. In 2018, national park visitors to Greater Yellowstone and Glacier contributed 1.5 billion dollars to the local economy supporting approximately 1.1 billion in additional economic activity. Montana's grizzlies are foundational to our livelihoods. We have built our businesses around showing people Montana's iconic wildlife and photographing the unique wildlife of the state. Without a healthy grizzly population our businesses would suffer and so would Montana's rapidly growing tourism/recreation economy. A healthy grizzly population in and around the parks has a direct positive impact on our livelihoods as wildlife watching tour operators and wildlife photographers. There are over 50 wildlife tour operators in Greater Yellowstone alone. We employ local guides who take thousands of people on trips every year. Seeing a grizzly bear is often the trip highlight as one visitor put it, "I went to see wolves and found myself awestruck and by the bears and that amazing coyote too".

"To see these animals in their home and thriving was such a joy." Even individual bears can have a positive impact on business as people travel and spend money to see specific animals. Additionally grizzlies indirectly contribute to Montana's economy in the form of providing important ecosystem services. An example would be grizzlies appetite for huckleberries. An individual bear can eat thousands of huckleberries a day, in doing so they distribute the seeds across the landscape, creating new berry patches and reseeding the old. Huckleberries alone are responsible for an estimated one million dollars in revenue for Montana.

Grizzlies play a vital role in the overall health of the environment with in turns fuels our recreation economy.

We recognize that living with grizzlies does have a cost; conflict mitigation and compensation for depredations takes time, money, and resources to address. However grizzlies are essential to Montana's wildness and bring tremendous benefit to Montana's economy and our businesses. They are a critical part of how we make a living and we need thriving, healthy populations of bears to be part of our future.

We are deeply concerned by the increasing number of grizzly mortalities across the state. Without an increase in resources for conflict prevention these numbers will be exacerbated by climate change and a growing human population. Grizzlies presence on the landscape is not a guarantee and could easily reach a tipping point, sliding toward extinction.

This council has a opportunity to prioritize coexistence and connectivity management solutions, and in the process protect our way of life. We hope that this council recognizes the ecumenic and intrinsic value of the grizzly bear. Four of the six federally designated grizzly bear recovery areas are wholly or partially in Montana; as such, the state plays a huge role in their full recovery. A healthy grizzly population is genetically and demographically connected. It also requires strong investment in conflict prevention and coexistence strategies in cites, towns, and frontline communities. Montana's recreation economy is only projected to grow; this council has the opportunity and responsibility to make recommendations which protect the grizzly and recognize it as an important economic asset to the state.

Thank you for your consideration.

Christopher Thomas Hoff

5th generation Montanan.

Photographer and owner of two Montana Galleries.

#101

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, February 24, 2020 2:18:30 PM
Last Modified: Monday, February 24, 2020 2:18:58 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:28
IP Address: 47.37.37.78

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Montana Governor's Grizzly Bear Council,

Montanans do not like being told what to do, especially when it comes to managing our land. Currently, the Pacific Northwest Trail (PNT), the legislative work of a hiking group from Washington state, cuts directly through a very vulnerable ecosystem in the Yaak Valley. Most of the public didn't even know the trail existed until after the legislation because there were no public meetings or advertisements. Worse, this route will actually work against the protection of a very endangered group of grizzly bears in the Yaak. Which poses the question—Is this short section of the PNT, which has viable re-routing options, worth further endangering this already struggling grizzly population? The Yaak grizzlies number somewhere between 19 and 25 bears, with only a few breeding females remaining. There's nothing left to give.

Every human deserves the opportunity to experience the outdoors and to recreate in areas relatively untouched by mankind, but bears deserve the opportunity to exist in this world, too. To allow for both of these to happen, we need to re-route this section of the PNT. There has been a detour proposed to the south, one which would provide an equal, or greater experience, to the PNT hiker, would benefit local businesses, and would allow the Yaak Valley grizzly bears an opportunity to recover. The proposed detour offers excellent scenery along the Kootenai River, as well as resupply opportunities in Libby and Troy.

As you all meet on 26th and 27th in Libby, I hope you take this serious and local issue into concern.

If the PNT is re-routed, hikers get to enjoy nature, businesses will likely benefit, and bears get to be bears.

Sincerely,

Andy Connelly
105 Colorado Avenue
Whitefish, MT 59937
406-579-7715

#102

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, February 21, 2020 5:54:24 PM
Last Modified: Monday, February 24, 2020 2:29:00 PM
Time Spent: Over a day
IP Address: 184.166.49.229

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Matt Holloway

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Governor's Grizzly Bear Council,

As you prepare to meet in Libby this week, I urge you to give special time and consideration to the problem with the existing route of the Pacific Northwest Trail through Yaak.

It makes no sense to advertise and promote a designated, national trail through core habitat of the most endangered population of grizzly bears in our state--the Yaak grizzlies. There are maybe 20-25 grizzlies in Yaak, with maybe 3-5 breeding females. Any bad year of mortalities could collapse such a population.

There is a proposed southern route that goes through Libby and Troy and avoids these core grizzly bear zones in Yaak.

An official re-route would require an act of Congress, but our Montana delegation is very aware of the issue.

Please help those last few grizzlies in Yaak. Help re-route the Pacific Northwest Trail out of the core grizzly recovery zones in Yaak and down through Libby and Troy.

Unless this happens, bear displacement and bear-hiker conflicts are possible in those core zones. This seems counter in aim and procedure to the overall goal of such recovery zones.

Thanks very much for your time and attention.

Best,

Matt Holloway

836 10th Street West

Columbia Falls, MT 59912

406-270-7429

#103

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, February 24, 2020 2:18:27 PM
Last Modified: Monday, February 24, 2020 2:29:42 PM
Time Spent: 00:11:14
IP Address: 56.0.84.25

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bo Sparks

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I think, as many others I have spoken with, that this is a relatively simple solution. If, and I mean if, you can get the liberals that hold key offices and environmental activists to see the light.

I am often confused as to how the grizzly bear is an endangered species and protected, then (FWP) deems a grizzly a "Problem Bear" and in some cases, kill the animal. Thought they were protected? Having said that:

- 1) Delist grizzly bears off the (ESL)
- 2) Set a hunting season for the grizzly bears
- 3) Have a draw on the bears. If the hunter draws and is successful, he may never draw again. If unsuccessful, the hunter must wait a calendar year before re-submitting.
- 4) Establish a price for the draw. recommend (\$100)
- 5) Place hunters on a call list. If there is a "Problem Bear" (FWP) will call the first hunter on the list and have the opportunity to kill the bear. And so on down the line

A hunting season will make bears weary of humans. And able to keep the population in check. Or do we want them walking down the street?

#104

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, February 24, 2020 9:35:25 PM
Last Modified: Monday, February 24, 2020 9:43:04 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:38
IP Address: 216.14.233.84

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Rob Rich

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Rob Rich
Condon, MT
rlrich3@gmail.com

To The Members of the Grizzly Bear Advisory Council (GBAC),

Thank you very much for your service on this supremely important council, and for welcoming public comment to inform your recommendations to Governor Bullock. I respect the time, resources, and collaborative ethic that each of you has put forth to make this bold, unique, and innovative effort possible. Your devotion towards assuring a promising future for the grizzly makes me proud to be a Montanan.

I have aimed to share comments that speak to the formative clauses, objectives, and topics as outlined in described in Executive Order that developed the GBAC. Please do not hesitate to contact me at rlrich3@gmail.com if you would like further clarification for any comment I have made. My comments do not reflect the views of my employer, colleagues, or fellow citizens in Condon.

- To start with the broadest possible comment, I do not endorse the delisting of the grizzly bear at this time, or in the foreseeable future. I am aware of the fact that it is not the GBAC's role to decide on delisting, but since this issue is tied to your funding, connectivity, and coexistence questions, I would like to see the Governor reminded that delisting is premature at this time. Grizzly populations are increasing in number and expanding in range, but they are not doing so in ways that warrant complete and convincing recovery. To achieve full recovery according to the letter and spirit of the Endangered Species Act (ESA), it is essential to consider items the GBAC is charged with exploring, especially: habitat connectivity between ecosystems, and a healthy, sustainable population of bears (with genetic diversity for long-term viability). Given that: 1) we have not physically confirmed consistent exchange of bears between recovery zones; 2) several recovery zones remain deficient in viable numbers of bears; 3) increasing numbers of bears have been dying annually from anthropogenic causes, the grizzly is not ready to be managed without the highest protections that the ESA affords.

- What I most respect about the GBAC is the way it is considering effects beyond the existing recovery zones, in the implicit knowledge that the entirety of Montana (and much more of the West beyond the recovery zones) was significant in the grizzly's historic range prior to the Homesteading Era. As we ask questions and focus research around grizzly bear distribution, I think it is just as important to account for the quality of habitat in these new-old landscapes as it is to quantify numbers of bears. I am particularly interested in research that nuances what is actually driving grizzly expansion: Is it habitat saturation, as is commonly assumed, or do climate change and diminishing food resources play a role too? Or, are grizzlies being lured to expand in sub-optimal habitats because they are increasingly becoming habituated to easier foods in anthropogenic landscapes? The science on these issues matters, and I encourage GBAC to fully consult expertise such as the ongoing research of Dr. Tabitha Graves (USGS, Northern Rockies Office), the work below from Dr. Clayton Lamb, and others.

Prevey, J, Parker L, Harrington C, Lamb CT, Proctor M. 2020. Climate change shifts in habitat suitability and phenology of huckleberry (*Vaccinium membranaceum*). Agriculture and Forest Meteorology.

Lamb, C.T., Mowat, G., Reid, A., Smit, L., Proctor, M., McLellan, B.M., Nielsen, S.E., Boutin, S. 2018. The effect of habitat quality and access management on the density of a recovering grizzly bear population. Journal of Applied Ecology.

- Connectivity between ecosystems should require maintained and enhanced communication between states and nations; not only with other recovery areas Idaho, Wyoming, and Washington, but also into Canada and with the sovereign tribal nations within the grizzly's current and former range. Functional and durable connectivity cannot occur without this constructive, transparent dialogue among all stakeholders, and this is the only way we will achieve long-term genetic integrity. We need more science in those crucial linkage zones showing how bears are expanding, and where/why their journeys are being denied if we hope to make informed, enduring progress on connecting isolated populations. I would also urge the council to carefully examine Vital Ground's approach to conservation easements, which could benefit habitat connectivity and mitigate threats associated with human development. And it is also worth remembering that nothing about the "biologically suitable and socially acceptable" mantra is static: landscapes can be restored or conserved, and minds and hearts can be changed. Connectivity for grizzlies and other wildlife can grow

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

and hearts can be changed. Connectivity for grizzlies and other wildlife can grow.

- I cannot speak with experience to the conflicts being faced elsewhere in the state, but as a resident of the Swan Valley – a mosaic of wild and working landscapes that is familiar with grizzlies – I am confident that coexistence requires preventative, preemptive action. Transplanting and euthanasia are reactive and unsustainable in the long term. But electric fences, bear-resistant garbage cans/containers, and education are all tools that my community has successfully used in a mostly-forested landscape with landowners who own ~100 acres or less. There are certainly attractants where I live, and we've certainly made mistakes, but we're learning how to solve conflicts by preventing them in the first place. I encourage you to fully internalize the impact of Swan Valley Bear Resources, a public-private partnership established in 2007 to help prevent, reduce, and manage conflicts at the community level. This is one potentially transferrable model for rural and suburban communities like those found throughout Western Montana.
<https://www.swanvalleyconnections.org/swan-valley-bear-resources>

While I am most familiar with Swan Valley Bear Resources, there are many other collaborative and ad hoc groups making promising efforts for bear coexistence including but not limited to: fruit exchanges, electric fencing, trash/attractant reduction, education/outreach (in myriad forms), and a whole lot more. I would like to see emphasis from the Governor that incentivizes and funds the most successful and urgent contributions of these groups. To do that, I might suggest a focused, comprehensive inventory and assessment of existing groups, which I think would be a valuable means to help managers identify the diversity of options and means of operating for bear coexistence partnerships. What is working well? What could be done better? Where are the gaps in funding or human capacity? Where could efforts be given more autonomy, and where could efforts be more unified? An inventory that asks such questions might reveal opportunities for the Governor to create a new grant sources that are accurately tiered to actual needs, or perhaps an equitable method of dispersing funds from a pool collected for this purpose. It is really too early to predict that outcome, but helping these groups to be individually effective locally AND united in a supportive, statewide network that advances bear recovery goals will go a long way.

- Even if the grizzly was delisted, hunting should not have a role as a “management” option for grizzlies. I acknowledge that my stance against grizzly hunting is largely a moral one, but I also do not believe that it is logistically tenable or ecologically feasible, especially if can't come to terms with the increasing numbers of bears dying from human causes. While the North American Model of Wildlife Conservation does assure that funding from licenses for hunted species can advance their conversation, the grizzly is a prime chance for us to be bold and innovative in the development of other ways to fund wildlife conservation in an era when numbers of hunters are declining. The grizzly is an iconic species with many keystone impacts, and I'd like to believe this can advance its likelihood of earning funding beyond hunting. The following alternatives may not be immediately popular, but in the long term they could draw from root grizzly conservation issues and incentivize paradigm shifts for grizzly coexistence: 1) An increase in permitting fees for commercial harvest or fees for the sale of huckleberries, given that they are a crucial bear food; 2) An increase in fees for recreational, oil/gas extraction, and grazing permits on public lands, all of which have potentially problematic impacts to grizzly habitat.; 3) A direct fee increase at campsites to support the installation of coexistence and education measures for that particular site.

These are the comments I have for now, but I am sure more thoughts will come to me as this issue evolves, and I look forward to staying engaged in that conversation. Thank you again for welcoming public comment, and for your service to grizzly bears and the state of Montana.

Best,

Rob Rich

#105

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 9:39:04 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 9:40:56 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:51
IP Address: 69.146.125.63

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Mike Powers

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Thank you for looking into this issue. I feel that the hiking trail should be re-routed in order to help protect the grizzly bear habitat. This is another example of doing what is best for people or doing what is best for the grizzly bear. I feel we should do what is best for the grizzly bear by changing the route of the hiking trail. I am in favor of the hiking trail and think it is a great idea, just move it a little south. Thank you.

#106

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 11:18:03 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 11:37:32 AM
Time Spent: 00:19:28
IP Address: 184.166.56.117

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Laura Strong

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Grizzly Bear Advisory Council,

I am writing to encourage you to ensure our grizzly population in the Cabinet- Yaak ecosystem has a chance to survive and thrive by continuing strong protections for this small population of bears. If we enable this bear population to continue to grow they will have the chance to intermingle and breed with grizzly populations in Canada and the Selkirk range, which could make them stronger and more viable a population. Montana is our last chance to get this right and protect our last grizzly populations in the lower 48 states. Grizzly bears are a great draw to Montana tourists. They are also a good indicator species for the health of our wilderness areas and National Forests.

When I was in my twenties (way back in the 70s) I worked for the Forest Service out of Libby and did lots of hiking and camping in the Cabinets and up the Yaak. I loved how wild and free the country was. I also loved that there were grizzlies along with wolverines and other rare predators here. We must do all we can to protect the grizzly bears we have left in Montana and ensure these populations will be here for our children and grandchildren.

Thank you for taking my comments.

Sincerely,

Laura Strong

Columbia Falls, MT

#107

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 6:18:42 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 6:20:21 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:39
IP Address: 73.126.26.148

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Michael DeAngelis

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please protect these bears from cruel hunting

#108

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 6:20:31 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 6:21:08 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:36
IP Address: 73.126.26.148

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

wolfgang burger

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

this cruelty to our wild animals has to stop!

#109

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 6:21:17 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 6:22:36 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:18
IP Address: 73.126.26.148

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

nancy burger

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

unbelievable cruelty has gone on with these poor creatures it has to stop!

#110

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 8:33:51 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 8:35:51 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:59
IP Address: 71.208.118.33

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

More trails and human involvement in grizzly habitat is a bad idea all the way around. Would you want a track built through your home? Is there any space left for animals to live freely without humans?? Leave them alone in peace. We do not need more trails.

#111

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 9:40:20 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, February 25, 2020 9:42:27 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:07
IP Address: 72.174.131.187

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kathy Heffernan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am a hiker and I love trails. BUT I feel that the grizzly bear habitat should trump trail plans. Do not take this trail right through prime grizzly bear habitat.

#112

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 3:43:38 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 3:43:57 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:19
IP Address: 84.82.205.207

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Anna Brewer

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

let the council and the Governor hear our concerns and input about the Pacific Northwest Trail and it's impacts on grizzly bear recovery. Please do what's best for hiker's, bears, and for Montana. And collaborate with organizations who are specialists in bear recovery! Congress designated the Pacific Northwest Trail in 2009, they also mandated that the Forest Fervice produce a management plan within two years in order to determine the carrying capacity of the trail, and to include public oversight. None of this has happened. The last 25 grizzlies—the rarest grizzly subpopulation in Montana, among the rarest in North America have to be protected from tourists, hikers, hunters, illegal activities!

#113

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 9:13:15 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 9:14:14 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:58
IP Address: 68.96.229.189

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

the grizzlies need to be protected

#114

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 9:16:47 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 9:18:54 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:07
IP Address: 24.23.236.70

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Deanna Horton

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We need to protect our Grizzly bears. Hunters are killing too many - just to kill. They need protection to ensure they survive this ugly human race.

#115

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 9:19:02 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 9:20:06 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:03
IP Address: 24.23.236.70

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

dan horton

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please protect our grizzly bears. These beautiful animals do not deserve to be gunned down and killed just for sport.

#116

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 10:57:52 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 11:01:29 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:36
IP Address: 85.74.190.199

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Cristina Economides

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Sir/Madam, please consider being ethical to the wild life. Grizzly Bear it's a part of our eco-system, and it's worthwhile preventing its total destruction. thanks. Cristina E. Zois, Greek Ambassador's wife

#117

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 1:18:32 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 1:22:15 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:42
IP Address: 73.94.204.203

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tara Morrison

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I strongly urge you to consider the many reasons that a southern re-route for the PNT is absolutely necessary. The current route goes through too much core grizzly habitat. The southern re-route would be better for grizzlies as well as for the local economies in Libby and Troy, as well as better for hikers being able to resupply, having fewer road miles, more highpoint. The southern re-route is FAR better for the Yaak's few remaining grizzlies. Please help them by backing the southern re-route.

#118

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 1:50:32 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 1:53:10 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:38
IP Address: 217.215.143.203

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The Yaak Grizzly Bear population is threatened by the current location of the Pacific Northwest Trail. I strongly urge consideration of a southern re-route to bypass this critical Grizzly habitat and limit potential for human-bear interactions.

#119

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 1:13:57 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 4:00:58 PM
Time Spent: 02:47:01
IP Address: 162.207.212.240

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Rick Bass

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Welcome to Libby and thank you for all of the work y'all are putting in on this issue. Our grizzly subpopulation in the Yaak Valley, as you may already know, is genetically isolated from all other subpopulations, including even the nearby Cabinet Mountains. The most vital habitat for species recovery is summer/fall habitat for females-with-young--generally overlaps with Priority One designated core habitat. The high-volume thru-hiker Pacific Northwest Trail was legislated without input from Montana stakeholders and in the map that was given to Congress for that authorization (which the USFS had opposed for 32 years, due to cost and effects on Yaak grizzlies), more than 26 miles of highest-quality designated core habitat is bisected, with negative consequences for bears, hikers, while failing almost completely to offer any support for Lincoln County's attempts at diversifying its economy. As well, the USFS is ten years out of compliance, having failed to produce the requisite Comprehensive Management Plan that Congress mandated be completed within two years of the enabling legislation. As such, it is premature and inappropriate to be advertising the out-of-compliance thru-trail, which is already having the unintended consequences of curtailing vegetative management proposals atop the trail, and the imminence of limiting local access and requiring currently-open roads in the area to be closed in order to stay below the 200-parties-per year quota, at which point the trail becomes classified as an open road. I urge the council to examine closely the unintended consequences of concentrated and high-volume recreation in sensitive habitat and to offer support for alternatives that avoid the most critical grizzly habitat, as we seek to recover this mist endangered of Montana's grizzly subpopulations. I urge the council to recommend a legislative correction to the current train wreck that is an unmanaged and unplanned Pacific Northwest Trail. Thank you.

#120

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 6:56:22 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, February 26, 2020 7:16:43 PM
Time Spent: 00:20:20
IP Address: 73.189.161.128

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Darren Eastman

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

My feedback falls into two areas regarding grizzly delisting from the ESA. First, the vital impact of California reintroduction and the biological issues. Secondly, the due process, treaty and religious freedom violations posed to all Native Americans by delisting is explained.

I. Montana's Endangered Grizzlies Vital for California Reintroduction

No brown bears have existed in California since the last was shot in Tulare County, in 1922. The last brown bear identified in California occurred in Sequoia National Park in 1924—despite being featured on California's flag, since its 1953 state animal designation. The U.S.' largest omnivore thrived in the valleys and lower mountains of California in what's thought to be the largest numbers anywhere—until eradication in 1922.

Despite numerous conservation attempts, no brown bears have been identified in California since 1922. Biologists estimate 86 species of brown bear once existed in North America, with only 1 remaining. Accordingly, bears don't understand borders, with historical migration causing California's once thriving population. Bears remember locations of food sources across hundreds of miles of territory.

Delisting would cause not even one brown bear to ever migrate to California during my lifetime. Dr. David Mattson estimated in 2016 that somewhere between 46,500 and 72,200 grizzly bears once occupied 763,700 square miles of the western U.S. in their benchmark year of 1800, with the largest historical populations in Montana (9,300), California (6,900), Wyoming (5,400), and Colorado (5,300). Mattson states Yellowstone's grizzly populations are currently threatened by the loss of white bark pine.

Perceptible harm will be caused to Californians, Native Americans and many other enthusiasts and researchers, as they'll be unable to observe, engage in religious practice with brown bears.

Americans are concretely affected by delisting since the wrongful idea affects those few remaining in the Yellowstone ecosystem. Public rights legislatively pronounced to belong to each individual forming part of the public are at-risk, especially for California, Idaho, Montana and Wyoming residents.

Most scholars agree there's less than 1,000 grizzlies left in the lower- 48 states, with most concentrated in the Yellowstone ecosystem. The ESA and three decades of enforcement saved the species from extinction, while proving how difficult restoring the population is. Illegal hunting still poses a reproductive threat, with abandoned cubs observed each year. Delisting from the ESA will ensure certain extinction—against the interests of the DOI, who's tasked by statute to save them.

A. Saproxylic Insects and Endangered Bird Reintroduction

Another problem California's faced from not having brown bears is the corresponding decline of saproxylic insects and birds, especially endangered woodpeckers. Feeding and marking activities of brown bears can damage trees, as well as sapwood foraging—allowing insects and birds to establish breeding and feeding sites inside them; which typically doesn't occur in perfectly healthy trees. University biologists proved this between 2008-2011 by observing 278 brown bear-wounded silver firs in the Bieszczady Mountains of Poland. Trees with the oldest bear-wounds (5+ years) had the highest probability of occurrence of saproxylic insects and woodpeckers. 43% hosted insects and 33% of them hosted woodpeckers.

All woodpeckers are protected under the Migratory Bird Treaty Act of 1918, with 2 California woodpeckers (the Gila woodpecker and Gilded northern flicker) listed on the ESA. Reintroduction of brown bears in California will increase reintroduction of saproxylic insects and endangered birds. Brown bears have historically been attracted to the state's vast coastal areas, in-addition to their traditional mountainous ranges; no coastal regions exist in Idaho, Montana or Wyoming—where the nations few remaining bears currently live.

II. Effect Upon Native American Religious Freedom and Practice

Secondly, repeatedly proposed delisting actions affect both the conservation and religious practices of California's 109 federally recognized Indian tribes with 78 entities petitioning for recognition. Tribes in California currently have nearly 100 separate reservations

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

recognized Indian tribes, with 75 tribes petitioning for recognition. Tribes in California currently have nearly 100 separate reservations throughout the state. The Bear Dance's performed to bring back the ghosts of ancestors; spirits of whom then join to help bears relax and properly hibernate. The Circle of Life Dance brings warmth for hibernating bears. 7 The songs of the Ute Bear Dance show respect for the spirit of the bear, which makes one strong 8 and just some examples. Native Americans have all expressed heightened importance towards protecting the bear and their continued integration into regular religious practices.

A. Violation of Due Process and Treaties

The deprivation of due process that reversal would cause to Indian populations is obvious and unnecessary; a state cannot exercise wrongful authority over a protected species critical to both the conservation and religious practice of sovereign Indian nations inside the U.S. Such a conflict arose between the Mescalero tribe and New Mexico's Department of Game in *New Mexico v. Mescalero Apache Tribe* 630 F.2d 724 (1980). The Mescalero claimed sole right to control access to wildlife on the reservation and intentionally disregarded state game and fishing regulations. The Tenth Circuit upheld the Mescalero Indians rights—states have no control over wildlife found on Indian lands...which comprise much of California, Idaho, Montana and Wyoming. Some Indian treaty rights extend to land outside reservations, again limiting the state controlling their access to wildlife.

In *Fond du Lac Band v. Carlson* 68 F.3d 253 (8th Cir. 1995), Chippewa Indians sought injunctive relief against Minnesota to prevent enforcement of the state's fish and game laws—which was granted because 1837 and 1854 treaties signed with the U.S. provided exemption, just as in recent wrongful delisting efforts in the GYE.

Antoine v. Washington 420 U.S. 194 (1975) stated that even on lands ceded to the state, the Supremacy Clause precludes the application of state fish and game laws upon tribes. Congress showed no intent to subject them to state jurisdiction for hunting—while the state can regulate non-Indians in a ceded area, Indians must be exempted from such regulations. Even tribes no longer recognized by the government retain historical fish and game rights. *Menominee Tribe v. U.S.* 391 U.S. 404 (1968).

The American Indian Religious Freedom Act clearly protects the grizzly under freedom to worship for ceremonial and traditional rites; with the usage and possession of bear objects considered sacred. All Indian tribes regard the grizzly as sacred—performing regular ceremonies oriented towards them continuously for thousands of years. The lands of Indian nations both inside the Yellowstone ecosystem and previous ranges (like California) are considered protected religious sites. Reversal would cause interference, thus preventing free exercise of Indian religion.

Executive Order 13007 instructed federal agencies to evaluate policies regarding Native American sacred sites. Land managers were ordered to: “(1) accommodate access to and ceremonial use of Indian sacred sites by Indian religious practitioners and (2) avoid adversely affecting the physical integrity of such sacred sites.” The DOI produced a compliance manual, *Departmental Responsibilities for Protecting & Accommodating Access to Indian Sacred Sites*. Delisting the grizzly from the ESA violates both these guidelines and Executive Order 13007.

Disparate impact and irreparable harm from delisting violates the Piikani Nation Grizzly Treaty of Solidarity—the first signed between sovereign Indian nations in Canada and the United States in 152 years, and, is also signed by California Indian nations.

Article VI (Hunting) states, “Understanding that the GRIZZLY is an ancestor, a grandparent, and a relative, no hunting of the GRIZZLY – be that categorized as sport or trophy hunting – will be permitted or licensed on any lands our NATIONS hold jurisdiction over. The GRIZZLY will enjoy full protections on all tribal lands.” Article VII (Management) clearly identifies the legal right of Indian nations, “to not adopt state, provincial or federal plans, as all are infringements of [our] sovereignty” and states, “Recognizing that our collective objective is to see the GRIZZLY returned to areas of biologically suitable habitat on tribal lands within the Grizzly's historic range pre-colonial contact, and for linkage zones to be established between the existing, fragmented populations, GRIZZLY management plans for our NATIONS will be formulated from a cultural foundation, while accommodating the “best available science.” WE, collectively, recognize that our ancestors practiced the “best available science” in their stewardship of the land, as they lived in balance with our Mother Earth when the biomass was at its height. Our NATIONS will not adopt state, provincial or federal plans, as all are infringements of our sovereignty. WE, collectively, will formulate vocational and educational programs for our people, so that on our lands, they will be the leaders of our culturally compatible GRIZZLY management programs. Upon the signing of this TREATY, any management removal of a GRIZZLY will be undertaken with ceremony, and such parts of the GRIZZLY that have always been kept in sacred bundles or used for traditional healing practices will be provided to such persons qualified. No GRIZZLY will be removed from the population before all

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

other options have been exhausted.”

Both endangered animals and Native Americans deserve due process. Existing statutes and treaties must be honored. The Supreme Court has described the obligation of the U.S. to tribes as that of a guardian to his wards. *Cherokee Nation v. Georgia* 30 U.S. (5 Pet.) 1 (1831). Religious expression and freedoms guaranteed for all religions, not some.

Thanks for your consideration and vital work to once again restore California's state animal. We don't understand why some otherwise reasonable folks in our neighboring states have wanted to eradicate our state animal in recent years...which we have none of, but adorns our flag. We'd happily take all unwanted bears in the GYE.

#121

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, February 27, 2020 8:54:48 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, February 27, 2020 9:20:03 AM
Time Spent: 00:25:14
IP Address: 174.234.138.134

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jane Miller

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I agree with the Yaak Valley Forest Council that a Congressional legislative fix is needed to reroute the trail properly. The USFS has already shown its inability to effectively address the trail route in its tardiness to come up with a management plan. USFS was required by Congress to develop a plan within 2 years. That was back in 2009, and still NO plan. The plan was to include public oversight and determinations of the maximum load of the trail. Without even this basic framework, how can the trail be optimally located in terms of what's best for the hikers and the environment, especially the Yaak's severely endangered grizzlies? I've visited Montana in the past, hiking and camping in the National Forests for extended vacations. I'm concerned about all endangered species, but after spending time in Montana, I'm especially concerned about the last of the grizzlies in the Yaak Valley. I urge you to work to find and implement an ethical and scenic re-route of the Pacific Northwest Trail (PNT) one that protects both bears and hikers. The current proposed re-route through the Yaak Valley dangerously places hikers and grizzlies in the same small alpine meadows at the same time of year. It's very questionable whether the trail is in compliance with the Endangered Species Act (ESA). That, combined with USFS Region 6 lack of compliance with the legislatively mandated timeline, demonstrate that it's way overdue to address these issues.

The trail has attracted a large volume of users, which is taking its toll in placing increasingly more demands on bears, hikers, water availability, hiker provisioning, Border Patrol, Search & Rescue, and road traffic. It appears to be becoming so over used that locals could end up having to take part in a lottery to obtain permits to use dispersed trails in the area.

Dispersed recreation would be so much better for the hikers, bears, locals, and timber alike. Remember, there are only 25 grizzlies left in the Yaak Valley, and they have ZERO acres of protected wildlands, unlike glacier grizzlies. The Jonkel Report to Congress backs this up, as does the 2018 analysis by Dr. Lance Craighead and Wayne McCrory. Dr. David Mattson's recent analysis found that loss of just one female Yaak grizzlies every other year will result in extinction of these grizzlies within the next twenty years.

It's vital that first-do-no-harm be applied to such an endangered population. Plus, it's not beneficial to anyone for PNT to go through designated grizzly habitat, and the re-route should work to enhance, as much as possible, economic opportunities for Lincoln County through usage of the trail towns such as Eureka, Libby, and Troy.

Thanks for considering my comments, and please address the PNT issues promptly. It's been put off for far too long, further endangering the grizzlies, which at the same time endangers hikers.

Jane Miller
Vienna, IL 62995

#122

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, February 27, 2020 10:48:14 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, February 27, 2020 11:43:28 AM
Time Spent: 00:55:13
IP Address: 162.244.175.137

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tim Thier

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Yesterday, I had the privilege of attending your meeting in Libby. Unfortunately, I could not attend the evening public session so I am writing you instead in hope that you will seriously consider what I have to say.

I am a retired wildlife biologist and for several decades I was involved in various aspects of bear research and management. This involved also working with the public on conflict situations in NW Montana that involved not only black and grizzly bears, but also everything from beavers to elk and mountain lions. I can't tell you how many bears we trapped and moved over the years, or even how many bears and mountain lions we had to kill in the public interest. What I can tell you is that what really made a difference in the long run was public education and the proper use of electric fencing.

I know that there is a stigma about electric fencing that I don't understand. I also know that when it is properly installed, it works. Period. People that suggest otherwise are not installing or maintaining it properly .

During my career, I learned that it was far more cost effective and better for both the public and wildlife in general if electric fencing was properly and strategically implemented. This involved everything from the fencing of beehives to apple orchards to county dumpster sites. I have used it for everything from deterring bears, to preventing beavers from damming culverts, to keeping my daughter's cat from pooping in my carrot bed. It works.

I strongly feel this council would be seriously remiss in it's duties if the use and implementation of electric fencing was not a key element of its final recommendations. Therefore, it should be a key element of your current discussions. At least several hours of your time should be dedicated to this issue.

One of the few organizations that have really stepped up to the plate in this regard is Defender's of Wildlife. I have worked on numerous projects with Erin Edge and her staff and have no doubt she can provide the guidance needed for this group to get things moving in the right direction. This group needs to have open discussions on the latest in technology, recommended standards, funding of future research, public education and outreach, and funding for implementation that goes beyond what Defender's of Wildlife is currently able to distribute.

I beg you to please consider what I have to say and please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions. Take care.

Tim Thier

#123

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, February 27, 2020 11:43:38 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, February 27, 2020 11:46:53 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:15
IP Address: 162.244.175.137

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tim Thier

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Yesterday, I had the privilege of attending your meeting in Libby. Unfortunately, I could not attend the evening public session so I am writing you instead in hope that you will seriously consider what I have to say.

I am a retired wildlife biologist and for several decades I was involved in various aspects of bear research and management. This involved also working with the public on conflict situations in NW Montana that involved not only black and grizzly bears, but also everything from beavers to elk and mountain lions. I can't tell you how many bears we trapped and moved over the years, or even how many bears and mountain lions we had to kill in the public interest. What I can tell you is that what really made a difference in the long run was public education and the proper use of electric fencing.

I know that there is a stigma about electric fencing that I don't understand. I also know that when it is properly installed, it works. Period. People that suggest otherwise are not installing or maintaining it properly .

During my career, I learned that it was far more cost effective and better for both the public and wildlife in general if electric fencing was properly and strategically implemented. This involved everything from the fencing of beehives to apple orchards to county dumpster sites. I have used it for everything from deterring bears, to preventing beavers from damming culverts, to keeping my daughter's cat from pooping in my carrot bed. It works.

I strongly feel this council would be seriously remiss in it's duties if the use and implementation of electric fencing was not a key element of its final recommendations. Therefore, it should be a key element of your current discussions. At least several hours of your time should be dedicated to this issue.

One of the few organizations that have really stepped up to the plate in this regard is Defender's of Wildlife. I have worked on numerous projects with Erin Edge and her staff and have no doubt she can provide the guidance needed for this group to get things moving in the right direction. This group needs to have open discussions on the latest in technology, recommended standards, funding of future research, public education and outreach, and funding for implementation that goes beyond what Defender's of Wildlife is currently able to distribute.

I beg you to please consider what I have to say and please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions. Take care.

Tim Thier

#124

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, February 27, 2020 12:51:50 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, February 27, 2020 1:18:19 PM
Time Spent: 00:26:28
IP Address: 174.208.2.195

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tony Johnson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I attended the meeting in Libby during the public comment period. I listened to a story by Linda Alkire about a conflict with a Grizzly I understand her fear. On the other side of this story is non-conflict. My mother was born in Libby 1930 her family moved to Libby area from Malta Mt. I was born in Libby 1953. I lived on lower quartz creek north of Libby for a decade with no bear trouble. My family built a home in Yaak valley cyclone creek and Yaak River. Again we experienced no bear trouble. I was the first to build a home on Shannon flats above the Kootenai River. Our home sits right below the Cabinet Mt. Wilderness. Again no bear conflicts. I am strict about no attractants for bears on my property. My point is we can co- exist with Grizzlies. I am very proud to live in a area that has Grizzlies, Wolves, Wolverines, Lynx and all the other creatures that we share our lands with.

Tony Johnson
583 Overview dr. Troy Mt. 59935
406-291-3975

#125

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, February 27, 2020 12:11:16 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, February 27, 2020 2:00:44 PM
Time Spent: 01:49:28
IP Address: 67.143.192.150

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Ashley South

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council,
First off thank you for the opportunity to have public comment.

I am a Yaak, MT resident and have lived in the surrounding area for 26 years. I work, play, and live in this valley. This small watershed is unique and very different from any other place in Montana. This valley is vital for many habitat areas to thrive and survive, as it is an inland rain forest. This specialized area in the north west holds around 200+ human residents as well as multitudes of flora and fauna. As more people move into this valley it is pushing the wildlife further into fragmented landscapes that are hard to survive in because the habitat areas no longer exist due to development and private land uses.

With 200+ residents in this valley and only 25 breeding grizzly female's located in the Yaak grizzly recovery zones, means there is no balance for recovery here. If this valley can hold the capacity of 100 bears and there is only 25 breeding females then we are still in recovery. The Yaak ecosystem is different from the Cabinet ecosystem, or any other recovery zone in MT. These habitat areas are similar but totally different at the same time. The Yaak is not protected wilderness like the Cabinet Mountains. It seem as if these two grizzly recovery zones are connected but they are fractured by the BNSF railway, Highway 2, private land, timber management, and the expansive Kootenai River. To traverse these dangerous barriers is a huge feat for a bear, or any other wildlife trying to find new habitat. Another fragmenting issue in the Yaak Valley is the Pacific Northwest Trail (PNT) and it's current location. This trail is a problem. Not only for wildlife but for timber management, border security, hiker safety, solitude, and the landscape. This trail traverses Grizzly Core Habitat... pushing numerous hikers (not including local use) that are not familiar with the landscape and habitat areas, directly into grizzly recovery zones. This is not a step in the right direction for recovery. Not if but when this trail become high use (20 parties per week including local use) will result in closing existing roads and trails to mitigate for the high use trail. This will also result in problematic timber management as a national scenic trail has a scenic view shed requirement insuring no timber harvest or large development within sight of the trail and one mile on either side of the trail is non-harvestable to insure wildness. The PNT parallels the U.S. Canadian border. Border security is an issue in the Yaak Valley and further restrictions can be put in place to insure security. Permitting, even the locals. With a high use trail, permits would be put in place for trail users including locals. No one want's that. With the possibilities of having a high use trail come with a lot of negativity impact in this are and needs to be moved to the Southern Alternative. Hiking is a wonderful activity but hikers in multitudes do not need to be pushed through grizzly recovery areas.

We need to do a better job at educating the public about what a bear is, how it lives, where it lives, and how to live along side them, because it is possible. Bears do not want human interaction, they want to leave us alone. If a bear does not find an easy food source they will move on. It is our human responsibility to keep our livestock safe, our food put away, garbage taken to the dump, and any other attractants out of reach from any wildlife. If people are not educated on what preventative measures they can take then conflict will continue to arise, and recovery will not be an option without stricter laws. Our youth is crucial to the next generations ability to make good decision, and education is the only way we can secure a responsible future. Conflict resolution is possible and there are methods to insure balance such as bear spray, bear proof garbage cans (also used for livestock feed storage), Ovcharka bear dogs, high voltage electric fences, fruit tree barriers, etc. These methods have been developed and just need to be implemented. Funding would help establish education between specialist and every day Montanans.

It is true all across Montana that we can coexist and work with all living organisms in our state and on the planet. These species that are listed as endangered and of concern are in this position because of human impact. Plain and simple. Taking responsibility for our actions is the only way we will use tax payers money as a means to fix the degradation from our past generations and to leave something left for our future generations. We can coexist with timber management, ranching, private lands, and wildlife. Education on these matters is key.

For the ranchers and land owners across Montana I wanted to share information about Ovcharka Bear Dogs. They have been used for centuries if trained properly to protect families, land, livestock, and their private land territory. There are a few breeders in NW Montana and you can find more information here <https://homesteadcaucasians.com/predator-control>

As Montanans we should value what little wildness we have left and try to establish education, responsibility, and coexistence between humans and the wild elements we all call home. Bear country is a part of our heritage.

Thank you,

-Ashley South

#126

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, February 27, 2020 4:30:02 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, February 27, 2020 4:52:15 PM
Time Spent: 00:22:13
IP Address: 174.216.27.43

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Carol Dubay

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

To Montana Governor's Grizzly Bear Council:

I , Carol Dubay elder member of the Confederated Salish, Kootenai and PendO'Reilles Tribes of the Flathead Nation am speaking on behalf of Grizzly Bear

Grizzly Bear is calling you loud and clear--

"We Grizzly Bear are the true guardians of this entire ecosystem!"

All corridors are our forever, eternal trails. The Grizzly Bear rights to live, prosper and protect our Creator -given homeland and the forests, rivers and mountains must not be violated by human intervention.

These natural facts demand careful actions by all who love and honor Grizzly Bear and all of our relations and all animal brothers, fishes, and birds.

We demand our freedom "to be"; all intruders who do not respect these truths are not welcome.

#127

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, February 27, 2020 5:34:32 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, February 27, 2020 5:53:33 PM
Time Spent: 00:19:01
IP Address: 174.216.14.173

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It's scientifically established that when humans consistently enter areas where grizzlies den and hunt that there are more human/grizzly incidents. Then bears are killed. Grizzlies also tend to leave the area or the birth rate decreases when a lot of humans frequent their usual habitats. Yellowstone is the perfect example. BeRs den away from humans. And a sow with cubs is a usual human/grizzly incident.

So it makes no sense to put a through trail right through the most important grizzly habitat in the Cabinet-Yaak. It's a bear recovery area. Dangerous for bears and humans. A southerly route is a safer alternative. In the event of injury of someone other than a bear encounter people are farther from communication and help. Farther from refueling stops.

Please reroute the Pacific Trail. Protect bears and humans. Allow bears their comeback.
Allow Montanans to trade more with more people and people to get what they need.

The Trail is not heavily trafficked-YET. It's established in studies that more pressure is on our present through trails like PCT and Appalachian Trail. A new trail will be a huge draw. Let Montanans have tourist benefit and have a more southerly route to better protect bears and humans.

Reroute the Pacific Northwest Trail.

#128

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, February 28, 2020 5:33:57 PM
Last Modified: Friday, February 28, 2020 5:37:18 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:20
IP Address: 174.208.7.175

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bill Mckinley

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Take away from another grizzly bear advisory council meeting.

There is no one size fits all strategy that makes for successful grizzly bear management !!!

It is critical to determine what factors limit the grizzly bear population in an area... biological, social, landownership, economics

For each area, the management plan needs to address the urgency of the problem. Population trending (up/down), social acceptance, connectivity

Last but not least

Risk assessment of management plan

The degree of risk one is willing to accept depends greatly on the population level of grizzly bears in a management unit

Risk is more easily assessed when there are competing models(more than 1). Just another reason to support the fact that There is no one size fits all strategy that makes for successful grizzly bear management !!!

I appreciate the opportunity to listen to these meetings. It's broadened my thoughts on successful grizzly bear management. The problems, perspectives, and acceptance (or lack of) for the bears is only going to increase over time with expansion of numbers and areas occupied.

I'll ask everyone to take a few seconds as you drive to the east front for your next meeting. Do bears belong here? Does this area seem like good grizzly bear habitat? And if at all possible I'd like to hear your thoughts Friday morning.

Thanks again for your time and effort.

Bill McKinley

As always my phone isn't far away if you'd like to visit

4062890432

#129

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, February 29, 2020 11:05:54 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, February 29, 2020 11:21:00 AM
Time Spent: 00:15:06
IP Address: 162.244.175.221

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

To: Montana Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council

From: Todd Butts

Subject: Comments to Advisory Council on the management of Grizzly Bears and Grizzly Bear habitat in the State of Montana.

My name is Todd Butts. I am a wildlife biologist, (University of Idaho class of 1991), and manage a small biological consulting firm in northwest Montana. During the past 28 years as an independent biological consultant I have spent 365 days a year living, working, and playing in Montana Grizzly Bear habitat. I have Grizzly bears passing through my property on an annual basis. I was part of the most recent DNA sampling effort of Bears in NCDE western Montana. I attended the Council meeting in Libby in late February, 2020.

NCDE Math & Comments

Considering that the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem is mostly in Wyoming (58%), I would like to focus on the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem (NCDE), which is almost 100% in Montana. In 2004 Montana FWP biologists, with collaborators, conducted a DNA study which was used to estimate the number of Grizzly Bears in the NCDE, (I was a collaborator). The number they came up with through sound science was 765 bears. Ongoing research, including further DNA work, estimates that the Grizzly Bear population in the NCDE is increasing at 2.3% per year. With this research, State and Federal biologists estimated the number of Grizzly Bears in the NCDE in 2014 to be 960 bears, with a statistical minimum of 837 bears.

The area of the NCDE is approximately 16,000 square miles, with an additional 6,000 square miles outside of the official NCDE boundary being used by NCDE Grizzly Bears. This totals 22,000 square miles of area being used by Grizzly Bears in and around the NCDE. The average home range for female Grizzly Bears in North America is 70 square miles, with the home range of male bears being much larger (300-500 square miles). The lowest home range size for Montana Grizzly Bears that I could find in the available scientific literature was 39-77 (average 58), square miles.

Next I did some simple math. $22,000 \text{ square miles (area of NCDE plus 6,000)} / 58 \text{ square miles (low average for female grizzly bear home range)} = 379 \text{ bears}$. Now as a biologist, I understand that the home ranges of grizzly bears have some degree of overlap which is dependent on many factors including habitat quality. To account for this overlap I doubled the number of bears that the NCDE could conceptually hold. $379 \times 2 = 758 \text{ bears}$.

In conclusion, I took a VERY conservative approach to estimate the capacity of the NCDE to accommodate the needs of Grizzly Bears, and came up with a maximum carrying capacity of 758 bears for the NCDE. This number is more than 200 bears less than the mid range estimate for the 2014 NCDE Grizzly Bear population of 960 bears. Some might say that given the fact that the 2014 NCDE population estimate of 960 is almost 200 more than my estimated capacity of 758, my conclusions must be incorrect. To the contrary, I believe that the 2014 "surplus" of over 200 bears provides an explanation for some of the current trends within the NCDE Grizzly Bear population. First, there is a documented increase in bear to bear conflicts within the NCDE, (Grizzly Bears killing other Grizzly Bears is an increasing cause of death in the NCDE). Second, there is a documented increase in the number of Grizzly Bears being found in the area of Montana due east of the NCDE, (Grizzly Bears have been documented as far east as Fort Benton and beyond, often coming into conflict with humans as they attempt to make a living in inferior habitat conditions).

The bottom line is that sound science supports the fact that Grizzly Bears are no longer endangered or even threatened in the State of Montana. In fact, Grizzly Bear recovery in the NCDE has been so successful that the NCDE now has a surplus of more than 200 bears over the estimated carrying capacity of the habitat, making the NCDE a very crowded neighborhood for Grizzly Bears. My conclusions are supported by the fact that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS), attempted to officially delist the Grizzly Bear in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem in 2017 before the decision was appealed and ended up in the courts. Prior to the 2017 court intervention, USFWS had planned on delisting the NCDE Grizzly Bear population in 2018. Unfortunately that has not happened, because it is absolutely the right thing to do. Removing Grizzly Bears from the endangered species list will be an important step toward keeping Grizzly Bear management in Montana in the hands of qualified biologists where it belongs, and away from courts and politicians who often give more credence to the emotion of an issue than the facts and science of the issue.

Other Comments

Comment #1: Due to declining habitat productivity in the NCDE it is quite possible that bear numbers in the NCDE have peaked in recent years, and are now on a natural population decline. It is well documented that bears are moving east and south out of the NCDE. This is not by accident. This is because the NCDE is FULL, and the bears are being forced out the NCDE to make a living. The only way to create more room for bears in the NCDE is to improve habitat productivity. The only way to improve habitat productivity is through vegetation management.

Comment 2: The draft recovery plan talks about "measurable habitat based recovery criteria". Two of the "measurables" listed are road density and overnight recreation sites. These are totally bogus measurables. There is NO! science that proves road density or the number of overnight recreation sites impacts bear populations? The science simply doesn't exist. In fact the available science

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

number of overnight recreation sites impacts bear populations. The science simply doesn't exist. In fact, the available science completely opposes this view. Consider the Swan Valley. This is one of the most heavily roaded areas in the NCDE with a checkerboard of State, Federal, and Private timberlands. The reason the Swan valley has such high bear densities despite being heavily roaded is the premier habitat conditions. The Swan valley is located between the Missions and the Swan range. The intensive forest management in this area has created premium habitat conditions in the perfect area. This is why bear densities are so high in this area. The habitat is so good, despite being heavily roaded, that this area is supporting bears with smaller home ranges than any other area in the NCDE. The same goes for overnight recreation sites. There is absolutely no science supporting the fallacy that adding overnight recreation sites would be detrimental to bear habitat or impact bear numbers. People camping in bear country need to be educated for sure, but bears and humans don't conflict at clean campgrounds, bears and humans conflict when humans spook bears on trails at 6 A.M. Livestock and sheep allotments are another issue, but the issue relative to bears is more about location. Sheep and cattle allotments west of Augusta or north of Lincoln are going to have bear issues whether they are new or old. A new livestock allotment north of Drummond, or west of Kalispell, might have no impact on bears or bear habitat. The bottom line is that any "measurable" used in this plan should be backed by sound science. We don't need a plan that restricts forest access, road building, overnight camping opportunities, or livestock, just because somebody thinks that these factors might maybe someday be detrimental to the bear population.

Comment #3. Why have bear numbers steadily increased since the bear was listed under the ESA? Have we improved habitat conditions significantly? NO! Is it because of road closures and controlling open road densities? NO! Why then? Quite simply it is because humans, the bears only natural predator, stopped hunting them and killing them. As soon as humans stopped killing bears, numbers began to increase in the NCDE, and continued to increase until the carrying capacity of the habitat was reached. As much as biologists and federal land managers would like to take credit for "managing" the bear through the recovery period, "managing" bears is overrated. Have biologists helped reduce human-bear conflicts (and therefore bear fatalities resulting from those conflicts), through education? Absolutely! Those biologists, should be commended, and those efforts should continue and expand. However, the true driving force behind bear recovery was the elimination of human caused mortality as a result of hunting. Period! End of subject!

Comment #4: If the State of Montana would truly like to sustain the bear populations in the NCDE and throughout Montana, there are some simple things that need to be done, and they have nothing to do with restricting forest access through road closures, or limiting overnight recreation opportunities. The bear management tools described below apply no matter who is "managing" the bears, and whether or not the bears are listed under the ESA.

First - Continue to regulate bear hunting. This doesn't necessarily mean there should be no hunting. If bears keep showing up in Conrad, it's probably not going to hurt if we shoot a couple around Dupuyer. Do the math.

Second - Continue to educate people living and recreating in and around the NCDE other identified ecosystems. If the chicken coop is electrified - bear gets zapped - bear doesn't kill the chickens - bear doesn't get shot. If camper keeps cooler in pickup - bear doesn't get into cooler - bear doesn't get shot. Pretty simple, but education VERY! is important.

Third - If the State of Montana wants to maintain or increase the current bear population in Montana, it is absolutely critical that the State works with federal land managers to improve forest management on federal lands, which will in turn improve bear habitat productivity. Sound vegetation management equals more diverse vegetation & more berries, which equals more ungulates, which equals more bears. Watching our national forests go up in smoke year after year, (as the result of a total lack of vegetation management), doesn't do anybody any good, including Grizzly Bears. For proof of this – See Stillwater and Swan State Forest lands. Lots of roads, lots of vegetation management, lots of bears. Pretty Simply.

Comment #5 Restricting forest access in the form of road closures or other access restrictions is not having a significant impact on Grizzly Bears in Montana. Contrary to some of the fearmongering propaganda that has been spread in the past, people are not actively driving around in the woods looking to poach Grizzly Bears. Grizzly Bears that are getting shot by humans are getting shot as a result of chickens and chance encounters in the woods, and misidentification, not because people are actively poaching the bears. With this being said, forest access restrictions in the name of the Grizzly Bear need to come to an end. We have lots of bears, and the citizens of this state should not be deprived access to their forest lands in the name of an animal that is far from endangered or even threatened. If anyone would like to check facts, the majority of the scientific information contained in these comments can be found at the Montana FWP website, or the Interagency Grizzly Bear Committee website.

Cabinet-Yaak

The Cabinet Yaak Ecosystem is 2,600 square miles, and has a current population of 55-60 Grizzly Bears. Doing the same math as was done for the NCDE: $2,600/58\text{sq miles (low bear home range)} = 45\text{ bears}$. For arguments sake let's say that the Cabinet Yaak Ecosystem is less productive habitat than the NCDE, so with some overlap in home range (and likely larger home range size), the habitat capacity for CYE is not $45\text{ bears} \times 2$ like the NCDE, but $45\text{ bears} \times 1.5$, which equals 68 bears. 68 is not far from the 55-60 population estimate (It should be noted that population estimates from DNA sampling have been shown to be consistently low). Given these facts, the CYE is not far from carrying capacity for Grizzly Bears. It should also be considered that bears can easily migrate from

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

the NCDE to the CYE through a number of travel corridors, and have done so in the past. If they are not doing so, (the science says bears from the NCDE are mostly moving east, not west), as a biologist I can only conclude that there is simply not the available habitat in the CYE to support many more bears, because if the habitat was available, bears from the overfull NCDE, would be heading west into the CYE. With these facts being presented, my comments specific to the CYE, would be much the same as previous comments.

#1: Based on the available science there is absolutely no justification for restricting forest access or recreation opportunities to “protect” a bear population that is nearing the carrying capacity of its available habitat.

#2: If the State wishes to have more bears in the CYES, it must improve the habitat productivity in the CYES. Improving the habitat productivity can only be done through improved vegetation management in the CYES.

#3: Finally, it should be noted that there is no available science suggesting that mining in small areas around the CYES will negatively impact the Grizzly Bear population in the CYES.

Overall Bottom Line: First, Montanan's should not be asked to give up any more land, forest access, recreation opportunities in the name of a Grizzly Bears, as they are near or exceeding the carrying capacity of their habitat in all of the major identified ecosystems in Montana. Second, in regards to conserving bears within the identified ecosystems, the elephant in the room is vegetation management on national forest lands. Until the State can convince the USFS to begin managing vegetation to improve bear habitat productivity, habitat productivity in all identified ecosystems will continue to decline, reducing the capability of those habitats to support Grizzly Bears.

Todd Butts

#130

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 02, 2020 7:54:21 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 02, 2020 8:07:19 PM
Time Spent: 00:12:58
IP Address: 174.27.165.247

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

RA Rusnak

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I have twice visited MT's Yaak mountain region to hike, bird and photograph, and find it unreasonable to build a new through-hike trail across a core grizzly habitat. Especially given the extreme density on this forest habitat, making it more likely for visitors to encounter grizzlies at very close quarters, upping the likelihood of serious injury or human fatalities, and subsequent bear take downs by MT wildlife officials. A loose-loose situation, given human risk, tiny bear population, and budgetary strains on MT F&W as the number of incidents rise.

#131

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 03, 2020 9:14:11 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 03, 2020 9:46:00 AM
Time Spent: 00:31:48
IP Address: 99.48.206.104

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jack C. Clary

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Governor and Council: Greetings. Please help reroute the PNT away from the Yaak grizzlies. It's the better and decent choice—conservation-wise, scientifically, economically, and commonsensically—for all involved based upon the studies and literature I've seen. It's relatively cost-effective in the long haul, and grizz in lower North America (and elsewhere) is worth the long haul. I'm a 60 year old Midwest lawyer, hunter (birds and big game but not grizz though I've been face-to-face a number of times), angler, grateful for wild places and wildlife, including your special Montana where I've baled hay by the Crazies, avoided rattlers with Huns in the air, gazed in peace in Glacier from when a boy to recently and maybe again upon retirement. Grizz in N America is among the top of miraculous wonders, alongside us who are the only source of grizz' future . Our world and lives are too full of impatience and taking easier routes. Please protect this rarity—grizz in the Yaak, and everywhere—because we have so few chances to do it. We the people have essentially unlimited recreation and can afford recreating responsibly guided by sustainability values. Thank you for your service and consideration here. All the best.

Respectfully,
Jack C. Clary

#132

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 03, 2020 4:36:38 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 03, 2020 4:49:17 PM
Time Spent: 00:12:38
IP Address: 172.221.102.194

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Marc Beaudin

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Council members,

As you continue to work toward true Grizzly recovery in Montana, I ask you to keep the following facts in mind:

- 1) With the stresses caused by climate change, the bears will only survive if they are allowed to travel to and inhabit new areas. This can only happen with human tolerance, ESA protections, education and wildlife underpasses along major roadways.
- 2) The stresses of climate change aren't going away in our lifetimes. It makes no scientific sense to loosen protections for the foreseeable future.
- 3) The bears of the Yaak Valley are particularly threatened by the misguided route of the proposed Pacific Northwest Trail. The re-route offered by the Yaak Valley Forest Council should be followed.
- 4) Regardless of the unscientific stands of the state game agencies who have caved to pressure by trophy hunters and the NRA, the Yellowstone grizzly, as an island population, is doomed without full protections and new possibilities of safe and secure connectivity.

Thank you for taking my comments into consideration.

~Marc Beaudin

Livingston

#133

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 04, 2020 3:51:44 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 04, 2020 3:55:37 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:52
IP Address: 73.156.166.126

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Eugene Hogan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please give the utmost consideration to the proposal being offered by the Yaak Forest Council for the Northwest Trail being proposed through the Yaak. It is crucial to adhere to their plan in order to preserve the required habitat for the grizzlies of northwest Montana with the least impacts from humans. Thank You.

#134

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 05, 2020 8:38:12 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 05, 2020 8:43:48 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:36
IP Address: 75.105.180.64

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

keith kubista

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Now that the GGBAC is working on their recommendations it is vital for the general public to have the meeting meetings and agendas information sooner.

#135

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 05, 2020 11:56:06 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 05, 2020 12:01:50 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:44
IP Address: 76.101.143.248

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Roberta Mcy

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

As someone who lives surrounded by Forest service land I fully support the efforts being made on behalf of Grizzly bear sustainability. Like the wolves they are necessary predators. They are important to maintaining ecological balance. They are not fully recovered and need to be protected as ways are found to connect their population in the Yak to those closer to the Clark Fork and even Yellowstone.

#136

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 06, 2020 12:53:42 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 06, 2020 1:02:43 PM
Time Spent: 00:09:01
IP Address: 199.167.97.26

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Scott Soultz & Brandon Diller

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

During the February 27, 2020 GBAC meeting in Libby, MT, the Kootenai Tribal Fish and Wildlife Dept. made the following comment, and wish to submit this as a written comment as well: Understanding that the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem (NDCE) grizzly bear population is doing well but the Cabinet-Yaak Ecosystem (CYE) grizzly bear population continues to struggle, the Kootenai Tribe of Idaho is concerned about the management of grizzly bear populations across large geographic areas (Example - State & Forest Service boundaries). In particular, the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council needs to consider the management inconsistencies between (2019) NCDE grizzly bear management strategy and the 2011 grizzly bear access amendment for Cabinet-Yaak ecosystem.

#137

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 09, 2020 9:10:33 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 09, 2020 9:15:49 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:15
IP Address: 172.1.181.144

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

WILLIAM KEETING

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

This Council should not address whether bear should be listed under The Endangered Species Act because that's an issue that's already being decided in the courts based on the law and science. Grizzly bears in Montana are currently protected under the esa. The purpose of this council is to address challenges in to help set long-term goals for Bear management and conservation not to pave the way for delisting as has been commented on by some agency leaders. Also none of the grizzly populations in Montana are connected which poses a serious risk to their long-term existence in the US. Who are the six recovery areas established our holy are partly in Montana so the state place and absolutely critical role in the future of Grizzlies. To prevent conflicts with people in bears and the bears with livestock has been done previously but more needs to be done to keep people in very safe to achieve the connectivity between Grizzlies in Montana. The council could consider developing recommendations like prioritizing the highest conflict areas, additional funding, additional resources, development of Clearing House of conflict prevention, implementation of recommendations in the end agency Grizzly study and more

#138

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 10, 2020 12:44:13 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 10, 2020 12:45:50 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:36
IP Address: 98.125.89.248

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Brian Schott

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I think it would be smart to re-route the Pacific Northwest Trail out of Yaak and down through Libby and Troy to help those last 25 grizzlies in Yaak. The existing trail goes through core grizzly bear recovery zones in Yaak. With 3-5 breeding females, this doesn't make sense. Plus there is good economic benefit to Libby and Troy with this move.

#139

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 10, 2020 3:38:30 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 10, 2020 3:39:47 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:16
IP Address: 208.114.128.20

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Charles Seymour

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hunting grizzly bears is a terrible idea. There is no science whatsoever that shows that hunting will reduce conflict. Rather proper storage of food in grizzly bear habitat is far more effective. This doesn't even get into the moral and ethical reasons for banning a hunt.

#140

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 10, 2020 4:43:04 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 10, 2020 5:06:19 PM
Time Spent: 00:23:14
IP Address: 97.73.244.100

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Not sure it makes any difference to say anything after what I've seen the council do on wolves but these grizzly bears need to have a season put on them. I personally know a few ranchers that have lost so many cows and calves at their summer grazing permits that they can no longer afford to chance bringing stock to these areas which greatly affects their livelihood and you people are responsible by not doing anything and covering to the small group of loudmouths that you know have an agenda and are the ones actually hurting wildlife. They need to be managed just like the wolves need to be better managed or you may as well turn Montana into one big Yellowstone Park. Maybe that's your agenda too. Don't have much faith in you political idiots. Do what's right for true Montanan's instead of the out of state loudmouths and transplants!!! Remember, once the majority of people and sportsman see nothing being done to a very obvious threat we will take it into our own hands. Same with the wolves and open up a real trapping season on the wolves too. Quit playing your PR game for the loudmouth anti's, they aren't the ones that fund you but soon you may have to try to rely on them for your funding when real true Montanan's finally have enough of your political crap.

#141

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 8:50:29 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 8:51:37 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:07
IP Address: 50.201.179.133

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

JEAN PUBLICC

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

TOTALLY AGAINST GRIZZLY BEAR/ BLACK BEAR/ MT GOAT, BIG SHEEP, AND OTHER ANIMAL KILLING BY HUNTERS. HUNTERS ARE FEW IN NUMBERS AND DECLINING EVERY SINGLE YEAR. ITS TIME FOR TH EMAJORITY TO RULE AND CUT OUT ALL THE ANIMAL KILLING. THIS NEEDS TO BE STOPPED. HUMAN SCUM ARE INTO KILLING AND MURDERING FAR TOO MUCH. THE HUNTERS AND TRAPPERS NEED TO BE STOPPED NOW. ITS OVER. ITS NOT 1860 ANYMORE.

#142

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:31:25 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:36:13 AM
Time Spent: 00:04:48
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Valerie Harms

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I moved to Montana to see grizzly bears and wolves in real life, not books. I strongly care that their habitat areas be connected so they can thrive more easily. Many people, such as Louisa Willcox, have demonstrated how people can prevent predations. Living with grizzlies and wolves makes this a very special place.

#143

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:37:02 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:39:32 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:30
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Teresa Lewis Watts

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We moved to Bozeman to enjoy the boundless beauty of the landscape & the intact ecosystem of the Greater Yellowstone Region. We believe grizzlies are crucial to the wildness of Montana's wilderness, & we invite family & friends here so that they, too, can experience an intact ecosystem & see what our whole country (& continent) used to be like more than a hundred fifty years ago. Grizzlies are highly intelligent, & they are amazing to observe from a safe distance. We hope that many other Montanans voice their opinions about how valuable it is to live in such a bountiful state where all wildlife is valued for the intangible benefits they contribute to our souls: The wilderness is not wild without grizzlies.

#144

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:39:36 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:47:24 AM
Time Spent: 00:07:48
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Toni Patterson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We need this council to recommend proactive solutions for grizzly management, we need a plan that allows for an expansion of the grizzly population and connectivity between core habitats. I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana.

#145

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:47:57 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:48:37 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:39
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Karl King

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because these large predators are a very important part of the ecosystem, that have a powerful influence on populations of other plants and animals. They make the Rocky Mountains of Montana what they are, and the way Montanans expect them to be. They are necessary to keep our landscape healthy, functioning and wild.

#146

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:50:48 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:51:44 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:55
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Rocio Muhs

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...we need n love them.

#147

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:51:48 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:56:52 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:03
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeffrey Troxel

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We need full recovery and not decide that means it's time to go out and hunt them by chipping the numbers down one bear at a time, give them time to fill back in and become stable and then we can talk again. Thank you.

#148

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:57:10 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:59:40 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:30
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Sandra McGhee

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because they play the role of an "umbrella species", meaning that by protecting enough appropriate and productive habitat for a healthy, secure population we also provide and protect habitat for many other species. It also protects a diversity of ecosystems, protecting native plant communities as well. Grizzlies have had an astounding recovery, but they still have a relatively small population statewide. The two largest populations of griz in the state are still isolated from each other. There are conservation obstacles like protective corridors for genetic diversity and new habitat. We also need to do a better job of educating the public, and reducing conflicts with humans. Overall grizzlies need continued protections until the existing populations of these magnificent animals are stronger and have a clear path to continued recovery

#149

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 9:59:43 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:02:06 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:23
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Roderick Jude

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Healthy grizzly populations ensure the existence of healthy ecosystems. A healthy ecosystem is home to a variety of other species and essential ecosystem services including clean water. I have a cabin in the Swan Valley where grizzly bears frequent my property. We are very conscious of the vital role Grizzlies play in our Crown of the Continent ecosystem, and we take necessary measures to ensure their safety and ours. Coexistence with grizzlies takes knowledge and willingness to follow recommendations to minimize conflicts. When Grizzlies disappear, wilderness disappears with them.

#150

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:02:12 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:04:06 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:53
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Brad Foss

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzly bears symbolize wild places that people desperately need in the face of urban sprawl and environmental degradation

#151

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:04:45 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:05:25 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:39
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Patrick Day

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because my daily blog sent out to several hundred individuals and businesses promotes the wildlife of Montana, and especially the grizzly. They are iconic Montana residents who need our help in achieving their recovery and permanent presence here in our state with it's abundant range of animal species and gorgeous scenery.

#152

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:16:27 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:17:32 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:05
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Rochelle Gravance

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I strongly support continuing recovery of grizzly bears in Montana, including habitat restoration and expansion, and associated efforts to re-establish habitat corridors connecting individual bear populations within Montana, which are essential to avoid genetic isolation and in-breeding. MOREOVER, THERE SHOULD BE ABSOLUTELY NO SPORT HUNTING OF GRIZZLY BEARS IN MONTANA

#153

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:18:03 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:19:54 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:50
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Virginia Caplette

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am tour guide in Yellowstone Park year round. I also supplement my income with pictures of wildlife and scenic of the park. We have about 250 grizzlies in the park and approximately 700 in the greater Yellowstone area. They are being well managed by the Park Service.

#154

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:20:00 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:21:01 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:01
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Adrienne Croft

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because I take tourists out during the summer months. Almost every time the # 1 animal that they would like to see on their wish list is the grizzly bear.

#155

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:21:40 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:22:43 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:03
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Marlene Miller

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because they are an indicator of how we are doing as stewards of our environment. They are an important ecological contributor. Their presence in MT brings millions of tourists and their dollars every year. Many Montanans have jobs and livelihoods that depend on a clean, healthy and robust ecosystem. I'm a native Montanan and am proud of our legacy taking back power from corrupt mining companies to protect our environment. I want to see that continue, especially in light of global climate change.

#156

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:51:31 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:52:14 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:42
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Daniel Mandelko

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Bears are an important part of the ecosystem. Yes, we must come up with ways to successfully educate the public to be better and more responsible humans which will help us coexist much better. I have no issue with eventually creating a hunting season in the fall only. Opening up wildlife corridors is also an important objective

#157

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:52:50 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:53:25 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:35
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Gerard Byrd

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because healthy grizzlies means a healthy ecosystem -- and intact wild areas.

#158

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:53:48 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:55:00 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:12
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Heather Mckaig

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because... Not only are they a source of income for a range of businesses across Montana, be it from tourism, photography or otherwise, they are a natural part of the ecology of Montana and this part of the country, to remove their protections, would be to only further remove Montana's protections of its natural world, and puts the animals to be once again at risk for over-culling and trophy hunters who want to pretend that their kill means something.

#159

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:55:45 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:57:12 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:26
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Cynthia Delgado

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The whole reason I first moved out here in 1996 was to work in Yellowstone and to take in what it has to offer (especially the grizzly bears and reintroduction of wolves). We have an extremely beautiful state that is so special by having these amazing bears that not only help with the ecosystem but also draw in tourism in which keeps several towns in business.

#160

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:57:44 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:58:32 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:48
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Clinton Nagel

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Just knowing that grizzlies still live and thrive in Montana reminds me that there are still wild places left in our good old USofA. I am blessed to live in Montana and very fortunate to have encountered the Grizz in person, and every time I have I was not only scared, but humbled and impressed with its presence, which makes you focus immediately on the present , and how fleeting life can be, things one can take for granted in society in town

#161

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:59:01 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 10:59:56 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:55
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Duane Dyrud

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...Where the Grizz roams the earth is healthy!

#162

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:00:02 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:01:18 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:15
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lynn Arney

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I work in the tourism industry and love showing these beautiful creatures to tourists from near and far, and teaching them about the importance of grizzlies contributions to the ecosystem.

#163

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:03:50 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:05:47 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:57
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Ron Kaminski

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...they are essential to the entire Yellowstone Eco-culture

#164

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:06:28 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:07:29 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:01
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Brock Roy

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

As a citizen of Montana, it is one of my goals to ensure that wildlife and our wildlands receive the utmost protection. They need a voice and they are not receiving it because of either selfish greed, exploitation or extraction. Grizzly bears and other large roaming species need to be able to connect to these protective habitats and they can't do that unless the corridors are also protected. Land-use management decisions on private land must be part of and match those decisions made by state and federal officials on public land.

One reason I feel so strongly on this issue is because of the biodiversity of the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem. This is one reason that my family moved here 9 years ago. But even if we hadn't moved here, my feelings would be the same. It is the wild and the wildlife that make living worth while, to know we are not alone on this planet.

#165

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:09:33 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:10:16 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:42
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Halie DeVos

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because the grizzly represents Montana at its finest, most wild and most primitive. It is a premier and iconic species. We MUST protect them.

#166

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:13:33 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:14:23 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:49
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Cynthia Rademacher

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because they are a vital part of the western eco system

#167

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:14:44 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:15:20 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:36
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lorraine Rowe-Conlan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...they are part of our normal environment and ecology.

#168

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:15:55 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:17:08 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:12
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

James Kobasziar

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...they are a vital species to the ecosystem. Too many of them are needlessly killed by negligent hunters, negligent drivers on our roads, and the occasional train. They need to be protected. They need to be preserved. I love grizzly bears. I love to go bear watching. Tourists come to our state to see the grizzly bear roaming wild and free.

#169

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:17:33 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:18:09 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:35
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Erin Mcraith

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because the Yaak valley has a small population left. If we do not protect them now - then when?

#170

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:18:34 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:19:09 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:34
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

John Feckanin

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I strongly believe that grizzly recovery is in the interests of people as much as that of the grizzlies.

#171

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:19:40 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:21:11 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:31
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We can't keep moving the wildlife of Montana til they are none left inexistence. Where they become put in zoo's or put on a flag. As what has happened to them in California. This is Montana the last of the refuge of the wild. Montana has the land. There is no reason not to keep a healthy population of Grizzlies. People need to be reminded that this is Montana . What the advisory committee needs to work on is keeping our water ways clean. Keep Montana wild. Hanna, Missoula

#172

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:21:16 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:22:20 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:03
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Carol Hanson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because they are essential to the ecosystems of Montana, maintaining biodiversity in our world, and to not care would be another indication of human's inability to be empathic to the species we share the planet with. I know that co-existence is possible and a privilege as I have done so for years. I also know that if economics is an issue they hold value for their tourism dollar as such large mammals become ever rarer and as humans want to see such animals in the wild they will travel to such places to do so.

#173

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:30:04 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:30:54 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:49
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Sandra Lowney

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...A diverse and robust natural environment is paramount to our own survival

#174

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:31:21 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:32:19 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:57
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Debbie Spicer

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because...they are an important part of the ecology. The animal kingdom was here before humans and have every right to be here.

#175

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:32:38 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:33:22 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:44
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Samuel Westlind

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because they deserve to exist as much as homo sapiens.

#176

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:33:48 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:34:20 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:32
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Karen Cashley

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I care about the future of grizzly recovery in Montana because..they are integral to a fully functioning ecosystem.

#177

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:34:49 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:36:33 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:44
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Scott Merrell

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The future of the living planet depends on wild places and wildlife. The planet has been transformed by human activity, and not in a good way. We can see that now. Scientists who work in the field of climate science have shown that we need to save at least a third of the planet from human impact, and that means saving all of the species inside that third of the planet. Grizzlies are an important part of the web of life and their life is as important as mine or yours

#178

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:36:59 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:39:26 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:27
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Randy Brumback

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I believe that the Grizzly deserves to thrive and be protected. There are ways to manage a species with out culling. Please protect our grizzlies and make sure that future generations thrive in our state.

#179

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:39:46 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:40:28 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:41
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Po Hall

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The grizzly bear is a Montana icon. They were here before us and have a right to be here now. We are the ones encroaching on their land. They deserve to live and flourish.

#180

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:40:45 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:41:59 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:13
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Nina Anderson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzlies are the difference. As Montanan's we demonstrate world leadership in species conservation. So many countries and states have failed. Giving a species a safe place to call home matters. It matters to me, it matters to all humanity and it matters economically. Who doesn't want a chance to see the great bear? I have met many a grizzly on the trail in the backcountry. There is nothing more real than to experience the sanctity of true "wild" places. This is our opportunity to ensure healthy populations for future generations to see, know and respect.

#181

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:42:18 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:43:03 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:45
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeanette Copeland

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I think wildlife should be protected. humans have taken over too much of their territories and resources. it's their world as well as ours and diversity is important to the the survival of all life on earth.

#182

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:43:21 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 11, 2020 11:44:22 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:01
IP Address: 34.100.72.185

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

June Mohler

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Every friend and relative who visits me in the Flathead Valley wants to see a grizzly bear. They want to see a marvel that they cannot see at home. A healthy grizzly population is a significant part of Montana's tourism culture. Please allow us to co-exist with as many species as possible.

#183

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 12, 2020 8:13:43 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 12, 2020 8:24:26 PM
Time Spent: 00:10:42
IP Address: 174.33.160.193

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tom Radandt

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hunting is an essential wildlife tool. It's important that state managers have the ability to influence bear numbers in an economical manner. Hunting is that cost effective tool. Hunters pay for 2/3 the cost of grizzly bear management right now, hunting is a necessary and legitimate conservation action.

#184

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 8:51:44 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 8:52:58 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:14
IP Address: 71.11.217.209

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Natalie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Your archaic and unreasonable animal mgmt practices need a dose of reality science and common sense. Stop the killing insanity!!!!!!

#185

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:11:25 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:12:30 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:04
IP Address: 174.255.7.10

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): **Respondent skipped this question**

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Every animal has as much right to be here and have a life as any person.

#186

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:27:47 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:33:35 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:47
IP Address: 70.171.175.189

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tom Kircher

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I think there should be more education with people on how to avoid bears and to protect yourself by keeping food put away not trying to feed them or get to close, to have bear spray with you when out hiking, making noise so you dont startle the bear, and making people aware of bears when hiking. There are many ways to coexist with wild animals, the first thing that always comes up is to kill them, many nonlethal ways to deal with animals in the wild, givecthem their space and you can still view them and take photos

#187

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:31:52 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:34:31 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:38
IP Address: 75.187.187.177

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Zach Freidhof

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please support non-lethal means of coexistence with bears. Hunting will not solve the problems and will damage the environment, the tourism economy, and more. Many communities have learned ways of existing with bears without killing them. Take up those measures and leave something for our grandchildren to enjoy and experience.

#188

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 10:09:45 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 10:13:47 AM
Time Spent: 00:04:02
IP Address: 174.45.90.129

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jill

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Do NOT allow people to trophy hunt these magnificent animals. They are not fully recovered. There are far too many things working against the bear to know for sure that they have a healthy enough population to allow hunting: Human overpopulation, humans moving into their habitats, lack of food, trains/cars (both killed many bears last year), etc. This is wrong!

#189

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 10:24:30 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 10:28:23 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:52
IP Address: 78.149.207.58

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Annemarie Cavell

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Remember there are more people who don't torment torture rape cattle than do there are more people who don't kill everything that isn't human and there are more people who don't own weapons what ties this altogether they aren't perverts And they also use social media email telephone letters and they also comment so you can't lie and say nobody said anything We are fully aware of what you want to do understand we don't like it and disliking it has many meanings

#190

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 10:31:11 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 10:33:14 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:03
IP Address: 72.12.251.189

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Sandy Zelasko

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

PLEASE, fund non-lethal methods of coexistence. Educate ranchers and citizens in areas with bears to prepare BEFORE bears show up! Thank you!

#191

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 11:33:24 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 11:34:47 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:22
IP Address: 70.97.229.146

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Amy Jones

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not hunt grizzlies because they are still Endangered and the vast majority of both Montanans and Americans don't want to see grizzlies hunted because it is not supported by science and is not sustainable for a slowly reproducing species like grizzlies.

#192

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 11:34:58 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 11:36:38 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:40
IP Address: 99.196.184.82

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Michelle Knaier

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Take action and live WITH bears.

#193

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 11:49:10 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 11:51:40 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:30
IP Address: 76.19.57.189

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Robert Sargent

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

There is not, & has never been legitimate scientific justification for killing grizzly bears. Please listen to the science.

#194

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 12:23:18 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 12:24:06 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:47
IP Address: 173.95.80.242

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

J Underwood

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not allow recreational grizzly bear hunting!

#195

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 1:34:05 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 1:35:21 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:15
IP Address: 216.185.233.190

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

STOP KILLING THE GRIZZLY, WOLF, PUMA, FOX, COYOTE THEY ARE THE CURE FOR CWD...WAKE UP THERE ARE NONLETHAL WAYS TO PROTECT STOCK...AFRICA HAS IT FIGURED OUT WHY CAN'T YOUR STATE?????

#196

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 1:42:44 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 1:47:32 PM
Time Spent: 00:04:48
IP Address: 209.52.88.80

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Karen

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The time has passed where killing sentient beings for recreation and trophies is considered acceptable. Further expansion of grazing land into the habitats of wildlife is also no longer acceptable in the eyes of the majority of the public. Please consider respecting the soe ies with whin we share this planet and employing non lethal methods to resolve conflict.

#197

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 3:02:20 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 3:23:10 PM
Time Spent: 00:20:49
IP Address: 75.69.37.125

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeff

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The Grizzly should be left alone and allowed to prosper in the few little area of the country that has room enough for them to live. I have seen the area in the early 1980 and the low population of bears at the time. It has taken a long time to get there population up. In the same amount of time I have seen Wyoming and Montana change a lot also. Even theses magnificent states are loosing there wild lands fast. Before we know it there will not be enough land for these great bears except in the park. Ranching is hard but being a grizzly is harder with to many people that fear the bear. Any bear on state or Federal land should be the first priority. They are part of that land and belong there. Cattle on this same lands do nothing beneficial for the land. Bears bring in way more money to these states then cattle also. With educating people about living with grizzly bears and just a little bit of people changing there ways, both can coexist. It is proven it can work, There is no need to kill bears out of hatred or fear period.

#198

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 5:06:16 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 5:08:44 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:27
IP Address: 69.174.149.44

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Heidi Steinert-Bresilge

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzly bears and every other animal are absolutely necessary to healthy environments and should be left alone to live their lives!!! Why are idiot humans always kill-happy and feel they need to "manage" things?!?!? Stop the grizzly hunt!!!!!!!!!!!!

#199

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 5:29:02 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 5:31:27 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:24
IP Address: 107.204.156.242

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Erica Waugh

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please help our Grizzlies. The odds are against them in this world of aggressive mankind. They have their place, and we will be sorry in the long run if we don't do our part to help.

#200

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:08:45 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:12:23 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:37
IP Address: 99.253.142.165

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lisa Sproule

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please leave the Grizzly bears alone. Soon you will kill all of them off and we will have no more. Let nature do her own balancing on earth. Just stop killing them, cruel, barbaric and completely unnecessary.

#201

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:28:52 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:36:21 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:28
IP Address: 107.77.161.31

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Cindy Kreiman

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am asking that we please educate and learn how to live with the Grizzlies, our wildlife and environment. These beings have the right to be here as much if not more than we do. They have been our teachers in learning to survive, heal ourselves. What we fear and have no understanding of, we destroy. These beautiful beings have families, they play, feel grief, bleed, feel pain..all the things we do. Please open your hearts souls and minds to life. Look into their eyes what do you see?????

#202

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:37:45 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:38:01 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:15
IP Address: 107.77.205.41

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): **Respondent skipped this question**

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

No!

#203

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:46:59 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 9:55:28 PM
Time Spent: 00:08:29
IP Address: 71.84.10.169

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Beth

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't allow trophy hunting. Hunting should only be done to eat the meat and I don't think that many people eat bear. These beautiful animals need to have their space and to live their lives just as man. They were here before we were and we need to live with them not kill them because we see them as predators.

#204

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 10:18:37 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 10:20:07 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:29
IP Address: 107.77.234.155

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Sue

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please fund non-lethal methods of coexistence. We have seen evidence that this works. A healthy ecosystem needs predators. Also, the grizzlies are a huge draw for ecotourism.

#205

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 13, 2020 11:11:09 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 13, 2020 11:12:27 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:18
IP Address: 107.2.185.138

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Marianne Giesler

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzlies cover only 1% of their historical range. Why do you support further destroying genetic diversity?

#206

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:45:24 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:47:24 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:00
IP Address: 86.160.125.230

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Barbara Barker

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Leave these beautiful animals to live.

#207

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 3:32:15 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 3:33:36 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:21
IP Address: 105.226.88.6

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): **Respondent skipped this question**

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Why does this activity in anyway exist in this day and age. This is disgusting.

#208

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 4:27:32 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 4:29:19 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:47
IP Address: 80.110.72.170

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't allow trophy hunting. It's inhumane, vane, brutal and unnecessary. I'm sure other methods can be implemented to regulate the number of the species. Thank you!

#209

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 4:45:36 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 4:46:34 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:57
IP Address: 142.183.216.160

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please protect the bears from hunters

#210

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 5:10:21 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 5:11:52 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:31
IP Address: 79.72.154.5

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lynn Stuart

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't kill the grizzly bears, the Trump administration has no respect for wildlife. Please stop the killing.

#211

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 5:28:02 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 5:31:13 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:10
IP Address: 24.252.252.15

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I'm writing this to let you know that I think hunting the grizzlies is wrong. What happened to non deterrents? We need to provide and educate ranchers and citizens how to live peacefully with grizzlies.

Hunting doesn't work. This is not conservation or in my book humane or ethical. We have taken so much habitat away with our housing and businesses. We must find a better way to handle this. Education and deterrents would be a good start

#212

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:02:05 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:04:10 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:05
IP Address: 81.98.6.244

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Allowing hunters to hunt these bears is a disgusting display of the lack of humanity of the council and ultimately only puts a bandaid on this issue. Try educating farmers and ranchers on local wildlife, not giving them more allowance to go gun happy on yet another struggling species.

#213

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:04:12 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:04:32 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:20
IP Address: 116.240.89.120

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

AliceBarlow

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I think the practise of hunting is disgusting and archaic. It targets innocent animals which play a valuable and irreplaceable role in the ecosystem. Disrupt the natural order of this ecosystem and other animals will overpopulate! When you hunt one animal, you aren't just affecting that animal but the entire food chain! LEAVE THE BEARS ALONE

#214

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:21:08 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:22:46 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:37
IP Address: 172.243.168.249

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not harm animals. They are unable to defend themselves from humans. We should start educating accordingly. We do not lawfully harm children, seniors, or those with different comprehension of existence and this should follow the same respected category. Thank you.

#215

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:21:41 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:23:42 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:01
IP Address: 74.76.220.45

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jennifer G.

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I have visited Montana and enjoyed your hospitality. I believe it is our responsibility to be good stewards of the earth and protect its inhabitants, both human and nonhuman. People can coexist with bears. Please look into non-lethal methods of controlling human/bear interactions. Public education is key.

#216

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:47:09 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:48:11 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:02
IP Address: 85.255.234.222

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Carole

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Don't kill these wonderful bears, it's so cruel and needless

#217

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 7:58:43 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:00:38 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:54
IP Address: 184.166.238.37

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lucinda Battenschlag

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please use non lethal controls to manage grizzly bear populations.

Thank you

#218

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:24:29 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:24:58 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:29
IP Address: 68.32.201.248

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Linda A Arndt

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Leave these creatures alone!!

#219

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:26:04 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:30:00 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:55
IP Address: 31.49.233.7

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeanette Dickson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Stop the killing it's getting beyond a joke all the animals that's being murdered they have the right to live so please don't let these Grizzly bears be next to be murdered levillsan

#220

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:30:08 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:30:16 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:07
IP Address: 31.49.233.7

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeanette Dickson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Stop the killing it's getting beyond a joke all the animals that's being murdered they have the right to live so please don't let these Grizzly bears be next to be murdered levillsan

#221

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:44:09 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:45:24 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:15
IP Address: 73.68.200.70

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Linda Mcdermott

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't harm the bears.they have a right to live as we do.

#222

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 9:47:29 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 9:47:43 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:14
IP Address: 185.69.145.76

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): **Respondent skipped this question**

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dont be a fucktard, kill eachother not bears

#223

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 10:10:25 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 10:13:25 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:59
IP Address: 68.145.190.163

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

David R Gildea

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

As a person who lives in what used to be the heart of Grizzly country I am pleading with you to not allow any form of grizzly hunting, these magnificent animals are on the verge of being wiped out., for what? Human satisfaction of some primeval urge? Or just ego?

#224

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 12:00:14 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 12:18:31 PM
Time Spent: 00:18:17
IP Address: 98.202.15.71

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tristan Adler

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please prioritize non-lethal methods for dealing with human/bear conflict. Bears are an integral part of the ecosystems where they live, and we humans have a responsibility to care for our natural places.

#225

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 12:19:59 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 12:21:32 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:32
IP Address: 80.215.41.251

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Clement de conti

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please dont' do this , grizzly bears deserve to live ! And if not we don't deserve to live on this planet anymore

#226

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 12:43:35 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 12:50:55 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:20
IP Address: 176.159.239.108

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

MARSOL

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

hello, i sincerely believe that on this planet, there is room for all, human and bear, and that the human with his intelligence and his capacity of adaptation must preserve the fauna which lives hard and which it has less ease of adaptation in a human world.

#227

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:10:12 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:11:02 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:50
IP Address: 162.233.202.243

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Barbara Henninger

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not kill. Find another way to solve problems. Thank you.

#228

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:20:54 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:23:12 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:18
IP Address: 68.14.102.97

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): **Respondent skipped this question**

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I support a non lethal solution which in my opinion is the best course of action. Hunting does not reduce unwanted encounters with bears. Please don't perpetuate the myth!!

#229

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:25:03 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:26:06 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:02
IP Address: 71.192.216.89

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kat Green

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't hunt them. Humans have been taking their home to make land. Let's not take anymore from the creatures that just try to live their life with trying to invade ours as little as possible

#230

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:45:07 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 1:47:00 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:53
IP Address: 109.158.157.135

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Gillian Buckley

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not kill the grizzly bears. They are a great tourist attraction and people are becoming more anti hunting as our natural wildlife is needlessly decimated.

#231

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 2:03:46 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 2:04:43 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:57
IP Address: 86.26.162.143

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): **Respondent skipped this question**

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Bears are beautiful animals and critical for ecosystem function humans have no right to kill them in their own habitat.

#232

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 2:08:21 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 2:09:49 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:28
IP Address: 73.99.143.12

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Karen Fedorov

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not allow hunting of grizzlies. They already have problems with their food source. Give them room; allow them to live. We humans are NOT the only species that matter!!

#233

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 3:18:30 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 3:22:10 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:39
IP Address: 50.96.38.98

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

PATTY TRAMMELL

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please leave our wildlife, including predators alone. I know there are problem instances but we should let them live if possible. We need to ban traps and hunting farmed animals also.

#234

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 3:55:24 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 3:58:25 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:00
IP Address: 174.246.195.20

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jasmine

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not kill these wonderful animals, they're entitled to this planet too. This was their home first and we need to respect their space. Most people wouldn't walk into someone's home and kill them, how is it any different when someone kills grizzlies in their own territory. Please respect these animals who are just trying to share this planet with us.

#235

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 5:25:28 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 5:27:15 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:47
IP Address: 76.118.12.150

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Dr. Walter and Evelyn Carleton

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

With the world in utter turmoil, give nature a chance without destroying God's creatures.

#236

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 5:25:18 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 5:28:40 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:22
IP Address: 63.155.141.241

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

VERY against hunting. Bears do not deserve to be hunted, especially for sport. Nothing does. Humans are raping this world of all it's life, and now mother nature is fighting back. Stop moving into THEIR habitats. We have evolved past neanderthal practices and diets. Join the 21st century.

#237

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 6:14:22 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 6:14:50 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:28
IP Address: 174.3.103.157

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please keep the bears safe, wildlife is a necessity - NOT a luxury

#238

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 6:15:48 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 6:16:17 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:28
IP Address: 174.3.103.157

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): **Respondent skipped this question**

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Save das bears

#239

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:27:13 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:28:59 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:45
IP Address: 107.77.200.208

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Stephanie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please use non-lethal methods to deter the Grizzlies. We don't need hunting of Grizzlies. if the ranchers need to protect their stock that is one thing but we don't need to hunt them

#240

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:29:04 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:29:08 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:03
IP Address: 107.77.200.208

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Stephanie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please use non-lethal methods to deter the Grizzlies. We don't need hunting of Grizzlies. if the ranchers need to protect their stock that is one thing but we don't need to hunt them

#241

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:35:39 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 8:37:10 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:30
IP Address: 73.118.47.21

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Rebecca Keaton

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The grizzly's numbers have been falling. Please don't let them become endangered! It's happening to too many animals.

#242

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 9:11:57 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 9:13:27 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:30
IP Address: 76.114.139.254

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Debra Wilson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please fund non-lethal methods supporting coexistence with the Grizzly Bear.

#243

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, March 14, 2020 10:00:57 PM
Last Modified: Saturday, March 14, 2020 10:06:36 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:38
IP Address: 73.214.155.115

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Helen

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not allow trophy hunting for bears. They should be left alone and protected.

#244

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:51:55 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:55:46 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:50
IP Address: 86.159.128.49

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Rikki Woodruff

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please can we not let nature alone if a cull is needed because of numbers then let it be an official one. Hunting for fun is barbaric, hunt if you need to eat, fight if you need to protect those you love but not for fun these bears might raid the garbage but they are not deliberately attacking people.

#245

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:59:46 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 3:00:40 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:53
IP Address: 101.114.237.17

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

This planet was meant to be shared between all life, great and small. If we work together with agencies for rehabilitation of animals, and teach children and families about safety in rural areas, then we can coexist with these majestic and beautiful animals!

#246

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 5:53:18 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 5:54:17 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:58
IP Address: 73.69.250.129

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please give the bears a break.

#247

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 7:51:49 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 7:52:53 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:04
IP Address: 75.105.180.64

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

With the Covid-19 situation is the meeting still on for March

#248

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 8:53:14 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 8:56:42 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:27
IP Address: 100.2.77.140

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't kill these bears. We are supposed to be the superior species and yet we haven't learned to live with wildlife? There are humane ways to keep them away. Educate!

#249

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 9:08:56 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 9:11:24 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:27
IP Address: 74.141.105.71

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

These are indigenous animals. Conflict with ranchers and hunters are not their fault. It is the fault of humans. Trophy hunting is archaic and barbaric. Taking an indigenous animals life for a trophy is selfish and greedy. This is not preservation or coexistence of wildlife and certainly should not be the priority of fish and wildlife. FWS should be on the side of preserving wildlife not catering to sport hunters and ranchers.

#250

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 9:06:36 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 9:16:21 AM
Time Spent: 00:09:45
IP Address: 174.192.199.92

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Laurel Gilligan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please learn to live with these wonderful animals. There are so many wildlife experts who can help lead an effort to coexist with these bears.

#251

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 12:37:57 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 12:39:57 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:00
IP Address: 174.208.9.195

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Something else to kill? Why? Can't we have just one animal that no one murders? Please don't let this happen. Thank you for your consideration.

#252

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 12:59:36 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 1:06:22 PM
Time Spent: 00:06:45
IP Address: 213.146.33.53

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please leave The bears alone, they have right to live their lives as we humans do. They have families, they have feelings and we humans abuse animals with weapons, it's not fair, it's abusive and humans need to stop feeling entitled as superior species, we need to show respect and empathy for animals who are here for a reason and are part of larger ecosystem. After all we are one big family of living beings and there is no need for violence and killing. Please don't allow these beautiful animals to be killed by cowards hunters behind guns, discussing!!!

#253

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 1:12:05 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 1:13:19 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:13
IP Address: 137.83.85.208

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Leave the damn bears alone. They were here first This is their home

#254

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 1:39:07 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 1:39:48 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:40
IP Address: 99.203.143.250

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please let bears be bears. There are many more human threats than bear threats.

#255

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:02:28 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:03:55 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:27
IP Address: 184.66.16.139

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Addison

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It's sickening and completely unnecessary to kill any bear. How many more orphaned cubs do wildlife rehabilitation centers need to rescue because of human interference and the selfish desire to kill living things for sport?

#256

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 1:55:50 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:09:19 PM
Time Spent: 00:13:29
IP Address: 172.79.155.158

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Donna Joy Mott

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is my hope that you all would Pursue a non lethal co-existence with the Grizzly Bear population. When I have the opportunity to travel west I always hope to see bears. It's one of the most joyous gifts I could receive!

#257

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:35:07 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:36:57 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:50
IP Address: 1.144.106.102

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Sam

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We need to come up with a non lethal way to move bears. We as humans can't keep going down the same path and kill everything. We have to educate and live in coexistence with not just bears but animals in general. You have a chance to make the right choice

#258

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:24:05 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:45:24 PM
Time Spent: 00:21:19
IP Address: 70.67.136.124

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Helen Botsis

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please help to protect these magnificent creatures instead of needlessly destroying them!!! Please fund non-lethal methods of coexistence. If we can educate ranchers and citizens in areas with bears, and prepare people where bears haven't shown up yet, on how to live with grizzlies, we can have a landscape where both bears and people can survive. Bears aren't going to change their behavior, we must be the ones to take action. Please do the right thing and make the right decision for bears and for people!

#259

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:44:14 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 2:46:16 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:02
IP Address: 68.8.91.16

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kristeen Roberts

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't allow the hunting of bears. They are all part of our ecosystem. Thank you.

#260

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 3:22:28 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 3:23:11 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:42
IP Address: 73.73.79.200

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Stop hunting bears!!! What is wrong with people?!

#261

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 4:00:57 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 4:03:15 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:18
IP Address: 99.20.69.156

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am taking this opportunity to address proposed trophy hunting and conflict "management" of bears. Hunting will not prevent conflicts. Please submit a comment telling the council to fund non-lethal methods of coexistence. If we can educate ranchers and citizens in areas with bears, and prepare people where bears haven't shown up yet, on how to live with grizzlies, we can have a landscape where both bears and people can survive. Bears aren't going to change their behavior, we must be the ones to take action.

#262

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 6:11:21 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 6:18:49 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:28
IP Address: 118.209.19.53

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Diana

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Tourists put more into the coffers of the State than trophy hunters, so you would be well advised to ban the cruel and unnecessary wildlife shooting. Ranchers need to be responsible for their animals and leaving them to roam into forest (public land) is invite natural predators to take them. It's no good blaming wild animals when the only irresponsible ones are the owners of the cattle/horses/sheep et al. Instead of allowing the reckless killing of wildlife and upsetting the ecosystem, the government of this state needs to be controlling the actions of the trophy hunters, competition shooters and ranchers. If you live in an area where there are bears, then you need to wake up and be responsible. The rest of the world is watching the actions of trophy hunters and those who recklessly permit their own animals to be killed and then blame nature. This happens in many countries, but right now it is the USA that people who care about nature are concerned. All around the world, Montana is regarded as being the "Big Sky Country' breathtakingly beautiful, but killing wildlife life for fun and because the citizens aren't responsible is NOT A GOOD LOOK and does the State no credit whatsoever.

#263

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 9:47:10 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 9:50:01 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:51
IP Address: 184.62.24.181

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Donna Hill

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

No more killing. There are non -lethal ways to handle the bears.
When will we as humans learn that God's creatures have rights also.

#264

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 15, 2020 10:26:15 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 15, 2020 10:28:29 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:14
IP Address: 174.222.7.22

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Ann White

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

No hunting of Grizzlies.

#265

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 12:20:15 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 12:23:09 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:53
IP Address: 99.199.171.254

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Doris Van Andel

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please have some compassion and wisdom by not allowing the hunting of these fine animals. Their life is not yours to decide on. They belong on the earth more than selfish humans that think they are the greater beings. It's all about the money and greed of humans. They need our care and protection not selfishness. Please make the best and humane decision you can by letting these lovely creatures live and enjoy their lives that belong to them and not humans.

#266

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 1:34:06 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 1:36:19 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:13
IP Address: 184.68.128.18

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Rocio

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

To kill is not a solution

#267

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 3:39:42 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 3:40:21 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:39
IP Address: 166.181.80.3

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Scott

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't allow Grizzly hunting.

#268

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 7:40:28 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 7:43:06 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:38
IP Address: 98.212.133.44

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Debbie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Killing God's creatures just for their heads or pelts or to put a sick picture of you and your kill on FB is truly EVIL!!! Trophy hunters are Sick, sick people.

#269

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 9:57:55 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 9:59:00 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:05
IP Address: 107.77.161.19

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Candyce bart

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please fund non lethal co existence with grizzlies

#270

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 10:27:16 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 10:29:29 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:13
IP Address: 75.1.196.232

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Victoria Mathew

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't allow the grizzly bear trophy hunt! This is not needed at all .

#271

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 11:15:32 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 11:27:26 AM
Time Spent: 00:11:54
IP Address: 153.90.233.121

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Michael G. Smith

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Councilors,

My Letter to the Editor of the Bozeman Daily Chronicle urging the public to help protect Montana's grizzly bear population was published February 16, 2020:

https://www.bozemandailychronicle.com/opinions/letters_to_editor/help-montana-protect-a-thriving-grizzly-population/article_351e62a5-7023-5cbc-8d67-03d51f5a8ab8.html

Michael G. Smith
Bozeman, MT

#272

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 11:43:45 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 11:45:59 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:14
IP Address: 24.130.144.175

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Michelle MacKenzie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am opposed to any hunting of grizzly bears in Montana. Hunting will not prevent conflicts. Science has repeatedly shown that non-lethal management is far more effective at preventing conflicts instead. Therefore, the Council should work toward encouraging and funding non-lethal management to deter conflict between grizzly bears and humans/livestock. Education on how to coexist with grizzly bears is the key. Let's work on funding that and not turn toward recreational hunting. Thank you.

#273

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 12:12:08 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 12:13:31 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:22
IP Address: 181.119.30.41

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): **Respondent skipped this question**

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please stop this inhuman killing of grizzlies. They have the right to live and be free just like we do. Thanks

#274

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 12:38:29 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 12:41:58 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:28
IP Address: 98.0.48.73

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Robert Goldman

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is time to listen to the majority of citizens in Montana and around the US and the world who have had enough of the killing of grizzly bears. For goodness sake, no more absurd trophy killing of grizzlies. Stop that sick behavior now and permanently.

#275

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 12:54:25 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 1:00:24 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:58
IP Address: 65.130.211.199

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tyson Howard

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I would love to see the grizzly returned to their historic range before they are hunted in the lower 48. I am a hunter and understand the tradition and need for hunting. I personally wouldn't have a problem with a raffle being held to raise money to relocate problem bears with the winner of the raffle being allowed to harvest one boar grizz. Make it \$500 a ticket and set it up to reach a high dollar amount to help the bears.

#276

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 1:02:58 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 1:05:05 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:06
IP Address: 47.226.56.97

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Judy Flanagan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is time for the human race to stand up for all wildlife and put a stop to murdering the Grizzly Bears, wolves, etc..... There are too many people in the world, now, and any damage is bad for the eco-system. In the days of the pioneers, there were less people and more wildlife, but it is different now and must be recognized and stopped.

#277

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 2:15:06 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 2:20:06 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:00
IP Address: 70.89.175.110

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Mike McKeever

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I'm in the support of a managed grizzly bear hunt as I believe it will improve human bear interactions and create more jobs and improve the quality of life in Montana. Please do list the grizzly bears off the endangered list so we can focus on animals that really need the support.

#278

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 4:58:36 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 5:01:20 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:44
IP Address: 99.203.17.149

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Joan hansen

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't kill the bears. We are losing too much wildlife as it is. Teach people how to stay away from them.

#279

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 6:09:06 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 6:10:57 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:51
IP Address: 205.206.143.68

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Karin Nelson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Absolutely no to the idea of a grizzly bear hunt. These and all animals need to be able to live, unharrassed and killed by humans. There is no reason for this besides the fact that some people enjoy killing our wildlife.

#280

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 6:16:43 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 6:18:39 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:55
IP Address: 100.14.242.63

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Respectfully I oppose any hunting of grizzly bears and that you urge the Council to consider, instead, coexistence education and encouragement of nonlethal methods to deter conflicts between grizzly bears, humans, pets and livestock. Please adopt a modern science based ecosystem approach and not the outdated wildlife management approach.

#281

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 10:12:51 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 10:25:43 PM
Time Spent: 00:12:51
IP Address: 63.153.9.242

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Ryan Castle

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Members,

Knowing that the role of hunting is going to be of topic in the Chateau meeting I wanted to not necessarily give my opinion but maybe share a few things that I believe might help the conversation. Being a Brown Bear guide on Alaska's Kodiak Island I like to use Kodiak's management plan as an example. Kodiak Island has an area approximately 3,595 square miles (Montana is 147,040 square miles) and about 3,500 bears inhabit it. That is 0.7 bears per square mile. Kodiak Island has a city population of 6,013 people (2017) and an island population of 13,448 people (Montana has approximately 1,068,778) people. Kodiak has an average of 1 mauling a year and usually none at all. There is a 70 mile road system that stretches both directions out from the city of Kodiak. Residents can buy a \$25 over the counter bear tag for this area every year and hunt a spring (April 1- May 15) or fall season (October 25-Nov 30). If they harvest a bear they must wait 4 years to receive another tag. Non-residents need a guide to hunt brown bears in Alaska which I will address later. The rest of the island is on a permit system where a hunter must apply and draw through a lottery system. The number of tags awarded to resident or nonresident hunters is prescribed by the bear managers and is based on bear biology and social tolerance. I think this type of hunting system could be used by Montana carefully and strategically in combination with strict conflict prevention measures to reduce the number of conflicts in urban areas, build social tolerance for bears, and reduce the number of bear conflict mortalities.

While strict hunting regulations lead to successful bear management another key aspect on Kodiak is the requirements for non-residents to have a hunting guide. Alaska has an extremely strenuous system for acquiring your guides license. There are three levels of guides licenses in Alaska: assistant guide, registered guide and master guide. To move from assistant to registered guide, which is Montana's outfitter equivalent, requires five years of experience in the field and a rigorous in person test that has a written, oral and hands on portion. The point of this is that outfitting is a truly professional occupation and within the company I guide for, we only take mature male brown bears and are capable of correctly field judging and aging and doing so confidently. It is an interesting dynamic to think about when wanting to precisely prescribe a grizzly harvest because a lot of folks who spend a significant time in the field have trouble judging male or female grizzly bears but many Alaskan outfitters can because they are required to go through rigorous testing.

I emailed Nathan Svoboda, Kodiak Island's area biologist, and asked him several questions regarding Kodiak brown bears and how their management and prevention could relate to Montana bears. I found this information interesting and hope it could help lead the conversation when discussing hunting and management.

1. Why do you think Kodiak does not have as many conflicts as Montana? Do you think Montana grizzlies are inherently different than Kodiak brown bears? (More aggressive, more confrontational, more food driven)

Nathan: I haven't looked at the number of conflicts in Montana vs. the number of conflicts on Kodiak nor is it clear what typically classifies as a "conflict" versus say....a bear encounter? We typically classify "conflicts" a few different ways based on seriousness of the interaction. For example, we regularly have bears coming into town to forage on non-natural food sources (e.g., trash cans, dumpsters) and, although they can be considered "conflicts", we handle those situations much different than say a bear that comes into town and kills a dog or mauls a human. Similarly, if we have a bear that comes into town and forages on natural foods (i.e. salmon, berries) we handle these situations much differently still. I have attached one of our "Bear Observation" forms that gets filled out by local law enforcement agencies when a bear is reported in town. You will notice under the "Type of Observation" how each bear observation is categorized based on its activity. It often takes multiple reports before we establish a pattern of behavior from a particular bear (or bears) before we take action (unless of course it's a serious conflict such as injury or death). One reason Montana may have more conflicts (again I am assuming this is true) is simply because there are more people in Montana which can result in an increased possibility of bear-human interactions. The more people there are, the greater the likelihood one of them will have a bear encounter. One other reason could possibly be that Kodiak residents are more used to seeing bears and having bear interactions so they are less likely to report them. We have bears come into town almost daily (if not daily) during much of the year and most of our residents know this and are somewhat used to this so they don't report bear encounters as often as maybe they should. Yet another reason Montana may have more conflicts is the availability of non-natural foods vs. natural foods. Again, I am not sure what most of the conflicts in Montana are related to, but if there are bears coming into town regularly to forage on non-natural foods perhaps it is because these non-natural foods are easily accessible (or at least easier) and provide a regular food source? Eating out of a dumpster or trash can is likely much easier than chasing down a deer, foraging for berries, or trying to catch a salmon. Other than perhaps some life history characteristics (size diet to a certain extent movements) I don't think Montana grizzlies are inherently different than Kodiak brown

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

characteristics (size, diet to a certain extent, movements), I don't think Montana grizzlies are inherently different than Kodiak brown bears. I don't know why Montana grizzlies would be more confrontational or aggressive than any other brown bear...unless of course they are food limited, defending something (i.e. kill site, young), or have increased competition.

2. What are the average number of conflicts and the cause?

Nathan: This is hard to put a number on since we classify "conflicts" a few different ways and there is no good way to count them consistently. On average, I would say we have 1 mauling a year (sometimes more, usually less), but receive anywhere from 100-300 observation reports/year of bears coming into town. The number of reports we get any given year seems to vary based on numerous factors including resource availability (i.e. salmon runs, berry production...good year vs. poor year) and weather (drought vs. rain). However, another measure of 'conflict' could be the number of bears that are killed a year "in defense of life or property". The number of bears killed per year "in defense of life or property" has ranged from single digits (8-10) to the mid 30's (I think 34 bears was the most shot in a single year in defense of life or property). In order, I would say the biggest cause of conflicts on Kodiak Island are: 1. Non-natural foods (trash cans, roll carts, dumpsters), specifically residents not taking care of their trash responsibly by far results in the most conflicts on the island, 2. Livestock and poultry, specifically residents who don't use electric fences around their animals. This results in a large number of conflicts each year on the island, 3. Hunters and fisherman who don't take care of their game/catch properly or don't know how to interact with bears in the backcountry (i.e., don't let bears steal your fish, don't try to run a bear off your recently killed deer that the bear claims, don't drag your recently harvested game, etc. etc.). 4. Ignorance of living in bear country. On Kodiak, about half of our residents are members of the US Coast Guard and many (about 1/3 of them) are replaced each year with "new" members, many of which have never lived in bear country. Although we (in partnership with the USCG) try to educate these folks on bear safety, our warnings sometimes go unheeded which can lead to negative bear-human interactions.

3. What preventative measures does Kodiak have in place?

Nathan: There are a number of things we do on Kodiak to prevent negative interactions: We make concerted efforts to educate our residents as much as possible about bears and to teach and instill respect for bears (we find this is very helpful when done in the spring [right before bears emerge] and in the fall when hunting seasons start [but before bears start entering dens]). We have various educational programs for all age levels. We conduct regular bear safety presentations to multiple groups and organizations (schools, USCG, visitor center, Kodiak National Wildlife Refuge, regular education programs for residents, etc.). We work very closely with law enforcement agencies and our local trash company to track and respond to bears in town before they become an issue. We have various school programs that teach respect for bears and get kids involved with being part of the solution and learning about bears. For example, a few years ago we started a program with the high school welding and art classes to retrofit dumpsters so they are bear resistant. The welding students created the bear resistant dumpsters and the art students decorated them with "Bear Aware" messages (see attached photos). This was a partnership between the Alaska Department of Fish and Game, the Kodiak Island Borough School System, Alaska Waste, and the Kodiak Brown Bear Trust. We have found these programs have tremendous success when we bring together the students, residents, and the relevant agencies and we all work together to tackle an issue. We also have regular PSA's that get broadcast either on the radio, in the newspaper (or both), or get distributed to the schools. I have attached a few examples (handouts and sound bytes). This is just a short list of the things we do on Kodiak to help prevent negative human-bear interactions. Needless to say, this is an endless battle and requires a significant amount of time and effort; however, it is my feeling this is an essential part of being a biologist in bear country. I have no doubt that these efforts (only a small portion of which are listed here) have saved countless numbers of bears....and probably a few humans. I would be happy to discuss some of these things with you over the phone if you are interested. For example, we also have 2 groups on Kodiak (Kodiak Brown Bear Trust, Kodiak Unified Bear Subcommittee [KUBS]) that work together to tackle bear concerns on the island. I would be happy to discuss these and other measures we take on the island to keep our residents (both humans and bears) safe.

4. Do you think any of these tools can be used in Montana?

Nathan: Yes, probably all of them. I don't know a lot about Montana, but I would guess if you had participation from local farmers and ranchers that would go a long way too...at least as far as education and respect.

5. I understand the road system is a registration area, is there a road system quota that would need to be hit for there to be a closure and has it ever been met?

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

Nathan: We do not have a quota on the Kodiak Road System for bears and we would likely never close down the road system for hunting bear unless something very dramatic happened (i.e. island wide bear crash, disease outbreak). The Kodiak Road System bear hunt is our way to reduce the number of bears coming into town, thereby reducing the number of bear-human conflicts (at least in theory...but it appears to work). Without getting too much into the history of Kodiak bear management (for more info see The History of Bears on the Kodiak Archipelago, by Dr. Larry Van Daele...my predecessor) we (the management agency) used to aerial shoot bears on the Kodiak Road System using a super cub with a mounted rifle. "We" gunned down every bear that showed itself on the road system in an effort to reduce bear conflicts with cattle ranchers; however, in 1968 an article was published (by Jim Reardon...I think) in Outdoor Life called "The Kodiak Bear Wars". This article lead to outrage from the general public and resulted in a paradigm shift in the way we managed bears on the Kodiak road system. Suffice it to say, this eventually led to the Road System Management Area in which we now provide those harvest opportunities to hunters (rather than us shooting them from a plane).

Nathan was very responsive and could be a great source for additional questions about what Kodiak is doing to keep bears and people safe. He referenced several attachments in the body of his responses and I would be happy to forward those on to the council if there is interest--I wasn't able to attach them through the online submission form.

I hope this information was helpful to you.

Sincerely,

Ryan Castle

#282

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 10:45:46 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 10:58:34 PM
Time Spent: 00:12:48
IP Address: 98.181.141.96

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Susan Fong

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please route the Pacific Northwest Trail so that it does not encroach upon the small and struggling Yaak Valley Grizzly Bear population. Hikers will disrupt the natural behaviors of these bears and disturb their peaceful habitat. Thank you for your consideration!

#283

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 16, 2020 11:21:59 PM
Last Modified: Monday, March 16, 2020 11:25:24 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:24
IP Address: 174.247.98.63

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tina Zenzola

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I was planning on attending the Choteau meeting as part of the general public. I also attended the meeting in Polson. Now that the Choteau meeting will be held via video conference, I'm wondering if there is any way the public will be able to listen in? I don't want to put additional strain on a difficult situation but I'm hoping that the general public can participate.

#284

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 17, 2020 3:01:00 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 17, 2020 3:01:30 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:30
IP Address: 99.240.232.101

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

David Oxford

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Lay off the grizzlies! They deserve better.

#285

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 17, 2020 7:54:13 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 17, 2020 7:59:45 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:32
IP Address: 73.94.204.169

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeanette Fordyce

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

You may want to ask yourself: what kind of person do I want to be? Am I someone who preserves/protects our wildlife...our wilderness; or how do I love our problems? Is killing animals viable? Do we chose for only ourselves or for others also? What about our children's children; don't they have a right to have wildlife as their world also. Not all states have wildlife like you do in Montana! There is a responsibility to our North America climate.

#286

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 17, 2020 5:12:02 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 17, 2020 5:21:04 PM
Time Spent: 00:09:02
IP Address: 107.182.40.123

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kelly R Sweeney

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Governor and members of the Grizzly Bear Advisory Council,

As a wildlife lover I urge you to do everything in your power to explore, fund and implement NON LETHAL methods of conflict mitigation between people and grizzly bears. Most people-in fact a vast majority of people-enjoy wildlife and want to see it protected. Studies show non lethal methods, when widely and properly employed, can be sufficient to prevent conflict between people and bears and to greatly lessen livestock losses due to predation by bears. PLEASE make lethal removal of bears the ABSOLUTE very last resort.

Sincerely,

Kelly R Sweeney

#287

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 18, 2020 1:35:31 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 18, 2020 1:38:19 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:47
IP Address: 50.209.128.54

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Rebecca Woodruff

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is not necessary to kill Grizzlies. It's simply cruel and a way for strange people to entertain themselves by killing innocent animals. No one needs to eat bears. Hunting should only be about food not bloodsport.

#288

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 18, 2020 6:24:04 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 18, 2020 6:52:10 PM
Time Spent: 00:28:05
IP Address: 69.145.22.63

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

KC York

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

As I believe grizzly experts can attest, to effectively and responsibly manage grizzlies, efforts to manage people will create the most favorable results for both species. We do not need to lower grizzly numbers, we need to lower conflicts or potential ones. Grizzlies remain at risk, continue experiencing high annual mortality and are not fully recovered. The fact areas exist with little to no conflicts now with grizzlies because non-lethal strategies have been utilized reinforces the need for widespread implementation and support. Some of these efforts have included secured garbage, electrified fencing, removing livestock carcasses or relocating them at a safe distance. Measures to respectfully coexist need to be the norm not the exception. Montana should be the state to step up, demonstrate and enhance this model. Lethal actions and opening hunting of grizzlies aren't the answer and are an irresponsible short term response promoting bragging rights for those who simply want an expensive wall or rug trophy. Thank you.

#289

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 6:14:08 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 6:14:29 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:21
IP Address: 84.234.130.24

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

E E

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please Please do not kill the bears.

#290

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 9:09:56 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 9:10:24 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:28
IP Address: 216.129.232.174

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Melody Martinsen

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please use full names in introductions and each person needs to restate their name when they speak.

#291

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 9:30:52 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 9:33:10 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:17
IP Address: 72.174.72.149

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Claudia Narcisco

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I'm listening on the conference call. There was mention of of support material for this meeting. Did I hear this correctly, and if so could you share with the public? Also, I was unable to attend Libby meeting and have been looking for the minutes. When will these be posted? Thanks for your work!

#292

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 9:33:27 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 10:04:12 AM
Time Spent: 00:30:45
IP Address: 72.174.72.149

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Claudia Narcisco

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I'm listening on the conference call. There was mention of of support material for this meeting. Did I hear this correctly, and if so could you share with the public? Also, I was unable to attend Libby meeting and have been looking for the minutes. When will these be posted? Thanks for your work!

#293

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 10:09:32 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 10:11:25 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:53
IP Address: 72.174.72.149

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I just submitted comment about availability of spreadsheets and other working material. Twice got a response that said thanks for the survey. Clearly, my comment is not being received. Also, Libby notes area not yet posted so public is in the dark.

#294

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 10:17:12 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 10:18:51 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:38
IP Address: 174.247.115.13

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bill Mckinley

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Not happy with the the groups not talking openly about how proper hunting regulations can improve grizzly bear acceptance amongst Montana's farmers and ranchers. Also need to address the fact that hunting can increase genetic diversity and contribute to a larger population of bears which is a goal for many!!!
Do the right thing whether it's popular or not

#295

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 10:57:16 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 10:59:16 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:00
IP Address: 206.127.126.53

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): **Respondent skipped this question**

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The meeting is impossible to follow when each group doesn't say what their topic is about. Really a poor way to facilitate a meeting

#296

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 10:57:15 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 10:59:47 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:31
IP Address: 216.129.232.174

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Melody Martinsen

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It would be nice if you could provide the Zoom addresses for the afternoon sessions and let people who are interested log in to listen to the small group of their choice. You could post these log in numbers on the GBAC website, could that facilitate public access to these small group meetings?

#297

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 11:08:06 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 11:10:50 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:44
IP Address: 216.220.13.84

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Senator Butch Gillespie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Did not understand if public can get back on or just the Advisory council members. Also can I send in some comments or questions I come up with listening to the morning session. thanks for having this available.

#298

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 12:26:13 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 12:29:06 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:52
IP Address: 192.230.170.205

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Joseph KIPP

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Extreme thanks to all members of gbac, for hosting secretary of interior last October. Great rewards for all Montana from your work.

#299

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 12:51:50 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 12:53:00 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:09
IP Address: 98.22.45.199

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

C N

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We love grizzly bears. These bears have reached the prescribed recovery and a small quota hunt would be nothing but beneficial for the bears, the land and people. Thank you

#300

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 3:07:18 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 3:07:51 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:32
IP Address: 73.82.246.218

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

John

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The bears are past their recovery point. A hunt is good for everyone involved

#301

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 3:17:32 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 3:20:09 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:37
IP Address: 98.247.70.179

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please re-instate Grizzly Bear Hunting as science and populations objectives have been met. Conservation benefits when hunting is involved. Ethical hunting sustains populations and brings money and resources that government does not and cannot. Not all things are answered by government. But hunting stewardship of our game species benefits the land and the animals.

#302

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 3:33:25 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 3:39:04 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:38
IP Address: 107.242.113.36

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

S. McCraine

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is such an amazing testament to science and the efforts of conservationists that the grizzly is doing so well. I want my children and grandchildren to enjoy the existence of these wonderful creatures in their natural environment. Hopefully the population continues to grow and an ethical science-based harvest can be implemented through a limited quota hunt.

#303

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 7:43:26 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 7:44:49 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:23
IP Address: 96.31.98.190

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Dan Fong

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is time for the grizzly to be delisted and managed locally by state game and fish. The GYE grizzly population is beyond healthy. I would like to see the population managed through big game tags, not depredation removals. Let local conservationists who know the land lead the way.

#304

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 19, 2020 12:51:10 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 19, 2020 9:52:15 PM
Time Spent: 09:01:04
IP Address: 216.220.13.84

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Senator Butch Gillespie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Time to reevaluate, protect what we have accomplished, and realize how much we need our Natural Resources and those that care for them.

#1- I am not against hunting , but to start with would it not be better to start culling the problem bears. Targeted hunts or relocating them to some kind of sanctuary where they can be viewed by people that want to see them up close, but do not want to be mauled in the process. Key would be, when to label a problem Bear. Ex. First time killing or mauling humans, livestock, pets. Ones that loiter around towns, cities, farms, ranches, public places should be educated not to do that. Their comfort zone needs to be away from these areas. That requires tough love. Rubber bullets and such come to mind, not the soft approaches that only antagonizes a little bit. Rubber bullets are proven to work when Grizzlies need to be dispersed by FWP to protect against attacks to large groups of tourists or Marathon runners in the Park.

2 Respect and treat our small town citizens, farm and ranch families, and all others that live in rural areas equal to how they would be treated if they lived in down town urban areas. No way would we, or should we, encourage or allow, Grizzlies to habitat our more urban areas.

#3- Don't tie the hands of our fellow citizens to protect themselves, or be subject to attack, just because their work place is in a rural setting growing food for a hungry nation, cutting timber for housing, tending to noxious weeds in our pristine natural resource areas, or many other necessary jobs to keep our economy vibrant in these trying times we are now confronted with.

#4 We face many challenges caring for our citizens and our environment. The corona virus is a major disruptor we are forced to confront face to face. It is time to reevaluate our priorities. Where and how we spend our time and invest limited resources is paramount.

#305

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 20, 2020 9:44:01 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 20, 2020 9:44:49 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:47
IP Address: 98.193.15.239

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Robert Aland

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Protect and preserve grizzly bears now and forever.

#306

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 20, 2020 9:46:26 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 20, 2020 9:48:31 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:04
IP Address: 209.193.109.59

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Anna Gamez and Courtney Long

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Before the session started, it would be beneficial for your public viewers to assume that we are not aware of the issues and strategies that are being discussed. It would be helpful to get a quick recap or list of those so we know what each group is addressing.

#307

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 20, 2020 10:04:35 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 20, 2020 10:08:22 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:47
IP Address: 72.174.72.149

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Claudia Narcisco

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Might be good for writing team to have a protocol that keeps other group member involved during the process. A lot of combined effort has gone into the process to date. Need to take care that all members thoughts, prioritization etc is accurately captured. I suggest a writing team review protocol is established.

#308

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 20, 2020 10:16:27 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 20, 2020 10:18:17 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:49
IP Address: 206.127.126.53

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

George Edwards

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Rather than BC or Alaska you should be looking at Alberta where it more closely matches Montana

#309

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 20, 2020 10:25:36 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 20, 2020 10:39:11 AM
Time Spent: 00:13:35
IP Address: 35.133.45.126

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Joe Kondelis - Western Bear Foundation

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

In terms of hunting and looking at different areas such as Kodiak and BC we think the group should look at areas more comparable to Montana. Although nothing is like Montana in terms of landscape, habitat, and potential for conflict there are some areas we think that would be better to look at.

If looking at Alaska peninsula your looking at a high population of a much larger bear. Your also looking at an area with high food sources and remarkable bear habitat. This is so much different than areas like the Rocky Mountain Front. Kodiak is an island with some of the biggest bears in the world. There is very limited bear conflict issues and the potential for conflict is minimal. We think the group should look at populations and hunting on the interior of Alaska and areas with high conflict potential such as around Anchorage. The interior bears are much more like the grizzly bears in Montana. Portions of the Interior provide over the counter hunts and other portions like the North Slope of the Brooks are draw hunts for Non-Residents. It may benefit the group to look at hunting in these areas and compare conflicts to hunting opportunity. We dont think the group can look at areas with OTC hunting opportunities and compare that to Montana which will never be an OTC hunting opportunity. We suggest trying to compare apples to apples as close as possible.

We do support hunting and are in support of delisting and providing a hunting opportunity for grizzly bears in Montana. We are also don't feel like hunting alone will solve the problem. Hunting is not going to immediately make bears afraid of people It will take generations to re-learn the bears. It wont happen over night. In Alaska bears have been hunted for ages, its not a new tactic there. The bears know this. It will take a very long time to break that learned behavior of Montana Bears.

I recently hunted grizzly bears in Alaska on the North Slope. One interesting point from the hunt I thought I would share. Alaskans have a very different idea of securing attractants in the back country than we are used to In many areas where sportsmen are in the back country it is recommended to keep your attractants and meat as close to your camp as possible The idea is that if a bear smells a person it is less likely to come to camp and receive a reward as they will smell humans. They equate humans to trouble and will avoid it. This has been the case for me on multiple trips hunting up there. They bears over they years of hunting have started to equate humans to danger and tend to stay away. This is what hunting has done. Hunting of grizzly bears up there has gone on for generations and the still have some of the most robust populations of bears in the world. Something to think about.

#310

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 20, 2020 11:24:10 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 20, 2020 11:25:13 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:02
IP Address: 174.208.7.50

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bill Mckinley

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Unfortunately the East front meeting wasn't able to happen.

I did listen to the discussions but wasn't impressed with the work accomplished. Prior to this I thought good ideas and recommendations came forward from your work. The "sensitive" issues need to be the priority moving forward, that's why you were appointed. If you can't come forward as a whole your time and effort will unfortunately be discredited. If you've read my takeaways from past meetings you'll notice the difference in my approach to comment. Please be willing to put extremes aside and focus on concepts and recommendations that will lead to successful grizzly bear management.

As always thanks for your time.

Bill McKinley

406 289-0432

There is no one size fits all strategy that makes for successful grizzly bear management !!!

#311

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 20, 2020 10:53:30 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 20, 2020 11:54:16 AM
Time Spent: 01:00:46
IP Address: 98.193.15.239

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Robert Aland

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

1. **HUNTING.** Hunting, as expected, dominated today's meeting, which I watched online. Hunting of the relatively few grizzly bears that remain should be prohibited, which is the current situation as a result of the ESA. First, hunting is not a "sport," the term used by several Council members today. Any sports fan knows that a true sport involves 2 or more competitors (individuals or teams) competing against each other with the same rules and equipment. A "hunter" sneaking up on an unsuspecting grizzly bear with a powerful weapon and killing it is only legal slaughter. The only reasons for killing a grizzly bear -all bad - are to gain access to its critical habitat for exploitation of natural resources, avoid losses to domestic livestock (usually on public lands at the public's expense), even though reimbursed, and decoration of the hunter's family room floor (of course, with a ferocious appearance to reflect the hunter's self-styled machoism). If the hunter wants a true sport, let her or him go into the forest on foot without a weapon and challenge the bear one-on-one. Guess which competitor would win that one. Or instead the hunter should go after the bear with a camera or binoculars, which provides the benefits without the slaughter. Some justify hunting as "part of our culture." That is false. Mr. Jackson or Mr. Sublette or other western icons would be appalled by hunting today with packs of dogs with electronic collars, bear baits and other disgusting practices. They hunted to survive; not for profit or to decorate their homes and to show their machoism.

2. **RECOVERY.** One of the council members today stated that she would like to hear from experts "what recovery looks like." That was a very wise comment, and I congratulate that member. Clearly the reduction of the number of grizzly bears in the "lower 48" from 75,000 - 100,000 to about 700 in the GYE and maybe 900 in the NCDE - nobody knows because they cannot be physically counted and instead are by counted by abstract formula by the US Fish & Wildlife Service, which has a direct interest in over-stating the number, is not recovery by any stretch of the imagination, especially in light of the lack of connectivity between the GYE and NCDE. I strongly suggest that the Council invite Dr. David Mattson, the leading grizzly bear expert, to make a presentation with regard to recovery. Another great expert would be the world-reknown scientist, Dr. Jane Goodall, who submitted comments to the USFWS with regard to the current delisting effort on behalf of herself and 65 other experts. If the Council instead invites a representative from the USFWS or the ID, MT or WY state wildlife agency, it will surely get false information with regard to numbers and the meaning of recovery.

3. **UNIQUE OPPORTUNITY.** This country and the entire world are facing a very sad and challenging situation at this time and for months (or longer) to come as a result of the coronavirus, staggering economies, strife in many places and other causes. People now want to see and read about good and uplifting developments; they do not want to read about sickness, death and destruction. We are no longer in a time of business as usual. That gives the Council the opportunity to do something special in its small corner of the world if it has the courage and foresight to seize the opportunity. Stop talking about hunting and looking for guidance to Kodiak, Alaska and BC. Instead look to preservation and protection of grizzly bears, which are icons of American history. Announce to the world that the Council rejects hunting/slaughter of the great bears and invite people from all over the world to come to Montana (when travel bans are lifted) to enjoy the incredible natural resources, including grizzly bears, and to bring their cameras and binoculars. Be leaders - not rubber stamps for the good ol' boys and girls who want business as usual with a continuation of the slaughter that got us to this point in the first place. This is what the younger generation wants in this country; that generation wants a more compassionate future, a future not burdened by archaic practices of the past such as slaughter in the name of sport that pleases relatively few. Look at the numbers; hunting is declining every year and, despite the efforts of sum, that decline cannot be stopped. To end with a true sports analogy: "Council, step up to the plate; protect and preserve."

Robert Aland
Winnetka, IL

#312

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 20, 2020 10:53:18 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 20, 2020 1:30:09 PM
Time Spent: 02:36:50
IP Address: 71.32.57.196

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

keith kubista

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I commend your commitment to march on with your efforts working remotely.

Postponing meetings, gathering additional information and the inability to have face to face interactions with others during this difficult time will also result in a gap in valuable public input, think about getting it right versus meeting a difficult deadline.

I think Mr. Grosfield raised some key points that need further deliberations.

As the Council moves forward creating a draft document I urge you to consider grizzly bear influenced human challenges especially as you evaluate connectivity areas, which is an important topic in the Governors Executive Order.

There is a significant difference between recovery zones and the connectivity areas that are dependent on activities essential for citizens well-being and livelihoods.

Nothing is more important during such times as we are now in than to protect and maintain our self reliance activities needed to sustain human interests.

The document like the briefing paper Charlie Sperry referenced needs to be publicly available as soon as possible.

Lastly I am re-submitting some of my initial comments from 8-14-19 recommending the Council's Final Report for grizzly bear management include a regulated public hunting season.

This is an essential option in the management plan to ensure FWP, Fish and Wildlife Commission (Commission), and the citizens of Montana achieve activities that state based grizzly bear management has always intended.

Hunting is the most effective method of balancing grizzly bear numbers for minimizing livestock depredations against private property, grizzly bear attacks on humans, and reducing the burden of government on the taxpayers of Montana.

FWP and the Commission insinuated there would be regulated public hunting season by signing a science-based Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) between Montana, Idaho, and Wyoming for the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem to allocate discretionary mortality to include public harvest (hunting).

Additionally The Interagency Grizzly Bear Committee (IGBC) created and endorsed the Grizzly Bear Hunting Position Statement that supports the use of regulated public hunting for grizzly bears and follows the principles of the North American Model of Wildlife Conservation.

FWP as a member of the IGBC endorsed hunting expressed in this statement.

Furthermore one of the duties of the Council is to recognize interagency commitments already in place such as the existing MOA, MOU's, ARM's, and MCA statutes and the position statement all of which contain references or preferences regarding hunting of grizzly bears once they are delisted.

There is a long trail of consistency in various types of current documents, reports, plans, conservation strategies etc. that include hunting of grizzly bears. It's vital to continue this uniformity within the Council's Final Report.

Montana has been sustainably harvesting recovered wolves and game animals for many years using science based regulated hunting seasons specifically crafted not to threaten their populations, that include adaptive management with systematic monitoring, recovered grizzly bears should be no different.

It is noteworthy that despite some divisiveness the wolf advisory council included hunting within the range of tools for management.

It is prudent to look ahead and provide language that includes hunting in the Council's Final Report given the litigious environment surrounding grizzly bear management.

Due to the saga of legal challenges in Montana and other states, inevitably groups and individuals will look to challenge grizzly bear hunting if the Council's Final Report for state-based management do not contain language supporting regulated public hunting of grizzly bears.

Thank you for considering these comments.

Keith Kubista

#313

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 10:32:00 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 10:43:51 AM
Time Spent: 00:11:51
IP Address: 24.46.255.110

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lisa Haut

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Peaceful coexistence with our majestic wildlife is the answer. Hunting will not prevent conflicts. Please fund non-lethal methods of coexistence. If we can educate ranchers and citizens in areas with bears, and prepare people where bears haven't shown up yet, on how to live with grizzlies, we can have a landscape where both bears and people can survive. Our national wildlife heritage belongs to all Americans, not just trophy hunters!

#314

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 10:50:01 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 10:51:04 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:03
IP Address: 174.106.180.119

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Yvette Rogers

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Leave the bears alone!!

#315

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 11:01:24 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 11:03:52 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:27
IP Address: 142.114.242.52

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Barrie K Gilbert, PhD

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

My name is Barrie Gilbert. I am an independent scientist with a specialty in Grizzly bear behavior and ecology, stretching of 40 years from Yellowstone to British Columbia and three sites in Alaska. I have kept aware of grizzly population and management issues in Montana and elsewhere over those years. Recently I published a book on bear behavior based on my direct observations and interactions with bears. I very much appreciate the opportunity to provide science-based input.

Grizzly bears are managed as a public trust, as an iconic carnivore species whose survival and conservation are of supreme interest to the American people. Unfortunately, the idea that they are nearing "recovery" is not compatible with the tenets of conservation biology or bear population survival in the long term. I offer the following appraisal and facts.

- Grizzlies numbered in the tens of thousands in the past so gains in the GYE from approximately 200 bears creates an illusion of success. This perception is called the "shifting baseline syndrome", which utilizes increases from recent low population numbers as indicative of success.
 - Satisfactory recovery of grizzlies requires isolated populations to expand their range to become connected with other populations, both for genetic heterogeneity and broader adaptive capacity. When human-caused mortality degrades bear emigration the implications for negative impacts are manifest, both behaviorally and genetically. For example, we could predict a decrease in behavioral adaptability and changes in habitat selection to more secure habitat but perhaps less nutritious food sources.
 - Managing Montana bears should: aim at connecting populations; improve the security of bear habitat by reducing human-caused mortality (now at an unsustainable rate); reject a hunting season on grizzlies: improve enforcement on roads on public land; improve hunter education to reduce bear-human conflicts especially during hunting season and through better handling a big game kills.
 - Although federal agencies have the mandate to manage terrestrial habitat, state agencies have additional opportunities to manage human behavior to benefit grizzly bear survival. An example would be to reduce aversive treatment of bears and improve the handling of attractants that lead to conflict and mortality of bears. There are many techniques (too detailed for treatment here) that ranchers, land-owners and trail users can employ to reduce conflicts rather than capturing and transporting bears to habitat unfamiliar to bears and thus threatening their survival.
-

#316

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 11:06:33 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 11:08:31 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:57
IP Address: 92.107.5.118

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Catherine

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Why do you want killing poor innocent bear ? It's just inhumain. These poor souls deserve to live free and safely. Please stop this insane killing !

#317

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 11:34:10 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 11:37:21 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:11
IP Address: 148.74.85.106

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Joyce dannheim

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The human race. USF learn to coexist with our wildlife in a humane way. We take their IBd and invite them into our neighborhood with garbSge. BeTs are sentient beings and deserve to live. Trophy hunting g will accomplish nothing. Bears do not hunt humans. Please take steps to educate people how to coexist with bears and do the right thing.

#318

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 12:46:59 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 12:57:20 PM
Time Spent: 00:10:21
IP Address: 63.153.98.109

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lance Olsen

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I was president of the Great Bear Foundation for 10 years during which many biologists including Chuck Jonkel and John Craighead generously devoted large amounts of time to my learning about the grizzly bear. For about the last 18 years, I've run a listserv about climate, species and ecosystems for university scientists, active and retired agency staff, the staff of conservation groups operating from local to global scale, and graduate students. Here, you will see my comments to the US Fish and Wildlife Service for its 5 year review of the status of the grizzly bear.

To : United States Department of Interior, Fish and Wildlife Service
From: Lance Olsen, 624 E. Pine C3, Missoula MT 59802
Subject : Comment on 5-year grizzly bear status review
Date: Submitted by email to grizzly_review@fws.gov on January 20, 2020

Thank you for the opportunity to offer comment on the 5-year grizzly bear status review.

This will be a commentary and literature review centered around lines of evidence necessary and essential to determining the status of grizzly bears, and to determining need for continued protection and support of these bears.

Although this review is intended to provide material information necessary and essential, it is not intended to be exhaustive.

Preface: Some basic points to be covered in this comment

Across many decades, an increasing human population has been moving into historic grizzly bear habitat no longer occupied by grizzly bears, and settling there. These past years and decades of human residential development in the grizzly's former habitat seemed to have posed no immediate risk of conflict for grizzlies when the bears were still absent, but did establish an enduring legacy of risk now that an initial few grizzlies are making an early, exploratory attempt to recover access to that same former habitat.

Put most briefly, the grizzly's status today had already been determined by human settlement and residential development of yesterday, but the effect hadn't been evident until today.

This belated impact of earlier human occupation places it in the realm identified by the sciences as a "lag effect," where the impact of an action is a "done deal" or fiat accompli that does not appear until some years or even decades after it was initiated.

Likewise, the grizzly's status in the future is being decided by additional residential development of today, and, importantly, the years of residential development ahead will add cumulatively increased risk over and above risk established in years gone by.

Moreover, the predictable — and predicted — future years of even more human residential development in grizzly habitat will come in tandem with the predictable — and predicted — future years of climate change.

For climate change, too, the lag effect is an important fact, because felt increases of temperature can lag behind emissions by 10-30 years, so that emissions released to the atmosphere 10-30 years ago could not be felt until today, and the emissions we now release every day will have been a "done deal" unavoidably forcing temperatures to new heights 10-30 years from now.

Dual lag effects suggest an unavoidably worsening future for grizzlies on two fronts. However, when the conditions affecting grizzly bears and their habitat were described in 2011, CO2 emission levels of the year were not included. This was an important mistake, an error of omission that mustn't be repeated because, for all scientific purposes, emissions are a de facto feature of habitat with at least some predictive power. In the present grizzly bear status review is conducted, current emissions must be listed along with other conditions including roads.

Human occupation of the historic homelands that grizzlies are trying to recover can be permanent, a.k.a., irreversible and irretrievable. The same is largely true of climate change; i.e., Solomon et al (2009) found that, once CO2 emissions are released to the atmosphere by combustion of fossil fuels, the emissions remain in the atmosphere long enough that temperatures can not even begin to fall for

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

by combustion of fossil fuels, the emissions remain in the atmosphere long enough that temperatures can not even begin to fall for 1,000 years. While temperatures may begin to taper off at that point, it is a long, slow process with effects lingering as long as 10,000 years (Eby et al 2009).

Even at present levels, temperature is an important feature of all animals' habitat. As a feature of animal habitat, temperature has some potentially adverse consequences. At the predicted extremes of the future, it can affect animals directly via threats at the physiological level. Even when heat has not reached lethal levels, it can easily have several important physiological consequences adversely affecting animal health and survival. Likewise, temperature affects animals indirectly via via threats to other important features of habitat, including soil moisture and plant vitality.

Human population trends and temperature trends are interactive. For example, heat-driven drought notably forces wild species to travel farther to find a drink of water and a bite to eat, and this routinely forces them into contact and, importantly, conflict with the still-increasing residential development put into effect by a still increasing human population.

An apparently increasing number of grizzly bears in tandem with a well-documented increasing number of humans vying for occupation of the same acreage heightens risk of bear-human conflict. These conflicts have a demonstrated history of leading to the killing of grizzly bears.

There is legitimate and reasonable cause for concern that the grizzly's present, initial, tentative attempt to recover former, but increasingly human-occupied, homelands can be slowed and reversed by the long increased and still-increasing human presence. There is highly similar reason for concern that the grizzly's current, tentative attempt at recovering access to former homelands can be slowed and reversed by the increasing heat that is and will be forcing change on the habitat conditions basic to grizzly survival. Thus, while an apparently increasing number of grizzlies may seem basis for the contrary, extinction can't be ruled out.

Alternatively, and more optimistically, we may end up with a perpetually endangered grizzly that, with considerable effort, can be maintained at stable levels despite risk of reversal.

Best available evidence

"Whereas any one line of evidence may be weak in itself, a number of lines of evidence, taken together and found to be consistent, reinforce one another exponentially."

Preston Cloud and Aharon Gibor. The Oxygen Cycle.
Scientific American, September 1970

I will cite references at the end of this referenced comment/review. I will also be submitting pdfs of all but very few of the referenced studies.

For your convenience, I'll label each submitted pdf with the last name of the lead author and date of publication; e.g., Anderson 2011.

I will not present any one study as best available science, or any one researcher, or any one research team, or studies from any one scientific journal, or from any other source — e.g., National Wildlife Federation — as best available science. I am confident about the competence and credibility of each referenced article, and believe that the lines of evidence they present together require a hard look during the 5-year grizzly bear status review.

People and grizzlies compete for access to the same acreage

"'We are facing more bears and more people and therein lies the challenge,' said council member Caroline Byrd of Bozeman." Byrd was so quoted in a northwest Montana Daily Interlake news report on a recent meeting of Montana governor Steve Bullock's Grizzly Bear Council.

Her observation — and it's implications — were borne out on page 59 of the Biological Assessment for Threatened, Endangered, and Proposed Species Forest Plan Amendments <>; "The human population in northwest Montana has grown at a relatively high rate during the past few decades, and growth is expected to continue." As a result, "Increasing residential development and demand for

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

recreational opportunities can result in habitat loss, habitat fragmentation, and increases in grizzly bear human conflicts. These impacts are likely to intensify.”

This likely intensification will be a worsening of conditions basic to the grizzly's future ability to make an attempted recovery.

The Biological Assessment does add a general, vague assurance that, “appropriate residential planning, outreach about how to minimize adverse effects of this likely intensification, and assistance in resolving conflicts can help mitigate these impacts.”

However, mitigation only softens blows, if indeed effected, and the source of funding necessary to planning, outreach, and assistance in resolving conflict remains uncertain and undefined. Indeed, though many efforts to reduce conflict have actually been put in place in the NCDE, mortality rates are achieving record levels and local media report that managers are “running out of options.”

The Biological Assessment goes on to say, “Increasing development on private lands has the potential to have cumulative adverse effects on the NCDE grizzly bear population.”

Cumulative adverse effects translate directly to worsening conditions for the grizzly bear population.

However, there is no evidence of intent to monitor the expansion of residential development, which would be fundamental to detection of a worsening situation for wildlife in general and the grizzly bear in particular. Instead, monitoring seems restricted to monitoring the population status of the grizzly; “Monitoring of population status will provide a mechanism to identify areas of concern so that appropriate preventive or corrective actions can be taken.”

Monitoring the status of the bear population would amount to waiting for the bear to respond a worsening situation. This delay, at a minimum, raises at least some concern about risk that the bear's recent, tentative attempts at recovery can be slowed, stalled, and reversed. It may even indicate that a slowing and reversal is a done deal, with a lag effect that won't show up for years or decades.

Hansen et al (2005) suggest just such a lag effect for species affected by expanding residential development in rural settings; “This 'exurban' development (6-25 homes/km²) includes urban fringe development (UFD) on the periphery of cities and rural residential development (RRD) in rural areas attractive in natural amenities,” and add that the effects of residential real estate development “may be manifest for several decades following exurban development, so that biodiversity is likely still responding to the wave of exurban expansion that has occurred since 1950.”

The lasting impact of human range expansion in the form of land development was again emphasized in a broadly based, global finding that “lag time” from action to later consequence means that land use exerts cumulative influence on the biodiversity of the future, often leaving an “extinction debt” in which extinctions occur long after the conditions that set them in motion (Essl et al, 2015).

Among other things, this means that the conditions existing in 2011 were not what they seemed, simply because they were never going to remain the same, thanks to foreseeable impact of a done deal. In effect, the future had already been decided.

Interestingly and as importantly as the noted lag effect, Hansen et al also report that, “RRD is more likely than UFD to occur near public lands; hence it may have a larger influence on nature reserves and wilderness species.”

In other words, residential development can exert influence beyond its own borders.

Hansen et al have been far from alone in noting this broader impact. For just three examples, Radeloff et al (2010), Martinuzzi et al (2015), and Dimarco et al (2015) also cite evidence pointing in that direction.

Radeloff et al reported that “... housing growth poses the main threat to protected areas in the United States whereas deforestation is the main threat in developing countries,” and that, “US protected areas are increasingly isolated, housing development in their surroundings is decreasing their effective size ...”

Martinuzzi et al find that “Land use change around protected areas can diminish their conservation value,” and add that discouraging urbanization around National Forests can reduce future pressures, but, “Overall, our results highlight that future land-use change

around protected areas is likely to be substantial.”

The likelihood of likely future substantial impact reported by Martinuzzi et al is highly consistent with the finding with NCDE finding that the expected expansion of residential development in Montana is “likely to intensify.”

The importance of protecting land around protected areas had also been underscored by Prugh et al (2008) whose detailed analysis led to a conclusion that, while protected areas – and their size -- “are indeed important factors,” conservation may get even higher returns by improving the habitat quality of lands around and between them. In their review of Prugh et al, Franklin and Lindenmayer (2009) agreed, saying, “Matrix management matters because formal reserve systems will never cover more than a small fraction of the globe; human-modified land —the matrix— overwhelmingly dominates.”

Given likely future trends, the developed-land matrix adjacent to and near to protected areas will be exerting more not less influence on wildlife including grizzly bears in coming years and decades. Authors of a recent study project that human population growth “will result in a significant anthropogenic environmental change worldwide through increases in developed land (DL) consumption an important environmental and socioeconomic process affecting humans and ecosystems (Grekousis and Mountrakis, 2015).”

The name of the game is reducible to a single word. Fragmentation, which translates directly to likely increased difficulty for grizzly success in movement and travel for instance between the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem (NCDE) and Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem (GYE).

To the degree that continued expansion of residential development surrounding protected protected areas is substantial, it's going to be consequential for the grizzly's own attempts at expansion; Di Marco et al report that human pressures predict species' geographic range size better than biological traits. They add that “Climatic and human impacts have determined the extinction of mammal species in the past and are the main factors shaping the present distribution of mammals.”

The importance of local decisions specific to grizzlies was apparent in a recent meeting of Montana governor Steve Bullock's Grizzly Council, as reported in the Daily Interlake (DIL). As the following excerpt from the DIL report indicates that grizzlies involved in bear-human conflict are often euthanized — killed by agency staff — that agencies are “running out of options,” and that the grizzly's much acclaimed expansion is thus being slowed, stalled, even its early stages. Reversal and possible extinction cannot be ruled out.

Excerpt

The 18-member group has four more public meetings before submitting recommendations to the governor that may be used to determine future policies on how to manage Montana's growing population numbers of grizzlies.

“They've now stabilized. But nobody told the bear they were supposed to only live in the wilderness and it turns out we don't know whether we are prepared to recover the griz across the state,” said Mike Thompson with FWP's Region 2.

Multiple researchers addressed the council, detailing scenarios of relocation, or when a bear is moved to an already bear-occupied portion of a recovery zone. And the takeaway was there are few protocols in place for dealing with bears like the one in Stevensville. That is, a grizzly that is a non-target bear without much of a history of conflict but has found itself encroaching on, and eventually disturbing human civilization in some capacity.

Stacy Courville, a wildlife biologist for the Confederated Salish and Kootenai Tribes, talked about the slim rate of success his team has had in relocating bears from the Flathead Reservation to areas such as Arlee and Glacier National Park.

“The majority of the bears I relocate to the north in the Flathead or Glacier, don't stay there,” Courville explained. “I don't know what the solution to that is, but the conflict bears that are moved a long ways don't have high success rates.”

The term “success” is broad, but generally is measured by whether the bear survives in its new habitat or whether the bear manages to stay away from civilization and out of trouble. For Courville, he said relocations are often unsuccessful because “they just bounce all over the place, sometimes wandering 80 to 100 miles back to where we first picked them up.” He added that relocating is sometimes just a way to buy locals time to fix a problem before the bear comes back whether it be removing an attractant, installing certain bear-resistant trash containers or building an electric fence.

“There is always a discussion about what the bear has done, where we should move it. But a lot of times we don't have a choice and we remove,” Courville said.

The sentiment was one shared by other wildlife managers who seem to be running out of options for relocation as populations grow. This above-demonstrated potential for a slowing recovery, in this case mediated by repeated, bear-by-bear euthenization, has to be

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

recognized as an early warning for prospects of recovery. For one example of lines of evidence about early warning about risk to recovery, consider the van Nes et al (2007) observation that, "recovery rates decrease as a catastrophic regime shift is approached, a phenomenon known in physics as 'critical slowing down.' In all the models we analyzed, critical slowing down becomes apparent quite far from a threshold point, suggesting that it may indeed be of practical use as an early warning signal."

The following years saw continuing interest in risk of critical slowing down and catastrophic shifts in natural systems (e.g., Biggs et al, 2009; Drake and Griffen, 2010; Carpenter et al, 2011; Dai et al, 2012; Dakos et al 2014, and Jarvis 2016).

In continuing concern about risk revealed in these successive studies, Martin et al (2015) could report that catastrophic shift is "a paramount concern" and that examples "can be found in ecology, climate sciences, and economics, to name a few, where regime shifts have catastrophic consequences that are mostly irreversible."

In its Winter 1982 issue, the University of Montana forestry school's magazine, Western Wildlands, devoted an entire issue to articles by experts speaking to the status of grizzly bears in the lower 48 states. In his article, US Fish and Wildlife Service biologist Chris Servheen said development (i.e., subdivision) and human occupation was the "most detrimental" thing that could happen to grizzly country.

I feel secure in arguing that it would be arbitrary and capricious to suggest that risk of critical slowing down and catastrophic shift arising from bear-human conflict in areas of present and likely future substantial residential development can be excluded from consideration of the grizzly's status, including whether the grizzly will require continued protection and support of the Endangered Species Act.

Heat can exert life or death influence across mammalian species

Please consider the quick blurbs immediately below as a preface to the commentary and literature review that will follow.

"As much as a decade ago a climate symposium organized to discuss the implications of a 4 C warmer world concluded, 'Less than a billion people will survive.' Here Schellnhuber is quoted as saying: 'At 4 C Earth's... carrying capacity estimates are below 1 billion people.' His words were echoed by professor Kevin Anderson of the U.K.'s Tyndall Centre for Climate Change: 'Only about 10 per cent of the planet's population would survive at 4 C.'"

"Similarly, in May of this year, Johan Rockström, current director of the Potsdam Institute opined that in a 4 C warmer world: 'It's difficult to see how we could accommodate 8 billion people or even half of that.... it will be a turbulent, conflict-ridden world.'

Meanwhile, greenhouse gas concentrations are still increasing."
<https://thetyee.ca/Analysis/2019/09/18/Climate-Crisis-Wipe-Out/>

"'Right now, there is an enormously heated debate within the climate modelling community,' said Earth system scientist Johan Rockstrom, director of the Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research."

"'You have 12 or 13 models showing sensitivity which is no longer 3C, but rather 5C or 6C with a doubling of CO2,' he told AFP. 'What is particularly worrying is that these are not the outliers.'"

"Models from France, the US Department of Energy, Britain's Met Office and Canada show climate sensitivity of 4.9C, 5.3C, 5.5C and 5.6C respectively, Zelinka said."

"'Climate sensitivity has been in the range of 1.5C to 4.5C for more than 30 years. If it is now moving to between 3C and 7C, that would be tremendously dangerous.'"

<>

--

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

Camilo Mora: " our choices for deadly heat are now between more of it or a lot more of it."

<https://www.ahajournals.org/doi/abs/10.1161/circoutcomes.117.004233>

Michael Mann: ""A new normal makes it sound like we have arrived in a new position, and that's where we're going to be. But if we continue to burn fossil fuels ... we are going to ... get worse and worse droughts, and heat waves, and super storms, and floods, and wildfires."

<https://www.pbs.org/newshour/show/climate-change-is-making-wildfires-more-extreme-heres-how>

Kate Marvel: "The whole idea that everything's going to work out isn't really helpful because it isn't going to work out " said Kate Marvel a climate scientist at the NASA Goddard Institute for Space Studies. Climate change is going to worsen to a point where millions of lives, homes, and species are put at risk she said.

<https://newrepublic.com/article/151608/case-against-climate-pessimism>

No studies have been done to provide explicit evidence specific to the grizzly bear's risks in an "extremely dangerous" future with somewhere between 3C and 7C heat added above historic levels. Likewise, no studies have been done to provide explicit evidence specific to the grizzly's risks in a world with increasing frequency and extent of deadly heat, worse and worse droughts, worse and worse heat waves, or where things worsen to a point where millions of lives, homes, and species are put at risk.

One might contend that the absence of these studies is an absence of best available evidence necessary to determine the status of grizzly bears, including whether grizzlies require continued protection and support provided by the Endangered Species Act

But it's not like we're flying blind, because "best available" evidence doesn't have to come from studies exclusive to grizzly bears in order to inform us about the status of these bears.

For example, it is abundantly clear that all animals, indeed all organisms, have thermal limits. In spelling out these limits, and their important implications, Portner et al (2008), say ""All organisms live within a limited range of body temperatures," and that, "Direct effects of climatic warming can be understood through fatal decrements in an organism's performance in growth, reproduction, foraging, immune competence, behaviors and competitiveness."

That fundamental point was also made evident by Dell et al (2013). "... organisms have a physiological response to temperature, and these responses have important consequences biological rates and times (e.g. metabolic rate, growth, reproduction, mortality and activity) vary with temperature."

With that stage set, it is important to recognize that temperature has important influence across a broad range of animal life even at sub-lethal levels. For example, both Portner et al and Dell et al point to temperature's effect on reproduction. In an article devoted to review of the literature on temperature's effect on reproduction in mammals, Hansen (2009) summarizes the breadth of those effects. "Heat stress can have large effects on most aspects of reproductive function in mammals. These include disruptions in spermatogenesis and oocyte development, oocyte maturation, early embryonic development, foetal and placental growth and lactation. These deleterious effects of heat stress are the result of either the hyperthermia associated with heat stress or the physiological adjustments made by the heat-stressed animal to regulate body temperature."

I feel secure in arguing that heat alone can slow recovery of a mammal, if only by affecting its reproduction, and that it would be arbitrary and capricious to suggest that this risk can be excluded from consideration of the grizzly's status, including whether the grizzly will require continued protection and support of the Endangered Species Act.

Note that Portner et al and Dell refer to heat's implications for physiology extend to animal behavior; e.g. performance, activity. Portner et al provide important detail at the physiological level. "Performance in animals is supported by aerobic scope, the increase in oxygen consumption rate from resting to maximal," and that only a passive anaerobic existence is possible beyond thermal limits.

Any increased demand for oxygen during physical exertion under increasing heat has direct implications for any animal involved in

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

The increased demand for oxygen during physical exertion under increasing heat has direct implications for any animal involved in vigorous activity. For grizzlies, that would include necessary and normal behavior including digging, running in pursuit of prey, running to avoid a human or humans, even mating and the frequently vigorous play of cubs. In turn, an animal's oxygen demand may be linked to its risk of extinction (McAlester, 1970). A more recent report indicates that a vertebrate animal's oxygen demand can impose limits on the animal's tolerance for heat (Smith et al, 2015).

The impact of heat extends beyond animals to plants. Grizzlies depend on plants for food, and rely on food from animals that themselves depend on plants. Mora et al (2015) report that suitable days for plant growth will decrease globally by 11% under a business as usual climate future. (For additional documentation of the future of plants in a hotter world, see the following pages referring to drought.)

A hotter world is unavoidable due to a lag in the climate system's response to the emissions of any given day or year.

It has become clear that additional heat, heat above the levels documented at a point in time, is a done deal, or fiat accompli, before it will be felt, because of a lag effect that keeps species and landscapes from feeling the full effect for 10 to 30 years (e.g., Ricke et al 2014). Among other things, this lag effect in the climate system means that the conditions existing for grizzlies in 2011 were already destined to worsen, thanks to foreseeable impact of a done deal set in motion by the CO₂ emitted in that year. Likewise, the conditions true for grizzlies in 2020 will have unavoidably changed for the worse 10 to 30 years from now, because of CO₂ released to the atmosphere in 2020.

However, when the conditions affecting grizzly bears and their habitat were described in 2011, CO₂ emission levels of the year were not included. This was an important mistake, an error of omission that mustn't be repeated because, for all scientific purposes, emissions are a de facto feature of habitat with at least some predictive power. In the present grizzly bear status review is conducted, current emissions must be listed along with other conditions including roads.

Journalist Elizabeth Kolbert, who has become an increasingly authoritative source in her own right, made direct reference the lag effect in the climate system during a recent interview.

Elizabeth Kolbert : "There's a lot of time lag in the system, there's a lot of inertia in the system."

Interviewer : "The system, meaning science?"

Kolbert: "No, in the climate system. So we have not yet experienced the full impact of the greenhouse gases we have already put up there. And once we do, you know, in whatever, a decade or so, there's a sort of a long tail to that, we will have put up that much more. So we are fighting a very very, very uphill battle."

<https://www.newyorker.com/news/the-new-yorker-interview/bill-mckibben-and-elizabeth-kolbert-on-the-un-extinction-report>

NASA stressed the same basic point in an online Climate Q & A

Climate Q&A

If we immediately stopped emitting greenhouses gases, would global warming stop?

"Not right away. The Earth's surface temperature does not react instantaneously to the energy imbalance created by rising carbon dioxide levels. This delayed reaction occurs because a great deal of the excess energy is stored in the ocean, which has a tremendous heat capacity. Because of this lag (which scientists call "thermal inertia"), even the 0.6–0.9 degrees of global warming we have observed in the past century is not the full amount of warming we can expect from the greenhouse gases we have already emitted. Even if all emissions were to stop today, the Earth's average surface temperature would climb another 0.6 degrees or so over the next several decades before temperatures stopped rising.

"The time lag is one reason why there is a risk in waiting to control greenhouse gas emissions until global warming becomes worse or its effects more serious and obvious. If we wait until we feel the amount or impact of global warming has reached an intolerable level, we will not be able to "hold the line" at that point; some further warming will be unavoidable<>."

Thus, without accounting for the lag effect, much of evidence available for determining conditions for the grizzly in 2011 was effectively

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

science via the rear-view mirror, because it failed to account for what was already unavoidable change. And, without accounting for the lag effect, much of the evidence available for determining conditions for grizzlies in 2020 is also science via the rear-view mirror, again because the future is already locked in by the emissions of today.

Evaluation of conditions pertinent to grizzly bears without accounting for the lag effect is arbitrary and capricious for purposes determining the status of grizzlies and for purposes of determining whether or not the grizzly bear will require future protection and support of the Endangered Species Act.

Future heat increase is not made inevitable by the lag effect alone.

Evidence has mounted in recent recent years that additional heat is also foreseeable from positive feedbacks that propel heat to higher levels over and above the heat forced by fossil fuel combustion. Positive feedbacks — feedbacks that make an already heated world even hotter — are not a new topic in climate studies, as physicist Spencer Weart reminded fellow physicists in an August 2, 2003 Physics Today article, The Discovery of Rapid Climate Change.

"During the early decades of the 20th century," Weart tells his fellow physicists, "a very few meteorologists did speculate about possibilities for rapid change. The most striking scenario was offered in 1925 by the respected climate expert C. E. P. Brooks, who suggested that a slight change of conditions might set off a self-sustaining shift between climate states. Suppose, he said, some random decrease of snow cover in northern latitudes exposed dark ground. Then the ground would absorb more sunlight, which would warm the air, which would melt still more snow—a vicious feedback cycle.

<https://physicstoday.scitation.org/doi/10.1063/1.1611350>

Same as evaluation of conditions pertinent to evaluation of conditions pertinent to grizzlies is insufficient without accounting for the lag effect, evaluation of conditions pertinent to the status of grizzly bears without accounting for positive feedbacks would also be arbitrary and capricious for purposes of any forward-looking wildlife management, including whether or not the grizzly bear will require future protection and support of the Endangered Species Act.

Positive feedbacks are forced into existence by the heat we add to the atmosphere when firing up the fossil fuels. For example, the heat driven by fossil fuel combustion is apparently already thawing permafrost that holds substantial reserves of carbon, and the thaw ends up releasing this carbon as emissions no matter what we do at this point. Moreover, like the emissions from combustion of fossil fuels (Solomon 2009, Eby 2009), the emissions from thawing permafrost will remain in the atmosphere for 1,000 to 10,000 years.

The core concern here is that we have plausibly made positive feedbacks a done deal by our continued combustion of fossil fuels. The larger concern lies in evidence that we've plausibly created more positive feedbacks than just one (Steffen et al 2018), thus setting conditions for all life on Earth, including the grizzly bear.

The Steffen et al article caught the attention of scientists and journalists worldwide, earning far-flung coverage including Germany's Deutsche Welle;

Domino effect could heat up Earth by 5 degrees Celsius

<https://www.dw.com/en/domino-effect-could-heat-up-earth-by-5-degrees-celsius-despite-paris-climate-deal/a-44968248>

Aug 6, 2018 ... Even if the Paris agreement is successfully implemented, the planet could still heat up by 5 degrees Celsius, scientists warn.

Deutsche Welle including direct quotes from the authors;

"Our study suggests that human-induced global warming of 2 degrees Celsius may trigger other Earth system processes, often called 'feedbacks,' that can drive further warming — even if we stop emitting greenhouse gases."

And:

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

"These tipping elements can potentially act like a row of dominos. Once one is pushed over, it pushes Earth toward another. It may be very difficult or impossible to stop the whole row of dominoes from tumbling over."

The above referenced PNAS article:

Steffen, Rockström et al. Trajectories of the Earth System in the Anthropocene. PNAS August 2018. [Open access]

<http://www.pnas.org/content/early2018/07/31/1810141115>

Temperature trends in Montana have direct relevance to the status of the state's wild species including albeit certainly not limited to the status of the grizzly bear. Pederson et al (2008), well ahead of the global average of 1C additional heat, report changes in "ecologically and socially meaningful thresholds." They found that, The daily temperature time series reveal extremely cold days ($\leq -17.8^{\circ}\text{C}$) terminate on average 20 days earlier and decline in number, whereas extremely hot days ($\geq 32^{\circ}\text{C}$) show a three-fold increase in number and a 24-day increase in seasonal window during which they occur. Results show that regionally important thresholds have been exceeded, the most recent of which include the timing and number of the 0°C freeze/thaw temperatures during spring and fall. Finally, we close with a discussion on the implications for Montana's ecosystems. Special attention is given to critical processes that respond non-linearly as temperatures exceed critical thresholds, and have positive feedbacks that amplify the changes."

The lag effect and positive feedbacks may not be the end of the story

In preparation for the next major report from IPCC, the 6th such report, scientists around the world have joined in a common effort to achieve the next-better models of climate change, hoping to settle on the next best single model, with the acronym CMIP6.

The scientists' latest effort has led them to concern that they have been underestimating how much heat is coming. The basis of the possible underestimate lies in assumptions about how clouds will respond to heat already trapped in the atmosphere by emissions released with combustion of fossil fuels.

It's long been known that clouds will be forced to respond. The big question has long been how.

Much hangs in balance because some clouds can reflect incoming solar radiation away from land and oceans, with a cooling effect. But other clouds can act as heat traps much like emissions do, adding to the heat from emissions alone.

In January, 2020, Geophysical Research Letters published the latest study (Zelinka et al, 2020) on the kinds of clouds we're might get, and the amount of heat we might get because of the clouds we'll get . I asked lead author Zelinka for a copy, but he sent only the manuscript as submitted instead of the full pdf, so I'll upload that.

But the response of the relevant science community has rippled into media coverage, including this, so I can offer that much here:

"Right now, there is an enormously heated debate within the climate modelling community,' said Earth system scientist Johan Rockstrom, director of the Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research."

"You have 12 or 13 models showing sensitivity which is no longer 3C, but rather 5C or 6C with a doubling of CO2,' he told AFP. 'What is particularly worrying is that these are not the outliers.'"

"Models from France, the US Department of Energy, Britain's Met Office and Canada show climate sensitivity of 4.9C, 5.3C, 5.5C and 5.6C respectively, Zelinka said."

According to Rockstrom, "Climate sensitivity has been in the range of 1.5C to 4.5C for more than 30 years. If it is now moving to between 3C and 7C, that would be tremendously dangerous."

<>

--

Temperatures of the future have been central to recent years of debate about “safe” versus “dangerous” levels of additional heat, mostly centered around whether an increase of 1.5 Celsius above pre-industrial levels is a truer limit on safety than an increase of 2 Celsius (Tschakert, 2015).

Wherever the safety limit may be, heat can have important impact even at sub-lethal levels, and wild species' and wild systems' response to increases of temperature was already evident even before we forced heat higher than today's 1C above historic levels. A review of over 800 studies dealing “exclusively with observed responses of wild biological species and systems,” found that “A surprising result is the high proportion of species responding to recent, relatively mild climate change (global average warming of 0.6 C).” (Parmesan, 2006).

Parmesan's finding of effects on a “high proportion” of wild species and wild systems at only 0.6C can be taken as an early warning of what was coming. And today's 1C is every bit as likely an early warning of what's still coming as continued combustion of fossil fuels translates directly to continued emissions of CO2, which in turn translates directly to continued heat trapped in the atmosphere.

Heat makes a difference beyond safety or danger to individual species, to whole ecosystems; e.g., “Between 1C and 2C increases in global mean temperatures most species, ecosystems and landscapes will be impacted and adaptive capacity will become limited.” (Leemans and Eickhout, 2004). And, “analysis suggests that despite high-level statements to the contrary, there is now little to no chance of maintaining the global mean surface temperature at or below 2C. Moreover, the impacts associated with 2C have been revised upwards, sufficiently so that 2C now more appropriately represents the threshold between 'dangerous' and 'extremely dangerous' climate change.” (Anderson and Bows, 2011).

Finally, this: “Climate change impacts have now been documented across every ecosystem on Earth, despite an average warming of only ~1°C so far. Here, we describe the full range and scale of climate change effects on global biodiversity that have been observed in natural systems. To do this, we identify a set of core ecological processes (32 in terrestrial and 31 each in marine and freshwater ecosystems) that underpin ecosystem functioning and support services to people. Of the 94 processes considered, 82% show evidence of impact from climate change in the peer-reviewed literature. Examples of observed impacts from metaanalyses and case studies go beyond well-established shifts in species ranges and changes to phenology and population dynamics to include disruptions that scale from the gene to the ecosystem” (Scheffers et al, 2016)

All of which means that it would be arbitrary and capricious to dismiss the projections of future extreme heat, including departure from natural variability of heat, when considering whether the grizzly requires continued protection of the Endangered Species Act. I feel secure in arguing that heat alone can slow recovery of a mammal, and that it would be arbitrary and capricious to suggest that this risk can be excluded from consideration of whether the grizzly will require continued protection and support of the Endangered Species Act.

A hotter world increases risk of drought

There have been but very few if any studies explicitly directed at drought's effects on grizzly bears, but drought's effects on wild animals are ubiquitous, and commonly lead to conflict with the surrounding human population.

In fact, we may already be getting a preview of these likely future conflicts in the Daily Interlake report excerpted early in this commentary and review.

The following few blurbs indicate that it would be arbitrary, and capricious to proceed as if grizzly bears can somehow be immune to the risks associated with drought.

“Just everybody is seeing bears everywhere. That's the unusual part of it -- in places where they haven't been seen before,” said state of Idaho Fish and Game wildlife biologist Bret Stansberry.

“It's a fairly severe drought and that's essentially the root of the problem. There is very little natural food for them to eat.”

http://www.terradaily.com/reports/Hungry_bears_plague_US_west_after_record_drought_000.html

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

http://www.tenadaily.com/reports/hungry_bears_plague_US_west_after_record_drought_999.html

“Drought conditions send wildlife in search of food, water, and cover—which means some animals travel farther than usual and into more developed areas.”

<https://www.neefusa.org/weather-and-climate/coexisting-wildlife-during-drought>

After weathering record-breaking temperatures, parts of Europe are now gripped by a punishing drought that is shriveling harvests, sparking water shortages and taking a toll on wildlife.

<https://www.voanews.com/europe/after-record-heat-wave-parts-europe-now-face-drought>

Heat and drought are causing feral camels to overrun communities in Australia

Particularly during times of extreme heat and drought, the animals bust into towns, clogging roadways and smashing through fences in search of water ...

Wildlife in southern India has been leaving protected reserve areas in search for water, as a weak, delayed monsoon has left waterbodies dry.

Elephants, leopards and tigers are forced to travel through towns to reach alternative water sources, which puts them in danger of human-wildlife conflict.

<https://www.worldlandtrust.org/news/2016/11/wildlife-corridors-become-urgent-indian-drought/>

In 2017, more than 215 bears were euthanized statewide due to two late-spring freeze cycles followed by drought conditions that made them desperate for food.

<https://www.outtherecolorado.com/colorado-springs-area-bears-prompt-more-than-200-calls-to-wildlife-officials/>

Elephants, zebras, hippos, impalas, buffaloes and many other wildlife are stressed by lack of food and water in Zimbabwe's Mana Pools National Park, whose very name comes from the four pools of water normally filled by the flooding Zambezi River each rainy season, and where wildlife traditionally drink.

<https://www.abc.net.au/news/2019-11-07/zimbabwe-severe-drought-is-killing-elephants-and-other-wildlife/11679516>

Observed data is not limited to the above anecdotal reports

Biological Conservation 2018

Compounding effects of human development and a natural food shortage on a black bear population along a human development-wildland interface

Jared S. Laufenberga,*¹, Heather E. Johnsonb,², Paul F. Doherty Jra, Stewart W. Breckc

a Department of Fish, Wildlife, and Conservation Biology, Colorado State University, Fort Collins, CO 80523, USA

b Colorado Parks and Wildlife, 415 Turner Drive, Durango, CO 81303, USAc USDA-Wildlife Services, National Wildlife Research Center, 4101 La Porte Ave, Fort Collins, CO 80521, USA

ABSTRACT

Human development and climate change are two stressors that threaten numerous wildlife populations, and their combined effects are likely to be most pronounced along the human development-wildland interface where changes in both natural and anthropogenic conditions interact to affect wildlife. To better understand the compounding influence of these stressors, we investigated the effects of a

climate-induced natural food shortage on the dynamics of a black bear population in the vicinity of Durango, Colorado. We integrated 4 years of DNA- based capture-mark-recapture data with GPS-based telemetry data to evaluate the combined effects of human development and the food shortage on the abundance, population growth rate, and spatial distribution of female black bears. We documented a 57% decline in female bear abundance immediately following the natural food shortage coinciding with an increase in human-caused bear mortality (e.g., vehicle collisions, harvest and lethal removals) primarily in developed areas. We also detected a change in the spatial distribution of female bears with fewer bears occurring near human development in years immediately following the food shortage, likely as a consequence of high mortality near human infrastructure during the food shortage. Given expected future increases in human development and climate-induced food shortages, we expect that bear dynamics may be increasingly influenced by human-caused mortality, which will be difficult to detect with current management practices. To ensure long-term sustainability of bear populations, we recommend that wildlife agencies invest in monitoring programs that can accurately track bear populations, incorporate non-harvest human-caused mortality into management models, and work to reduce human-caused mortality, particularly in years with natural food shortages.

Wildlife conservation without accounting for drought-driven shortage of food and water is wildlife conservation with its head in the sand. Periodic drought has long been bad news to life on earth. The worse news is that we can expect more of it, including its expansion across a wider expanse of the land base. For example, in 2006, the Journal of Hydrometeorology published findings that “ ... the proportion of the land surface in extreme drought is predicted to increase from 1 percent for the present day to 30 percent by the end of the 21st century.” (Burke et al 2006)

This modeled expectation of expanding droughty areas has been variously confirmed by observed real-world trends since then. For example, a 2018 study found that the drylands of the interior western US have expanded eastward, and by 140 miles. (Seager 2018)

As of 2004, Science could already run an article titled “As the West Goes Dry,” highlighting risk to stream flow resulting from temperature-driven threats to snow. (Service 2004). And, at that point, we had only cranked up global average heat by a relatively mild 0.6C.

Any decline of streamflow is a decline in diversity of places where a wild animal can find a place to drink, and this is a basic consideration in determining the status of any animal including the grizzly.

Pederson et al (2011) reported even before global warming of 1C, on “The Unusual Nature of Recent Snowpack Declines in the North American Cordillera.”

Leppi et al (2012), again even before global warming of 1C, had already reported temperature-linked late season decline of streamflow in Montana, Idaho, and Wyoming at levels that “pose serious concerns.”

What is Snow Drought?

<>

Snowpack typically acts as a natural reservoir, providing water throughout the drier summer months. Lack of snowpack storage, or a shift in timing of snowmelt from that reservoir, can be a challenge for drought planning. Few drought metrics include storage and release of snow water. Several years of low snowpack, especially across the western U.S., have led to many studies looking into the causes and impacts of reduced snow storage (see Resources) and the creation of a new definition of drought called Snow Drought. Snow drought is defined as period of abnormally low snowpack for the time of year, reflecting either below-normal cold-season precipitation (dry snow drought) or a lack of snow accumulation despite near-normal precipitation (warm snow drought), caused by warm temperatures and precipitation falling as rain rather than snow or unusually early snowmelt. (AMS Glossary of Meteorology) Snow-dominated regions face several challenges due to snow drought and its impacts:

- Summer Water Availability: Snow droughts reduce the amount of available water for spring and summer snowmelt. This, in turn, reduces streamflow and soil moisture, which can have impacts on water storage, irrigation, fisheries, vegetation, municipal water supplies, and wildfire.
- Winter Water Management: Warmer winter storms lead to rain instead of snow at higher elevations in mountain regions that

can create challenges for water management and flood mitigation strategies, particularly when dealing with extreme events.

- Outdoor Tourism and Recreation: Many local economies and industries rely on snowpack and river flows from snowmelt to support their outdoor industries such as skiing, rafting, and fishing.
- Ecosystems: Lack of snow can disrupt ecosystems over shorter and longer timescales.

<>

While precipitation including rain and snow has long been known to effect drought, recent years have turned up evidence that atmospheric heat can also trigger drought, almost regardless of precipitation. The basic reality here is that warm air can hold more water, and recent years have seen evidence that warm air actually demands water. The net effect is that a warm air mass moving over a landscape actively extracts water from the soil, and the hotter our temperatures get, the more water will be lifted away from the soils.

Alternatively characterized as vapor pressure deficit or atmospheric demand, the resulting soil drought has effects on ecosystems that translates directly to effects on animals. As is true of other variables cited in this commentary, it would be arbitrary and capricious to proceed as if vapor pressure deficit/atmospheric demand has no influence on the status of grizzly bears.

Framing the evidence in the language of vapor pressure deficit, or VPD, Yuan et al (2019) report that, "Synthesis of four global climate datasets reveals a sharp increase of VPD after the late 1990s. In response, the vegetation greening trend indicated by a satellite-derived vegetation index (GIMMS3g), which was evident before the late 1990s, was subsequently stalled or reversed," and that " Six Earth system models have consistently projected continuous increases of VPD throughout the current century. "

Framing the evidence in the language of atmospheric demand, Novick et al () close the abstract of their study saying, "Our results suggest that failure to consider the limiting role of atmospheric demand in experimental designs, simulation models and land management strategies will lead to incorrect projections of ecosystem responses to future climate conditions." In the text of the article, they say, "Looking to the future, it will become even more important to separately resolve VPD and soil moisture effects on ecosystem functioning. VPD is highly sensitive to changes in air temperature and is thus expected to rise globally in the future."

A USDA Forest Service report warned that "In essence, a survivable drought of the past can become an intolerable drought under a warming climate" (p.50, Vose et al, 2016).

When physicist Joseph Romm composed a guest editorial for Nature on the broad range and varied ramifications of drought, he called it "the most pressing" threat. In discussing its far-reaching effects he included mention of its impact on wildlife habitat. "And as habitats are made untenable, what will be the effect on biodiversity?"

This is gritty stuff, and not without implications for wild species including grizzlies. In fact, drought predicts the health and death of all wild animals, first through its direct effect on the productivity and quality of animal habitat, with a subsequent indirect bottom-up effect on animals' physical health — and risk of mortality. In drought, food and water can be very scarce, which forces animals to sprawl out more widely in search for a bite to eat or a drink of water, only to get in trouble when their necessary sprawl collides head-on with a sprawling human condition. In this collision, animals including bears can die as the ecosystem wilts.

However, the only Grizzly Bear Conservation Strategy for the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem that I've been able to access cited not one reference to drought in its 300 pages, as if the d-word is a potato too hot to touch even in some passing reference. This absence shrieks for attention when questions have been raised about whether the grizzly is going to need continued protection and support of the Endangered Species Act.

A tale of interacting trends

The human population is expanding its presence across landscapes at the same time that heat and drought are expanding their impact. The net effect for grizzlies is reduced freedom of movement and travel when movement and travel are becoming increasingly urgent needs.

Hetem et al (2014) offer an integrated analysis helpful to determining the status of grizzly bears, including whether grizzlies require continued protection and support of the Endangered Species Act.

Temperature. July/August/September 2014

Responses of large mammals to climate change

Robyn S Hetem^{1,*}, Andrea Fuller¹, Shane K Maloney^{1,2}, and Duncan Mitchell^{1,2}

1 Brain Function Research Group; School of Physiology; University of the Witwatersrand; Faculty of Health Science; Parktown, South Africa;

2 School of Anatomy, Physiology, and Human Biology; University of Western Australia; Crawley, Australia

Keywords: climate change physiology, phenotypic plasticity, physiological acclimation, behavioral flexibility, range shift, microevolution, temperature

Abstract

Most large terrestrial mammals, including the charismatic species so important for ecotourism, do not have the luxury of rapid microevolution or sufficient range shifts as strategies for adjusting to climate change. The rate of climate change is too fast for genetic adaptation to occur in mammals with longevities of decades, typical of large mammals, and landscape fragmentation and population by humans too widespread to allow spontaneous range shifts of large mammals, leaving only the expression of latent phenotypic plasticity to counter effects of climate change. The expression of phenotypic plasticity includes anatomical variation within the same species, changes in phenology, and employment of intrinsic physiological and behavioral capacity that can buffer an animal against the effects of climate change. Whether that buffer will be realized is unknown, because little is known about the efficacy of the expression of plasticity, particularly for large mammals. Future research in climate change biology requires measurement of physiological characteristics of many identified free-living individual animals for long periods, probably decades, to allow us to detect whether expression of phenotypic plasticity will be sufficient to cope with climate change.

Hetem et al find that phenotypic plasticity — an ability to “acclimate” to heat is about all large mammals have left when rapid evolution and far-flung travel are not possible. However, they cite considerable uncertainty about that remaining option. This indicates that it would be arbitrary and capricious to proceed as if “Most large terrestrial mammals, including the charismatic species so important for ecotourism,” can simply adapt to heat via acclimation.

That same concern is emphasized by Dowd et al (2020), who observe that, “Depending on the range of plasticity and the amplitude and speed of environmental variation, physiology can be either in tune with the surroundings or dangerously out of synch,” and “For example, if physiology responds to the moving average of past conditions, a longer acclimatization window generally results in greater imposed stress. If instead physiology responds to historical maxima, longer acclimatization windows reduce imposed stress, albeit perhaps at greater constitutive cost. This approach should be further informed and tested with empirical experiments addressing the history-dependent nature of acclimatization.”

Two elephants in the room: Human population expansion, and the question around decarbonizing the economy

Each of the two elephants pose a classic “wicked problem” difficult to solve for society at large and, as a consequence, an equal problem conservationists and for land and wildlife management agencies (e.g., DeFries et al 2017).

People

Mora (2014) reviews “recent studies showing how the issue of population growth has been downplayed and trivialized among scientific fields,” and argues that human population size “...despite being directly or indirectly linked to the deterioration of ecological systems and a key factor for the success of conserving species and ecosystems, has been rarely considered and in fact “trivialized or ignored”

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

by much of the conservation biology community.”

Human population growth in grizzly bears former homelands is clearly an issue that can't be downplayed or trivialized. Without that growth, grizzlies' attempt to recover access to former homelands would face less risk of slowing or reversal. But that growth is likely to intensify.

Fossil fuels

The National Wildlife Federation has weighed in on the carbon emissions -> climate change issue.

Below, some excerpts from its *Nowhere to Run*:

“Even the largest species on the landscape—our nation’s treasured big game wildlife—are being directly exposed to changing climate, and indirectly through effects on habitat. Populations and habitats have already been affected, and landscapes are changing. Increasingly severe drought, rising temperatures and greater weather extremes will leave no big game species untouched.”

“Carbon emissions, which drive climate change, can be addressed by implementing the Environmental Protection Agency’s authority under the Clean Air Act to reduce carbon pollution from power plants. Development of clean energy sources, such as solar and wind, facilitates reducing fossil fuel use. Restoration of natural carbon sinks has the double benefit of taking carbon out of the atmosphere and providing habitat for big game and other wildlife.

“Actions must also be taken to help safeguard big game wildlife from the climate impacts of carbon already polluting our atmosphere. These include promoting the practice of “climate-smart conservation” by explicitly taking climate change into account in our wildlife and natural resource management efforts.”

That, true as it is, will not be easy, and it would be arbitrary and capricious to dismiss or ignore the difficulty and its implications for determining the status of the grizzly bear, and for determining whether the grizzly will require continuing protection and support of the Endangered Species Act.

That will not be easy. Few are better positioned to lay out the difficulties than financial powerhouse S&P (formerly Standard and Poor’s)

S&P GLOBAL PLATTS 10 Dec, 2019

The biggest challenges to decarbonization are still ahead

To achieve a clean and affordable energy supply, we will need the right balance of technology and regulation, writes Chris Midgley, global director of S&P Global Platts Analytics. This is the second article in a series looking at key energy sector trends, ahead of the S&P Global Platts Global Energy Awards.

<https://www.spglobal.com/en/research-insights/articles/the-biggest-challenges-to-decarbonization-are-still-ahead>

==———— Closing paragraph —————==

“However, technology alone will not achieve this outcome. We will need well-thought through policies, socially responsible companies and investors, and consumer acceptance to changing behaviours and the cost increase of sustaining our planet for generations to come.”

==—————

The Extinction Rebellion protests and the passionate pleas of Greta Thunberg for world leaders in politics and industry to take action on what they describe as the unprecedented global climate emergency have brought a greater sense of urgency to the energy transition.

There can be no doubt that the cycle of significant climate events is increasing and that emissions of CO₂ or greenhouse gases (GHGs) are rising at alarming rates. However, in a world where over 1 billion people still lack access to simple electricity and many more still live in poverty, the dual challenge of providing affordable clean energy and tackling the impacts of climate change remains complex.

Addressing the challenge of climate change will require us to find a balance between regulation and government policy, technology, and consumer behaviour. Government policy can come with unintended consequences and tends to use taxpayers’ money inefficiently.

The German Renewable Energy Policy or Energiewende, for example, has successfully grown renewable energy in the country from less than 4% in 1990 to 40% today, but has also meant high electricity bills. However, CO2 emissions in Germany have been impacted by marginal dispatchable electricity coming from carbon-intensive lignite (low quality coal).

So has the Energiewende been a failure? Far from it. Without Germany effectively subsidizing the renewables industry, it would have not created the scale of demand that has seen technology and manufacturing processes bring down the cost of renewables to below the cost of thermal (oil, gas or coal) power generation.

Technology often needs a helping hand to gain momentum before it can compete with traditional fossil fuels. But policies cost money. We may have movements like Extinction Rebellion pushing for change, but we have equally passionate ones protesting about the cost of change, such as the gilets jaunes in France, or the protests in Iran, Ecuador and Chile over reductions in fuels subsidies and increases in transport costs.

Regrettably, consumers are strongly motivated by their personal welfare, which is determined by their disposable income or relative wealth. Lower energy costs over the last five years have resulted in an increase in energy consumption as the world economy has created wealth and jobs, leading to what I have previously described as consumer hedonism.

Taking away this privilege is hard, and with lower energy prices, technology will find it harder to compete with traditional fossil fuels and/or get the financing required.

Regulation and responsibility

However, there is a new pressure emerging that I call "moral regulation" or self-regulation. Corporations are coming under increasing pressure from shareholders to meet environmental, social and governance (ESG) standards, and are being punished for not addressing the impact of their businesses on society.

We have started to see this among International Oil Companies (IOCs) as their strategies, and more importantly capital, have moved away from high-intensity carbon fuels towards less carbon intensive gas and renewables, some even shifting towards becoming electricity suppliers.

At the same time, National Oil Companies (NOCs) are recognizing the ri

#319

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 12:59:39 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 1:01:29 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:50
IP Address: 63.153.98.109

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lance Olsen

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I just tried to submit comment but it is extensive enough that transmission of the complete comment may have failed. I saw no way to submit it as pdf

#320

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 1:03:01 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 1:04:37 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:35
IP Address: 174.221.14.175

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Robert McMullins

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

So much of our wildlife is being destroyed. Please let these bears live.

#321

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 1:50:14 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 1:52:06 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:51
IP Address: 72.175.65.116

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

John Salazar

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am hoping that science prevails as the reason that decisions are made for the grizzly management plans. Thank you for your hard work on this.

#322

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 6:12:26 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 6:13:12 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:45
IP Address: 71.70.188.27

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please reconsider what you are thinking about killing these bears. I am sure there is another way.

#323

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 9:52:59 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 9:55:19 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:20
IP Address: 97.120.140.136

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Emma

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hunting grizzlies will not reduce human contact or encounters. Educating the public on using park space intelligently and what to do if people encounter a bear will make all the difference. Bears have no interest in being around or harming people. Please reconsider this terrible idea.

#324

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, March 22, 2020 9:58:03 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, March 22, 2020 10:14:20 PM
Time Spent: 00:16:16
IP Address: 174.208.22.126

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Your performance is an embarrassment to your skills at the least and I, as a 56 year old manager would have fired many of you for failure to show results to those that your there to support. Are you blind to the facts? Your great plan failed and now your doing everything you can do not to turn to the hunting group that can bring this issue back under control and.....make this great state some money in the process. Your failures are based off what??...lack of know how? Outside sources of money's redirecting your commitment to the people and overall health of this great states animals? Your poor if not absolutely biased decisions are hurting this states futur. Wise up people!!

#325

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 23, 2020 7:21:28 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 23, 2020 7:29:24 AM
Time Spent: 00:07:56
IP Address: 108.28.13.213

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bill Triplett

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It's 2020. Why is it still okay to generate revenue by selling licenses that allow certain people to indulge their love of killing innocent, unsuspecting animals? Don't call it "tradition" -- slavery was once a tradition. And don't even try to call it "sport." It is the cruelty of cowards, and if you support it in any way, you're no better than they are. Be better than that. Please.

#326

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, March 23, 2020 11:44:26 AM
Last Modified: Monday, March 23, 2020 11:47:49 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:23
IP Address: 24.252.252.15

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is past time that ranchers and Fish & Wildlife and other government branches step into the 21st Century. Non lethal means are available and should be made mandatory.

Continuously killing our wolves, bears, and cougars upsets the ecosystem. Balance must be maintained for a healthy system.

I'm against hunting these grizzlies. The ranchers need to take responsibility and stop living off the taxpayers.

#327

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 3:32:51 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 3:41:44 AM
Time Spent: 00:08:53
IP Address: 176.159.239.108

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

MARSOL

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hello everyone, very good initiative from all of you, to find solutions, which for me, must go to the benefit of grizzly bears, in a world where eight billion human beings threaten animal life everywhere.

#328

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 11:57:15 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 11:57:37 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:21
IP Address: 174.219.129.38

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Paul

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is critical for regulated hunting to be included in the Grizzly Bear Management Plan.

#329

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 11:54:54 AM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 12:00:18 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:23
IP Address: 66.109.156.77

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

John Lunetta

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please manage these bears through legal hunting regulations. The Bear population is, and has been out of control for sometime. Idealization Management, is NOT WORKING !?!?!?

#330

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 12:11:52 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 12:17:57 PM
Time Spent: 00:06:04
IP Address: 184.166.72.38

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please follow the NA Model of Wildlife Conservation. Grizzlies deserve to be on the landscape, absolutely. But they do not deserve special protections. They should be managed like all other big game species in Montana. They've met and exceeded recovery objectives in both the GY and Crown of the Continent ecosystems. It's time to unlist and let FWP carefully manage while raising funds for conservation. Auction/raffle a limited number of tags and use the funds to create highway crossings where there's vehicular conflicts (killing way more bears than hunters would). The 'my-favorite-animal' game has to end. Emotionally driven wildlife management is wrong.

#331

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 12:32:23 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 12:33:59 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:36
IP Address: 174.208.0.144

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is absolutely critical to have a Grizzly bear hunting season to help regulate the population.

#332

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 12:36:54 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 12:39:41 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:46
IP Address: 174.237.10.8

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Mary Maguire

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The Grizzly population must be controlled. Hunters/trappers pay the state fee which in turn reduces pollution issues and the money goes to needed programs.

#333

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 12:35:18 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 12:50:17 PM
Time Spent: 00:14:59
IP Address: 107.191.165.55

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Chris

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

There has to be a management over all our natural resources. Including predators, for example the wolf reintroduction was the single biggest detriment to our wild game in the west and soon to be the country. What happens when predators such as these beloved bears run out of food and range. People are going to have huge conflicts. When this happens who is going to be the target for litigation? The poor bastards that made the decision at the state level, the one that signed the plan of action. I am sure this isn't concerning to anyone in government because they seem to hide out behind doors but mark my words there could be some crazy extremist group that could be a lynch mob that could come to your door. People will eventually take things back from our government. My problem lays that I live in Lincoln county and it seems that all troubled bears seem to get placed here. With that being said maybe they should get planted into your back yard and forgotten about. See how much you would like that conflict. I am a lover of our great state and our wildlife and the love of the mountains. But, when bear conflict happens I am not the one packing bear spray. I shoot to kill. I am for seeing these beautiful animals in the wild and don't go out of my way to have conflict with them. But as a sportsman things have gotten worse not better with our management practices. When you can hike 12 miles in the wilderness of the cabinets range and not see one animal except a squirrel something is wrong.

#334

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 1:03:04 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 1:07:06 PM
Time Spent: 00:04:02
IP Address: 71.32.57.101

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

MAC MCLAUGHLIN

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

THE STATE OF MONTANA NEEDS TO CONTROL THE GRIZZLY POPULATION IN CERTAIN AREAS, HUNTING IS THE ONLY COST EFFECTIVE TOOL IN THE BOX, WE HAVE TO MANY BEAR ENCOUNTERS TO ENJOY THE OUT DOORS

#335

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 1:26:32 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 1:28:45 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:12
IP Address: 174.208.23.176

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Ronald Sager

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Wildlife management including large predators should be left to our hired experts at the state level I STRONGLY OPPOSE management by lawsuit or t as kknng politics into the matter in any way.

#336

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 1:55:32 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 1:57:38 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:06
IP Address: 99.196.245.23

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Reg Gonsel

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Advisory Council,

It is IMPERATIVE that you include, as part of the management strategy for grizzly bears, hunting, trapping and snaring. My ranch depends on being able to maintain some kind of control over these bears, they are getting out of hand and spreading.

Thank you.

#337

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 2:18:38 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 2:19:36 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:57
IP Address: 174.247.96.73

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Wyatt

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Given the number of attacks last year, it might be prudent to allow a well managed hunting season to be run in the spring and fall as we do with black bears.

#338

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 2:22:07 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 2:39:38 PM
Time Spent: 00:17:31
IP Address: 64.25.135.205

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Guy

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I've been following and listening to the Grizzly Bear issues since the early 70's when the Craigheads first started the discussion. I firmly believe that the Grizzly is in fine shape to be taken off the Endangered Species list.

It is time for the bear to be added to a " controlled" hunt. The issues against hunting are pretty much just rhetoric mixed with continually changing science that is more than a little politically driven. That and for many anti hunters it's their religious beliefs that are the true problem for them. They are entitled to their religion but that should not interfere with my right to hunt. I won't get into our heritage and hunting culture here in Montana as I'm sure you are or should be aware it already.

Please allow hunters to more than just a financial piggy bank. Allow us to respectfully hunt the Gizzly Bear.

Sincerely

Guy

#339

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 3:35:47 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 3:42:06 PM
Time Spent: 00:06:18
IP Address: 208.45.4.242

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeff Darrah

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

As a citizen of Montana I strongly support the delisting of the Grizzly Bear from the ESList. I feel that the bear is recovered and trying to restore the bear to all of original home range is not a good idea. I feel that the state should manage the Grizzly and that FWP should use science and the North American Model as the example of how to manage the bear. I strongly feel that hunting should be used as a management tool for the Grizzly Bear. I also feel that those landowners that live with the bears deserve adequate compensation and assistance from the State of Montana.

#340

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 4:20:31 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 4:23:17 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:46
IP Address: 216.14.233.9

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Stacy

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please include regulated hunting as part of management of grizzlies in Montana. Not only is this necessary in helping control the grizzly population, it could also create much needed revenue for FWP, since tag sales have been declining. All predators need increased hunting to help our struggling elk, moose and deer populations. Thank you.

#341

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 4:21:23 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 4:29:25 PM
Time Spent: 00:08:02
IP Address: 216.166.169.13

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jordan Voigt

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

After a successful comeback, it's time to manage our state's grizzly bear resource. Our state enjoys a multitude of game that has been hunted responsibly for decades, bringing in out of state money and countless other benefits. Montana hunter's put their money where there mouth is and with bear encounters getting ever more prevalent, our bears can be managed like all other healthy game populations.

#342

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 4:40:13 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 4:42:30 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:17
IP Address: 184.166.81.170

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

JimBradford

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I cannot stress enough the need for these bears to experience some hunting. There are just too many

#343

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 4:51:22 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 5:17:55 PM
Time Spent: 00:26:33
IP Address: 63.153.103.70

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Laurien Riehl

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

We all love seeing the Grizzly bear recovery going so well. But we really have to manage bear numbers. Hunting quota systems work. We can still relocate expand territories and do what we have done in the past. But at some point we have to start Grizzly hunting to reduce #'s in certain areas. Black bear numbers are off the charts and we manage them with hunting. We can do the same with Grizzlies.

Thank you,

#344

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 5:49:45 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 5:56:57 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:12
IP Address: 99.20.69.156

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Suzanne Hodges

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hunting will not prevent conflicts. Please fund a non-lethal methods of coexistence. If we can educate ranchers and citizens in areas with bears, and prepare people where bears haven't shown up yet, on how to live with grizzlies, we can have a landscape where both bears and people can survive. Montana's vast and beautiful landscapes and wildlife are a source of tourism which helps your economy don't put this in jeopardy. Bears aren't going to change their behavior, we must be the ones to take action.

#345

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 7:06:27 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 7:22:20 PM
Time Spent: 00:15:52
IP Address: 199.190.61.230

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Harold Johnson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I wonder what this council expects to happen. It appears you made 1/2 of the council animal rights people who care little about the people who have to deal with these bears and the other half made of people who want management of bears to occur. You cannot have it both ways. It appears we have too many bears in too little habitat. Perhaps a hunting season would put some fear of man back into the grizzly population and less problems would result? Quite honestly, you have not tried this. I personally feel that the Montana Fish and Game is squandering our monies on this useless committee that will not in any way solve the problem. You do employ Biologists who obviously have much more experience with bears than most of the people involved in this committee? How many bears are being killed now due to predation on livestock and other problems? OPEN A SEASON! I think the biggest problem we have in the Montana Fish and Game is they employ too many lawyers and not enough Biologists. Do something for the people who have to put up with the problems. Quit pandering to out of state interests!

#346

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 7:53:52 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 7:55:21 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:28
IP Address: 63.153.3.229

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Rob Arnaud

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hunting is necessary for true conservation. Please conclude this on your plans

#347

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 7:55:06 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 7:57:57 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:51
IP Address: 70.57.206.220

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Thomas Jackson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I think it's about time to listen to scientific facts rather than emotion Griz are far from endangered and need to be managed.

#348

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 7:57:47 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 24, 2020 8:02:47 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:00
IP Address: 173.3.102.253

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tatyana Komin

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Hello Governor Advisory Council,

We are visiting Grand Teton and Yellowstone parks every year. Our main attractions are marvelous grizzly bears. We are very concerned about bears families and adorable bear cubs. Please do not remove grizzly bears from the area, fund non-lethal methods of coexistence grizzly bears with ranchers and citizens. Please educate ranchers and citizens. We usually staying in West Yellowstone, this way we help Montana economy: hotel, diners, restaurant, souvenirs.

#349

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 5:20:23 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 5:22:21 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:57
IP Address: 198.98.208.125

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

James Vogel

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is time to have a hunt for grizzlies,they are kill ranchers livestock and even people.

#350

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 9:50:16 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 9:54:34 AM
Time Spent: 00:04:18
IP Address: 170.144.220.41

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Brian Smith

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Regulated hunting (draw system with points)needs to be considered as a viable option for Grizzly Bears. The carrying capacity is obviously full and numbers need to be reduced to avoid conflict.

#351

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 10:46:06 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 10:47:07 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:01
IP Address: 174.247.98.251

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Garett Bacon

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please include grizzly bear hunting in the management plan.

#352

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 3:01:21 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 3:02:06 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:44
IP Address: 72.174.18.135

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Mike Bader

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

STATEMENT OF MIKE BADER
INDEPENDENT CONSULTANT
MISSOULA, MONTANA

March 25, 2020

Introduction

My name is Mike Bader, residing in Missoula, Montana. I am an independent natural resource consultant and sole proprietor of Ecological Research Services. I sent a letter (attached) to Governor Bullock requesting that he appoint me to the Technical Advisory Committee so I could supplement the information you have received from the State and federal agencies with information from non-agency affiliated scientists with vast expertise and experience with grizzly bears. Unfortunately, I was not provided the courtesy of a reply.

I have been an independent consultant for the past 19 years. I have more than 35 years of experience in landscape conservation of habitats suitable for recovery of grizzly bears, bull trout and other species. I have been employed and done contract work as a National Park Ranger, executive director of a non-profit regional conservation organization, para-legal researcher, project developer for state and national organizations, producer of State of Montana funded environmental education programs.

My field experience associated with bears includes bear management as a National Park Service ranger in Yellowstone National Park. In addition to my ranger work, I was a part-time field assistant with the Yellowstone Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team, including involvement in research and management trapping and relocation of grizzly and black bears, radio-tracking, collection of scat samples, separating bears from people, carcass monitoring and extensive visual observations of grizzly bears.

I have authored and co-authored numerous peer-review papers and professional reports. These have been widely cited in the peer-reviewed literature, books, grizzly bear management plans published by state and federal agencies, environmental analyses by land management agencies including the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service and U.S. Forest Service and in statements from professional societies including the American Society of Mammologists.

Statement

Regarding the prospects of survival and recovery of grizzly bears in the Northern Rockies I offer the following observations.

A viable, self-sustaining population of grizzly bears will number from 2,500-5,000 individuals and must have demographic linkage through a system of protected habitats.

In a series of published papers (two which were used for the 2006 Statewide Grizzly Bear Management EIS) I concluded:

- 1) roadless areas are source habitats for grizzly bears and the source value of roadless areas increased following the cessation of grizzly bear hunting;
- 2) none of the isolated Grizzly Bear Recovery Areas are large enough to support 2,500 grizzly bears and that the core recovery areas should be expanded and linked together with connected and protected habitats;
- 3) that sufficient high quality, secure habitat currently exists to provide for the spatial requirements of a viable northern Rockies grizzly bear meta-population.

The map below incorporates the findings of five leading independent experts on grizzly bears (Drs. Allendorf, Metzgar, Mattson, Craighead, Horejsi, copy attached). As you can see, the majority of the essential linkages are located within Montana and are in urgent need of protection

need of protection.

The experts also recommend the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service develop an updated and comprehensive Grizzly Bear Recovery Plan based upon sound scientific principles and findings. The 1993 plan is woefully outdated and there is abundant new science to be considered and incorporated.

An area of chronic neglect and with extensive habitat restoration needs is the Cabinet-Yaak, the area around it and the areas between it and the NCDE and Bitterroot Recovery Areas. These small recovery zones need to be expanded and linked with the other areas as shown on the map.

Grizzly Bear Hunting Is A Bad Idea

I have studied the effects of hunting and post-hunting distribution of grizzly bear mortality in the NCDE and GYE. It is an impediment to emigration and population linkage and I believe hunting of grizzly bears threatened the distribution, abundance and social structure of the population. Another researcher found that female mortality on the Rocky Mountain Front was unsustainable during hunting. We can't simply shoot certain behaviors out of the population. One of my mentors said "death is not a teacher."

Any plan that proposes sport hunting of grizzly bears dressed up as "scientific management" would not only face public outcry, it would certainly face legal challenge. Many proponents of grizzly bear hunting are basing their support on political and social concerns, rather than scientific and biological considerations.

Hunting creates numerous problems while not solving any. Existing strategies for management of bear-human conflicts is sufficient if properly resourced. Hunting grizzly bears would send absolutely the wrong message that everyone can let their guard down at exactly the wrong time when we are seeing the beginning stages of population distribution into historically-occupied habitats vital to long-term persistence and recovery of grizzly bears. Grizzly bear hunting is also objectionable on spiritual and moral grounds.

Summary

The Grizzly Bear Advisory Council needs to consider more than population numbers and bear-human conflict prevention and resolution, as critical as these are to any meaningful set of recommendations. Moreover, the Council must incorporate information from non-agency affiliated scientists. Equally critical needs are effective habitat protection standards in all grizzly bear habitats including linkage areas supporting demographic occupancy. The Forest Service is not providing that protection and they continue to target the major linkages with large-scale roadbuilding and logging projects. Effective demographic (male and female) passage structures across the major highways in the region are another vital component of this effort.

Sincerely,

Mike Bader

Montana Governor Steve Bullock
State Capitol, Helena
March 21, 2019

Dear Governor Bullock,

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

My name is Mike Bader. I am an independent natural resource consultant in Missoula. I request that you appoint me to the Technical Advisory Committee to assist the grizzly bear citizen advisory council with technical information, support and advice.

My qualifications include 35 years of experience in grizzly bear science and management. I have authored and co-authored several professional papers on grizzly bear habitat assessment and management, the importance of roadless areas, and hunting/post-hunting mortality. Two of these were used to help form the Montana Statewide Grizzly Bear Management EIS (see attachment) for which I was a member of an informal group of advisors. With Dr. John J. Craighead, the Craighead Institute and Timothy Bechtold I co-authored Alternative 4 in the FEIS for Grizzly Bear Recovery in the Bitterroot Ecosystem, working with Dr. Chris Servheen.

As an independent consultant I have authored numerous reports including an assessment of the conservation value of Plum Creek lands in the Swan Valley which led to all the high value lands transferred to public ownership, which has benefited grizzly bears. I also worked for several years with Montana Fish, Wildlife and Parks as the contractor responsible for production and distribution of Trout Identification Guides and produced a three-part program and teachers guide on bull trout recovery, vetted by the Department.

I maintain professional relationships with several leading non-agency scientists with expertise in grizzly bear population ecology, genetics, population viability and habitat management as well as GIS mapping and analysis. I am currently the co-author and director of a study of potential denning habitat for grizzly bears in Montana west of the Divide.

There is new, relevant information on potential linkage or connectivity areas for grizzly bears that is just as important as population numbers. Other considerations include genetics and the effects of isolation and assessments of habitat suitability and security in historically occupied habitats that grizzly bears are beginning to explore.

Moreover, the citizen advisory council would benefit from receiving scientific data and advice from non-agency scientists who sometimes have different perspectives and conclusions. For the council to succeed, it must have a broad diversity of input from the technical advisors.

I look forward to your reply.

Sincerely,

Mike Bader

C: Martha Williams, Patrick Holmes

#353

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 5:37:11 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, March 25, 2020 5:39:28 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:17
IP Address: 24.93.193.42

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Debby Chandler

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzlies are worth more alive. Stop. Kowtowing to an outdated industry and support the tourism dollars that local wildlife brings.

#354

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 26, 2020 9:58:17 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 26, 2020 10:10:29 AM
Time Spent: 00:12:11
IP Address: 63.153.94.161

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Paul

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

As a Montana resident who will be impacted greatly by any decisions made as compared to out of state and international comments I would hope you weigh my response accordingly. Hunting is a great tool for most all wildlife management and needs to be part of this. Also if management is done by hunters instead of state and federal agencies it will be cheered by some of the most impacted stakeholders (hunters). We also have to have ranchers and farmers be able to protect themselves and there livelihood by allowing them to handle bear management as it happens in a lethal method if necessary. There should be no punitive action against anyone protecting life and livelihood.

#355

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 26, 2020 10:06:52 AM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 26, 2020 10:12:16 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:23
IP Address: 82.10.140.231

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

sandy williams

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

surely we can all live in harmony ,no need to kill wildlife ,remember they were here before we were ,im from the uk and find that the killing of bears ,wolves wildcats etc is so barbaric and that the kill is entirely uncalled for ,does it make these people feel good to take a life ,would they do this to a human being ?lets stop this killing please .

#356

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, March 26, 2020 1:06:21 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, March 26, 2020 1:09:19 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:57
IP Address: 35.133.2.204

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tom Fieber

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please use facts and data and not emotional requests from out of state and the US. when you consider your actions.

#357

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 27, 2020 3:18:23 AM
Last Modified: Friday, March 27, 2020 3:24:14 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:51
IP Address: 162.195.97.89

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Owen Voigt

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I hunt a fair bit in Alaska and see where hunting the grizzly there is a good way to meet population goals of not only the grizzly but also of the animals it preys on such as elk and moose. Calf predation by grizzlies is a major issue for sustainable huntable populations of moose and elk. Also there is definitely a safety factor for all recreationists. In areas where grizzlies are hunted there is a recognition by the grizzly population of danger associated with humans, where there is no hunting there is no recognition of danger of humans and human bear encounters are more frequent and have a much more devastating outcome. Hunting is another tool the fish and game can use for management. Please reinstate hunting of the grizzly, even at a very limited number.

#358

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 27, 2020 3:06:06 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 27, 2020 3:08:34 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:28
IP Address: 72.174.137.187

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Fred W. Allendorf

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I hereby submit my comments on the brief "Connectivity: a primer for Montana grizzly bear conservation" written for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council. Overall, I think that this brief is well written and scientifically sound. Nevertheless, I do have some important concerns.

The first paragraph states that connectivity is "helpful" for the long-term persistence of individual populations within a metapopulation. The word "helpful" here is not correct. By definition, local populations function together as a metapopulation only if they are connected. In addition, the rest of this brief discusses how connectivity is essential for the long-term persistence of local populations within a metapopulation. Thus, this statement should say that connectivity is "required" or "essential" for the long-term persistence of populations within a metapopulation, not "helpful".

I also have concerns about the treatment of the NCDE, CYE, and SE as separate populations in this brief. Under the US Endangered Species Act (ESA) only discrete population segments can be listed or delisted. These three populations clearly do not meet the requirements for being separate populations under legal policy (USFWS & NOAA 1996). For example, as explained in this brief, the CYE and SE populations have been augmented by translocations of bears from the NCDE. Therefore, the NCDE cannot be considered by itself for delisting under the ESA.

Thank you for your consideration of my comments.

USFWS and NOAA. 1996. Policy Regarding the Recognition of District Vertebrate Population. Federal Register 61 (26): 4721 – 4725

#359

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 27, 2020 4:11:02 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 27, 2020 4:14:33 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:30
IP Address: 72.174.71.73

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lee Metzgar

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Comment to MT Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council
By Lee H. Metzgar, Ph.D. Professor of Biology and Wildlife Biology [Ret.]
Regarding A Recovered Population and Hunting

Together with four other scientists (Drs. Allendorf, Mattson, Horejsi and Craighead), I contributed to a Compendium of professional statements regarding grizzly bear status in the lower 48 states and the bear's requirements for survival. That Compendium* has been distributed to the Grizzly Bear Advisory Council and I ask for inclusion of the entire document in this public record.

To summarize major conclusions in the Compendium, the current recovery areas will not support sufficient grizzly bears to constitute a population with viability over several hundred years. Grizzly bear recovery in the Northern Rockies will require five populated recovery areas and linkages of protected habitat with sufficient security to allow occupation by both male and female grizzly bears. Such a landscape will require reestablishing a third major breeding population in the Selway-Bitterroot region in Idaho to provide core habitat and regional linkage between other Recovery Areas.

It is my view, based on the best available science, that there is no recovered population of grizzlies in the lower 48 states. Furthermore, no existing "population" includes sufficient numbers to be considered recovered, no recovery zone is large enough to accommodate a recovered population and there is no evidence for natural genetic exchange among grizzly bears in all five U.S. subpopulations.

I also want to go on record in opposition to any grizzly bear hunting season. Hunting mortality within subpopulations will diminish essential numbers and outside those areas will kill potential migrants. Furthermore, trophy hunting of grizzlies that removes dominant males may increase cub predation by subordinate males, identification errors will lead to female deaths and hunting promotes a damaging, utilitarian attitude toward this iconic animal.

Grizzly bears of the lower 48 states are so vulnerable to multiple habitat threats and so slow to reproduce that a hunt cannot be justified until the bears are recovered as described above and both a "population surplus" and sustained gene exchange between the several subpopulations have been documented.

Reference:

* The Status of the Grizzly Bear and Conservation of Biological Diversity in the Northern Rocky Mountains, A Compendium of Expert Statements. October 2019. Available from Flathead-Lolo-Bitterroot Task Force, P.O.Box 9254, Missoula MT 59807.

#360

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, March 27, 2020 4:14:59 PM
Last Modified: Friday, March 27, 2020 4:16:51 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:52
IP Address: 72.174.71.73

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lee Metzgar

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Comment to MT Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council
By Lee H. Metzgar, Ph.D. Professor of Biology and Wildlife Biology [Ret.]
Regarding Basic Requirements for Recovery and Successful Management

Basic Requirements for Grizzly Bear "Recovery"

Any adequate plan for the conservation of grizzly bears in the Northern Rockies will start with and be based on the number of bears required for long-term viability. The best scientific guidance in this matter comes from Dr. Fred Allendorf, the world's leading scientific expert on grizzly bear population viability. Dr. Allendorf has stated: "A minimum meta-population goal should be ... no less than [approximately] 2,500-3,000 grizzly bears." He also notes that this range may be too low and that "as many as 5,000 grizzly bears may be needed in a single population for viability." [1]

The "primer" distributed to the Council by Dr. Costello [2] presents background information for the numerical requirements of a viable grizzly bear population. Unfortunately, the document fails to make the numerical requirements explicit and the first paragraph of that document obfuscates what viability will actually require. The paragraph would be better stated as follows in which my modifications appear in CAPS:

The ONLY POSSIBLE scenario for the long-term persistence of grizzly bears in the Lower-48...WILL INVOLVE multiple grizzly bear populations connectivity among populations is ESSENTIAL for their long-term persistence. Conservation efforts most often fail when management agencies allow political pressures to compromise what science has shown a species requires. After science has identified a species' requirements, it is the job of managers to find compromises within which those requirements can be met fully. Requirements are requirements and their compromise is not compatible with management success.

Citations

1. F.W.Allendorf, 2019, pp.2,4 In: The status of the Grizzly Bear and Conservation of Biological Diversity in the Northern Rocky Mountains, A Compendium of Expert Statements.
 2. C.Costello, Connectivity: a primer for Montana grizzly bear conservation.
-

#361

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 31, 2020 3:25:24 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 31, 2020 3:26:40 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:15
IP Address: 66.8.138.198

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

David Mattson - 1

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Comments by David Mattson

31 March 2020

I very much appreciate the opportunity to provide written input to the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council. These comments are one of two pieces that I am submitting along with a link to a report that is relevant to both the Council's deliberations and development of a grizzly bear management plan by Montana Fish, Wildlife, & Parks. What follows in the main text is perhaps the most accessible version of my comments. My other comments contain reference to a number of citations pertaining to the efficacy of hunting. You can download a report on status and trend of the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem grizzly bear population, entitled "Heart of the Grizzly Bear Nation," through this link:

<https://www.grizzlytimes.org/grizzly-times-reports>

then by clicking on the graphic for the "Heart of the Grizzly Bear Nation" cover.

A BIT ABOUT ME

I spent much of my 40-year professional career studying mountain lions and grizzly bears with the tacit and even explicit goal of better understanding relations between these large carnivores and people. My involvement in grizzly bear research and management ranged from Kluane National Park in the Yukon, through the Mountain Parks of Canada, to the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem of the United States. My investigations of mountain lions spanned six different study areas in the Southwest, including two in Utah, one in Nevada, and three in Arizona.

In addition to straight-forward ecological studies, my research has focused on conflict between large carnivores and people, as well as among people over carnivores. Of particular relevance here, my studies of mountain lions focused on factors affecting the outcomes of close encounters with people, as well as human safety in urban-wildland contact zones. My research with grizzly bears included close scrutiny of factors driving conflicts on agricultural landscapes in Montana. More recently, I've served as an advisor for non-profit organizations seeking to develop and promote a coexistence infrastructure. Until my retirement in 2015 I also taught topically relevant classes at Yale and the Massachusetts Institute of Technology that were the catalyst for thinking more comprehensively about human-carnivore coexistence.

INSTITUTIONS ARE FAR MORE IMPORTANT THAN TECHNOLOGY

Non-lethal prevention and mitigation of conflict with humans is recognized by many as central not only to human safety, but also to long-term conservation of large carnivores. My 40 years of experience have taught me, though, that tactics and technologies for preventing and mitigating conflicts can only be effectively deployed as part of a coexistence infrastructure embedded in well-resourced and otherwise sustainable coexistence institutions. Moreover, any meaningful response to long-standing and emerging domains of conflict requires insight into the full panoply of relevant drivers, both human and natural.

Tactics, methods, and technologies are necessary elements of coexistence between people and carnivores, yet only a small part of effective nonlethal regimes.

With that seminal point in mind, I hope in what follows to clarify what I see as the main domains, drivers, and challenges of grizzly bear-human conflict.

CONFLICTS OCCUR IN DIFFERENT ARENAS WITH DIFFERENT AUTHORITIES

All but a trivial number of human-grizzly bear conflicts can be assigned to six domains typified by shared drivers and common solutions:

- (1) Attractants such as garbage and small domestic animals associated with private residences;
- (2) Collisions with vehicles and trains travelling along heavily-trafficked transportation corridors;
- (3) Attractants and depredations on private agricultural lands;
- (4) Depredations and scavenging of domestic livestock on public land grazing allotments.

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

- (4) Depredations and scavenging of domestic livestock on public land grazing allotments;
- (5) Competition and close encounters with big game hunters on public lands; and
- (6) Displacement and poaching associated with secondary road systems—also on public lands.

An important higher-order distinction can first be made between human activities associated with conflicts that are wholly confined to private lands, where options for government intervention are more limited (as with [1] and [3]); versus human activities located on public lands or entailing common pool resources, over which government authority is well-established ([4], [5], and [6]); versus activities on both private and public lands, but on rights-of-way over which governments have primacy ([2]).

These distinctions readily differentiate domains where the primary tools to foster coexistence entail persuasion, subsidies, assistance, and other enticements ([1], [3]) from those where governments have authority to mandate, prohibit, or authorize. In other words, the role of government in modifying human behaviors is inescapable when it comes to managing human-carnivore conflicts—even the adoption of technologies. Corporations and non-profit organizations do not have sufficient authority or even resources.

MOST DRIVERS ARE INCREASED CONFLICT ARE RELATED TO HUMANS

The over-arching human drivers of conflict are unambiguous. Leaving aside the all-important role of worldviews and attitudes for the moment:

- (1) Conflicts over residential attractants are mounting as regional populations steadily increase (e.g., the Flathead Valley in Montana).
- (2) Likewise, bear deaths from collisions with vehicles and trains have climbed dramatically commensurate with increasing traffic on highways and railways, both as a function of increased intra-regional as well as national through-traffic (e.g., along the Highway 2-Burlington Northern Santa Fe transportation corridor in Montana).
- (3) Conflicts on public land grazing allotments have skyrocketed, partly because of changes in bears diets and behaviors (see below), but also because government agencies have surrendered their responsibilities for prudent permitting in the face of political pressure generated by well-connected ranchers (e.g., the Upper Green River complex of grazing allotments in Wyoming).
- (4) Similarly, conflicts over agricultural attractants on private lands have escalated, again in part because of changing bear behaviors (see below), but also because resources and enticements sufficient to deploy proven coexistence techniques have not been available (e.g., the Rocky Mountain Front and eastward in Montana).
- (5) Conflicts involving sport hunters have steadily increased despite declining and then static hunter numbers, partly because of changing bear diets (see below), but also partly because government bureaus have failed to propagate reasonable and prudent regulations mandating deployment of preventative practices (e.g., requiring that hunters carry deterrent sprays, limiting the time of day when hunting is allowed, and compelling the surrender of hunter-kills when usurped by scavenging bears).
- (6) Finally, conflicts and bears deaths associated with secondary roads on public lands take a steady toll, and promise to mount as the US Forest Service launches ambitious programs to build and resurrect roads in support of industrial-scale timber harvest (e.g., the Kootenai and Flathead National Forests in Montana).

Importantly, the trends identified in [3], [5], and [6] are closely identified with private individuals gaining profit or pleasure from public resources. As important, with the exception of vehicle and train collisions, sport hunting and technology will predictably play a minimal, even inconsequential, role in addressing problematic human drivers of conflict between people and grizzly bears.

ENVIRONMENTAL CHANGE ROOTED IN ANTHROPOGENIC CHANGE IS ALSO DRIVING CONFLITS

The other major suite of factors driving grizzly bear-human conflicts pertain to the numbers, distributions, diets, and behaviors of grizzly bears linked, in turn, to past and present environmental conditions. As it turns out, minimal or even non-existent increases in grizzly bear numbers are probably the least important of these drivers.

Minimal Growth of Bear Populations Does Not Explain Increasing Conflicts

Distributions of grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone (GYE) and Northern Continental Divide (NCDE) Ecosystems have indisputably undergone major expansions during the last 20-40 years, often into agricultural, industrial, and residential areas where conflicts with humans invariably follow. The question, though, is whether these increases in distribution have been driven wholly or even largely by increasing bear numbers, or by environmental changes that have produced comparative redistributions of high-quality foods towards

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

the peripheries of these two key ecosystems—driving a comparative redistribution of bear populations towards the periphery as well.

In fact, growth of grizzly bear populations has stalled in the GYE and NCDE during the last 5-20 years. There has been essentially no increase in numbers of reproductive females since the early 2000s within the Demographic Monitoring Area (DMA) of the GYE, which encompasses almost all grizzly bears in the ecosystem. Numeric increases outside the DMA are unknown, but certainly modest and comprised disproportionately of male bears. An almost identical situation exists in the NCDE, although obfuscated by reliance of biologists in this ecosystem on notoriously unreliable methods using data that are, on average, a decade old (see the report referenced at the beginning of my comments).

This lack of increase in bear populations begs the question of why grizzly bear are showing up in ever more areas. In fact, the pace at which bear distributions have increased in the both the GYE and NCDE has far outstripped even the most inflated claims regarding numeric increases of these grizzly bear populations. Rapid increases in population distributions—and related increases in conflict with humans on agricultural lands, in residential developments, and while hunting—cannot be adequately explained by the modest, even nonexistent, growth of grizzly bear populations.

By contrast, much has changed environmentally, most prominently for grizzly bears in the GYE, but also for bears in the NCDE. Although these environmental changes have occurred in the putative natural realm, to call them “natural” is a misnomer given that virtually all have been driven by either anthropogenic climate warming or by invasive non-native species introduced by humans.

Deteriorating Environmental Conditions are Driving Conflicts in the GYE

In the GYE, grizzly bears have suffered catastrophic losses of high-quality foods that previously concentrated them in areas remote from people. Over 70% of mature whitebark pines (a source of fat-rich seeds) was killed in an alarmingly brief 10-year period by an unprecedented outbreak of mountain pine beetles unleashed upon the formally frigid haunts of this tree species by climate warming.

Cutthroat trout, previously available in the center of Yellowstone National Park to bears while spawning in streams tributary to Yellowstone Lake, were functionally extirpated as a bear food by predation from an introduced non-native fish species (Lake trout), but with the effects of this predation exacerbated by deteriorating hydrologic conditions driven by climate change.

Beginning in the mid-1990s, all of the elk herds in core grizzly bear habitat simultaneously declined—some precipitously so—from the combined effects of human sport hunting, grizzly bear predation, wolf predation, and deteriorating summer range conditions, the last also driven by climate warming.

Most of these deleterious changes culminated between 2005 and 2010, shortly before a rapid expansion in distribution of the GYE grizzly bear population and related exponential increases in conflicts with ranchers and big game hunters over meat resources located mostly on public lands. The foci of these conflicts were (and continue to be) livestock on public grazing allotments and publicly-owned elk pursued and killed by sport hunters.

These dramatic increases in meat-related conflicts were unambiguously linked to increased consumption of meat by grizzly bears in compensation for losses of other foods. And, more importantly, all of these dynamics were rooted in anthropogenic causes. None are plausibly explained simply by increases in bear numbers.

Deteriorating Environmental Conditions are Also Driving Conflicts in the NCDE

Similar changes have assaulted grizzly bears in the NCDE. Here, as well, whitebark pine was functionally extirpated, but during an earlier period (1980s-2000) by a non-native fungal pathogen called white pine blister rust. Not by coincidence, the first major expansion eastward of this bear population followed final extirpations of whitebark pine along the Rocky Mountain Front.

On the west side of the ecosystem a sustained drought during 1998-2008 produced a berry famine during which production of fruit on three of the most important berry-producing shrubs was at a nadir. Again, not by coincidence, rapid expansions of the bear population to the west ensued.

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

Meanwhile, acreages burned by wildfires throughout the NCDE rapidly increased during the same drought period, resulting in a sustained pulse of transient unproductive habitats, the prelude to yet another rapid expansion of grizzly bears to the south and east out from the Rocky Mountain Front. As further inducement for wandering grizzly bears, this period of expansion onto private agricultural lands coincided with restocking of cattle numbers to record levels after a drought-driven decline, synchronous with a substantial drop in numbers of mule deer, the main alternate source of meat other than livestock for grizzly bears on the High Plains.

Here in the NCDE, as in the GYE, almost all of the deleterious environmental changes plausibly driving expansion of grizzly bears into conflict arenas is ultimately rooted in human causes, including anthropogenic climate warming. Perhaps as much to the point, little of the increased conflict between grizzly bears and humans in the NCDE can be attributed simply to the minimal likely increase in grizzly bear numbers.

Environmental Conditions Will Continue to Deteriorate

Projected environmental trends are not auspicious for grizzly bears. Numbers of people and the associated extent of housing developments and transportation infrastructure will almost certainly steadily increase in the Northern Rockies. Inescapably, conflict arenas will expand and intensify, as will barriers to movement by grizzly bears.

Insofar as foods are concerned, most will likely decline. Climate warming will preclude any chances for recovery or restoration of whitebark pine. Cutthroat trout will also be subject to continued habitat degradation that will prevent meaningful restoration to ecological functionality. The best available science suggests that key berry-producing shrubs will be less abundant throughout the Northern Rockies. Some species are projected to decline catastrophically. Intensified droughts from warming—sufficient to negate any increases in precipitation—will continue to reduce the fecundity of elk. Wildfires will become extensive and frequent enough to overthrow conventional notions that disturbance benefits bears. And army cutworm moths will likely disappear as a food source for bears with disappearance of the alpine flowers that currently sustain over-summering moths.

And what about replacement foods? Most candidates are either unidentified, of lesser quality to the ones likely to be lost, or unlikely to colonize at a pace that compensates for rates of loss. The world will almost certainly become a more difficult place for remaining grizzly bears in the contiguous United States, with predictable intensification of conflicts with humans.

SOLUTIONS WILL REQUIRE HONESTY, INSTITUTIONS, RESOURCES, AND REFORM OF STATE MANAGEMENT

Any meaningful non-lethal response to the daunting challenges of human-grizzly bear coexistence will require honesty about the drivers of conflict. Only then can we collectively develop meaningful and comprehensive strategies focused on priority landscapes. However, effective implementation of such strategies will require substantial human and financial resources, supportive institutions, and changed attitudes among people currently populating state wildlife management agencies.

Unfortunately, willful denial of the dominant and multi-faceted role played by humans in conflicts with grizzly bears is commonplace—including the role of anthropogenic climate warming. The invocation of phantom increases in grizzly bear populations merely aids and abets this denial, as does a focus on technological rather than cultural and institutional solutions.

One of the biggest obstacles, though, is in the finances, cultures, and practices of state wildlife management agencies. The default preference among state wildlife managers is unambiguously for lethal solutions (e.g., sport hunting) to perceived problems. This cultural proclivity is reinforced by financial dependencies upon hunters that create a business model premised on producing harvestable surpluses to satisfy the presumed customer.

This core institutional dynamic will confound any attempt to foster widespread coexistence between people and grizzly bears given that state wildlife managers have an inescapably important role to play. So long as wildlife managers see the solution to human-grizzly bear conflicts as primarily one of killing more bears—whether through sport hunting, lethal resolution of conflicts, or more effectively arming people—gains will be marginal at best in areas of state jurisdiction.

Social Acceptance is Little More Than a Political Football

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

As a perhaps logical derivative of preference for lethal regimes, state wildlife managers commonly argue that killing more grizzly bears, whether by trophy hunting or more prompt lethal response to conflicts, will create more “social acceptance” of grizzly bears. However this argument has shaky logical foundations, is at variance with the best available evidence, and is prefaced on a narrow and exclusionary definition of who the public is.

The presumption seems to be that killing grizzly bears, for example through sport hunting, will make those who are currently intolerant of live grizzly bears become more tolerant. Yet the limited research done on this dynamic, notably by Dr. Adrian Treves, suggests that there is no effect, or that the opposite occurs. Intolerance among the intolerant typically remains unchanged, with evidence even of increased poaching as a probable consequence of the tacit permission for such behaviors given by implementation of regimes that prioritize killing carnivores.

Moreover, my personal experience as well as that of coexistence professionals with whom I closely work clearly shows that those who are intolerant will consistently opt for lethal remedy as long as such remedy is readily available and authoritatively sanctioned. Under such circumstances, there is little incentive for such people to undertake the effort or expense of deploying non-lethal preventative measures. More to the point, increasingly permissive lethal regimes will predictably undercut—even negate—the hard work of developing non-lethal regimes founded on widespread adoption of new practices.

Perhaps most problematic, the social acceptance argument fielded by state managers tacitly defines “the public” as being a very small minority defined by a particular geography, ideology, and demographic profile. In other words, those who are currently intolerant of grizzly bears are ideologically predisposed to be intolerant, in a politically favored status, and comprising <1/10th of 1 percent of the American public. By contrast, surveys of the American public writ large consistently show (for example) that around 70% of adults oppose or find morally unacceptable trophy hunting of any animal—including grizzly bears. Similarly, a super-majority of Americans enthusiastically supports recovery of grizzly bears and flock to places such as Yellowstone National Park every year wanting to see live bears.

As a corollary, state wildlife managers as well as certain ranchers and hunters also commonly argue that a small number of local people are burdened with the costs of having grizzly bears, whereas a large number of more distant people reap the benefits. Inequity is the central implied issue. Yet such asymmetries are commonplace with common pool resources. In fact, the local residents who bear most costs are, in the main, heavily subsidized by American tax-payers, including those who graze cattle on public lands for private profit at rates well below market, or those who benefit from hunting for pleasure on public lands maintained at public expense. With such subsidies comes an obligation on the part of beneficiaries to constructively deal with any incurred marginal costs.

In short, there is little or no moral or evidentiary basis for killing more grizzly bears to purportedly build more social acceptance.

PEOPLE ARE FAR MORE DANGEROUS TO GRIZZLY BEARS THAN GRIZZLY BEARS ARE TO US

My concluding thought pertains to human safety during close encounters with grizzly bears, drawing not only on publicly-available data, but also upon my own numerous close run-ins with these bears. First, regarding the data: only 80 people are known to have been killed by grizzly bears in North America going back as far as written records take us—to the mid-1800s. During this same time, people have killed literally 10s of thousands of grizzlies.

Even in the contiguous United States, where grizzly bears still receive Endangered Species Act protections, 80-90% of all the adolescent and adult bears that die do so from human causes, amounting to hundreds of dead bears during the last two decades alone. By comparison, <1/1000th of one percent of all people who venture out of their cars and into the back country occupied by grizzly bears are killed or injured by a grizzly (see the report regarding impacts of pedestrians [people on foot] on grizzly bears: <https://www.grizzlytimes.org/grizzly-times-reports>) . The asymmetry of risk is profound. We are far more deadly to grizzly bears than they are to us.

Moreover, having closely scrutinized many of the circumstances under which human injury and death occurred—and been close witness to four—I can confidently assert that most could have been averted by common sense, increased awareness, prudence, better regulations, and better enforcement of regulations. Certainly that holds for the large majority of cases involving hunters.

More concretely, requiring that hunting occur only during morning hours; that carcasses uncovered by nightfall be abandoned; that

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

more concretely, requiring that hunting occur only during morning hours, that carcasses unsecured by nightfall be abandoned, that carcasses approached by a bear likewise be abandoned; that hunting clients be accompanied by a minimum of two guides; plus prohibiting bow hunting in grizzly bear habitat—together would deal with nearly all current risk to hunters. Yet, clearly, to do so would require that state wildlife managers change their stance from that of business-people providing a product to paying customers, to that of stewards of the public trust with an obligation not only to wildlife, but also human safety.

And, finally, insofar as my personal experiences are concerned, including numerous close encounters with—even charges by—grizzly bears, my conclusion is that situational awareness, knowledge of bears, and calmness are the ingredients most critical to a successful outcome.

#362

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, March 31, 2020 3:29:33 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, March 31, 2020 3:30:23 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:50
IP Address: 66.8.138.198

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

David Mattson - 2

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Additional Comments by David Mattson
Specific to the Effects of Sport Hunting
31 March 2020

The comments that follow are the second of two pieces that I am submitting along with a link to a report that is relevant to both the Council's deliberations and development of a grizzly bear management plan by Montana Fish, Wildlife, & Parks. My comments here relate to the prospective impacts of sport hunting on grizzly bears.

SOME PROBLEMS WITH EXISTING STATE PLANS

Existing and prospective state plans for managing grizzly bears outside the Demographic Monitoring Areas (DMAs) of the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem (GYE) and Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem (NCDE) compound the deficiencies in protocols for managing grizzly bears within. These plans matter because the US Fish & Wildlife Service (USFWS) has explicitly stated in the Final Rule in promulgated to remove ESA protection for GYE grizzly bears that "Mortalities outside the DMA are the responsibility of each State and do not count against total mortality limits," which functionally gives state managers carte blanche. Of relevance here, the three involved states either intend to limit or even prevent occupancy of areas outside the DMA by grizzly bears—as in the case of Wyoming—or, at best, allow for expansion in highly ambiguous and qualified terms—as in the case of Montana.

To quote the Wyoming Grizzly Bear Management Plan: "Habitats that are biologically and socially suitable for grizzly bear occupancy are the portions of northwestern Wyoming within the DMA that contain large tracts of undisturbed habitat, minimal road densities, and minimal human presence" and "Although grizzly bears will not be actively discouraged from occupying all areas outside the DMA, management decisions will focus on minimizing conflicts and may proactively limit occupancy where potential for conflicts or public safety issues are very high" (my emphasis added).

As direct evidence of its intent, the state of Wyoming during 2018 planned a sport hunt to kill as many as 12 grizzly bears in areas outside the DMA. Two of these bears would prospectively have been adult females. Given that there are almost certainly no more than 90-100 bears outside the DMA, the sport hunt alone would have prospectively killed 12-13% of all extra-limital grizzly bears in Wyoming, and this on top of other mortality that would likely have been of equal magnitude. No research has ever shown that an annual mortality rate near 25% can be sustained by any interior North American grizzly bear population. More commonly, sustainable mortality rates are less than half such a rate, nearer 5-10%.

With reference to key linkages in Montana, the USFWS's delisting Rule merely stated: "To increase the likelihood of occasional genetic interchange between the GYE grizzly bear population and the NCDE grizzly bear population, the State of Montana has indicated they will manage discretionary mortality in this area in order to retain the opportunity for natural movements of bears between ecosystems" (again, my emphasis added). The Grizzly Bear Management Plan for Southwestern Montana (Montana Fish, Wildlife & Parks, 2013) states throughout that "non-conflict" grizzlies will be accommodated in potential linkage zones, but then specifies measures for dealing with "conflict" grizzly bears, all of which history has shown lead to a high likelihood of death for the involved bear. As a consequence, and as the Plan itself acknowledges, connectivity between the GYE and other grizzly bear populations will depend on widespread effective efforts to prevent conflict and curb detrimental private land development, all of which require ample funding.

ADEQUACY OF RESOURCES FOR STATE MANAGEMENT OF COEXISTENCE

Despite laudable language in various planning documents, the U.S. Forest Service and States of Wyoming, Montana, and Idaho are demonstrably ill-equipped to prevent or non-lethally mitigate escalating human-grizzly bear conflicts concentrated on the periphery of the GYE and NCDE. Grizzly bear deaths have been increasingly linked since the mid-2000s to human-associated meat, notably livestock and the remains of hunter-killed big game, together accounting for near 55% of known and probable bear fatalities in the GYE. The fact that meat-associated grizzly bear deaths have been increasing in the GYE at rates of 5% (hunter-related) and 17% (livestock-related) per annum during a period of stalled population growth is a self-evident verdict on the deficiency of measures taken by managers to non-lethally address these burgeoning causes of human-grizzly bear conflict.

Current Conservation Strategies for the GYE and NCDE, along with state grizzly bear management plans, furthermore explicitly call for maintenance or even deterioration of the status quo, which will likely institutionalize an inadequate conflict prevention regime. A pointed example can be found in the Upper Green River Area Rangeland Project Final EIS completed by the Bridger-Teton National Forest during October 2017 and the Black Ram Final EIS completed by the Kootenai National Forest during 2019. There are no provisions in these EIS documents for substantive improvements in access management, husbandry practices, stocking rates, or any other management practices. Unmitigated conflict and resulting bear deaths will likely continue here and elsewhere.

This prognosis is rendered even more plausible by the fact that state grizzly bear conflict specialists will likely be further under-resourced in the near future. Appendix F of the penultimate GYE Conservation Strategy summarizes the prospective annual costs of implementing mandated human/grizzly bear conflict management, estimated to be \$650,000 for the US Forest Service, \$735,000 for the state of Wyoming, and \$246,000 for the state of Montana. On top of this, the Montana state plan also asserts the importance of “Securing important linkage habitats through purchase or easement...” Few of the requisite operating funds are currently available, much less funds for purchasing easements or fee simple titles. Out-year budgets for the Forest Service and state wildlife management bureaus suggest a worsening rather than improving fiscal situation.

Funding deficiencies are fully acknowledged in state grizzly bear management plans. The 2013 Montana plan states “...a funding mechanism to support Montana’s responsibilities for Yellowstone grizzly bear management is necessary.” Since then, the agency’s wildlife-related budget has been essentially static after accounting for inflation, with no increased allocations to support grizzly bear conflict prevention. Likewise, the 2016 Wyoming plan states “...costs associated with data collection and conflict management will vastly exceed any revenue generated by the grizzly bear program.” The Wyoming Game and Fish Department’s budget has concurrently declined by a net \$6 million since 2016 (Wyoming Game & Fish Department 2017). There is little prospect that short-falls will be covered by grants from the federal government given that proposed 2018-2019 budgets for the FWS and Forest Service call for major cuts in programs supporting recovery of endangered and threatened species.

Inadequacies of the current conflict prevention regime in the GYE are not mere speculation. One need look no further for evidence than in grizzly bear mortality trends in the GYE and NCDE during the last three years, which have, if anything, amplified during 2018 and 2019. None of these increases can be adequately explained by even the most optimistic estimates of increase for our two largest grizzly bear populations.

LIKELY DIRECT EFFECTS OF SPORT HUNTING

Hunting promises to further harm GYE and NCDE grizzly bears, if for no other reason than by magnifying and compounding dynamics that I have described already sorely compromising future prospects of these populations. But, even more problematic, this harm is likely to be irreparable, not only for the directly affected bears, but also for surviving bears through a cascade of subsequent indirect effects.

Most obviously—perhaps tautologically—the grizzly bears killed by sport hunters will be irreparably harmed. These bears’ lives will be irreversibly ended in ways definitively linked to hunting. They will, moreover, be unambiguously removed from the pool of potential reproductive individuals.

But beyond the obvious, there is the question of whether bears that will be killed by hunters would have likely died for other reasons during the subsequent year. If yes, then these hunting-related mortalities would have ‘compensated’ for other causes of death. If no, then hunting-related mortalities would be in addition to any that would have otherwise occurred. This is the distinction in technical ecological literature between ‘compensatory’ and ‘additive’ mortality. If hunting-related mortality is fully compensatory then, at a population level, there are no direct numeric effects incurred during a seasonal cycle. However, if mortality is additive, then population numbers will axiomatically be reduced below levels that would have otherwise been sustained. This is a key consideration because it sets the stage for determining whether, aside from irrefutable harm to individual bears, hunting could cause irreparable harm to the population and its long-term prospects.

In fact, there is little doubt that most hunting-caused mortality will be additive, not compensatory. Deductively, heavily-armed humans that deliberately seek out bears to kill them (i.e., sport hunters) will be, as a modality, far more lethal than humans under virtually any other circumstances. Absent hunting, a certain number of independent-aged grizzly bears would survive the existing relatively lethal environments that they are exposed to largely because of choices they make, for example, by seeking out gut piles that bring them into

close contact with elk hunters or by seeking out and either killing or scavenging livestock.

But these endemic scenarios do not translate into the near-certain death of the involved bears upon encountering the involved humans—which would be the case with a grizzly bear sport hunt. The point here is that sport hunting by its very nature is, deductively, per capita much more lethal to grizzly bears. By first principles, many deaths from sport hunting will be additive—that is, would not have otherwise occurred.

The weight of empirical evidence supports this conclusion. Without being exhaustive, research by Bishof et al. (2009) and Frank et al. (2017) has definitively shown additive effects of hunting in *Ursus arctos* populations, consistent with additive effects shown for wolves by Creel & Rottella (2010), for American black bears by Obbard & Howe (2008), and for cougars by Wielgus et al. (2013), Robinson et al. (2014), and Wolfe et al. (2015). By contrast, no credible investigation of any species of large carnivore has shown that hunting-related mortality wholly or even largely compensates for other causes of mortality.

Importantly, under current State plans and agreements, tallies of grizzly bear mortalities pre-dating a fall sport hunt will not account for the additive effects introduced by hunting-related deaths. Nor, under current management protocols, will the additive effects manifest during the 12 months following a hunt be accounted for in calculations of mortalities allowed for the following year.

LIKELY INDIRECT EFFECTS OF SPORT HUNTING

But the toll of sport hunting will not be limited to direct numeric effects on the GYE and NCDE grizzly bear populations. Other indirect effects, manifest in decreased production, survival, and recruitment of cubs, will likely transpire during subsequent months.

Some mammalian populations have been shown to increase reproduction and recruitment in the aftermath of elevated human-caused mortality. These responses have the potential to indirectly compensate for mortality caused by sport hunting. However, in other instances, human-caused mortality depresses reproduction during subsequent months, which amplifies and exacerbates direct numeric effects. These sorts of compensatory effects have been most consistently shown for carnivore species in which males kill offspring of reproductive females to enhance their own reproductive opportunities—a phenomenon known as sexually-selected infanticide, or SSI (Ebensperger, 1998, Milner et al. 2007).

By first principles, SSI is likely to be common in brown and grizzly bear populations given the large average difference in size of male and female bears (i.e., sexual dimorphism) and the fact that females have 3-year reproductive cycles (Schwartz et al. 2006). Synthetic analyses by researchers such as Harano & Kutsukake (2018) have shown the SSI correlates with the intense competition among males that leads to selection for increasingly large comparative size. Moreover, rough parity between numbers of adult males and females slaved to a 3-year reproductive cycle—as with GYE grizzly bears (Schwartz et al. 2006)—means that there are approximately three reproductive males for every breeding female. Such a skew by itself predictably leads to intense competition among males; a substantial portion of cubs unrelated to the males battling to reproduce; and significant incentive for males to kill cubs as means of inducing premature estrus in the targeted female (Bunnell & Tait 1981). Even a lesser ratio of reproductive males to breeding females predictably generates such a dynamic.

Amplification of SSI by sport hunting that disproportionately targets adult males would entrain several deleterious consequences. Cub and yearling death rates would likely increase with an influx of non-sire males triggered by the disruption of a social structure otherwise maintained by mature resident males. Longer-term, reproductive females would likely abandon productive habitats to seek refuge in more Spartan environs (for example; Mattson et al. [1987, 1992]; Ben-David et al. [2004]; Gardner et al. [2014]), with resulting depression of fecundity. All of this could exacerbate, longer-term, the direct and additive numeric effects caused by hunter-caused deaths.

But, in addition to a strong deductive case, there is overwhelming empirical support for the existence of SSI and related dynamics among grizzly bears, and for the amplification of these phenomena by human persecution. Without being exhaustive, there are more than 20 publications reporting evidence from investigations of brown and grizzly bears that: SSI is amplified by sport hunting (Bellemain et al. 2006; Gosselin et al. 2015, 2017; Bischof et al. 2018), including compensatory effects on birth and death rates (Stringham 1980, Swenson et al. 1997, Wielgus et al. 2013, Gosselin et al. 2015, Frank et al. 2017, Bishof et al. 2018); that deleterious social restructuring occurs, including an influx of potentially infanticidal males (Swenson et al. 1997; Wielgus et al. 2001; Ordiz et al. 2011,

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

2012; Gosselin et al. 2017; Leclerc et al. 2017; Bishof et al. 2018; Frank et al. 2018); and that foraging efficiencies of adult females decrease (Wielgus & Bunnell 2000; Ordiz et al. 2011, 2012; Hertel et al. 2016; Bishof et al. 2018) in tandem with increased physiological stress (Bourbonnais et al. 2013, Støen et al. 2015).

These results specific to *Ursus arctos* are in context of compendious research showing the same spectrum of results for large carnivores more broadly (for example; Milner et al. 2007, Packer et al. 2009, Harano & Kutsukake 2018), as well as more specifically for American black bears (Czetwertynski et al. 2007, Stillfried et al. 2015, Treves et al. 2010), mountain lions (Robinson et al. 2008, Peebles et al. 2013, Wielgus et al. 2013, Maletzke et al. 2014, Keehner et al. 2015, Teichman et al. 2016), and wolves for example; Murray et al. 2010, Wielgus et al. 2014).

By contrast, research specific to *Ursus arctos* that calls into question the potential amplification of SSI and other depensatory effects by hunting amounts to essentially two publications (Miller et al. 2003, McLellan 2005). Even so, Miller et al. do not cover conditions of particular relevance to the GYE and NCDE grizzly bear populations, where, unlike what they considered, hunting would perturb social dynamics of a population near a dynamic carrying capacity, and McLellan premises a regime where “some” adult males might be killed, which does not concur with the regime that was being considered by Wyoming and Idaho during 2018 that would have hunted 21 males in addition to congeners that will have died from other human causes. Moreover, this paucity of relevant findings is consistent with a continent-wide deficit pertaining to other large carnivores. Only a handful of authors, notably Czetwertynski et al. (2007) and Murray et al. (2010), call into question depensatory effects of sport hunting on black bears and wolves, respectively, and, even so, with significant qualifications.

Deductive logic and the available evidence leaves little doubt that male-biased sport hunting will entrain longer-term depensatory effects that amplify the more immediate negative effects of elevated mortality among grizzly bears. Any arguments to the contrary will necessarily be based on ignoring the weight of evidence, inflating uncertainties, and over-stating research in ways convenient to the purpose.

CONCLUSIONS

Post-delisting regimes for managing grizzly bear populations in the GYE and the NCDE are being expressly designed to prevent numeric increases within the heart of each ecosystem (i.e., the DMA); discourage, if not prevent, dispersal to and colonization of most of the adjacent or farther distant suitable habitat; and will likely promulgate inadequate non-lethal conflict prevention programs. Moreover, this potentially punitive management is being implemented using monitoring methods that not only engender considerable uncertainty, but also stand a good chance of leading to unintended undetected population declines (see the report linked on this web page: <https://www.grizzlytimes.org/grizzly-times-reports>) .

These inauspicious regimes are being imposed at a time when long-term conservation goals and on-the-ground conditions create an imperative to encourage—not discourage—occupancy of all adjacent suitable habitat; connectivity among ecosystems; colonization of novel yet suitable habitats; and implementation of a full suite of non-lethal coexistence measures.

Compounding these manifold stressors and problems, the states of Montana, Wyoming, and Idaho are all moving aggressively forward with designing sport hunts. These hunting-caused deaths will almost certainly be additive to the toll taken by humans for other reasons, likely compounded by longer-term indirect but depensatory effects on female reproduction and recruitment.

Taken all together, problematic environmental dynamics coupled with uncertain monitoring methods and purposefully lethal post-delisting management could harm all of the extant or potential grizzly bear populations in the Northern US Rocky Mountains. As a consequence, prospects for meaningful recovery and restoration could also be compromised, which is of consequence given that grizzly bears in this region represent a globally unique genetic and behavioral lineage, as well as an imperiled remnant of bears that once occupied most of the western contiguous United States.

REFERENCES

Aune, K., & Kasworm, W. (1989). East Front grizzly bear study: Final report. Montana Department Fish, Wildlife & Parks. Helena, Montana.

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

- Ausband, D. E., Stansbury, C. R., Stenglein, J. L., Struthers, J. L., & Waits, L. P. (2015). Recruitment in a social carnivore before and after harvest. *Animal conservation*, 18(5), 415-423.
- Bellemain, E., Swenson, J. E., & Taberlet, P. (2006). Mating strategies in relation to sexually selected infanticide in a non-social carnivore: the brown bear. *Ethology*, 112(3), 238-246.
- Ben-David, M., Titus, K., & Beier, L. R. (2004). Consumption of salmon by Alaskan brown bears: a trade-off between nutritional requirements and the risk of infanticide?. *Oecologia*, 138(3), 465-474.
- Bischof, R., Bonenfant, C., Rivrud, I. M., Zedrosser, A., Friebe, A., Coulson, T., ... & Swenson, J. E. (2018). Regulated hunting re-shapes the life history of brown bears. *Nature Ecology & Evolution*, 1(2), 116-123.
- Bischof, R., Swenson, J. E., Yoccoz, N. G., Mysterud, A., & Gimenez, O. (2009). The magnitude and selectivity of natural and multiple anthropogenic mortality causes in hunted brown bears. *Journal of Animal Ecology*, 78(3), 656-665.
- Blanchard, B. M., & Knight, R. R. (1991). Movements of Yellowstone grizzly bears. *Biological Conservation*, 58(1), 41-67.
- Brodie, J., Johnson, H., Mitchell, M., Zager, P., Proffitt, K., Hebblewhite, M., ... & Gude, J. (2013). Relative influence of human harvest, carnivores, and weather on adult female elk survival across western North America. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, 50(2), 295-305.
- Brook, B. W., Traill, L. W., & Bradshaw, C. J. (2006). Minimum viable population sizes and global extinction risk are unrelated. *Ecology Letters*, 9(4), 375-382.
- Bunnell, F. L., & Tait, D. E. N. (1981). Population dynamics of bears—implications. Pages 75-98 in Smith, T. D., & Fowler, C. W., eds. *Dynamics of large mammal populations*. John Wiley and Sons, New York.
- Carroll, C., Noss, R. F., & Paquet, P. C. (2001). Carnivores as focal species for conservation planning in the Rocky Mountain region. *Ecological Applications*, 11(4), 961-980.
- Carroll, C., Noss, R. F., Paquet, P. C., & Schumaker, N. H. (2003). Use of population viability analysis and reserve selection algorithms in regional conservation plans. *Ecological Applications*, 13(6), 1773-1789.
- Carroll, C., Noss, R. F., Paquet, P. C., & Schumaker, N. H. (2004). Extinction debt of protected areas in developing landscapes. *Conservation Biology*, 18(4), 1110-1120.
- Cooley, H. S., Wielgus, R. B., Koehler, G. M., Robinson, H. S., & Maletzke, B. T. (2009). Does hunting regulate cougar populations? A test of the compensatory mortality hypothesis. *Ecology*, 90(10), 2913-2921.
- Craighead, F. L., & Vyse, E. R. (1996). Brown/grizzly bear metapopulations. Pages 325-351 in *Metapopulations and Wildlife Conservation Management*. Island Press, Washington DC.
- Creel, S., & Rotella, J. J. (2010). Meta-analysis of relationships between human offtake, total mortality and population dynamics of gray wolves (*Canis lupus*). *PLoS one*, 5(9), e12918.
- Czertwytynski, S. M., Boyce, M. S., & Schmiegelow, F. K. (2007). Effects of hunting on demographic parameters of American black bears. *Ursus*, 18(1), 1-18.
- Davison, J., Ho, S. Y., Bray, S. C., Korsten, M., Tammleht, E., Hindrikson, M., ... & Cooper, A. (2011). Late-Quaternary biogeographic scenarios for the brown bear (*Ursus arctos*), a wild mammal model species. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 30(3-4), 418-430.
- Doak, D. F. (1995). Source-sink models and the problem of habitat degradation: general models and applications to the Yellowstone grizzly. *Conservation Biology*, 9(6), 1370-1379.
- Doak, D. F., & Cutler, K. (2014a). Re-Evaluating Evidence for Past Population Trends and Predicted Dynamics of Yellowstone Grizzly Bears. *Conservation Letters*, 7(3), 312-322.
- Doak, D. F., & Cutler, K. (2014b). Van Manen et al., Doth Protest too Much: New Analyses of the Yellowstone Grizzly Population Confirm the Need to Reevaluate Past Population Trends. *Conservation Letters*, 7(3), 332-333.
- Ebinger, M. R., Haroldson, M. A., van Manen, F. T., Costello, C. M., Bjornlie, D. D., Thompson, D. J., ... & White, P. J. (2016). Detecting grizzly bear use of ungulate carcasses using global positioning system telemetry and activity data. *Oecologia*, 181(3), 695-708.
- Erlenbach, J. A., Rode, K. D., Raubenheimer, D., & Robbins, C. T. (2014). Macronutrient optimization and energy maximization determine diets of brown bears. *Journal of Mammalogy*, 95(1), 160-168.
- Evans, S. B., Mech, L. D., White, P. J., & Sargeant, G. A. (2006). Survival of adult female elk in Yellowstone following wolf restoration. *Journal of Wildlife Management*, 70(5), 1372-1378.
- Frank, S. C., Leclerc, M., Pelletier, F., Rosell, F., Swenson, J., Bischof, R., ... & Zedrosser, A. (2018). Sociodemographic factors modulate the spatial response of brown bears to vacancies created by hunting. *Journal of Animal Ecology*, 87, 247-258.
- Frank, S. C., Ordiz, A., Gosselin, J., Hertel, A., Kindberg, J., Leclerc, M., ... & Zedrosser, A. (2017). Indirect effects of bear hunting: a review from Scandinavia. *Ursus*, 28(2), 150-164.
- Gardner, C. L., Pamperin, N. J., & Benson, J. F. (2014). Movement patterns and space use of maternal grizzly bears influence cub survival in Interior Alaska. *Ursus*, 25(2), 121-138.
- Gosselin, J., Leclerc, M., Zedrosser, A., Steyaert, S. M., Swenson, J. E., & Pelletier, F. (2017). Hunting promotes sexual conflict in brown bears. *Journal of Animal Ecology*, 86(1), 25-42.

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

BROWN BEARS. *Journal of Animal Ecology*, 80(1), 35-42.

- Gosselin, J., Zedrosser, A., Swenson, J. E., & Pelletier, F. (2015). The relative importance of direct and indirect effects of hunting mortality on the population dynamics of brown bears. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B*, 282, (1798), 20141840.
- Griffin, K. A., Hebblewhite, M., Robinson, H. S., Zager, P., Barber-Meyer, S. M., Christianson, D., ... & Johnson, B. K. (2011). Neonatal mortality of elk driven by climate, predator phenology and predator community composition. *Journal of Animal Ecology*, 80(6), 1246-1257.
- Gunther, K. A., & Smith, D. W. (2004). Interactions between wolves and female grizzly bears with cubs in Yellowstone National Park. *Ursus*, 15(2), 232-238.
- Gunther, K. A., Haroldson, M. A., Frey, K., Cain, S. L., Copeland, J., & Schwartz, C. C. (2004). Grizzly bear-human conflicts in the Greater Yellowstone ecosystem, 1992-2000. *Ursus*, 15(1), 10-22.
- Gunther, K. A., Koel, T. M., Perrotti, P., & Reinertson, E. (2011). Spawning cutthroat trout, Pages 30-32 in Schwartz, C. C., Haroldson, M. A., & West, K. (eds.). *Yellowstone grizzly bear investigations: Annual Report of the Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team: 2010*. U.S. Geological Survey, Bozeman, Montana.
- Harano, T., & Kutsukake, N. (2018). The evolution of male infanticide in relation to sexual selection in mammalian carnivores. *Evolutionary Ecology*, 32, 1-8.
- Haroldson, M. A., Schwartz, C. C., Kendall, K. C., Gunther, K. A., Moody, D. S., Frey, K., & Paetkau, D. (2010). Genetic analysis of individual origins supports isolation of grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem. *Ursus*, 21(1), 1-13.
- Haroldson, M. A., & Gunther, K. A. (2013). Roadside bear viewing opportunities in Yellowstone National Park: characteristics, trends, and influence of whitebark pine. *Ursus*, 24(1), 27-41.
- Hertel, A. G., Zedrosser, A., Mysterud, A., Støen, O. G., Steyaert, S. M., & Swenson, J. E. (2016). Temporal effects of hunting on foraging behavior of an apex predator: Do bears forego foraging when risk is high?. *Oecologia*, 182(4), 1019-1029.
- Hertel, A. G., Bischof, R., Langval, O., Mysterud, A., Kindberg, J., Swenson, J. E., & Zedrosser, A. (2018). Berry production drives bottom-up effects on body mass and reproductive success in an omnivore. *Oikos*, 127(2), 197-207.
- Hilderbrand, G. V., Schwartz, C. C., Robbins, C. T., Jacoby, M. E., Hanley, T. A., Arthur, S. M., & Servheen, C. (1999). The importance of meat, particularly salmon, to body size, population productivity, and conservation of North American brown bears. *Canadian Journal of Zoology*, 77(1), 132-138.
- Kaeding, L. R. (2010). Relative contributions of climate variation, lake trout predation, and other factors to the decline of Yellowstone Lake cutthroat trout during the three recent decades. Dissertation, Montana State University, Bozeman.
- Keehner, J. R., Wielgus, R. B., Maletzke, B. T., & Swanson, M. E. (2015). Effects of male targeted harvest regime on sexual segregation in mountain lion. *Biological Conservation*, 192, 42-47.
- Lande, R. (1995). Mutation and conservation. *Conservation biology*, 9(4), 782-791.
- Leclerc, M., Frank, S. C., Zedrosser, A., Swenson, J. E., & Pelletier, F. (2017). Hunting promotes spatial reorganization and sexually selected infanticide. *Scientific Reports*, 7, 45222.
- Macfarlane, W. W., Logan, J. A., & Kern, W. R. (2013). An innovative aerial assessment of Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem mountain pine beetle-caused whitebark pine mortality. *Ecological Applications*, 23(2), 421-437.
- Maletzke, B. T., Wielgus, R., Koehler, G. M., Swanson, M., Cooley, H., & Alldredge, J. R. (2014). Effects of hunting on cougar spatial organization. *Ecology & Evolution*, 4(11), 2178-2185.
- McLellan, B. N., & Hovey, F. W. (2001). Natal dispersal of grizzly bears. *Canadian Journal of Zoology*, 79(5), 838-844.
- McLellan, B. N. (2005). Sexually selected infanticide in grizzly bears: the effects of hunting on cub survival. *Ursus*, 16(2), 141-156.
- McLellan, B. N. (2011). Implications of a high-energy and low-protein diet on the body composition, fitness, and competitive abilities of black (*Ursus americanus*) and grizzly (*Ursus arctos*) bears. *Canadian Journal of Zoology*, 89(6), 546-558.
- McLellan, B. N. (2015). Some mechanisms underlying variation in vital rates of grizzly bears on a multiple use landscape. *Journal of Wildlife Management*, 79(5), 749-765.
- Middleton, A. D., Morrison, T. A., Fortin, J. K., Robbins, C. T., Proffitt, K. M., White, P. J., ... & Kauffman, M. J. (2013). Grizzly bear predation links the loss of native trout to the demography of migratory elk in Yellowstone. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences*, 280(1762), 20130870.
- Miller, C. R., & Waits, L. P. (2003). The history of effective population size and genetic diversity in the Yellowstone grizzly (*Ursus arctos*): implications for conservation. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 100(7), 4334-4339.
- Miller, C. R., Waits, L. P., & Joyce, P. (2006). Phylogeography and mitochondrial diversity of extirpated brown bear (*Ursus arctos*) populations in the contiguous United States and Mexico. *Molecular Ecology*, 15(14), 4477-4485.
- Miller, S. D., Sellers, R. A., & Keay, J. A. (2003). Effects of hunting on brown bear cub survival and litter size in Alaska. *Ursus*, 14(2), 130-152.
- Milner, J. M., Nilsen, F. B., & Andreassen, H. P. (2007). Demographic side effects of selective hunting in ungulates and carnivores.

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

- Conservation Biology, 21(1), 36-47.
- Montana Fish, Wildlife, & Parks (2013). Grizzly bear management plan for southwestern Montana, 2013, Final programmatic environmental impact statement. Montana Fish, Wildlife & Parks, Helena, Montana.
- Murray, D. L., Smith, D. W., Bangs, E. E., Mack, C., Oakleaf, J. K., Fontaine, J., Boyd, D., Jiminez, M., Niemeyer, C., Meier, T. J., Stahler, D., Holyan, J., & Asher, V.J. (2010). Death from anthropogenic causes is partially compensatory in recovering wolf populations. *Biological Conservation*, 143, 2514-2524.
- Nielsen, S. E., Larsen, T. A., Stenhouse, G. B., & Coogan, S. C. (2017). Complementary food resources of carnivory and frugivory affect local abundance of an omnivorous carnivore. *Oikos*, 126(3), 369-380.
- Norman, A. J., & Spong, G. (2015). Single nucleotide polymorphism-based dispersal estimates using noninvasive sampling. *Ecology & Evolution*, 5(15), 3056-3065.
- Obbard, M. E., & Howe, E. J. (2008). Demography of black bears in hunted and unhunted areas of the boreal forest of Ontario. *Journal of Wildlife Management*, 72(4), 869-880.
- Ordiz, A., Støen, O. G., Delibes, M., & Swenson, J. E. (2011). Predators or prey? Spatio-temporal discrimination of human-derived risk by brown bears. *Oecologia*, 166(1), 59-67.
- Ordiz, A., Støen, O. G., Sæbø, S., Kindberg, J., Delibes, M., & Swenson, J. E. (2012). Do bears know they are being hunted?. *Biological Conservation*, 152, 21-28.
- Packer, C., Kosmala, M., Cooley, H. S., Brink, H., Pintea, L., Garshelis, D., ... & Hunter, L. (2009). Sport hunting, predator control and conservation of large carnivores. *Plos One*, 4(6), e5941.
- Peck, C. P., Van Manen, F. T., Costello, C. M., Haroldson, M. A., Landenburger, L. A., Roberts, L. L., ... & Mace, R. D. (2017). Potential paths for male-mediated gene flow to and from an isolated grizzly bear population. *Ecosphere*, 8(10).
- Peebles, K. A., Wielgus, R. B., Maletzke, B. T., & Swanson, M. E. (2013). Effects of remedial sport hunting on cougar complaints and livestock depredations. *PLoS One*, 8(11), e79713.
- Proctor, M. F., McLellan, B. N., Strobeck, C., & Barclay, R. M. (2004). Gender-specific dispersal distances of grizzly bears estimated by genetic analysis. *Canadian Journal of Zoology*, 82(7), 1108-1118.
- Proctor, M. F., McLellan, B. N., Strobeck, C., & Barclay, R. M. (2005). Genetic analysis reveals demographic fragmentation of grizzly bears yielding vulnerably small populations. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences*, 272(1579), 2409-2416.
- Proffitt, K. M., Cunningham, J. A., Hamlin, K. L., & Garrott, R. A. (2014). Bottom-up and top-down influences on pregnancy rates and recruitment of northern Yellowstone elk. *Journal of Wildlife Management*, 78(8), 1383-1393.
- Reed, D. H., O'Grady, J. J., Brook, B. W., Ballou, J. D., & Frankham, R. (2003). Estimates of minimum viable population sizes for vertebrates and factors influencing those estimates. *Biological Conservation*, 113(1), 23-34.
- Retzlaff, M. L., Leirfallom, S. B., & Keane, R. E. (2016). A 20-year reassessment of the health and status of whitebark pine forests in the Bob Marshall Wilderness Complex, Montana. US Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station, Research Note RMRS-RN-73.
- Robinson, H. S., Desimone, R., Hartway, C., Gude, J. A., Thompson, M. J., Mitchell, M. S., & Hebblewhite, M. (2014). A test of the compensatory mortality hypothesis in mountain lions: A management experiment in West-Central Montana. *Journal of Wildlife Management*, 78(5), 791-807.
- Robinson, H. S., Wielgus, R. B., Cooley, H. S., & Cooley, S. W. (2008). Sink populations in carnivore management: cougar demography and immigration in a hunted population. *Ecological Applications*, 18(4), 1028-1037.
- Schwartz, C. C., Haroldson, M. A., White, G. C., Harris, R. B., Cherry, S., Keating, K. A., ... & Servheen, C. (2006). Temporal, spatial, and environmental influences on the demographics of grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem. *Wildlife Monographs*, 161(1).
- Schwartz, C. C., Fortin, J. K., Teisberg, J. E., Haroldson, M. A., Servheen, C., Robbins, C. T., & Van Manen, F. T. (2013). Body and diet composition of sympatric black and grizzly bears in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem. *Journal of Wildlife Management*, 78(1), 68-78.
- Servheen, C., Waller, J. S., & Sandstrom, P. (2001). Identification and management of linkage zones for grizzly bears between the large blocks of public land in the Northern Rocky Mountains. University of California, Davis, Road Ecology Center. Retrieved from: <http://www.escholarship.org/uc/item/9kr1w8fp>
- Smith, C. M., Wilson, B., Rasheed, S., Walker, R. C., Carolin, T., & Shepherd, B. (2008). Whitebark pine and white pine blister rust in the Rocky Mountains of Canada and northern Montana. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*, 38(5), 982-995.
- Støen, O. G., Zedrosser, A., Sæbø, S., & Swenson, J. E. (2006). Inversely density-dependent natal dispersal in brown bears *Ursus arctos*. *Oecologia*, 148(2), 356.
- Støen, O. G., Ordiz, A., Evans, A. L., Laske, T. G., Kindberg, J., Frøbert, O., ... & Arnemo, J. M. (2015). Physiological evidence for a human-induced landscape of fear in brown bears (*Ursus arctos*). *Physiology & Behavior*, 152, 244-248.

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

- Stillfried, M., Belant, J. L., Svoboda, N. J., Beyer, D. E., & Kramer-Schadt, S. (2015). When top predators become prey: black bears alter movement behaviour in response to hunting pressure. *Behavioural Processes*, 120, 30-39.
- Stringham, S. F. (1980). Possible impacts of hunting on the grizzly/brown bear, a threatened species. *International Conference on Bear Research & Management*, 4, 337-347.
- Swenson, J. E., Sandegren, F., Söderberg, A., Bjärvall, A., Franzén, R., & Wabakken, P. (1997). Infanticide caused by hunting of male bears. *Nature*, 386(6624), 450-451.
- Teichman, K. J., Cristescu, B., & Darimont, C. T. (2016). Hunting as a management tool? Cougar-human conflict is positively related to trophy hunting. *BMC Ecology*, 16(1), 44.
- Trall, L. W., Bradshaw, C. J., & Brook, B. W. (2007). Minimum viable population size: a meta-analysis of 30 years of published estimates. *Biological Conservation*, 139(1), 159-166.
- Trall, L. W., Brook, B. W., Frankham, R. R., & Bradshaw, C. J. (2010). Pragmatic population viability targets in a rapidly changing world. *Biological Conservation*, 143(1), 28-34.
- Treves, A., Kapp, K. J., & MacFarland, D. M. (2010). American black bear nuisance complaints and hunter take. *Ursus*, 21(1), 30-42.
- Van Manen, F. T., Haroldson, M. A., & West, K., eds. (2012). *Yellowstone grizzly bear investigations: Annual Report of the Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team: 2011*. U.S. Geological Survey, Bozeman, Montana.
- Van Manen, F. T., Haroldson, M. A., & West, K., eds. (2013). *Yellowstone grizzly bear investigations: Annual Report of the Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team: 2012*. U.S. Geological Survey, Bozeman, Montana.
- Van Manen, F. T., Haroldson, M. A., Bjornlie, D. D., Ebinger, M. R., Thompson, D. J., Costello, C. M., & White, G. C. (2016). Density dependence, whitebark pine, and vital rates of grizzly bears. *Journal of Wildlife Management*, 80, 300-313.
- Vucetich, J. A., Smith, D. W., & Stahler, D. R. (2005). Influence of harvest, climate and wolf predation on Yellowstone elk, 1961-2004. *Oikos*, 111(2), 259-270.
- Waits, L. P., Talbot, S. L., Ward, R. H., & Shields, G. F. (1998). Mitochondrial DNA phylogeography of the North American brown bear and implications for conservation. *Conservation Biology*, 12(2), 408-417.
- Weaver, J. L., Paquet, P. C., & Ruggiero, L. F. (1996). Resilience and conservation of large carnivores in the Rocky Mountains. *Conservation Biology*, 10(4), 964-976.
- White, D., Jr., Kendall, K. C., & Picton, H. D. (1998) Grizzly bear feeding activity at alpine army cutworm moth aggregation sites in northwest Montana. *Canadian Journal of Zoology*, 76, 221-227.
- Wielgus, R. B., & Bunnell, F. L. (2000). Possible negative effects of adult male mortality on female grizzly bear reproduction. *Biological Conservation*, 93(2), 145-154.
- Wielgus, R. B., Morrison, D. E., Cooley, H. S., & Maletzke, B. (2013). Effects of male trophy hunting on female carnivore population growth and persistence. *Biological Conservation*, 167, 69-75.
- Wielgus, R. B., & Peebles, K. A. (2014). Effects of wolf mortality on livestock depredations. *PLoS One*, 9(12), e113505.
- Wielgus, R. B., Sarrazin, F., Ferriere, R., & Clobert, J. (2001). Estimating effects of adult male mortality on grizzly bear population growth and persistence using matrix models. *Biological Conservation*, 98(3), 293-303.
- Wolfe, M. L., Koons, D. N., Stoner, D. C., Terletzky, P., Gese, E. M., Choate, D. M., & Aubry, L. M. (2015). Is anthropogenic cougar mortality compensated by changes in natural mortality in Utah? Insight from long-term studies. *Biological Conservation*, 182, 187-196.
- Wyoming Game & Fish Department (2016). *Wyoming grizzly bear management plan*. Wyoming Game & Fish Department, Laramie, Wyoming.
- Wyoming Game & Fish Department (2017). *Game and Fish budget cut, Governor and Legislature provide license fee increase to continue investment in wildlife management*. Wyoming Game & Fish Department Press Release 3/21/2017 2:10:32 PM, Laramie, Wyoming.
- Zedrosser, A., Støen, O. G., Sæbø, S., & Swenson, J. E. (2007). Should I stay or should I go? Natal dispersal in the brown bear. *Animal Behaviour*, 74(3), 369-376.

#363

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 01, 2020 2:24:59 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 01, 2020 2:27:01 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:01
IP Address: 70.176.159.86

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

David A. Smith

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Bear Spray: Five Rules For Hikers In Grizzly Country

Carry bear spray in hand.

The moment you see a nearby bear, get ready to spray.

Use two hands when spraying.

If a bear is close enough to spray, spray it!!

If a bear is charging from a distance, spray when it's 45-60 feet away so it runs into the spray.

"Odds are that if you deploy bear spray, it will be on a charging bear." Biologist John Morton, Kenai National Wildlife Refuge. Tips for using bear spray, Refuge Notebook, April 24, 2015

Carry bear spray in hand: It's at least 1--4 seconds faster to deploy bear spray carried in hand than bear spray carried in a holster on your hip or attached to the shoulder strap on your pack. Carry bear spray in hand whenever practical while you're on the move in grizzly country.

Deploying bear spray carried in hand is simpler than deploying bear spray carried in a holster--and simpler is better in a high stress situation. People facing a charging grizzly tend to get panicky. They develop fumble-fingers. It's important to keep things as simple as possible. With bear spray in hand, all you have to do is thumb off the safety as you extend your arms toward the bear, then use the same thumb to depress the trigger and spray. Simple. Quick.

The moment you see a nearby bear, get ready to spray. Remove the safety drop into a comfortable crouch as you extend your arms toward the bear. If you start backing away or waving your hands overhead before getting ready to spray, you may not have time to spray if the bear charges. First get ready to spray. Then consider your options.

Use two hands when spraying--one hand holding the base of the can. When people spray one-handed, the nozzle tends to tilt upward, causing people to spray over the bear. You don't need to "aim" bear spray. Just keep both eyes on the bear, point, and spray.

If a bear is close enough to spray, spray it! Bear spray has a range of 25 to 35 feet; If you're within 25 to 35 feet of a wild bear, you've encroached on the bruin's personal space, which forces it to fight or flee. Given that bears will charge "without warning," there's no reason to wait for the bear to charge or show signs of aggression.

If a bear is charging from a distance, spray when it's 45 to 60 feet away so it runs into the spray. A full-size school bus is 45 feet long.

#364

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, April 02, 2020 12:13:36 PM
Last Modified: Thursday, April 02, 2020 12:15:03 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:27
IP Address: 72.174.18.135

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Mike Bader

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

ADDITIONAL COMMENT FROM MIKE BADER

I supplement my comments specifically related to the role of hunting in grizzly bear population management and express my disappointment in the way the Council is handling this issue. Leaving the framing and discussion of history and facts exclusively to Ken McDonald, who has long been a proponent of grizzly bear hunting in Montana, is biased. You also need to hear from professional population ecologists such as Dr. Lee Metzgar, who has analyzed the effects of hunting on the demography of the grizzly bear in Montana.

The following quotes are from a published paper that assessed the distribution of grizzly bear mortality locations in the NCDE and GYE during years with hunting seasons and those without hunting seasons for grizzly bear (Bader 2000a, U.S. Forest Service Wilderness Science Proceedings). This analysis has been expanded and corroborated by Dr. David Mattson.

“There are important management implications in the shift of mortalities from W (wilderness) to NW (non-wilderness). If grizzly bear populations are delisted and legal hunting is resumed (the stated intention of state fish and game agencies in Wyoming and Montana), mortality density may shift back to core population areas and increase mortality among wary bears, while non-wary bears in non-wilderness habitats will still face high mortality risks. The source/sink habitat structures in these populations could thus be destabilized, and the source potential of wilderness habitat reduced, as some of the current source area would be converted to sink.

Due to the spatial distribution of wilderness habitat at the core of the GYE and NCDE recovery areas, hunting could have a destabilizing effect on these grizzly bear populations.

Some have theorized that hunting mortality among grizzly bears is compensatory and removes “problem” bears from the ecosystems, reducing the need for control actions (Greer 1976). However, the spatial distribution of the mortalities indicates that hunting mortality may be additive due to the location of numerous hunting mortalities in very remote areas, spatially distant from “problem” bears in front-country areas. Moreover, NCDE hunting mortalities from 1970-1979 were strongly skewed towards wilderness habitat, where more than 85% of the hunting kills occurred. Dood and others (1986) reported that only eight of 81 nonhunting mortalities from 1973-1985 occurred in wilderness. Another corroborating factor indicating that hunting mortality is additive are the mean mortalities per year, which decreased significantly (25.0 to 10.4 in GYE and 19.1 to 13.0 in NCDE*) following the end of legal hunting seasons. Dood and others (1986) reported that hunter harvest was the leading cause of NCDE mortalities from 1967-1985.” *the years immediately following the end of hunting.

Data presented by Greer (1972, 1976) also shows that annual hunter harvest of grizzly bears in Montana was very high preceding the listing of the grizzly bear in 1975 and accounted for a majority of deaths. Annual average minimum mortality between 1947-1969 was 39, although the surveys stated that “additional bears may have been killed by trappers, ranchers, sheepherders or cattlemen.” From 1967-1969 female grizzlies accounted for 33% of hunter kills. It is clear that authorized hunting played a major role in the decline of the grizzly bear population to the point it had to be listed under the ESA.

Going back to hunting again as soon as the grizzly might be delisted would certainly cause population decline. The records from Greer and Dood, et al. are from an era that predates several major sources of grizzly bear mortality that have essentially replaced hunting as unsustainable sources of mortality. These include a doubling of the regional human population and vast increases in infrastructure such as subdivisions, high speed highways and rail lines, a several-fold increase in annual visitation and an explosion of chicken farms and recreational use (see Mattson 2019). Adding hunting back into this new mortality mix is additive mortality that cannot and would not be sustainable as the other major sources of mortality remain largely unmitigated.

The FWP's and the Conservation Strategies set population standards of 800 grizzly bears in the NCDE and 500 in the GYE that specifically allow declines of up to 250 grizzly bears in both the NCDE and GYE. Reducing the populations by 30% or more is bad policy and even worse management.

The Montana Fish, Wildlife & Parks may make assurances that hunting would be carefully targeted so as not to threaten recovery efforts. However, this argument has no scientific analysis to support it. In fact, targeting grizzly bears at the edges of core population

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

errors. However, this argument has no scientific analysis to support it. In fact, targeting grizzly bears at the edges of core population areas in which they occur at relatively low densities would have the likely effect of reducing both the total distribution area and the smaller demographic core distribution area (overlapping ranges of male and female grizzly bears) and seriously diminish the prospects for genetic and demographic linkage of isolated populations.

In general, grizzly bear populations are either in a state of decline or non-growth around a density of 4/1000km² or less. Miller, et al. (1997) found grizzly bears have trouble finding breeding mates when density declines to around 1/1000km² or less.

Arguments that hunting might be limited to areas such as the Rocky Mountain Front are social and political. This is the only area where grizzly bears have reoccupied traditional plains habitat and exhibited feeding strategies unique to this area (Mattson 2019). According to FWP's bear manager Mike Madel, most of the grizzly bears making use of the plains still return to the mountains to den and spend considerable amounts of time there in other seasons. Therefore, a "targeted hunt" intended to reduce bear density in higher-conflict areas would also reduce density in the core.

Finally, a hunt targeted at "conflict bears" might mean the hunters would be guided there by state managers using radio telemetry or aerial observation. This is not fair chase or ethical hunting and isn't allowed in the hunting of any other wildlife. If a hunt were more generalized by area or hunting district it would be certain to result in the taking of non-conflict bears including females since there is no way to distinguish males and females from a distance.

Any discussions of grizzly bear hunting are premature and should be beyond the scope of the Council's mission since none of you are grizzly bear scientists. The fact it is not further reveals the agency bias inherent in this process. You have no reasonable alternative but to conclude you do not have enough scientific information to make a recommendation that hunting of grizzly bears is an acceptable management tool and would not cause harm to the populations within Montana.

Sincerely,

Mike Bader
Independent consultant
Missoula, Montana

#365

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:11:46 AM
Last Modified: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:13:09 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:22
IP Address: 216.14.243.27

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Cathy Reich

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I adamantly oppose allowing the hunting of grizzly bears. I see no good reason to encourage trophy hunting of our limited resources. This would not be the Montanan way.

thanks for listening,

Cathy Reich

#366

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:15:16 AM
Last Modified: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:16:50 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:34
IP Address: 150.131.184.163

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Emma Wear

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I strongly oppose any proposal to permit grizzly bear trophy hunting in Montana.

People travel from all over the world to the state for a chance to see a grizzly bear in the wild. The money generated from this tourism contributes greatly to Montana's economy. Grizzly bear hunting would be a scar on the state's reputation.

Please follow conservation biology best practices and scientific advice, rather than anti-predator scaremongering. At present, grizzlies occupy less than 5% of their historic range and populations have decreased in recent years.

When federal protections were removed from grizzly bears in 2017, Montana wisely decided not to approve a grizzly bear hunt. Please uphold this decision in the future.

#367

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:17:06 AM
Last Modified: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:17:27 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:20
IP Address: 205.207.226.40

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Chris Clouse

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I'm writing to let you know that I strongly oppose grizzly bear trophy hunting in Montana, and I ask that you forward this comment to the Grizzly Bear Advisory Council and include it as part of the public record.

People travel from all over the world to the state for a chance to see a grizzly bear in the wild. The money generated from this tourism contributes greatly to Montana's economy. Grizzly bear hunting would be a scar on the state's reputation.

What's more, hunting is unnecessary because top predators like grizzly bears control their own population. And hunting won't change their behavior because grizzlies are solitary animals — and a dead bear doesn't learn anything.

When federal protections were removed from grizzly bears in 2017, Montana wisely decided not to approve a grizzly bear hunt. Please uphold this decision in the future.

#368

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:21:23 AM
Last Modified: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:22:53 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:29
IP Address: 216.47.62.234

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Dr. Kari Gunderson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Heather Stokes,

I'm writing to you from the Swan Valley to let you know that I strongly oppose grizzly bear trophy hunting in Montana, and I ask that you forward this comment to the Grizzly Bear Advisory Council and include it as part of the public record. I live and work in grizzly bear habitat and make every effort to live with them, not against them like some of my neighbors. Surely you are aware of Windfall and her 3 cubs who were habituated by people who didn't report it until it was too late resulting in the sow being euthanized, two of her cubs sentenced to a life imprisoned at the Yellowstone Discovery Center, and one cub who wasn't caught who is most likely dead by now. This should NEVER happen again and I am deeply ashamed of this happening in the Swan Valley where I've lived for 42 years. If we're worried about CWD then opening up a trophy hunting season on this top predator is a pretty stupid thing to do. It's these predators that will prey on the weak and injured ungulates. There are more people to listen to than some of the cattle ranchers on the east side who hate grizzly bears.

People travel from all over the world to the state for a chance to see a grizzly bear in the wild. The money generated from this tourism contributes greatly to Montana's economy. Grizzly bear hunting would be a scar on the state's reputation.

What's more, hunting is unnecessary because top predators like grizzly bears control their own population. And hunting won't change their behavior because grizzlies are solitary animals — and a dead bear doesn't learn anything.

When federal protections were removed from grizzly bears in 2017, Montana wisely decided not to approve a grizzly bear hunt. Please uphold this decision in the future.

#369

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:40:38 AM
Last Modified: Friday, April 03, 2020 11:46:12 AM
Time Spent: 00:05:34
IP Address: 63.153.5.117

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Kathryn Hiestand

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am pleased to sign my name to this letter.

I'm writing to let you know that I STRONGLY oppose grizzly bear trophy hunting in Montana, and I ask that my comments be included as part of the public record.

To call the grizzly bear a "recovered" species is a wholly inadequate assessment of this species. There are so very few grizzly bears left in this country compared to a few hundred years ago, that to remove this animal from the endangered species designation is criminal. To consider hunting grizzly bears is appalling. Managing grizzly bears DOES NOT mean they need to be hunted. Far too many grizzlies are killed because of cars and other "takings" that a hunting season shouldn't even be considered. Yellowstone bears are accustomed to protection. If they leave the Park, they are sitting ducks for greedy hunters. There is NO point in killing a grizzly bear besides having a trophy. This is doubly appalling. Taking the life of a grizzly bear is just plain criminal. Live and let live!

People travel from all over the world to the state for a chance to see a grizzly bear in the wild. The money generated from this tourism contributes greatly to Montana's economy. Grizzly bear hunting would be a scar on the state's reputation.

What's more, hunting is unnecessary because top predators like grizzly bears control their own population. Hunting won't change their behavior because grizzlies are solitary animals — and a dead bear doesn't learn anything.

When federal protections were removed from grizzly bears in 2017, Montana wisely decided not to approve a grizzly bear hunt. Please uphold this decision, indefinitely, into the future.

Sincerely,
Kathryn L Hiestand
Bozeman, MT 59718
rynneal@aol.com

#370

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, April 03, 2020 12:42:37 PM
Last Modified: Friday, April 03, 2020 12:43:32 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:55
IP Address: 208.45.4.51

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Chris Daum

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I'm writing to let you know that I strongly oppose grizzly bear trophy hunting in Montana.

People travel from all over the world to the state for a chance to see a grizzly bear in the wild. The money generated from this tourism contributes greatly to Montana's economy. Grizzly bear hunting would be a scar on the state's reputation.

What's more, hunting is unnecessary because top predators like grizzly bears control their own population (as well as incurring losses from highway deaths and poaching). And hunting won't change their behavior because grizzlies are solitary animals — and a dead bear doesn't learn anything.

When federal protections were removed from grizzly bears in 2017, Montana wisely decided not to approve a grizzly bear hunt. Please uphold this decision in the future.

Sincerely,
Chris Daum
Stevensville, MT 59870

#371

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, April 03, 2020 2:34:53 PM
Last Modified: Friday, April 03, 2020 2:35:24 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:30
IP Address: 47.37.51.93

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Dylan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I'm writing to let you know that I strongly oppose grizzly bear trophy hunting in Montana, and I ask that you forward this comment to the Grizzly Bear Advisory Council and include it as part of the public record.

People travel from all over the world to the state for a chance to see a grizzly bear in the wild. The money generated from this tourism contributes greatly to Montana's economy. Grizzly bear hunting would be a scar on the state's reputation.

What's more, hunting is unnecessary because top predators like grizzly bears control their own population. And hunting won't change their behavior because grizzlies are solitary animals — and a dead bear doesn't learn anything.

When federal protections were removed from grizzly bears in 2017, Montana wisely decided not to approve a grizzly bear hunt. Please uphold this decision in the future.

Sincerely,
Dylan Flather
Hamilton, MT 59840

#372

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Friday, April 03, 2020 6:49:01 PM
Last Modified: Friday, April 03, 2020 6:50:48 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:47
IP Address: 172.58.46.215

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Robert Bloyer

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I'm writing to let you know that I strongly oppose grizzly bear trophy hunting in Montana, and I ask that you forward this comment to the Grizzly Bear Advisory Council and include it as part of the public record.

People travel from all over the world to the state for a chance to see a grizzly bear in the wild. The money generated from this tourism contributes greatly to Montana's economy. Grizzly bear hunting would be a scar on the state's reputation.

What's more, hunting is unnecessary because top predators like grizzly bears control their own population. And hunting won't change their behavior because grizzlies are solitary animals — and a dead bear doesn't learn anything.

When federal protections were removed from grizzly bears in 2017, Montana wisely decided not to approve a grizzly bear hunt. Please uphold this decision in the future.

#373

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, April 04, 2020 7:56:08 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, April 04, 2020 8:05:03 AM
Time Spent: 00:08:54
IP Address: 174.208.12.82

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Shane Shima

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

As a Montana resident for almost 50 years, avid hunter, outdoorsman, rancher, landowner and retail business owner in Libby, Ronan and Hamilton I would like to advise the council to let MTFWP manage grizzly like all other wildlife. Enough of listening to nonresident, nonhunters and nonranchers emotions. I and people like me are the ones footing ALL the funding for wildlife management. Let FWP and their biologist use sound management practices of hunting to manage grizzly bears like all other wildlife. This is their job. Thanks

#374

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Saturday, April 04, 2020 9:40:23 AM
Last Modified: Saturday, April 04, 2020 9:49:50 AM
Time Spent: 00:09:27
IP Address: 69.146.24.117

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Chris Edgerton

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Who are you kidding? Any plans to hunt grizzlies will be taken to court and you will lose! Even if your scientific research shows they have reached a sustainable threshold for allowing a hunt, it will be stopped by the bleeding hearts. Squeaky wheel gets the grease! I'm all in for a hunting season but I won't hold my breath. Quit wasting taxpayer dollars trying to get them delisted.

#375

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 11:04:13 AM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 11:55:20 AM
Time Spent: 00:51:06
IP Address: 65.131.206.180

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Swan View Coalition, Keith Hammer Chair

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Swan View Coalition urges the GBAC to advise Governor Bullock to not consider grizzly bear sport hunting as a viable means to manage grizzly bears and to rescind the language in his Administrative Rules of Montana (ARM 12.9.103). Those rules require a sport hunt of grizzly bears as "the most desirable method of balancing grizzly bear numbers with their available habitat" should the bear lose its federal ESA protection.

Grizzly bears in the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem number about 1,000 while 100,000 people live in Flathead County alone. Nearly 400,000 people live in the 12 counties that contain the NCDE and the number of people visiting Glacier National Park's bear habitat each year is still climbing from the 2.4 million that visited in 2015!

Grizzly bears are struggling with increasing numbers of people living, working and playing in their habitat. You can't balance out this problem by killing grizzly bears without halting or reversing the recovery of the grizzly bear population.

Urge the governor instead to beef up his Administrative Rules of Montana to better protect grizzly bears and their habitat so that grizzly bear numbers can increase and the various grizzly bear ecosystems can be reconnected. Population experts say it will take 5,000 grizzly bears in a reconnected NCDE-Yellowstone-Selway Bitterroot-Cabinet-Yaak-Selkirks ecosystem to maintain genetic diversity over the long term.

Shooting grizzly bears runs contrary to increasing grizzly bear numbers and their reoccupation of essential habitats. And sport hunting does not target the bears that may need to be killed on occasion as a matter of human safety.

It took a lawsuit by Swan View Coalition and Fund for Animals to end Montana's former grizzly bear hunt in 1991, which was then responsible for 48% of all known human-caused mortality in the NCDE. Montana simply can't be trusted to manage grizzly bears through hunting, especially in light of increasing human and development pressures being applied to bear habitat.

#376

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 3:41:43 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 3:46:49 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:05
IP Address: 174.22.5.51

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Dani Mayberry

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Gov. Bullock - first of all thank you for keeping the people of Montana well informed during the pandemic. Please, do not allow the hunting of grizzly bears in Montana. Grizzly bears are struggling with increasing numbers of people living, working and playing in their habitat. You can't balance out this problem by killing grizzly bears without halting or reversing the recovery of the grizzly bear population. Shooting grizzly bears runs contrary to increasing grizzly bear numbers and their reoccupation of essential habitats. And sport hunting does not target the bears that may need to be killed on occasion as a matter of human safety. Montana simply can't be trusted to manage grizzly bears through hunting, especially in light of increasing human and development pressures being applied to bear habitat. Thank you -

#377

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 3:44:42 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 3:49:28 PM
Time Spent: 00:04:45
IP Address: 50.1.94.241

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Elaine Woodriff

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please advise Governor Bullock to not consider grizzly bear sport hunting as a viable means to manage grizzly bears and to rescind the language in his Administrative Rules of Montana (ARM 12.9.103). Those rules require a sport hunt of grizzly bears as “the most desirable method of balancing grizzly bear numbers with their available habitat” should the bear lose its federal ESA protection.

Grizzly bears are struggling with increasing numbers of people living, working and playing in their habitat. You can't balance out this problem by killing grizzly bears without halting or reversing the recovery of the grizzly bear population.

#378

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 3:47:53 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 3:51:20 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:26
IP Address: 24.35.99.135

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Martha suter

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not set back years of work to secure our griz population just to open it up to a bunch of trophy seekers for sport. I am definitely in favor of hunting but not in this circumstance. Reevaluate next year sincerely, Martha Suter

#379

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 3:45:58 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 3:53:29 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:31
IP Address: 174.22.1.242

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Michael ober

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Under NO circumstances should there ever be any form of grizzly bear hunting in Montana! California killed its last one decades ago but still displays one on their state flag. Let's not be the next to see them disappear. Grizzlies are our official state mammal. We don't allow the killing of our state bird, the meadowlark, so let's not start a general season on grizzlies! NO TO HUNTS.

#380

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 4:14:45 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 4:24:21 PM
Time Spent: 00:09:36
IP Address: 73.138.39.213

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tony Valovich

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Do not allow grizzly hunting. Every time the government tries to mess with Nature, the results are always negative. They killed all the wolves in Yellowstone and the place became a mess. Now that they are allowed back, the ecosystem has improved, grasslands have increased, natural selection of wildlife has occurred and it is a more beautiful place because of it. I travel to glacier and the Flathead region often and love that area more than anywhere other National Park. Opening Grizzly hunting for the price of a few licenses is ridiculous. Please reconsider this move and trust the conservation clubs to guide your decision making. they are in the woods all the time. Don't listen to gun and hunting lobbyists.

#381

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 4:33:43 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 4:34:55 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:12
IP Address: 75.72.54.6

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

James Nelson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

If you approve of grizzly hunting, you are crazy. Do not do this. Thanks. Be smart about this.

#382

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 4:16:42 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 4:41:22 PM
Time Spent: 00:24:39
IP Address: 24.96.183.45

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jim Fiddler, Bigfork, MT 59911

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Friends, I hope you will convey my very strong sentiments to our Governor, that I think any type of plan to allow hunting of Grizzly Bears should not be allowed and should not be enacted. An unusually large number of these Bears were killed this past year by trains, vehicles, and other human interactions. Humans are wreaking havoc with the Bears just by their presence in areas that are prime habitat for Grizzlies. We need to do a better job of minimizing their mortalities than creating a new way to legalize decreasing their numbers.

They have been protected for so many years because of the huge impact on their survival created by such vast numbers of human beings moving through their habitats. Human threats to their existence will continue to increase significantly without hunting.

I spent many years as hunter and even participated as an observer on a Grizzly hunt in B.C, Canada. I say leave the Bears alone.

#383

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 4:41:39 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 4:52:56 PM
Time Spent: 00:11:17
IP Address: 184.166.182.240

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Thomas H marx

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not allow hunting Grizzly bears.

I have family property on Trail Creek of the North Fork of the Flathead.

High concentration of bears. Never had a problem except for a couple times they entered uninvited.

I feel blessed to see, on occasion, the apex carnivore in North America.

Please don't hunt them.

Tom Marx. Age 72 parents bought property in 1949.

#384

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 4:53:36 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 5:06:57 PM
Time Spent: 00:13:20
IP Address: 174.208.5.148

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Edd Blackler

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please advise our governor that authorizing a Grizzly Bear hunting season would be counter productive to the need to increase the grizzly bear population in Montana.

The increasing number of visitors who are coming to Glacier National Park and the surrounding areas are putting pressure on the grizzly population. Adding a hunting season would not be advisable.

#385

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 5:30:15 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 5:32:56 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:41
IP Address: 67.188.5.241

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Susan Waldron

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

AN ABSOLUTE NO to allowing grizzly bear hunts. They were once hunted to extinction, and are finally recovering. Not to mention trophy hunts are nothing more than abhorrent senseless killing. For what? Bragging rights or a bear's head or hide that will later end up in someone's garage?

#386

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 5:25:55 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 5:42:25 PM
Time Spent: 00:16:29
IP Address: 174.22.1.192

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Catherine Haug

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I agree with the opinion recently stated by the Swan View Coalition regarding grizzly bear sport hunting. I urge the GBAC to advise Governor Bullock not to consider grizzly bear sport hunting as a viable means to manage these bears, and to rescind the language in his Administrative Rules of Montana (ARM 12.9.103).

Grizzly bears once roamed the prairies that are now agricultural fields, and as their populations grow, they should be able to occupy those prairies. Although their population in mountain areas may be close to recovery, their population in all the areas they once occupied is still low. For this reason, open hunting of grizzlies should not be allowed.

#387

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 7:46:05 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 7:52:19 PM
Time Spent: 00:06:14
IP Address: 67.143.192.151

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Betsey Hurd

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am completely opposed to the hunting of grizzly bears for sport. These animals need wild open country to live, and in every way they are being pushed into less and less space because there are too many humans. Leave the bears alone! No one is going to eat them, and trophy hunting is dishonorable. Please vote against allowing sport hunting of grizzly bears. Thank you, Betsey Hurd

#388

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Sunday, April 05, 2020 7:52:24 PM
Last Modified: Sunday, April 05, 2020 7:52:37 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:13
IP Address: 67.143.192.151

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Betsey Hurd

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am completely opposed to the hunting of grizzly bears for sport. These animals need wild open country to live, and in every way they are being pushed into less and less space because there are too many humans. Leave the bears alone! No one is going to eat them, and trophy hunting is dishonorable. Please vote against allowing sport hunting of grizzly bears. Thank you, Betsey Hurd

#389

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 4:29:44 AM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 4:34:41 AM
Time Spent: 00:04:56
IP Address: 110.142.1.182

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Philippa Goninan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I can't believe this is even a consideration - killing Grizzly Bears for sport. They are endangered - they are critical to the ecosystem. There are plenty of animals that can be hunted, mostly living in packs, not hibernating 5-7 months of the year. Please people, leave the Grizzly alone. Protect the ecosystem, the flora and fauna.

#390

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 9:16:37 AM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 9:18:39 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:02
IP Address: 216.47.55.234

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Christine Dickinson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not allow hunting of the Grizzly Bear. I realize this will generate revenue for your programs but the very idea of this magnificent animal being hunted is repulsive. I am absolutely opposed to this and pretty much everyone I know feels the same. Thank you.

#391

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 9:14:55 AM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 9:37:15 AM
Time Spent: 00:22:19
IP Address: 65.131.192.170

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Frances Wade

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I lived on Trail Creek Rd, up the North Fork of the Flathead, 6 miles from the Canadian Border for 9 years-1982 -1991-where I built a homestead off-grid. We raised chickens, goats and horses, and never had any problem from grizzly bears.. We saw them occasionally when, we were out riding and one or two passed through the property but never bothered our stock. We counted our few sightings as highlights of our day. People are a far greater danger to them, as we continue to destroy their ever decreasing habitat. Please try to save a place for them to live free. The world will be a sadder place when they are only alive in cages so we can gawk at them as prisoners of our refusal to limit the endless over-breeding of the human species.

#392

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 10:09:43 AM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 10:23:57 AM
Time Spent: 00:14:14
IP Address: 66.135.71.182

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Chris Gotschalk

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not allow for sport hunting of Grizzly Bears.

Focus your attention on maintaining their habitat and improving habitat degraded by commercial operations that the Forest Service has not held accountable for decommissioning roads and inspecting and/or removing culverts among other infractions. The notion that bears are expanding their range due to their increase population is not accurate. They are moving into new areas in search of protein no longer available in their diminished habitat. There are still way too few bears and too much mortality due to collisions with trains and automobiles along with the killing of so-called problem bears to warrant any sort of 'sport' hunting.

Thank you

#393

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 10:57:49 AM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 11:01:00 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:11
IP Address: 72.160.18.18

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

helen pilling

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I do not believe there should be any 'hunting' of grizzly bears. Enough of these important mammals are killed by cars, trains and ranchers. Please continue to save habitat and make this effort a corridor so that bears can be bears and have all they need to roam wild. thank you, Helen Pilling

#394

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 11:15:37 AM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 11:20:26 AM
Time Spent: 00:04:49
IP Address: 72.174.71.73

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

C. Campbell

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am writing in opposition to the plan of a grizzly bear hunt in Montana. There is no evidence that the disparate populations have found a way to maintain genetic diversity and not nearly enough numbers currently in the existing habitat.

Grizzlies are slow to reproduce and hunting will cull out crucial members of a diminishing population. Now is not the time to impact their numbers.

#395

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 12:29:28 PM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 12:37:58 PM
Time Spent: 00:08:29
IP Address: 216.211.178.14

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Paul Cogswell

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

While I'm all for healthy wildlife populations, it's my concern that wildlife populations are getting very high and becoming a problem. It used to be a treat to see deer. Now they're begging like dogs, devastating plant life and causing dangerous highways. Elk, turkeys, wolves, bears, and bison are beautiful but I'm concerned there are dangers from overpopulation and habitation to humans. I think hunting of grizzlies will keep the populations at a reasonable level and continue to keep them from being an increasing danger to humans.

#396

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 2:53:58 PM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 2:55:42 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:43
IP Address: 73.231.59.195

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I frequently visit Montana to hike and view wildlife. I would love to see a grizzly from afar. It seems absurd to me that Montana would consider allowing hunting of this iconic species. Please don't!

#397

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 4:24:59 PM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 4:32:20 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:20
IP Address: 184.166.54.48

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

LLOYD JONES

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

While managing the number of grizzly bear by hunting might seem appropriate, it opens a door to hunting that will be difficult to control and monitor. Once a few hunters have "bagged" a grizzly, the pressure to expand the hunting will be immense. Better not to open the door.

#398

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 4:47:13 PM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 4:48:15 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:01
IP Address: 65.131.203.75

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Brian Peck

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

April 6, 2020

Dear Council Members,

Please accept the following comments on the proposal regarding the hunting of grizzlies in Montana and enter them into the official record.

It seems to me that the proposal is a "Solution in search of a Problem", because it's based upon a number of assumptions that are almost universally incorrect, as follows:

(1) While the proposal acknowledges that hunting would only occur after delisting, it's clear that Montana FWP believes this will happen in the near future. Not so. Most independent scientists report that Real grizzly bear recovery will require a minimum of 2500-3000 bears (some say 5000), including all 6 Recovery Areas in a "metapopulation" connected by landscape level linkage zones that have been designated and protected.

None of this is the case. There are an estimated 1850 grizzlies in the entire lower 48 – Montana has about 1250; there is no U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) commitment to manage/recover these as one metapopulation; there is no designated or protected system of landscape linkage zones within and between Recovery Areas – or any clear commitment to develop one; the NCDE has no long-term, ecosystem-wide research to identify key grizzly habitat, or monitor it long-term; and the USFWS attempts to delist one isolated Distinct Population Segment (DPS) at a time are Dead on Arrival in the courts.

(2) The proposal appears to assume that there either already is an overpopulation of grizzly bears, or soon will be one. Grizzly bear populations are biologically incapable of experiencing a population explosion. As reported numerous times by the Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team (IGBST) at Interagency Grizzly Bear Committee (IGBC) meetings, grizzlies are the slowest reproducing mammal in North America. NCDE females average age of first reproduction is 5-6 years; cubs stay with their mothers for 3 years, during which time they don't breed; and most females won't replace themselves with another breeding age female until they're 12 years old, and few breed (or live) past about 25 years. The current population of 1850 is 3.7% of the estimated historic numbers of 50,000, occupying about 3% of historic habitat.

(3) Montana's Grizzly Bear Policy (ARM 12.9.1401) says under (c) Hunting and recreational use that, "These opportunities shall include sport hunting..., making it clear that the state's mind is already made up, the science be damned, and the public process is just an inconvenient speed bump on the way to the first season.

It also says, "Sport hunting is considered the most desirable method of balancing grizzly bear numbers with their available habitat, minimizing depredation against private property...and minimizing bear attacks on humans." None of this has any factual or scientific basis.

First, grizzlies have been balancing their numbers to available habitat for millions of years. We, on the other hand, haven't even bothered to fund and conduct the vital research to determine the quantity, quality, location, and connectivity of key habitat in the NCDE, so there's little hope that we can "balance" anything. Second, most "depredations" involve bears being pulled in by human provided food attractants, so the problem is Human behavior, not Bear behavior. In the case of livestock depredations on the Rocky Mountain Front, the majority involve poor animal husbandry, with many ranchers wanting to conduct operations like the "Good Old Days" when they ran stock as they pleased and killed any predator that got in their way. Third, as any wildlife or land manager can tell you, nearly all grizzly bear attacks on humans are caused by people behaving carelessly, foolishly, or recklessly in bear country. Unprovoked bear attacks are a tiny percent of the total conflicts.

So, how exactly would a grizzly hunting season address the specific bears involved in depredations and attacks? How would hunters know which grizzly to shoot. Clearly, the only way would be for Montana FWP to locate the problem bear – if they were collared – and lead the designated hunter in to kill the designated grizzly – essentially a guided "canned" hunt that would violate every principle of "ethical fair chase" and sportsmanship. Good luck selling that

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

critical for success and sportsmanship. Good luck being that.

Finally, on P: 4, the proposal says that regarding reducing “bear-human conflicts and danger to humans”, “We are not aware of definitive research that could support or refute either assumption for grizzly bears in Montana.” Period. Full Stop. A halfhearted attempt to inject some black bear data into the discussion does nothing to change this obvious conclusion. And P: 5 says, “The FWP support team points out that...recreational hunting would probably be limited to such a small number of bears that behavioral effects...would be unlikely.

(4) Hunting proponents have long proposed the unwarranted assumption that hunted grizzlies would be wary grizzlies, thus lowering conflicts and depredations. But this only holds water if large numbers of bears are wounded by hunters and escape to spread the word to other bears about increasingly dangerous humans. And, since poaching is already the #2 cause of mortality in the NCDE, grizzlies already have a pretty good idea that we're dangerous. Properly conducted, ethical, “One Shot” hunting teaches a grizzly to be Dead – not how to be Wary.

(5) P: 4 of the proposal notes that there would be a Spring Hunting Season running from March 15 – April 20. While most females with cubs come out after April 15, why take a chance on one of these valuable females being killed by mistake, particularly since spring bears will be smaller, lighter, with poorer coats – unless the goal is to just give hunters something to shoot at – not a particularly good, ethical, selling point. A Spring Season cannot be justified, and should not be held.

(6) The proposal seems to be making the assumption that without hunting, there's no way to control human-bear conflicts. Nothing could be further from the truth. I've worked on grizzly bear conservation programs for nearly 30 years, and have watched the Montana FWP Grizzly Bear Conflict Specialists, do a first rate job whether on food attractants in the Swan Valley, livestock depredations on the Rocky Mountain Front and Blackfoot-Clearwater, or fencing lambing grounds and chicken coops. They respond promptly and effectively to move, remove, or aversively condition conflict grizzlies. What they need in order to be even more effective is more staff, more funding, and less political meddling by anti-conservation members of the Montana Legislature.

(7) Finally, the proposal is correct that one of the chief reasons that most of the environmental community opposes delisting and a return to state management is the adamant insistence on grizzly hunting by those states. In that regard, the previously mentioned ARM 12.9.1401 mandating hunting is a prime example of Montana shooting itself in the foot. Since there's no biological justification to hunt grizzlies, and hunting can't effectively target food-conditioned, depredating, or aggressive bears, while FWP already does, this provision in the law needs a well-deserved burial.

Sincerely,

R. Brian Peck
Independent Wildlife Consultant
96 Trap Lane
Columbia Falls, Mt. 59912
406-892-3767
glrbear@centurytel.net

#399

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 5:10:39 PM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 5:12:58 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:19
IP Address: 72.175.118.119

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Conservation Congress

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Conservation Congress urges the GBAC to advise Governor Bullock to not consider grizzly bear sport hunting as a viable means to manage grizzly bears and to rescind the language in his Administrative Rules of Montana (ARM 12.9.103). Those rules require a sport hunt of grizzly bears as "the most desirable method of balancing grizzly bear numbers with their available habitat" should the bear lose its federal ESA protection.

Grizzly bears in the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem number about 1,000 while 100,000 people live in Flathead County alone. Nearly 400,000 people live in the 12 counties that contain the NCDE and the number of people visiting Glacier National Park's bear habitat each year is still climbing from the 2.4 million that visited in 2015!

Grizzly bears are struggling with increasing numbers of people living, working and playing in their habitat. You can't balance out this problem by killing grizzly bears without halting or reversing the recovery of the grizzly bear population.

Urge the governor instead to beef up his Administrative Rules of Montana to better protect grizzly bears and their habitat so that grizzly bear numbers can increase and the various grizzly bear ecosystems can be reconnected. Population experts say it will take 5,000 grizzly bears in a reconnected NCDE-Yellowstone-Selway Bitterroot-Cabinet-Yaak-Selkirks ecosystem to maintain genetic diversity over the long term.

Shooting grizzly bears runs contrary to increasing grizzly bear numbers and their reoccupation of essential habitats. And sport hunting does not target the bears that may need to be killed on occasion as a matter of human safety.

It took a lawsuit by Swan View Coalition and Fund for Animals to end Montana's former grizzly bear hunt in 1991, which was then responsible for 48% of all known human-caused grizzly mortality in the NCDE. Montana simply can't be trusted to manage grizzly bears through hunting, especially in light of increasing human and development pressures being applied to bear habitat.

#400

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 5:09:15 PM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 5:13:02 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:47
IP Address: 75.169.33.222

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Dear Council:

Tourism will flourish if Montana says no to hunting grizzlies and allows them to live with humans (with education, tamper- proof garbage cans, preserving land, and hiring rangers to help protect the iconic, always admired species. As an (old) raft guide, I know all my guests want to do is see a wolf and a grizzly in the wild. That's why they spend a fortune to get to ID, MT, and WY from New York, Texas, and Chicago. Please do the right ting for helpless wildlife. Thank you and stay safe.

#401

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 7:58:43 PM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 8:25:36 PM
Time Spent: 00:26:53
IP Address: 50.37.124.26

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Brett Haverstick

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Thank you for the opportunity to submit a comment to the council. I live in Idaho and I hope my comment carries the same weight as someone from Montana who submits a comment. Be that it may, I want to say with conviction that I am completely opposed to this council making a recommendation to the governor that supports a grizzly bear hunt. I live in the Clearwater region of Idaho and a couple of grizzlies were just confirmed in the Basin by the US Fish & Wildlife Service. These bears, at least one of them as I understand, was from the NCDE grizzly population. The science and the courts have both made it clear that grizzly bears cannot recover until their populations are connected and they grow in size, as well. This is not the case right now and the political posturing that this committee represents is absurd. If the committee wants to have any credence with the public then it will endorse the best available science and recommend to the governor to use the Administrative Rules to strengthen protections for bears and their habitat. I want to see bears recover in the Clearwater region of Idaho and the Bitterroots and the most likely way for that to happen is for them to naturally disperse from the NCDE. Thank you.

#402

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Monday, April 06, 2020 8:36:52 PM
Last Modified: Monday, April 06, 2020 8:40:14 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:21
IP Address: 76.75.13.205

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Leslie Stoltz

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Montana is not ready to have a Grizzly Bear Hunt. Despite numbers, there is so much more to see long term connectivity, survival rates, and how population dynamics will respond to increased population density. We need time frame parameters for these decisions about hunting.

Postpone a hunting season for Grizz

Leslie Stoltz

#403

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 1:43:47 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 1:47:18 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:30
IP Address: 174.22.4.216

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Charlotte Heldstab

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzlies should be treasured in this state and never hunted. We know that wolf watcher bring in million of tourism dollars to WY and some to MT. Grizzlies also being in big tourism dollars and that is rarely talked about. We always need to remember that grizzlies are native to North American whereas cattle and sheep were imported from Europe. Grizzlies don't live a long life but deserve to live all of those years in peace without the threat of being hunted.

#404

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 1:17:08 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 1:49:48 PM
Time Spent: 00:32:40
IP Address: 172.221.102.110

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Daniel Sullivan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

It is hardly within the realm of reason to consider any type of trophy hunt especially of the the Endangered Grizzly bear under the current circumstances. One thing is abundantly clear to reasonable people that have long been closely observing the disposition of the Grizzly bear here in the GYE for instance. That is the climate itself, which we share with them, is in extremely deep trouble. Why are we even pretending that a trophy hunt will mitigate any assumptions we have if we do not even address the climate effects on ourselves first, in total.

Why must humans place the blame on the icons of wilderness and wild places which we share communally with the Grizzly when it is no one best interests to do so. It is especially not in the interest of Grizzly if we destroy them in the name of misguided management.

Most of free world is on lockdown as a result of the pandemic and just because some do not appreciate the appropriate science why should other inhabitants of our public lands suffer as a result.

The GB Advisory Council should demand,with whatever discretion it may possess, to at the very least postpone any and all decisions,recommendations et al until further notice.

#405

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 1:58:34 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 2:03:44 PM
Time Spent: 00:05:09
IP Address: 70.66.144.35

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jorel Cuomo

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Grizzly Bears are an iconic species that is of great cultural and economic importance to the state of Montana. The value received for hunting is minute compared to the non consumptive mortality wildlife viewing activities available. In British Columbia the value attributed to a live Grizzly Bear is 10 times that of a dead bear. BC has halted Grizzly Bear hunting due to science and of economic importance to the province. I highly encourage you to follow suit.

#406

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 2:48:31 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 2:49:20 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:49
IP Address: 24.13.70.146

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

James F Sullivan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not de-list the grizzly

#407

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 2:50:51 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 2:52:00 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:08
IP Address: 173.205.62.147

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please, DO NOT Delist Grizzly Bears from Endangered Species Act and DO NOT allow Trophy Hunting.

#408

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 3:16:12 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 3:18:24 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:12
IP Address: 65.131.203.164

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Carol Buchan

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please, NO hunting of Grizzly Bears. These majestic animals need to be protected for to secure their future in the wild.

#409

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 3:29:10 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 3:42:13 PM
Time Spent: 00:13:03
IP Address: 73.62.247.8

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Tom Gilles

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please reconsider you thoughts on grizzly bear hunting. Your state is only one of a few places that grizzly bears exist in the lower 48 states. I'm from Minnesota and I'm an avid hunter. I enjoy visiting your state to be able to see one of these majestic animals. There's not many left. I understand it's money for the state and this won't kill them all but I would like to see money put aside and keep what we won't have in the future if we don't take care of these awesome animals.

Thank you.

#410

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 6:41:22 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 6:44:50 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:28
IP Address: 174.22.1.64

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Marlene Foard

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Under no condition (unless livestock or human life is in danger) do I think it's acceptable to hunt grizzly bears. These animals represent the the apex of wildlife at its best. The abundance of wildlife is why we bought out property almost 26 years ago.

#411

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 8:25:34 PM
Last Modified: Tuesday, April 07, 2020 8:27:00 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:26
IP Address: 71.32.50.211

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jeff Lonn

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Montana is known worldwide for its wild landscapes and its wildlife. There are plenty of places in the world where timber can be cut and livestock can be grazed, but few places where such wild lands and so much wildlife still exist. And the future of Montana's economy depends on these things. Therefore, the Grizzly Council should:

1. Promote protection of grizzly habitat by reducing roads, preserving intact forests, and protecting connectivity of recovery areas so genetic diversity and vigor can be maintained,
 2. Support more funding for bear managers in areas surrounding and in-between recovery areas to promote co-existence and prevent problem bears. Fund non-lethal co-existence measures when there are conflicts.
 3. Oppose the hunting of grizzly bears. Scientists say that the bear will not be fully recovered according to ESA law without at least 3000-5000 bears in the lower 48, sustainable populations in all recovery zones, and evidence of genetic exchange between recovery zones for at least two generations. Montana is now so far from these recovery goals that to discuss hunting grizzly bears is ludicrous.
 4. Support the creation of bear wise communities throughout Montana, including bear resistant garbage containers, bear-wise education in Montana schools, and food storage regulations on all public lands.
 5. Support science-based decisions. It is disturbing that there are no scientists on the council, but nonetheless the council should defer to best available science and never concede to political or short-term economic pressure.
-

#412

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 8:49:46 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 8:53:15 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:28
IP Address: 69.247.58.196

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Garold D. Powell

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Governor Bullock Grizzly Bear Advisory Committee

April 8, 2020

To Whom It May Concern:

This letter is written to express my objection to any planned sport killing of *Ursus Arctos Horribilis* (Grizzly Bear) in the State of Montana. I base my objection to the Grizzly hunt based on the following points.

First, the Grizzly has a low reproductive rate and a high mortality rate. A female Grizzly averages 10 cubs over a 20 year lifetime. The mortality rate of the cubs is 50 percent in the first year. If every cub that survives beyond the first year is a female, you would have something near 11 bears at the end of the original bear's life. The estimate assumes sexual maturity at five years old. Can we hunt animals with a such a low reproductive rate that are already under stress from environmental issues and habitat loss?

Second, increased development pressures and human activity alone are going to pressure the bear population. Approximately 50 Grizzly were killed each year in 2018 and 2019 due to human activity. Therefore, each year, the bear population is reduced by 5-10 percent just through human interaction. And, the percentage of deaths will most likely increase with the upturn in the human population. Additionally, the 100 dead bears for 2018 and 2019 don't include either natural death or unreported killings. Do we need to hunt an animal that is already being slaughtered?

Third, I have never read a bear population study that takes into account the increased fire cycles, habitat loss, and isolation of the genetic pool. The questions I have concerning these issues are as follows:

- 1) How will the change in fire cycles of more, bigger fires burning the same acres affect the bears?
- 2) Will this burned habitat support more or fewer bears in the future?
- 3) Will the Northern Rockies become nothing but brush? And, how will that affect the bear population?
- 4) How will future developments in valleys affect the bear population?
- 5) How will the isolation of certain bear communities affect the population? Will isolated populations suffer from genetic disease and be threatened with extinction?

I don't think any of these questions of the bear's future have been adequately answered for me to support the hunting of Grizzly in the present.

Lastly, I have several unanswered questions on how hunting itself will affect bear health, activity and bear/human interaction:

- 1) Will bears become even more isolated to inaccessible areas of the mountains?
- 2) Will bears seek areas where hunting will not be allowed?
- 3) Will hikers have to worry about wounded Grizzlies?
- 4) Will bears become more aggressive or more skittish due to hunting? Will hunting act like natural selection changing bear behavior?
- 5) What happens when a dominant male is taken out of a territory - will aggressive young males be more prevalent in the mountains?

I think these are questions that have to be seriously considered before Montana goes stumbling into a mess.

In closing, I would like to thank those making this decision for considering the questions I have before making a decision on the future of Grizzlies in Montana.

Sincerely,

Garold D. Powell

#413

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 8:52:05 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 8:54:00 AM
Time Spent: 00:01:55
IP Address: 76.19.57.189

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Robert Sargent

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

There is no moral, or scientific justification for killing grizzly bears. Please follow the science.

#414

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 9:14:59 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 9:15:12 AM
Time Spent: 00:00:13
IP Address: 174.247.113.70

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Bill Mckinley

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Why hunt grizzly bears in Montana?

What is best for successful grizzly bear management in Montana?

Two questions that need answered!!!!

Successful grizzly bear management is why I applied for the council and is why I've submitted my comments throughout this process. Knowing that there will be great ideas coming from this group that will support successful grizzly bear management I will take this time to focus on how hunting will make this list.

I understand the word "hunting" puts chills down your spine, regardless if you hunt or not. Hunting is the practice of seeking, pursuing and capturing or harvesting of berries, fruits, nuts, plants and wild animals. Gathering these renewable resources brings one close to nature and an appreciation or even a spiritual connection to Mother Earth.

Grizzly bears in several areas of Montana have reached recovery goals. With these numbers come different challenges. The challenge becomes, how to best use these areas to build population while increasing social acceptance. Hunting, I'll say selective harvesting, is the tool to do just that. By implementing selective harvest regulations FWP will build value for the bears as well as the private landowners. Without value tolerance is not achieved.

Increased social acceptance in conjunction with education will be a win win for encouraging the expansion, numbers and area, of grizzly bears.

I was thinking of expanding on selective harvest but I'll save that for another comment.

Thanks for the time you spend on striving for successful grizzly bear management.

Bill McKinley
4062890432

#415

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 10:10:23 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 10:12:59 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:35
IP Address: 97.121.198.195

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Charlie Donnes

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The ignorance of biology and shortsightedness of your proposed policy is impossible to comprehend without reference to Donald Drump Jr.

#416

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 10:42:46 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 10:45:40 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:53
IP Address: 66.113.35.217

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Teresa Henderson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do NOT consider trophy hunting of grizzly bears.

#417

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 10:45:12 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 10:47:32 AM
Time Spent: 00:02:19
IP Address: 174.195.210.142

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Saundra Holloway

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Population experts say that it will take 5,000 bears in a reconnected Northern Rockies (encompassing the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem (NCDE) - Yellowstone - Selway Bitterroot - Cabinet-Yaak - Selkirks ecosystems) to sustain a grizzly bear population long term.

Grizzly bears have an incredibly slow reproductive rate, and it can take 10 years for a female grizzly bear to replace herself in the wild.

Pregnant bears would likely be shot during a fall hunting season, potentially leading to the removal of 4 or 5 bears rather than just one.

Seeing grizzly bears in the wild is a leading attraction for tourists from all over the world.

"Management" should not necessarily mean "hunting."

Thank you for allowing me to comment on this issue.

#418

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 11:28:32 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 11:32:28 AM
Time Spent: 00:03:56
IP Address: 172.1.181.144

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

WILLIAM KEETING

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

So population experts say that it will take 5,000 bears in a reconnected Northern Rockies (encompassing the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem (NCDE) - Yellowstone - Selway Bitterroot - Cabinet-Yaak - Selkirks ecosystems) to sustain a grizzly bear population long term.

Grizzly bears in the NCDE are already struggling with the expanding human population, and opening up a hunting season will be an obstacle to establishing a healthy, connected population.

All Grizzly bears have an incredibly slow reproductive rate, and it can take 10 years for a female grizzly bear to replace herself in the wild.

Many pregnant bears would likely be shot during a fall hunting season, potentially leading to the removal of 4 or 5 bears rather than just one.

A (KNOWN) fact that seeing grizzly bears in the wild is a leading attraction for tourists from all over the world.

By you rushing forward with a hunting season before a connected grizzly bear population is established could substantially reduce grizzly bear numbers, squandering all the time and money spent on grizzly bear recovery.

Not any sport hunting will not change bear behavior as bears are solitary animals and cannot "learn" anything from the demise of other grizzly bears in distant areas.

Obvious to so many for long term persistence of grizzly bears management focus should be on establishing a large, metapopulation in a connected NCDE - Yellowstone - Selway Bitterroot - Cabinet-Yaak- Selkirk ecosystem.

"Management" should absolutely mean (ONLY) "hunting."

#419

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 11:31:07 AM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 11:42:58 AM
Time Spent: 00:11:50
IP Address: 208.114.165.7

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Jefferson Bray

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

If our current predicament illustrates anything, it is that solutions, I.e. preservation, no longer support behavioural pursuits of "traditional" male paths of ejaculatory self-elevation. 'Trophy' killing for revenues, size measurement contests and body part props to narcissistic stories...and people wonder why they're "locked down". It's time for good ol' boyz 'culture' to grow up, or be stopped. Lead by example.

#420

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 12:25:53 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 12:27:20 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:26
IP Address: 206.127.123.233

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Mark Lambrecht

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I believe the grizzly population in the tristate area of Montana, Idaho and Wyoming is fully recovered and all management authority should be transferred to state wildlife agencies. State management will bring into play a number of strategies—including limited, regulated hunting to ensure the long-term viability of grizzly populations.

I support state grizzly bear management with hunting for these reasons: (1) grizzly bear recovery goals for the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem population have been met; (2) the Northern Continental Divide Ecosystem population of 1,029 bears has greatly expanded beyond the initial designated recovery zone into habitats with human and livestock presence—causing significant conflicts; (3) studies have determined grizzlies are adaptable to changes in habitat; and (4) delisting the bear and transferring management to state wildlife agencies ensures continued conservation of the species while also increasing funding for habitat conservation through the sale of limited hunting opportunities.

State wildlife agencies in Montana, Idaho and Wyoming have collectively spent millions of dollars over the last four decades on programs to study grizzlies, monitor populations and conserve their habitat. The hunters and anglers of these states who purchase hunting and fishing licenses, generating millions of dollars for programs to benefit grizzly bears and other wildlife, made these efforts possible. This revenue stream will continue to be available for grizzly bear conservation under state management—and will be significantly enhanced if states are able to sell limited opportunities for grizzly bear hunting.

Regulated hunting of grizzlies should follow these parameters:

- Establish that either sex grizzly bears may be taken, except adults accompanied by young, and young accompanied by adults.
- Establish that immediately after harvest of a grizzly bear, the tag must be validated and securely attached to the hide.
- Add grizzly bear to the list of species for which evidence of sex must be left naturally attached to the hide until mandatory check requirement has been fulfilled.
- Establish requirement that any hunter who kills a grizzly bear must report harvest within 24 hours by calling a toll free grizzly reporting number.
- Establish mandatory check requirement for grizzly bears whereby any harvested grizzly bear skull and hide must be presented to a state wildlife agency regional office for checking within 5 days of harvest.
- Establish targeted grizzly bear hunts in areas with significant human/livestock conflicts.
- Prohibit grizzly bear hunting within 200 yards of any designated dump ground or landfill.
- Establish a rule to limit harvest of a grizzly bear to once per lifetime.
- Protect the identity of individuals who draw grizzly bear hunting licenses and those who legally harvest grizzly bears.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments.

#421

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 1:48:35 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 1:55:14 PM
Time Spent: 00:06:38
IP Address: 72.174.68.170

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Blake Nicolazzo

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Regarding the GBAC conversation around the role of hunting in GB mgmt- I don't honestly see a role for hunting when we are not engaging in proactive coexistence measures. That must be our first line of defense. If the government can fund \$250k for more Wildlife Services boots on the ground, they can find money to give people real time, real life solutions that keep everyone alive. We do not have a state-wide effort in place to coexist. Once that is up and running and we have even a simple majority of the population trying in earnest to peacefully live on the land that belongs to the bears, then we can talk about killing when all other potential solutions are exhausted. If the Covid-19 pandemic teaches us anything, it's that humans are being asked to reevaluate how we treat the natural world. What we do to them, we do to ourselves. Wishing you all good health.

#422

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 2:53:52 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 2:58:15 PM
Time Spent: 00:04:23
IP Address: 69.145.149.183

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Mike Nemacheck

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

The grizzly bear is unique to America bringing in tourist dollars from all around the world to view this majestic species. If we want a viable population in the northern rockies ecosystem hunting cannot be part of the equation. Please keep the grizzly bear on the endangered species list and do not allow it to be hunted in Montana. Thanks!

#423

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:00:14 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:04:12 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:58
IP Address: 192.161.70.67

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

David Mattson - 3

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

David Mattson, Ph.D.

8 April 2020

WILL HUNTING GRIZZLY BEARS MAKE THEM MORE FEARFUL AND THEREBY PEOPLE SAFER?

The idea that sport hunting will make grizzly bears more fearful of people has gotten a lot of attention in recent years as one of several justifications for removing endangered species act (ESA) protections for grizzlies in the Northern Rockies, devolving management to the states, and instituting a sport hunt.

The notion of instilling fear in grizzlies through a hunt is emotionally charged because there have been several bear-caused human fatalities in the Northern Rockies during the last few years. So the idea is to have sport hunters kill grizzlies to teach them to fear people. As a presumed result, there will be fewer bear attacks. People will be safer. To borrow a phrase from Valerius Geist, a proponent of hunting bears, people will have “freedom of the woods.”

What follows is my review of the logic and relevant evidence (or lack thereof) for these propositions. But first:

SOME GRIZZLY BEAR FUNDAMENTALS

The first point to be made is that grizzly bears exist at a baseline characterized by a greater tendency to respond aggressively to perceived threats compared to other bear species. Steve Herrero, a Canadian behavioral ecologist, was the first to speculate that this aggressiveness was rooted in the evolutionary history of grizzlies (Herrero 1972). Grizzlies (and brown bears—all of the same species, *Ursus arctos*) evolved in open environments where safety depended on an animal standing its ground and intimidating or beating back any threat. (You can find more on the formative evolutionary environments of grizzlies by following [this link](#) and [this link](#)).

Even so, grizzlies can exhibit a high degree of tolerance for humans and other bears that might otherwise be viewed as threats (Herrero 2002, Herrero et al. 2005, Smith et al. 2005). You can see this in coastal environments where bears have become highly socialized and tolerant of each other because of frequent interactions with conspecifics concentrated around salmon spawning streams. Or you can find this among bears that have interacted enough with benign humans to internalize a less fear-based response—a process known as “habituation.”

So, a couple of key points are worth making up front: First, grizzlies seem to be hard-wired genetically to deal with perceived threats aggressively. Second, and perhaps more importantly, grizzlies can become less reactive to people, not as a result of heightened fear, but rather as a result of the opposite. These fundamentals alone call into question the logic of using hunting to increase human safety. Killing grizzlies (and, as I address later, we’ve done a lot of that even with ESA protections) is unlikely to rewire the genetic underpinnings of their behavior; and less fear rather than more is probably going to make people safer, especially if we continue to reduce the number of circumstances (e.g., garbage around human residences or hunters near freshly-killed elk) that allow people to do things that trigger aggressive responses from even the most tolerant bears. I elaborate more on this a little later.

THE TAKE AWAY

Assuming that the focus here is on the question of whether sport hunting will instill fear in grizzly bears and thereby make people safer by reducing the odds of attack and injury, my main points are:

- Attacks by bears on people on foot are quite rare, whether near or far from residences. Estimates of attacks per close encounter with a grizzly bear range from 3 to 6 per 1,000—or 0.3 to 0.6% of encounters (Nadeau 1987; Mattson 2019, page 14). Close encounters are judged to be any that occurred at distances of 50-120 yards. These are really low odds. You stand a greater chance of being injured when encountering a strange dog. And this only accounts for encounters where the involved people were aware of it happening.
- But what are the odds of a bear acting aggressively in any obvious way during a close encounter, typically by bluff charging or approaching in a threatening manner? This response happens during roughly 4-6% of encounters (Mattson 2019, pages 12-13)

Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council Public Comments

approaching in a threatening manner. This response happens during roughly 4-6% of encounters (Mattson 2019, pages 12-16).

- Focusing further on risk, let's assume that a close encounter did result in an aggressive response by the bear—so, involving only 4-6% of close encounters. What are the odds of injury given some degree of initial aggression? Estimates come in at around 6-18% or 6-18 of 100 encounters where aggression results in actual injury (Kendall 1983, Nadeau 1987, Mattson 2019).
- These low odds are premised on the bear acting aggressively in the first place—as opposed to being passive, curious, or fleeing. In fact, under circumstances where grizzly bears could be observed, they fled from humans during 72% of close encounters. During 22-24% of encounters the involved bear acted curious and eventually left, or didn't overtly react in any way (Mattson 2019, page 6).
- What about the known circumstances of attacks? Most people are attacked by grizzly bears for a limited suit of reasons, including: females with cubs defending themselves and their offspring; bears defending a food source that they've laid claim to, whether that food be natural or of human origin; close or other problematic encounters with bears attracted to human food sources; and chance surprise encounters. Only very rarely are attacks of a predatory nature and, if so, almost wholly at night involving people in tents (for example, Herrero & Fleck 1990; Herrero & Higgins 1999, 2003; Herrero 2002; Smith & Herrero 2018; https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_fatal_bear_attacks_in_North_America).

All of this leads to some pretty straight-forward conclusions: (1) grizzly bears don't actually pose much of a threat to people, especially compared to other risks for people out in the woods or pursuing normal day-to-day activities; (2) there is no obvious connection between any effect of sport hunting on grizzly bears and the types of circumstances that result in documented injuries; and (3) instead, there is a more obvious connection of risk to how people behave when they are out among bears, the proximal configurations of terrain and habitat, whether a bear is defending a food source or its dependent young, and whether people have food or other attractants available to bears around the places they live and work. Sport hunting does not address any of these risk factors and may, in fact, lead to people to be less cautious, less informed, and more lax.

- There is very little scientific evidence addressing whether sport hunting of grizzly bears leads them to become generally more fearful of people. The scant available evidence shows increased diel avoidance of people by hunted bears (Ordiz et al. 2012), which could lower odds of an encounter, but without any obvious connection to whether bears might be less aggressive during an encounter should it happen.
- Basic knowledge of animal behavior strongly suggests that a fearful animal such as a dog or cat will be more dangerous than one that is not during a close encounter. This almost certainly holds for bears as well.
- Tolerant (i.e., less fearful) bears are, by definition, not particularly reactive to people. As a consequence, tolerant bears tend to be less aggressive during most close encounters, which can make such encounters safer for the involved people (Herrero et al. 2005). On the other hand, bears that are tolerant of people will typically let people get closer than would otherwise be the case, which increases the odds that someone will do something stupid at close range. Nonetheless, there is no clear connection between sport hunting and the prevalence of tolerance or habituation—which typically develops when bears are seeking a food resource near people (Herrero 2002).
- Grizzly bears have been functionally “hunted” by people in the Northern Rockies even under protections offered by the ESA. Much of the human-caused mortality in defense of life and property functionally mimics hunting—complete with gunshots, blood, gory remains, and lots of associated human scent and sign. There is no evidence that bears have generally become more (or less) fearful.
- By definition, sport hunting will not occur in National Parks where a significant portion of bear attacks on people have happened (Herrero 2002). Even if sport hunting changed bear behavior it would not affect dynamics unfolding within Parks, other than, perhaps, along Park boundaries.

This, then, leads to some additional (final) conclusions: (4) despite intensive research on bear behavior in Europe and North America, and a de facto situation that functionally entails the hunting of grizzly bears in the Northern Rockies, there is no evidence that hunted bears are more fearful of people, other than perhaps through a tendency to be more night- rather than day-active. (5) Even if hunted grizzlies were to become more fearful of people, there is no reason to conclude that people would be safer; in fact, the opposite is more likely to be the case.

REFERENCED LITERATURE

Herrero, S. (1972). Aspects of the evolution and adaptation in American black bears (*Ursus americanus* Pallas) and brown and grizzly bears (*U. arctos* Linne.) of North America. *International Conference of Bear Research & Management*, 2, 221-231.

Herrero, S., & Fleck, S. (1990). Injury to people inflicted by black, grizzly or polar bears: recent trends and new insights. *International Conference on Bear Research & Management*, 8, 25-32.

Herrero, S., & Higgins, A. (1999). Human injuries inflicted by bears in British Columbia: 1960-97. *Ursus*, 11, 209-218.

Herrero, J., & Herrero, S. (2000). Management options for the Moraine Lake Highline Trail: grizzly bears and cyclists. Report to Parks Canada, Calgary, Alberta.

Herrero, S. (2002). *Bear attacks: their causes and avoidance*. Revised edition. Lyons Press, Guilford, Connecticut.

Herrero, S., & Higgins, A. (2003). Human injuries inflicted by bears in Alberta: 1960–98. *Ursus*, 14(1), 44-54.

Herrero, S., Smith, T., DeBruyn, T. D., Gunther, K., & Matt, C. A. (2005). From the field: brown bear habituation to people—safety, risks, and benefits. *Wildlife Society Bulletin*, 33(1), 362-373.

Kendell, K. C. (1983). Trends in grizzly/human interactions in Glacier National Park, Montana. US Park Service, Glacier National Park, Research Division, West Glacier, Montana.

Mattson, D. J. (2019). Effects of pedestrians on grizzly bears: an evaluation of the effects of hikers, hunters, photographers, campers, and watchers. The Grizzly Bear Recovery Project, Report GBRP-2019-3.

Nadeau, M. S. (1987). Habitats, trails, and campground situations associated with grizzly-human confrontations in Glacier National Park, Montana. M.S. Thesis, University of Montana, Missoula, Montana.

Ordiz, A., Støen, O. G., Sæbø, S., Kindberg, J., Delibes, M., & Swenson, J. E. (2012). Do bears know they are being hunted?. *Biological Conservation*, 152, 21-28.

Smith, T. S., Herrero, S. & DeBruyn, T. D. (2005). Alaskan brown bears, humans, and habituation. *Ursus*, 16(1), 1-10.

#424

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Thursday, April 02, 2020 12:30:43 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:05:11 PM
Time Spent: Over a day
IP Address: 69.20.132.18

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Andrea Santarsiere

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I strongly oppose the potential for grizzly bear hunting in the future should protections under the Endangered Species Act be removed. To permit hunting soon after removing federal protections would be a drastic mistake. It would cause the public to lose faith in the state's ability to manage wildlife in a sustainable and ethical manner. Grizzly bears are solitary animals (aside from sows with cubs) and thus hunting grizzly bears will not change grizzly bear behavior in any way, because a dead bear doesn't learn anything. People come from all over the world hoping to see a grizzly bear in the wild here - imagine a tourist spending hours watching a grizzly bear and taking pictures only to find out that it was shot the next day. The tourism dollars spent in Montana by wildlife watchers far outweighs any monetary gain that trophy hunters would bring to the state. I believe that permitting trophy hunting would be a black scar on the State of Montana.

I was happy when Montana declined to permit a hunt after federal delisting two years ago and hope that Montana would once again see and follows the wisdom in that decision.

#425

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:09:24 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:10:12 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:48
IP Address: 76.175.12.74

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Katherine

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I oppose grizzly bear hunting in the future. We can't hunt these beautiful and ecologically important animals!

#426

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:10:02 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:10:58 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:55
IP Address: 198.27.190.101

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Susan Larsen

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I oppose all grizzly bear hunting.

#427

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:07:59 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:11:20 PM
Time Spent: 00:03:21
IP Address: 97.95.248.129

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Dianne DuBois

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I oppose hunting of grizzly bears in our state. Grizzly bears are a critical part of our ecosystems and intact ecosystems are a huge draw for our tourism (hiking, nature tours, birding) industry that employs my family and many others.

#428

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:09:11 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:11:58 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:47
IP Address: 69.9.28.177

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Lydia

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not allow grizzlies to be killed on behalf of cattle operations. It's wrong.

#429

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:09:22 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:12:05 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:43
IP Address: 73.229.169.28

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Julie Teel Simmonds

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I would oppose any grizzly bear hunting in the future. These beautiful creatures belong in the ecosystem and play an important role in it. Their existence enriches our lives and outdoor experiences and enjoyment.

#430

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:11:58 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:13:44 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:46
IP Address: 67.9.36.234

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Hannah

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I adamantly oppose further grizzly hunting. Please do not allow grizzly hunting now or in the future.

Thank you for consideration of these comments,
Hannah

#431

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:12:50 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:14:31 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:40
IP Address: 65.120.93.210

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Eric

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please don't allow Grizzly Bear hunting. If you ain't eating it, don't shoot it.

#432

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:08:13 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:20:33 PM
Time Spent: 00:12:19
IP Address: 67.252.49.135

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Sarah

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I oppose grizzly bear hunting in the future.

#433

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:22:24 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:23:04 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:40
IP Address: 137.110.34.228

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I'm writing to oppose grizzly bear hunting in the future. Thank you.

#434

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:11:31 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:26:27 PM
Time Spent: 00:14:55
IP Address: 67.168.237.199

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Ann Brown

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I oppose all grizzly bear hunting in the future

#435

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:26:58 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:27:46 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:47
IP Address: 71.238.21.81

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Miranda

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please protect grizzly bears. This is their home too.

#436

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:26:32 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:33:50 PM
Time Spent: 00:07:17
IP Address: 172.250.15.176

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

I. E. Anderson

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I oppose hunting of grizzly bears in the future.

#437

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:41:11 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:42:42 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:31
IP Address: 70.162.91.248

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Stephanie

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

No more grizzly bear trophy hunts. The species is not recovered enough to handle the slaughter.

#438

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:49:54 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:50:36 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:41
IP Address: 96.255.232.189

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

This is terrible and will drive away tourists.

#439

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:55:22 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:56:12 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:49
IP Address: 100.15.188.171

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I oppose grizzly bear hunting. Their #s are not adequate enough and they do not need to be hunted.

#440

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:54:03 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:56:18 PM
Time Spent: 00:02:14
IP Address: 24.21.192.157

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Stephanie Feldstein

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I oppose grizzly bear hunting. It's harmful to the species and ecosystems as well as being cruel and unnecessary.

#441

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:01:09 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:01:38 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:29
IP Address: 47.6.184.235

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional): Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I oppose any grizzly hunting in Montana

#442

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:05:41 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:07:13 PM
Time Spent: 00:01:31
IP Address: 100.15.188.189

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

Please do not ever allow grizzly bear hunting. I plan to take trips to your state for the beautiful and wildlife but I won't if you authorize the sport killing of majestic animals such as grizzly bears.

#443

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:00:58 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:09:18 PM
Time Spent: 00:08:19
IP Address: 65.155.78.202

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Respondent skipped this question

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I live in the Idaho Panhandle and I oppose hunting of grizzly bears, who roam to and from our border. These species are under threat due to encroachment of their habitat and other human driven causes. Why on earth would you allow hunting them when they already face so many challenges?

#444

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:29:20 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:13:42 PM
Time Spent: 00:44:22
IP Address: 136.36.139.47

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Ryan Beam

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am deeply opposed to the hunting of grizzlies for sport. These inspiring creatures remain pushed to margins of existence. They should remain alive in the wild instead of dead and mounted to the walls of the rich.

#445

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:14:20 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:15:16 PM
Time Spent: 00:00:55
IP Address: 99.155.39.42

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Theresa Rettinghouse

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I am opposed to Grizzly Bear hunting in the future.

#446

COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 3:52:24 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, April 08, 2020 4:27:26 PM
Time Spent: 00:35:02
IP Address: 63.153.110.10

Page 1

Q1 Name (optional):

Patty Ames

Q3 Please enter your comments for the Governor's Grizzly Bear Advisory Council:

I have been following the the Grizzly Bear Council since it's inception. I must say that overall I am extremely disappointed in the Council. I have witnessed the members dismissing science, what little of it that has been presented. Most memebers appear to not even comprenhend any of the science based information they have been given, let alone even read it. Most all of the Council memembers had a very clear agenda going into this process, along with a closed mind. I have noted that the members were each hand picked based on the positions they held prior to joining the Council, and most have stuck with their original bias and misinformed opinions. Some of their emotionally charged, hysterical beliefs are just down right embarrassing ;"my children are going to get eaten at the bus stop".

There are many scientfific papers written, that the Council were given (and most did not read them) describing how the grizzly bears are not recovered yet. It will be crimminal for Council memebers to vote to hunt bears, given their lack of basic scientific understanding. Of course the deck was stacked from the beginning. Mt. FWP is ill equipped to mange grizzly bears without a hunting season, let a lone with a hunting season. We have had record high mortality, increasing every year....it is way premature to consider a grizzly bear hunting season.

The Council of hand picked, biased members, is not representative of most intllegent, informed Montanans, who do not want our iconic State animal hunted before they are actually recoved.

Sincerely,
Patty Ames
